

ALLEGHENY COUNTY COUNCIL

REGULAR MEETING

- - -

BEFORE:

John P. DeFazio	-	President, Council-At-Large
Nicholas Futules	-	Vice President, District 7
Samuel DeMarco, III	-	Council-At-Large
Thomas Baker	-	District 1
Edward Kress	-	District 3
Michael J. Finnerty	-	District 4
Sue Means	-	District 5
John F. Palmiere	-	District 6
Dr. Charles J. Martoni	-	District 8
Robert J. Macey	-	District 9
DeWitt Walton	-	District 10
Paul Klein	-	District 11
James Ellenbogen	-	District 12
Denise Ranalli-Russell	-	District 13

Allegheny County Courthouse
Fourth Floor, Gold Room
436 Grant Street
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219

Tuesday, November 22, 2016 - 5:03 p.m.

SARGENT'S COURT REPORTING SERVICE, INC.
429 Forbes Avenue, Suite 1300
Pittsburgh, PA 15219
(412) 232-3882 FAX (412) 471-8733

IN ATTENDANCE:

Jared Barker	-	Director of Legislative Services
Joseph Catanese	-	Director of Constituent Services
Walter Szymanski	-	Budget Director
Jack Cambest	-	Council Solicitor

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Would everyone stand for the Pledge of Allegiance and remain standing for silent prayer or reflection. After me ---.

(Pledge of Allegiance.)

(Silent prayer or reflection.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Roll call.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Here.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Kirk?

(No response.)

MR. BARKER: Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Kress?

(No response.)

MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Present.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Here.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Here.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Ranalli-Russell?

MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. DeFazio, President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Here.

MR. BARKER: We have 13 members present.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Proclamations and Certificates, 9914-16.

MR. BARKER: Proclamation recognizing Girl Scout Troop 51385 for earning the Silver Award after completing a renovation project at the Girl Scout Cabin in South Park. Sponsored by Council Members Means, Palmiere, DeFazio and DeMarco.

MS. MEANS: They always have to remind me I'm short --- like what? Remember me? I am just so excited today to have members of Girl Scout Troop 51 --- 51385 here today. I'm just excited and honored because they invested in our park, South Park, and so I'm going to read the proclamation. But we have here today, we have Erin Carter --- I'm sorry, Emily Carter; right? There's Emily. And we have Brianna Gieske. And we have Erin Carter. She's one of the Girl Scout leaders so ---. And she's a member of the Friends of South Park so it gets better. It just gets better. It gets better. And so I'm joined by Council Member Palmiere, Council Member DeMarco and Council Member DeFazio. And do you want to say anything before I read the proclamation? Would you like to say anything? And the proclamation pretty much says it all. And then you all can come up and say a little word, a couple words, if you like. No pressure. All right. Okay. So here we go.

And I'd also like to point out that the Director of Parks, Andy Baechle, is the one that came to me and said these girls deserve an award. And he's right because wait until you hear all the things they did to make our park look better.

WHEREAS, Girl Scout Troop 51385 of Bethel Park, Pennsylvania, made up of members Emily Carter, Brianna Gieske, Allison Kurtz and Madison Podsy --- oh, my goodness.

MS. PODSIADLY: Podsiadly (pronouncing).

MS. MEANS: Podsiadly, earned the Girl Scout's Silver Award, the highest honor Girl Scout Cadets can attain for their 50-plus hours of community service.

WHEREAS, their take action project, Girl Scout Troop 51385, with guidance from troop leaders Erin Carter and Diane Kurtz decided to complete an outdoor renovation for the South Park Girl Scout Cabin.

WHEREAS, in order to raise funds for their project, Girl Scout Troop 51385 held an event on October 2015 at the South Park Girl Scout Cabin to celebrate the late Juliette Gordon Low, the founder of the Girl Scouts. On November 7th, 2015, Troop 51385, alongside with the Friends of South Park, helped to remove litter from the hillsides and plant 1,000 daffodil bulbs at the entrance of South Park on Corrigan Place. On December 4th, 2015, Troop 51385 participated as Santa's Helpers in the light-up night hosted by the Friends of South Park.

WHEREAS, in the spring of 2016, Girl Scout Troop 51385 created a sturdy, safe wooden box to hold firewood, removed overgrown bushes and uncovered a beautiful stone sidewalk and a matching stone face on the porch. Using stones and rocks around the property, they reframed the flower beds to match the sidewalk and porch. New plants were added in containers. And to prevent weeds, they spread six tons of gravel to keep yard fabric in place, and they designated and built a wishing well completing their Silver Award project in July 2016.

THEREFORE, NOW, LET IT BE RESOLVED, that Allegheny County Council, in recognition of dedication, hard work and the achievement of Girl Scout Troop 51385, does hereby congratulate them for earning the Girl Scout Silver Award. We thank Girl Scout Troop 51385 for beautifying South Park today, sponsored by myself, Sue Means, John Palmiere, John DeFazio and Sam DeMarco on this, the 22nd day of November, 2016. Congratulations.

(Applause.)

MS. MEANS: So Emily, would you like to say a few words? You're taller than I am.

MS. EMILY CARTER: We would like to thank the County for allowing us to work there and we hope to work with them again soon.

(Applause.)

MS. MEANS: Do you want to say something? Okay. We get to get our picture taken together now.

(Pictures taken.)

MS. MEANS: Well, I'm really excited --- we have to read the number; right? We have to wait until the President gets back up there.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: One second. Okay. 9915-16.

MR. BARKER: A proclamation congratulating Mr. Robert Demsky for being selected Mt. Lebanon High School Homecoming King on October 14th, 2016. Sponsored by Council Member Means.

MS. MEANS: So I am so excited today. We have with us today today's hero, and we are going to honor Robert Demsky because there are people in the world that face challenges. They face that challenge with such determination that they inspire all of us. So today we are honored to have amongst our midst Robert Demsky. And I'm just so happy to have you here. You are an example of overcomers. This is not only an award for you, but it's an award for your school, your teachers, your classmates,

because you've inspired them all and they support you all and you're just a wonderful person. So honored that you're here today. Mr. DeMarco, do you want to say anything?

MR. DEMARCO: Do you want to --- do you have the background you were showing me before?

MS. MEANS: Oh, not with me. Let me see if I can grab it. Did you want to read that?

MR. DEMARCO: I thought that would be a good ---.

MS. MEANS: Oh, okay. That's a good thing. Let me see if I can grab it.

MR. PALMIERE: Which one do you want, Sue?

MS. MEANS: I don't know if I can find the ---. Sorry. All right. Let's just read it. All right.

WHEREAS, Mt. Lebanon High School has worked diligently over the years to provide a high quality and well-rounded education to its students embracing the message of total inclusion for all regardless of skills and abilities.

WHEREAS, Mt. Lebanon High School has many talented, intelligent and dedicated students, one such student is Robert Demsky; and

WHEREAS, as a student at Mt. Lebanon High School, Robert Demsky has served as an inspiration to his classmates, his teachers, positively impacting everyone who has the opportunity to meet him.

WHEREAS, Robert Demsky despite being diagnosed with Down's syndrome has and continues to surpass any obstacles set before him; and

WHEREAS, Robert Demsky was recently selected by his classmates as the 2016 Homecoming King of Mt. Lebanon High School.

NOW, THEREFORE, LET IT BE RESOVLED, that Allegheny County Council does hereby congratulate Robert Demsky for being crowned the 2016 Homecoming King of Mt. Lebanon High School, and we recognize the students, the teachers and the administrators of Mt. Lebanon High School who have rallied to support Robert Demsky. Sponsored by myself, Sue Means and all the members of County Council.

(Applause.)

MS. MEANS: You're his sisters, come on up. You're part of the family. His two sisters are cheerleaders; right? And when your name was announced, they ran onto the field and gave you a --- they probably

crushed you; right? Everyone was so excited and you were the man of the hour and everyone wanted their picture taken with you. Isn't that just wonderful? Do you want to say a few words?

MR. DEMSKY: I love you guys.

MS. MEANS: Thank you. Mom and dad, would you like to say anything? And this is his mom, Valerie and his dad, Robert as well.

MRS. DEMSKY: I just wanted to say thank you to the Council members. I want to say thank you to the Council members. Robert has worked very hard in school to just be one of the regular kids. That's all he ever wanted to be, was just one of the guys. And he's attended so many football games and basketball games. He takes regular ed classes. He does archery. He does all these different things within the school. So it was so nice to have them nominate him for the Homecoming Court and to select him as Homecoming King. And I thank the Council for this recognition.

(Applause.)

(Pictures taken.)

MR. KRESS: John --- or excuse me, Joe, can we put everybody's name on the proclamation?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. 9916-16.

MR. BARKER: Proclamation congratulating Ms. Janet Lauer, district manager of the Allegheny Conservation District, for earning the 2016 Women in Energy Leadership Award from the Pittsburgh Business Times. Sponsored by Council Member Finnerty.

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you. Jan Lauer is just an amazing, amazing organizer and an amazing district manager for the Conservation District. She brought the Conservation District from nothing to being one the best in the State of Pennsylvania. Numerous awards.

MS. LAUER: Lots of Board help. Lots of Board help.

MR. FINNERTY: And I'm on the Board, too, so --- not that I had anything to do with it. I'm just on the Board. But this to honor Janet Lauer with the 2016 Women in Energy Leadership Award from the Pittsburgh Business Times. And as I read the proclamation, you'll know why she got this award.

WHEREAS, Ms. Janet Lauer is a recipient of the 2016 Women of Energy Leadership Award from the Pittsburgh Business Times and;

WHEREAS, as a director and founder of Three Rivers Clean Energy, Ms. Lauer is focused on bringing together southwest Pennsylvania companies that are part of the supply chain for the energy generating industry; and

WHEREAS, Ms. Lauer also serves as district manager for the Allegheny County Conservation District, an organization that forms partnerships and promotes innovation to conserve, promote and improve Allegheny County's natural resources. As chairman of the Pittsburgh Region Clean Cities, she works with fuel providers, vehicle fleet managers, community leaders and other stakeholders to reduce petroleum use; and

WHEREAS, Ms. Lauer's prior experience includes serving as senior vice president for the Allegheny Conference on Community Development, operations manager for Westinghouse Science and Technology Center and operations manager for Northrop Grumman Science and Technology Center.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that Allegheny County Council does hereby congratulate Ms. Janet Lauer for earning the 2016 Women in Energy Leadership Award from the Pittsburgh Business Times. And we commend her efforts to create cleaner and more efficient energy use in Allegheny County. It's sponsored by myself, Michael J. Finnerty, the 22nd day of November, 2016. Ms. Lauer?

(Applause.)

MS. LAUER: Thank you. I'm taller so I'll raise it up. I'm very honored by this. Thank you so much. I'm as honored by the proclamation as I am for the original award. And I'm also very grateful to the Conservation District Board for allowing me the time to continue to serve as the chairman of the Pittsburgh Region Clean Cities. And in that capacity we've brought in hundreds of thousands of dollars to help support alternative fuel conversions in the region in the past couple of years.

So the purpose of that is to reduce dependence on imported fuels and make better use of domestic fuels to help spur the domestic fuel industry.

So again, thank you so much. Much appreciated.

(Applause.)

(Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. 9917-16.

MR. BARKER: Proclamation congratulating South Fayette Connect Magazine for winning two 2016 MarCom

Awards in the print media category. Sponsored by Council Member Finnerty.

MR. FINNERTY: Andrea and Gwen and your father. That's all I get out to that one. Just let me stand on this side because the camera moves that way.

This proclamation congratulates South Fayette Connect Magazine for winning two 2016 MarCom Awards in the print media category. It's quite an honor and if you take a look at the magazine they're holding up it's quite well developed, has a tremendous amount of information in it. And that's all to our editor over here, Andrea. And I'm going to read the proclamation and they'll say a few words.

WHEREAS, South Fayette Connect, the official magazine of South Fayette Township, is the winner of two 2016 MarCom Awards in the print media category including a gold award for government magazines and an honorable mention for magazine writing; and

WHEREAS, South Fayette Connect is a free magazine published, distributed quarterly by South Fayette Township for the benefit of its citizens; and

WHEREAS, South Fayette Connect magazine is a nonprofit source of public information aimed at building a strong sense of community, identity and pride; and

WHEREAS, administered by the Association of Marketing and Communication Professionals, the AMCP, the MarCom Award is a creative international competition for marketing and communication professionals with more than 6,000 entries per year. MarCom judges recognize outstanding achievements and work that serves as a benchmark for the industry.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that Allegheny County Council does hereby congratulate South Fayette Connect for winning two 2016 MarCom Awards in the print media category, a gold award for a government magazine and an honorable mention for magazine writing. It's sponsored by myself, Mike Finnerty, on the 22nd day of November, 2016.

And Andrea, would you like to say a few words?

MS. IGLAR: Thank you, Councilman Finnerty. We appreciate your recognition. We are very pleased to be recognized because this is the first year that we've had our magazine. We just launched this year, and it's been a wonderful addition to the growing community of South Fayette Township. The residents have embraced it, as have

the businesses. And it's been a wonderful way for the community members to connect with each other. And we definitely want to thank our Board of Commissioners and our residents and businesses for their support in this. Thank you very much.

(Applause.)

MR. FINNERTY: We do have a Commissioner with us, Gwen Rodi. Do you want to say a few words?

MS. RODI: I just want to say thank you to Andrea for all of her hard work.

MR. FINNERTY: Does your father want to say anything?

MR. RODI: Well, sure. I didn't expect to say anything, but I will say how proud I am of Andrea. And all the good work she's done.

(Applause.)

(Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9918-16.

MR. BARKER: A proclamation recognizing the Keystone State Wrestling Alliance for hosting the 2016 Fan Fest-Toy Drive benefiting the Allegheny County Holiday Project. Sponsored by Council Members Baker, DeFazio, Martoni and Palmiere.

I should note that the remainder of these will be read into the record.

9919-16. Certificates of Recognition awarded to the 2016 Marcella McGrogan Carnegie Volunteer Awardees. Sponsored by Council Member Finnerty.

9920-16. Proclamation congratulating Podmilsak's Market upon the occasion of its 70th anniversary. Sponsored by Council Member Futules.

And 9921-16, a proclamation congratulating St. Clair Country Club upon the occasion of its 100th birthday. Sponsored by Council Member Means.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We have Public Comment. Helen Gerhardt.

MS. GERHARDT: I am Helen Gerhardt. I live at 1341 Shady Avenue in the City of Pittsburgh.

I'm here to address agenda items --- I'm sorry, 9923-16 and 9924-16, resolutions which provide for Local Economic Revitalization Tax Assistance Act programs for property located in Ward 7 in Shadyside and Ward 8 in East Liberty neighborhood, both very hot markets. LERTA is designed to simulate development to coal markets where there's a problem. And so I'm going to speak from

underneath several hats. I'm not speaking for any organization officially, but from my experience and responsibilities. So I work at Just Harvest and we have --- we address hunger issues, so we see the massive displacement away from sources of nutritious food. I am a member of Pittsburghers for Public Transit. We see people being pushed away from sources of the public transit that gets them to all their basic needs.

I am a Commissioner with the Pittsburgh Commission on Human Relations, on the Housing Committee, and on the Steering Committee of the Affirmatively Furthering Fair Housing task force.

So I would remind Council that this is basically welfare for developers. This kind of application of LERTA in a hot market is counter to its justification when there is an --- such an incredible shortage of affordable housing in this --- in Pittsburgh. We, as officials who have responsibilities, as part of our duties of government, it is our legal obligation to affirmatively further fair housing. The lack of affordable housing has disparate impact on black members of our communities, on low income members of our communities, on those with disabilities. So I ask you to remember your responsibilities as you look at where such tax breaks are given. At this point, our duty is to make sure that there is adequate housing in this city for all, especially for long-term residents who have networks of --- the social networks that allow for prosperity and for the overall health of our communities.

So thank you. Please consider carefully.
Thanks very much.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Alethea Sims.

MS. SIMS: Hi. Correct pronunciation, Alethea.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Alethea (changes pronunciation).

MS. SIMS: Okay. Long-time member of Coalition of Organized Residents of East Liberty, 33-year resident of East Liberty, the last person out of East Mall High rise. I've seen a lot of changes come into East Liberty. And as COR has often said, change is good. Change is wonderful. It's beautiful what's happening. But what I have a hard time explaining to the residents that I represent is why there's --- and I apologize for over-simplifying, but I don't speak legal --- why there is money coming into the community from the government to

improve the community that we call home, and it doesn't help us in the least. They're beautiful apartments that no one can afford that I know of.

So if there's even more money coming in, I would ask the --- okay, I've always called you guys the suits, sorry if it offends, but I would ask the suits to remember the people who stayed there during the hard times, during the bad times, dealing with the negative stereotypes which were many times unfounded. I don't think I'm a criminal kind of person.

Anyway, let some of this redevelopment, let some of this revitalization help us that need the transportation, that need to be close to the transportation, that need to be close to the stores that don't have cars and all the other good things. I don't think I'll need the other minute. You get my drift; right? Okay. Thanks.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. 9922-16.

MR. BARKER: Motion to approve the minutes of the October 18th, 2016 regular meeting of Council.

MR. MACEY: So moved.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Is there a second?

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye?

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it. Presentation of Appointments, 9909-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of Maureen Quinn to serve as a member of the Inaugural Board of the Tri-COG Land Bank for a term to expire on December 31st, 2018. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into the Appointment Review Committee. 9910-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the reappointment of M. Gayle Moss to serve as a member of the Minority Business Enterprise Advisory Committee for a term to expire on December 31st, 2019. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into the Appointment Review Committee. 9911-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the reappointment of James Overton to serve as a member of the Minority Business Enterprise Advisory Committee for a term to expire on December 31st, 2016. Sponsored ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into Appointment Review Committee. 9912-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the reappointment of Roxanne N. Sewell to serve as a member of the Minority Business Enterprise Advisory Committee for a term to expire on December 31st, 2019. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into the Appointment Review Committee. 9913-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the reappointment of Tim Stevens to serve as a member of the Minority Business Enterprise Advisory Committee for a term to expire on December 31st, 2018. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into Appointment Review Committee. Committee on Appointment Review, Second Reading. 9856-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the reappointment of Sally Cimini to serve as a member of the Personnel Board for a term to expire on December 31st, 2018. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Kress.

MR. KRESS: Thank you, Mr. President. On November 15th, 2016, the Committee on Appointment Review met with the Appointee, and at that time they made an affirmative recommendation for reappointment. At this time I'd like to make a motion.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye?

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it. 9904-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of Jesse A. Torisky, Esquire, to serve as a member of the Accountability, Conduct and Ethics Commission for a term to begin January 11th, 2017 and expire on January 11th, 2022. Sponsored by Council Member Baker.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Kress.

MR. KRESS: Thank you, Mr. President. On November 15th, 2016, the Committee on Appointment Review met with Jesse A. Torisky for his appointment to the Accountability, Conduct and Ethics Commission. And at that time we made an affirmative recommendation. However, since Councilman Baker was the sponsor, I'd like him to say a couple of comments.

MR. BAKER: Okay. Thanks, Mr. Kress. Yeah. I was happy to --- Mr. Torisky's name forward. He has a good legal background and also a good nonprofit background by running a nonprofit now related to autism. So we were very impressed by Mr. Torisky. He actually cut his vacation short to make sure that he was there for the meeting and it seems like he'll be very dedicated to the ACE Commission. So happy to put his name forward.

MR. KRESS: Thank you, very much, Councilman Baker. And I'd like to make a motion to approve.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in ---.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Wait, I have a question.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead. I'm sorry.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Mr. President, am I able to ask whether this vote was an unanimous vote by the Recommendation Committee?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah, you could.

MR. KRESS: It was a unanimous recommendation.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Thank you. Appreciate it.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Seeing no more comments, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.
9905-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of William F. Ward, Esquire, former Judge of the Allegheny County Court of Common Pleas, to serve as a member of the Accountability, Conduct and Ethics Commission for a term to expire on December 3rd, 2017. Sponsored by Council Member Baker.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Does someone want to make a motion?

MR. KRESS: Well, no, I have to ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Oh, I'm sorry. I'm sorry. Go ahead, Mr. Kress.

MR. KRESS: Thank you, Mr. President. On November 15th, 2016, the Appointment Review Committee met with William F. Ward, who is a former Judge of Allegheny County. And at that time we made an affirmative recommendation to place him on the Accountability, Conduct and Ethics Commission. And since again, this was Councilman's Baker's recommendation, I'd like Mr. Baker to speak on his behalf.

MR. BAKER: Thanks, Councilman Kress. Yeah, I mean, when we were collaborating on who could be an amazing fit to the ACE Commission, I think Judge Ward was the top, the top idea. And we weren't sure if he would be interested and he was. And he's got three plus decades of service to our community through the legal community. And also with a lot of boards, the Pennsylvania Commission for Crime and Delinquency. He's involved with us as well at Big Brothers, Big Sisters. He was a former Chief of Staff to the Governor. Just a guy that does, a person that does a lot of amazing things inside and outside of work. So we're very honored to nominate Judge Bill Ward.

MR. KRESS: Thank you, Councilman Baker. And I'd just like to say, too, it was unanimous in our committee vote.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Thanks.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Want to make a motion?

MR. KRESS: And I'd like to make a motion to approve.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.
9902-16.

MR. BARKER: Resolution of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, adopting the Grants Budget, Special Accounts Budget and Agency Fund Budget, by setting forth appropriations to pay said expenses during the fiscal year beginning January 1st, 2017 and ending December 31st, 2017. Sponsored by Council Members Finnerty, DeMarco, Macey, Martoni, Means and Palmiere.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you. This was released by the Committee with an affirmative recommendation. And the Grants, Budget, Special Accounts and Agency Fund Budget, if I could give you the numbers, the Grants Budget itself is \$109,796,000, the Special Accounts Budget is \$111,714,000, and the Agency Fund balance is \$4 million. So if you take that together, it's quite a --- quite a big number. And that is what we are moving tonight. So I make a motion that we approve this.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, before you take the roll, I thought I would put my name --- put my name on it. I thought it was. Okay. With that, we'll take a roll call vote.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Baker?
MR. BAKER: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?
MR. DEMARCO: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Ellenbogen?
MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Finnerty?
MR. FINNERTY: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Futules?
MR. FUTULES: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Kirk?

(No Response.)

MR. BARKER: Mr. Klein?
MR. KLEIN: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Kress?
MR. KRESS: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Martoni?
DR. MARTONI: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Means?
MS. MEANS: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Ranalli-Russell?
MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?
MR. WALTON: Yes.
MR. BARKER: President DeFazio?
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ayes, 14; noes 0 with one member absent. The bill passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9868-16.

MR. BARKER: An Ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, authorizing an increase in the expense allowance for members of Allegheny County Council as provided by Article III, Section 7 (e) of the Home Rule Charter of Allegheny County. Sponsored by Council Member Finnerty.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you. This has to do with increasing our expense account allowance. It's an adjustment that hasn't been made since 2000 in regard to this. And it will not go into effect 'til 2020. That means everybody up here will have to stand for election before they get this raise. The amount right now is \$3,000. And in 2020, the amount will be \$3,646.52. So that's what I'm proposing.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under ---.

MR. FINNERTY: And I ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead. Sorry.

MR. FINNERTY: You're the chairman. Do you want me to make the motion?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah, I thought ---.

MR. FINNERTY: I'll make a motion to approve.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Now, under remarks? Seeing no one ---. Oh, sorry. Go ahead.

MR. FUTULES: I have a ---. I was just waiting for somebody else to raise their hand first. Thank you, Mr. President. I think it's --- when we increase our pays and salaries sometimes, in my opinion, it could end up costing you more money. I have a piece in front of me here. It's difficult to see, but I'm going to show it to the Council members first. This is a picture of a hand into a cookie jar. This is --- someone has his hand in the County's cookie jar. And on the back, it says, he went to hotel rooms, movies, drives to and from the courthouse, lunch at the Carlton, private game stadium box, Christmas parties, restaurant openings, political fundraisers. This was something in somebody's expense account that wasn't illegal, but it made it look like it was.

When you're in a political circle, your opponent will do just anything to make you look like you're stealing money as an elected official. I don't even believe in the \$3,000, even though I do use some of it, quite frankly. I guess I'm a hypocrite about that. I always thought it should just be part of your pay. I always thought we should get maybe \$12,000 a year and say, okay, anything you do on your own. Why should you get paid to go to work? Why should you get paid to go restaurants? Why should you get paid to go into the community and visit your constituents? We have to love this job. So ---

MR. ELLENBOGEN: John.

MR. FUTULES: --- I'm more worried about the political fallout from this than I am receiving \$600. It could end up costing you as much as \$8,000 to \$10,000 to react to something like this when you're up for re-election. And that's just my opinion. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Macey.

MR. MACEY: Thank you, Mr. President, members of Council and residents of Allegheny County. Since 2000, and we're now in 2016, inflation has increased by 33 percent. And you all know that the gasoline prices have increased. And that we, as elected officials, are part-time employees. However, we experience full-time responsibilities. Now, nobody knows what we do every day, but let me share with you some of the things that we do. We attend various events. They may be Christmas, Halloween, Easter and a variety of different programs that go on within our communities. And keep in mind, I'm just going to speak for myself. I have 14 communities I serve, so it's a little difficult to be to all of those. And you have to think about gasoline, wear and tear. Now, you may say, well, you asked for this job. I did ask for the job and I'm going to do my job. But at the same time, I don't think it said in my guidelines or in the County Code that I'm supposed to lose money.

So all I am saying, that we're trying to be fair here and trying to increase our expenses. And I think that, you know, there again, people don't understand. People in the community and all the organizations, whether it's baseball, girls' softball, whether it's the high school that needs money for programs that aren't covered under your school taxes. We donate. And some of that may come out of our expense money from our campaign money. But at the same time, we're trying to do our best to accommodate those organizations in our community and provide those donations that we can barely afford to pay.

So all we're asking is to make this fair. If you go across the board and you talk to anybody, whether it's a union or whether it's any other --- here in the County people are getting two and three percent increases. But we, as a County Council, have not. We're not asking and our hands certainly aren't in the cookie jar. We're not getting anything special. We may get invited to different events, but keep in mind, many of those events are asking for a fee to go to those events.

So let's keep this practical. Let's keep this, you know, on top of the table that all we're asking for is our fair share of getting reimbursed for those things that we do to help others. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any other ---?
Representative Ellenbogen.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: You know, in the last ten years I've sat on this Council, I've never been one to mince words. I think that Councilman Finnerty is just trying to recognize the hard work that's done. Now, in my own district, I have two entire city council districts with both councilmen who receive a full-time salary and also have staff members who make more than we do, not to mention the half a dozen or so boroughs and townships that I represent also. My district is three times bigger than any city council district.

If you don't feel that you don't deserve a full-time salary, then you're really not doing your job. That being said, I'm not --- and like I said, I'm not one to mince words, but I'm not going to put myself out there for ridicule for \$2,000 that's not going to take place for another four years. And that's how I feel about it.

Do I think we deserve a substantial amount of money for what we do? Yes. Because we have to deal with a 900 plus million dollar budget which is probably \$400 million more than the City has to deal with, and yet they have full-time everything. So ---.

MR. FINNERTY: \$1.9 billion.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I beg your pardon?

MR. FINNERTY: \$1.9 billion.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: \$1.9 billion. I stand corrected by the Budget Chairman. So that being said, you know, I'm not putting myself out there for --- to me, this is basically, just --- you know, I know that the Budget Chair did the best he could with this, but it's just --- you know, it's just not worth it. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Futules.

MR. FUTULES: I have concerns. I see Mr. Finnerty is the primary sponsor, but I don't see any co-sponsors. And I'm not sure --- we have a lot of newly elected officials here. But maybe --- this isn't time sensitive. We've got four years. We could talk about this next month. We could talk about it two months from now and continue the conversation with Council members because I haven't heard from enough people up here to get

a consensus as to how they really feel. I've heard from Jim and Bob, and of course, Mike. And it might be a good idea to send it back to committee to discuss it with other Council members because there were only four of us at the committee meeting. And it left with a neutral recommendation as it was. And this is pretty important for us, you know. But maybe we should consider sending it back to committee. I'm not making that motion, but I'm thinking about a consideration, if anybody else does. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: I think you're going to find out how people feel about it because they're going to vote on it.

MR. FUTULES: Well, that's true.

MR. FINNERTY: They don't have to say anything. They will vote.

MR. FUTULES: That's true.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any other remarks?

MR. KRESS: I just want to make sure. Just for clarification, we're raising our expenses how much so that people understand what we're voting on? Because I think ---.

MR. FINNERTY: Six ---.

MR. KRESS: Yeah, but I mean, I think there was some confusion. I thought I heard \$2,000.

MR. FINNERTY: \$646.52.

MR. KRESS: Okay.

MR. FINNERTY: And it'll take effect 2020, January 1st.

MR. KRESS: That's all I wanted to know. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Seeing no more remarks, will you take the roll?

MR. BARKER: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: No.

MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: No.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: No.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: No.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Kirk?

(No response.)

MR. BARKER: Mr. Klein?
MR. KLEIN: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Kress?
MR. KRESS: No.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Martoni?
DR. MARTONI: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Means?
MS. MEANS: No.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Ranalli-Russell?
MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?
MR. WALTON: Yes.
MR. BARKER: President DeFazio?
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ayes, 8; noes 6 with one member

absent. The motion passes.

MR. FUTULES: There it is.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

MR. FINNERTY: What did you expect?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9869-16.

MR. BARKER: An Ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, authorizing an increase in the per meeting stipend for members of Allegheny County Council as provided by Article III, Section 7(a) of the Home Rule Charter of Allegheny County. Sponsored by Council Member Finnerty.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you, again. By the way, I forgot to mention, all this is ---. Excuse me?

MR. FUTULES: I'm sorry.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All right. Come on.

MR. FUTULES: I'll go to you.

MR. FINNERTY: All these are recommendations for the Government Reform Committee that we're doing here. And this again is --- this is our stipend. It's an adjustment of our stipend. At the present time, we make \$9,000 a year. That's our stipend. It's per meeting. And in the last, I guess, two, three four meetings, we don't even get a stipend because it's used. It's finished. All the committee meetings we have --- and I'm

chairman of Budget and Finance. And we have a --- Budget and Finance meeting about every week are --- all committee meetings that take place. So there is many things that go on. But I don't want to get into that. We're talking about something that hasn't been changed since the year 2000. A lot of things have changed since the year 2000. And we're talking about an increase which will happen in 2020. That will be 20 years from the year 2000. And the increase is going to be to \$10,936.55. That's five percent every five years. And that's what our --- that's what I'm proposing as an increase. So that's all I have to say. I make a motion that we approve.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Someone want to ---?

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Second. Under remarks?
Seeing ---. Oh, you have a remark.

MR. FUTULES: Yeah, kind of.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Futules.

MR. FUTULES: Yeah. I don't want to push it, but I'm pretty much on the same page. When you --- I said this in the committee meeting. When you run for office, the propaganda, you all saw the last presidential election. Nobody even talked about the issues any more. It was what I can tax somebody for. And quite frankly, it's possible your next election, somebody is going to put a big mailer out like that, and it's going to say, Mr. So and So or Mrs. So and So voted for a pay raise. Even though we deserve one, I agree with that. I can't disagree with that. We don't get that much money. But when it comes to the political fallout, it could end up costing you more money in the long run. That's all. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any other ---?
Representative DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: I would just like to thank Councilman Finnerty for bringing this to the table here. We've spoken. We know that we appointed a Government Reform Commission, or Council did last year, along with the Chief Executive. The first Government Reform Commission that would have been appointed, their recommendations, I don't believe, have been acted on. The second Government Reform Commission that submitted their recommendations has been requesting --- you know, when are we going to bring this up, and when are we going to take a look at these things? And I think that it's important

that we bring their recommendations to the full Council for a vote if we hope to get the quality of people to serve on the Government Reform Commission in the future, spent a year in studying this, in talking to the County Executive, talking to Council members, talking to the public and coming up with recommendations.

So I sincerely appreciate everything that Councilman Finnerty has done. I also recognize what a tough vote that this is for many of the Council members. As Chairman Finnerty had said, this doesn't go into effect until 2020. It's not actually a vote to give yourself a raise, but it's a vote to provide an increase in funds for future Council members.

But I look at the press article, the Tribune Review, from the very next day after this was introduced. Do they accurately portray it? No. They say Allegheny County Council to weigh pay raise for itself. So here's something that's clearly defined, but it's not portrayed properly out there.

And last, I also want to leave you with something. I've been around talking to a number of the folks that were involved in setting up the Home Rule Charter here. And they talked, and when I spoke to them they said the reason why they made County Council a part-time position is they wanted to be able to attract quality people with unique skill sets from around the County that they couldn't afford if they were just paying full-time Council members. So they wanted to make it a part-time position and attract us. But at the same time they said, it shouldn't cost the members money as well. And I know Council Member DeFazio, being an At-Large member yourself, you probably get even more invitations than I do to attend events and go to different things. And there's costs associated with it.

So I recognize how difficult it is for anyone to take a vote on this, but I just wanted to share that with the Council. Thank you, Mr. President.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any --- Representative Macey?

MR. MACEY: Thank you, Mr. President and members of Council and residents of Allegheny County. As Sam DeMarco eloquently put it, together we had nine people on our Government Review Commission. Now, these people were highly selected people, people of stature, people of education and many of them were lawyers. And keep in

mind, they didn't take this lightly either. And I think it's important that we, as a Council, recognize their recommendations. And in this recommendation, they said that we are deserving of some increase in our stipend. Keep in mind, our stipend is \$9,000. If you take and look at the inflation rate over those years, 33 percent, that would be \$11,970. As Councilman Finnerty has put together a program and looked at it, he's only recommending \$10,939. So we're not even keeping up with inflation. All we're trying to do is maintain a responsible and respectable salary or stipend as we get, to keep being able to support our position and also work within our communities.

And as Councilman DeMarco said, we're not here to lose money, all we're trying to do is our job. We're trying to do it in the best possible way we can. We're here to help others. It's not about football games, because I don't know, I can't remember the last time I was at a football game. We don't get tickets. People think that we get all these perks. We don't. That's a misnomer. And I have neighbors saying, well, you can get baseball tickets. You can --- that's not the way it works. We're here to do a job. We represent 96,000 people on average. And that's difficult when you think about it.

Our state representatives, on average, represent 64,000 people. They get a \$150 a day stipend. I'm not taking that away from them. I'm just trying to give you an example of what others have and what we don't. We're here because we have a love for our communities and for our districts. And we're here to help others. And I don't --- and I believe that's the case for everybody here. And I don't want to, you know, discredit us by saying we're money grabbers. We're not. We're just trying to keep up with inflation. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any other remarks? Seeing none, will you take the roll?

MR. BARKER:	Mr. Baker?
MR. BAKER:	No.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. DeMarco?
MR. DEMARCO:	No.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. Ellenbogen?
MR. ELLENBOGEN:	No.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. Finnerty?
MR. FINNERTY:	Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Futules?
MR. FUTULES: No.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Kirk?
(No Response.)
MR. BARKER: Mr. Klein?
MR. KLEIN: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Kress?
MR. KRESS: No.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Martoni?
DR. MARTONI: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Means?
MS. MEANS: No.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Ranalli-Russell?
MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?
MR. WALTON: Yes.
MR. BARKER: President DeFazio?
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ayes, 8; noes 6 with one member absent. The bill passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9898-16.

MR. BARKER: An Ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, amending the County's Administrative Code to increase the annual salary of the Allegheny County Chief Executive effective January 1st, 2020, and to provide for an annual revision of the Chief Executive's salary in succeeding years based upon certain criteria as authorized by Article III, Section 7(d) of the Home Rule Charter of Allegheny County. Sponsored by Council Member Finnerty.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you. Again, this was recommended by the Government Review Commission. And the Chief Executive should be making --- and what it says in the Charter is 68 percent of the Governor of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania. Our Chief Executive has not had a raise since the year 2000, either. So if you would just take that and in 2016, the Chief Executive makes \$90,000 and has since 2000. And you take 68 percent of what the Governor makes, and you'll come up with he should be making \$129,760 in 2016. Our Chief Executive makes

less than the row officers, \$10,000 to \$15,000 less. It's a shame. It's ridiculous that the Chief Executive of Allegheny County which has a \$1.9 billion budget, and has all other kinds of responsibilities, is only making that much.

So we're not talking about giving him a raise at the moment. We're talking about doing it in 2020, which he would have to stand for election. And the amount would be more than \$129,000 then because the Governor's salary will go up in those four years by whatever the cost of living, I believe, is. So it could possibly be \$135,000. We're not sure. But it is in the Charter, 68 percent of the Governor's salary. And that's what we're recommending.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Futules?

MR. FUTULES: On this particular issue, this is not our money. This is the Chief Executive asking. He supported this. So it really has nothing to do with us. And to support him for this position and this raise, I would support that.

MR. FINNERTY: It has everything to do with us.

MR. FUTULES: Well, yeah. We're going to vote on it, but what I'm trying to get at, it's not our raise. It's his.

MR. FINNERTY: It's our budget.

MR. FUTULES: Well, ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: One at a time. Let me start. Go back. Did someone second?

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Now, under remarks.

MR. FINNERTY: I didn't even make the motion.

MR. MACEY: That's all right.

MR. FINNERTY: I'll make the motion to approve.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: He makes a motion. Seconded by Representative Macey. Nick has the floor. And then I'll come down to you.

MR. FUTULES: And I won't repeat myself. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Again, this is a Government Reform Commission recommendation. And they took and they looked and examined this. And I think that when you look at this, only raising this to a \$129,000, I think it's the minimum we should be looking at. Because if you look in

totality the duties of the Chief Executive here, we're talking about today, a \$1.9 billion budget. By 2020, it will probably be a \$2.1, \$2.2 billion budget. Split that in half, you're looking at less than \$65,000 per billion dollar enterprise. I challenge you to find anybody out in the private sector or even in the nonprofit sector where they're taking in this kind of revenue and they're only getting paid \$90,000.

And I think we need to look at this and say, do we want to the best or the brightest people that are willing to serve? Do we want executives of corporations or companies or unions or whatever it may be, people with experience running large enterprises to consider running for office in the County? I think that answer is yes. And if we don't take and allow compensation to keep track or to keep up with this, we run the risk of setting it so that only wealthy people can afford to run. And then we no longer have a government by the people, for the people. So I am fully in support of raising this recommendation.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Did you --- Representative Macey?

MR. MACEY: Thank you, Mr. President and members of Council. It's been said by many in the political world that the Chief Executive of Allegheny County is the third most powerful person in Allegheny County.

DR. MARTONI: In the state.

MR. MACEY: In the state. I'm sorry. In the state. Let's keep that in mind when we're compensating someone because he has brought a lot of money and he's brought a lot of businesses. And hopefully he'll bring more people to our region. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any other comments? Oh, wait, we got a couple. Representative Futules and then I'll go down to you.

MR. FUTULES: I want to clarify what I said. I think I used someone's specific name. I'm not sure, but the raise is for the office of the Chief Executive, not any one individual. Not necessarily will somebody be there the next time somebody's running for that office --- the same person today. So the raise we're giving is just like we did for the Controllers and the Sheriff, and ---. it's for the office itself, not the person in the office. I want to clarify that. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I've listened to the arguments here, but the relevant argument here is the Chief Executive in this form of government does the work of three commissioners which would have cost at least double what the commissioners made plus their full staffs.

Number two, the Chief Executive is a 24 hour a day job. Whether there's an emergency or anything happens, he's held accountable through the County Manager. He directs a workforce of I don't even know how many including the Authorities.

MR. FINNERTY: At least 4,000.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: At least 4,000, not to mention there are Authorities and things that are relevant to him. The reason that he should receive it is what Councilman DeMarco said. In terms of getting the best and brightest people is --- the responsibility that's involved here and the time that is consumed here. This is not a 9:00 to 5:00 job. The current Chief Executive is --- he's --- I don't think he's ever been home in the last eight years. But that's what's relevant here, the work that is involved here. I'm surprised he hasn't killed the County Manager, just the things he makes him do. Thank you.

MR. WALTON: On the motion, Mr. President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Pardon me?

MR. WALTON: On the motion.

MR. FINNERTY: I just want to say one thing.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MR. FINNERTY: In relation to this, we are the last standing, I guess, group that does the budget. So this does very much concern us.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Did you make the motion?

MR. FINNERTY: I made the motion. It was seconded.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. No more remarks. Let's take the roll.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: No.

MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Kirk?
(No response.)
MR. BARKER: Mr. Klein?
MR. KLEIN: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Kress?
MR. KRESS: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Martoni?
DR. MARTONI: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Means?
MS. MEANS: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Ranalli-Russell?
MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?
MR. WALTON: Yes.
MR. BARKER: President DeFazio?
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ayes, 13; noes 1 with one member
absent. The bill passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Liaison Reports.

MR. PALMIERE: Mr. President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes. Yeah. Go ahead,
Representative Palmiere.

MR. PALMIERE: Thank you, Mr. President. I
just wanted to ---

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MR. PALMIERE: --- inform my colleagues that
this past Saturday night we had been on the --- been
appointed to the Board of Trustees of CCAC, and on
Saturday night we had our --- the combination of the whole
year, our 50th anniversary gala down at the Wyndham, which
was the former Hilton. And I just wanted to report to
everyone that it was an absolutely first class event, and
so well handled and so well accepted by the people there.
I think it was around 600 people. And it's the first time
I was in a tuxedo in a long time, and it was ---. And I
just wanted --- and of course, ---.

MR. FINNERTY: It's a shame it's a ---.

MR. PALMIERE: Hey, guys, I don't talk when
you're talking.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah, right. Okay. You bring up a good point. We should all wait 'til someone is finished.

MR. PALMIERE: I just --- Mr. President, thank you. I just wanted to, again, comment that it was just a first class affair. And I want to also mention to the people in Allegheny County that CCAC is the best bargain in the family budget. If you have children that are aspiring to go to college, and they're in doubt what they want to do, they can go --- they can come to the community college for the first two years and make up their minds and see what they really like, and what they want --- you know, what they want to do with their lives. And do it at a heck of a lot less money and a lot less expense to your parents and the grandparents and everyone else that supports the children going to school. It's just a wonderful way for the children to receive a top notch education and not burden your parents or grandparents with a big, large bill or yourselves for that matter.

So I just wanted to say that, Mr. President. I thank you very much.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Walton.

MR. WALTON: Thank you, Mr. President. I want to make three quick comments.

First, I want to laud or congratulate the County Executive and the Mayor of the City of Pittsburgh for their commitment to support an initiative by President Obama to sign a pledge to hire individuals who have been previously incarcerated and giving them a second chance which is so important in our community and every community. That people oftentimes make mistakes in their lives. And they should not be held or put into a situation where they can't rehabilitate themselves, where they can't recover and sustain --- and have a family sustaining career. I know of several instances where the County Executive has made a commitment that I'm aware of to hire individuals who have been previously incarcerated.

Secondly, I want to celebrate or congratulate the Workforce Investment Board for hosting an expungement day on November 14th and giving an opportunity for individuals who have been previously incarcerated to have their records sealed, which is an important tool in the whole effort to rehabilitate people and to put people back into taxpaying kind of positions in their lives, which is really important.

The third thing I'd like to say is I'd like to congratulate the Pittsburgh A. Philip Randolph Institute and its workforce development program on securing a substantial grant from the Pittsburgh Department of Labor and Industry to receive funding to identify, recruit and train individuals to go into family-sustaining careers, union jobs in the building and construction trades and in the manufacturing sector.

So we have a lot of opportunity that is in front of us here in Allegheny, Beaver, Westmoreland and Washington Counties. And we have to train individuals to take advantage of those occupations so that we can raise greater tax dollars, increase per capita income, increase home ownership, and as a result, truly improve public safety in western Pa. And I want to congratulate all these organizations and individuals. Thank you, sir.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any other --- Representative Sue Means.

MS. MEANS: Thank you for recognizing me, President DeFazio. I just wanted to thank all the hardworking members of the Allegheny County that worked so hard, all the employees. And I want to --- I'm just so thankful for them. And I want to wish everyone in Allegheny County a very happy Thanksgiving.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Okay. Let's start with Representative Baker and work our way up.

MR. BAKER: Thanks, Mr. President. I know Councilman DeMarco mentioned this event at the last Council meeting. But we did have the Allegheny 9, the second part of this series. The County Executive kicked off the race. Councilman DeMarco, Councilman Finnerty and I were there. It was a great race. It was a 6.2. I promised my wife that it was a 5K race. It turned out to be a 6.2K trail run which was a world of difference. But it was a very fun morning. It was really cold, but just a great chance for hundreds of people in our County to get together. The Allegheny 9 does continue. The next one will be in North Park in February which will be cold again, but it's a great way to keep our County healthy, to keep people out there, and most importantly, to get them in the parks, to get them just enjoying the parks and enjoying that shared time together.

So I want to congratulate the County Executive, Andy Baechle, everyone involved with --- and I should say the Parks Foundation --- everyone involved with making it

a big success. And I want to thank Councilman Finnerty and DeMarco for being there as well. And next time I want to see them running. You in? Councilman Palmiere should be in for the next one.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Councilman Baker sort of stole my thunder there because that's what I was going to talk about. But you know, you've heard the saying that with age comes wisdom. And that race was certainly the definition of that, because Councilman Finnerty, myself and the Chief Executive, we saw the race off and then we did what we should do at our age and left. And Councilman Baker was stuck running those trails with his wife, but hey, it was a great event. They had over 100 runners there. We had the Montour High School band there, were doing --- were playing for the folks for entertainment. It was a great event. I look forward to more of them. But no running trails.

MR. FINNERTY: Did you let your wife beat you?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any other ---?

MR. FINNERTY: Yeah.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah, Representative Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: First of all, who won, you or your wife?

MR. BAKER: Always my wife in these races. It used to be ---.

MR. FINNERTY: Just wanted to make sure about that. These are different things that are going on in some of our communities. Scott Township will have a tree lighting, and it will be in the Scott Township Amphitheater which is at the top of the park.

Carnegie is also having a lighting celebrating. It's 6:00 p.m. December 2nd. Collier will also have a lighting celebration and theirs is December the 2nd at 6:00 p.m. And Andrew Carnegie Free Library --- I don't know if you've ever been there. It's quite a --- quite a building. They're having a tree decoration party and it's at 6:00 p.m. and it's November the 28th. So it's pretty close. It's well worth going to see.

And these two events go on in Carnegie every year. This is at Peter and Paul Ukrainian Orthodox Church. They have a cookie walk. And it's from --- it's from 10:00 a.m. to 2:00 p.m. and it's December the 10th. And these churches are both together and they both have

--- one has a blue, like Russian, and one is gold and that
--- those globes on top.

The other is the Russian Orthodox Church and they're right next to each other. And on that day also the Russian Orthodox Church has their Russian food festival. And it's goes from 10:00 to 4:00 p.m. on December 10th. So if you're in any --- if you want to experience something, come to Carnegie on the 10th and go to these two places. They're --- it's amazing. Thank you. And happy Thanksgiving to everyone. What, those turkeys?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any other remarks?
Representative Macey?

MR. MACEY: Thank you, Mr. President and members of Council. Just to reiterate a little bit about community college. We're blessed to have a president of Boyce Campus and we also have a person who is --- John is on the Board. But keep in mind that not only do we have curriculum opportunities in CCAC, we also have the opportunity of learning trades. And it's been my experience --- and I think the record will show that 65 percent of the people in the trades are making more money than their college counterparts.

So listen, if you're interested in electronics, if you're interested in welding, auto mechanics, whatever, there's an opportunity for you to go to school. And as was stated before, it's very affordable. And you reach a milestone in creating an opportunity to yourself in the trades. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Seeing no more, Liaison Reports. Let's go down to 9923-16.

MR. BARKER: A resolution of the Council of Allegheny County, Pennsylvania, made pursuant to the Local Economic Revitalization Tax Assistance Act, LERTA, Pa. Stat. Ann. tit. 72 Section 4722 et. seq, (1995), as amended, providing for: a program of temporary exemption from increases in Allegheny County Real Property taxes, for specified time periods, resulting from improvements made by an owner of property located within the Seventh Ward of the City of Pittsburgh, County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, generally known as the Shadyside neighborhood, previously determined to be a deteriorated area; establishing a schedule for exempting increases in Allegheny County property taxes resulting from such improvements; and prescribing the requirements

and procedures by which an owner of property located within the deteriorated area can secure the temporary exemption resulting from such improvements. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Walton, do you want to put in your committee? Yeah, let's go to Economic Development. Okay. 9924-16.

MR. BARKER: A resolution of the Council of Allegheny County, Pennsylvania, made pursuant to the Local Economic Revitalization Tax Assistance Act, LERTA, Pa. Stat. Ann. tit. 72, Section 4722 et. seq. (1995), as amended, providing for: a program of temporary exemption from increases in Allegheny County real property taxes, for specified time periods, resulting from improvements made by an owner of property located within the Eighth Ward of the City of Pittsburgh, County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, generally known as the East Liberty neighborhood, previously determined to be a deteriorated area; establishing a schedule for exempting increases in Allegheny County property taxes resulting from such improvements; and prescribing the requirements and procedures by which an owner of property located within the deteriorated area can secure the temporary exemption resulting from such improvements. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into Economic Development Committee. 9925-16.

MR. BARKER: A resolution of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, adopting an Operating Budget pursuant to Article IV, Section 2 and Article VII, Section 4, of the Home Rule Charter, by setting forth appropriations to pay the expenses of conducting the public business of Allegheny County and for meeting debt charges for the fiscal year beginning January 1st, 2017 and ending December 31st, 2017. Sponsored by Council Member Finnerty.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into Budget and Finance Committee. 9926-16.

MR. BARKER: A resolution of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, adopting a Capital Budget pursuant to Article IV, Section 2, and Article VII, Section 4, of the Home Rule Charter by setting forth appropriations to pay the expenses for capital expenditures during the fiscal year beginning

January 1st, 2017 and ending December 31st, 2017.
Sponsored by Council Member Finnerty.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into Budget and Finance.

MR. FINNERTY: Mr. President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. FINNERTY: Can I make a brief statement? That meeting will be November the 30th, Budget and Finance meeting, at 4:00 o'clock.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Down to 9927-16.

MR. BARKER: A motion of the Council of Allegheny County repealing the findings and provisions of Bill No. 9398-16, a "Motion of the Council of Allegheny County Censuring Council Member Sue Means for conduct, specifically the introduction of a motion to approve the minutes of various committee meetings by the full Council at the December 15th, 2015 regular meeting, contrary to the Rules of Council and past practices, and which directly led to a breach of confidentiality regarding the unapproved minutes by Council staff. Sponsored by Council Member Futules.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Futules?

MR. FUTULES: I'd like this Council and Ms. Means to understand that I have nothing but good intentions here, but at this time, due to some of the language problems in the motion, I would like to withdraw this at this time.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Notification of Contracts.

MR. BARKER: We don't have any at this point.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Public Comment on General Items. Rusty Loudermilk?

MR. BARKER: He's not here.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Not here. Glenn Walsh?

MR. WALSH: Well, good evening. I'm Glenn A. Walsh, 633 Royce Avenue, Mt. Lebanon, project director of Friends of the Zeiss. From 1986 to 1991, I was Astronomical Observatory Coordinator at Pittsburgh's original Buhl Planetarium and Institute of Popular Science in Allegheny Center.

Last Saturday marked the 75th anniversary of a historic telescope operated at Pittsburgh's original Buhl Planetarium from 1941 to 1991. Called a Siderostat-type telescope, it has a unique design specifically for public use. It allows the public to remain in a heated room

while the telescope stays out in the cooler air. With a ten-inch lens upon reinstallation, it would be the largest Siderostat-type telescope in the world as two larger such telescopes have both been dismantled.

In 2002, in anticipation of reuse of Buhl Planetarium by the Children's Museum, the City issued an RFP regarding reuse of this City-owned telescope. Friends of the Zeiss responded with a proposal to use the telescope in place to benefit children visiting the Children's Museum.

The Carnegie Science Center told the City they would store the telescope until it would be installed, could be installed in a future science addition. With a legal Memorandum of Understanding, the City accepted the Science Center's proposal. Last month, the Science Center unveiled a plan to build a \$21 million building expansion and then reneged on its promise to install the historic telescope in this future addition.

Was the Science Center ever serious about installing this telescope in a building addition? Or was the Science Center's true goal to dismantle the telescope so neither Friends of the Zeiss, nor the Children's Museum could use this telescope in competition with their new 16-inch reflector telescope. Sadly, the evidence now seems clear that the Science Center's true motive was to prevent competition with their new telescope.

Now this historic telescope has no home. The telescope's previous home is now used as a board room for the Children's Museum. Had the telescope not been dismantled, there would be no major cost for its reuse, and it could have benefited children visiting the Children's Museum over the last decade. However, a major reinstallation cost means that this historic telescope will likely remain in storage indefinitely, educating no one. The Carnegie Science Center has acted improperly in this matter and should be held accountable for poor stewardship of important and historic public property.

We respectfully ask that this Council address this issue with Carnegie Museum's management. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Thank you. Michelle Hall.

MS. HALL: Hello. My name is Michelle Hall. I'm here to talk about the indoor vaping ban that's going to be proposed later on. I know it's not on the agenda

for today, but I'm not sure I'll be able to make the meeting whenever it, you know, comes on the agenda.

I am here as an owner of Diversity Vape Shop in Dormont. We have been established since 2012. We were one of the first vape shops ever in the City. And I'm proud to say that we have spurred a movement in this city. So many people we have helped stop smoking. I am also the owner of Pittsburgh Reporting Service. I'm a court reporter. I've been a court reporter since 1985. I own my court reporting agency in the City of Pittsburgh. I'm also a resident of Dormont, so I am an Allegheny County resident. I have many employees that work for me, and I am trying to state to you what a difficulty it is to have people that smoke and have to go outside to smoke. So I'm going to read my statement. Hopefully, I'll get through it in my three minutes.

My name is Michelle Hall. My husband and I own Diversity Vape Shop and the Fluid Factory in Castle Shannon. Thank you for this opportunity to address this Council. I had also e-mailed you all and I'd like to thank Councilman Kress for answering acknowledgement of my e-mail. I had a lot more that I said in my e-mail, too.

The mere fact that we are having this conversation is a testament that vaping works. We are now into the thousands of Allegheny County citizens who have chosen to make the switch from cigarettes to vaping. I would first like to address the proposed banning of those under 18 years of age in stores. We all agree that minors should not be allowed to vape. And as store owners we see many parents bring their children into shops, sometimes in strollers to purchase their vaping supplies. There's upwards, of 30 percent of our parents shopping with children, especially during the holiday season. We would propose amending the language to be unaccompanied minors. Otherwise, you may have parents leaving their children in cars or at home alone where neither is good for the child while running out to shop. If we do not allow them to bring their --- I'm never going to get through this. If we will not allow them to bring their minors into the store with them --- I'm talking small children. I'm not talking 16 year olds. I'm just saying these children are around their parents that vape. And I proposed this to Dr. Hacker, R. J. Reynolds --- I mean, R. J. Reynolds, jeez, that's tobacco --- R. J. Marino and I have met with Dr. Hacker of the Health Department. And we have proposed

to get --- to put together a guideline for vape shops, just to put together an etiquette. Rather than putting an all-out ban for the stores with children, we would just propose to put together if --- if your --- and we do this in the shop. If a child comes in, no one is blowing vapor in their face. Vapers know how to be discreet when they vape. You won't never even know they're vaping. They can do it without vaping. As an owner of Pittsburgh Reporting Service, if I would allow my employee to go outside to vape, it would take them at least 15 minutes, especially in my building with the elevators. Whereas they can in five seconds take their hit from nicotine they need.

I have a lot more to say, but ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Richard Marino. Not here. All right. How about Bill Godshall?

MR. GODSHALL: First of all, I'd like to thank you all for your public service.

Thirty (30) years ago I worked at the Allegheny County Health Department helping thousands of employers implement smoke-free policies. And I campaigned to enact Pittsburgh's 1987 Smoking Pollution Control Ordinance that banned smoking in tens of thousands of workplaces.

Since founding Smoke Free Pennsylvania in 1990, we've campaigned to ban smoking in workplaces and stop cigarette marketing to youth, including an ordinance sponsored by Mike Crossey (phonetic) 15 years ago in this County Council to reduce cigarette sales to minors. And we petitioned the County Council a decade ago to enact an ordinance banning smoking in County workplaces that was subsequently sponsored by Rich Fitzgerald and Mike Finnerty before we convinced the General Assembly to enact Pennsylvania Clear Indoor Air Act in 2008. For disclosure, neither smoke-free Pennsylvania nor I have ever received any funding from any tobacco, drug or vapor product company.

I'm here to urge you to reject the workplace vaping ban that was approved by the Allegheny County Board of Health without any discussion. According to the scientific and empirical evidence, vapor products are at least 95 percent less hazardous than cigarettes. They've helped million of smokers quit smoking. They have not created any nicotine dependence among nonsmokers and they pose no harm to nonusers. Public Health England and the

Royal College of Physicians have issued multiple reports confirming these same scientific findings during the past two years.

Since vaping emerged in 2009, the U.S. adult smoking population, the adult smoking rate, has declined from 20 percent down to 15 percent, a 25 percent decline. While teen smoking in this country has plummeted from 20 percent to below ten percent, a more than half decline. Each of the following things emit more indoor air pollution than any cigarette, but nobody is proposing banning them from workplaces. Smokers' clothes and hair, glues, paint, the carpet in this room, furniture, cooking, printers, copiers, cleaning products, dry cleaned clothes, hairsprays, perfumes, nail polish and remover, air fresheners and even a cup of coffee emits more carcinogens and toxins than any cigarette.

Many employers recognize that allowing workers to vape at their workplace has helped many smokers quit smoking, increased productivity, eliminated smoke breaks, protected vapors from secondhand smoke exposure and reduced absenteeism healthcare costs. In sharp contrast, banning vaping at workplaces and public places stigmatizes --- criminalizes and stigmatizes vapers, forces vapers to --- exposed to secondhand exposure again. It encourage vapers to switch back to smoking cigarettes, discourages smokers from switching to vaping, deceives the public to believe that vaping is as harmful as smoking and exposes youth to far more vapers and vaping outside of buildings.

Vapers and smokers have a human right to truthful health information and to use lifesaving alternatives than cigarettes. Consistently, public health officials have an ethical duty to truthfully inform the public and encourage smokers to switch to less harmful alternatives. Unfortunately, the Allegheny County Health Department and the Board of Health have refused to even acknowledge that vaping has helped even one person quit smoking. And we urge you to save the lives of vapers and smokers and not --- to allow people to make their own decisions.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Someone want to make a motion?

MR. FINNERTY: I'll move for ---.

MR. MACEY: Second. Making a motion for what?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Someone made a motion to adjourn.

MR. FINNERTY: I made --- I think we have to go to Executive ---

MR. FUTULES: Session.

MR. FINNERTY: --- Session. We were ---. We have released something from the Executive Committee with four people --- there was all six of us there, four in favor and two against.

MR. MACEY: The motion has been made to ---.

MR. FINNERTY: I think it has to be discussed.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Well, we have to recess. You can't --- I mean, you're better off ---. You're supposed to recess, though. Do we want to just recess and we'll come back?

MR. FINNERTY: Yeah, we could do that. It's up the body. I mean, you know, I'm just ---.

MR. FUTULES: Do we want to adjourn? Is that what you just said?

MR. FINNERTY: No. I didn't say that.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: If we --- the right way to do it is the recess.

MR. WALTON: There's no second, so ---. Without a second, there's no action on the motion.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. There's no action on the motion, so I'll just say we will have a recess and go into Executive Session. Okay?

MR. FINNERTY: okay.

(Meeting adjourned for executive session.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: And now, we're at the end of the meeting. If someone would like to make a motion to adjourn?

MR. WALTON: Motion to adjourn.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All those in favor, signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it. Meeting adjourned. Thank you very much.

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:33 P.M.

CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify, as the stenographic reporter, that the foregoing proceedings were taken stenographically by me, and thereafter reduced to typewriting by me or under my direction; and that this transcript is a true and accurate record to the best of my ability.

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Jed Reifer", is written over a horizontal line. The signature is fluid and extends to the right of the line.

Jed Reifer,

Court Reporter