

ALLEGHENY COUNTY COUNCIL

REGULAR MEETING

- - -

BEFORE:

Patrick Catena	-	Chair, District 4
Robert Macey	-	Vice-President, District 9
Samuel DeMarco, III	-	Council-at-Large
Bethany Hallam	-	Council-at-Large
Jack Betkowski	-	District 1
Susan Filiaggi	-	District 2
Anita Prizio	-	District 3
Tom Duerr	-	District 5
John Palmiere	-	District 6
Nicholas Futules	-	District 7
Michelle Naccarati-Chapkis	-	District 8
DeWitt Walton	-	District 10
Paul Klein	-	District 11
Robert Palmosina	-	District 12
Olivia Bennett	-	District 13

Allegheny County Courthouse
436 Grant Street
Fourth Floor Gold Room
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219

Tuesday, April 12, 2020 - 5:01 p.m.

SARGENT'S COURT REPORTING SERVICE, INC.
225 Ross Street Suite 202
Pittsburgh, PA 15219
(412) 232-3882 FAX (412) 471-8733

IN ATTENDANCE:

Jared Barker - Director of Legislative Services
Jack Cambest - Allegheny County Council Solicitor
Ken Varhola - Chief of Staff

PRESIDENT CATENA: Good evening everyone. I'd like to call this meeting of Allegheny County Council to order. Please rise for the Pledge of Allegiance.

(Pledge of Allegiance.)

PRESIDENT CATENA: Please remain standing for a moment of silence. Thank you. Please be seated. Jared, please take roll.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Bennett?

MS. BENNETT: Here.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Betkowski?

MR. BETKOWSKI: Here.

JARED BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Here.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Duerr.

MR. DUERR: Here.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Futules? Ms. Hallam? Mr.

Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Here.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Here.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis?

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: Here.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Here.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Palmosina?

MR. PALMOSINA: Here.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Prizio?

MS. PRIZIO: Here.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: Here.

JARED BARKER: President Catena?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Here.

JARED BARKER: I believe Ms. Hallam's now with us.

MS. HALLAM: Yes, I am.

JARED BARKER: Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. At this point we'll have the nomination of candidates for interim member of council for District 2. Councilman DeMarco.

MR. DEMARCO: Thank you, Mr. President. As the caucus chair for republican caucus on Allegheny County Council, I then spoke with a number of individuals in regard to the opening here left by our colleague Cindy Kirk stepping down here from her position on council to run for elected office. Upon after meeting with these

folks, I came away impressed with one particular individual, and I would like to nominate Suzanne Filiaggi to fill Cindy's remaining term here on Allegheny County Council. I'd like to make a motion that we vote.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. It's not required, but, Jared, please take the roll call.

JARED BARKER: On the nomination of Suzanne Filiaggi. Ms. Bennett?

MS. BENNETT: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Betkowski?

MR. BETKOWSKI: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Duerr.

MR. DUERR: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Futules? Ms. Hallam?

MS. HALLAM: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis?

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Palmosina?

MR. PALMOSINA: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Prizio?

MS. PRIZIO: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: Yes.

JARED BARKER: President Catena?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ayes 13, no's 0 with one member absent. The nomination is confirmed.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Congratulations. Would you like to --- we'll have the swearing in at this point. Judge.

JUDGE SPURGEON: All right. It is my honor to officiate this oath. Suzanne Filiaggi and I have been friends for nearly 25 years and former colleagues so I was humbled when she called to ask me to execute this for her

today so Suzanne please raise your right hand and swear after me.

I Suzanne Filiaggi.

SUZANNE FILIAGGI: I Suzanne Filiaggi.

JUDGE SPURGEON: Do solemnly swear.

SUZANNE FILIAGGI: Do solemnly swear.

JUDGE SPURGEON: That I will faithfully execute.

SUZANNE FILIAGGI: That I will faithfully execute.

JUDGE SPURGEON: The office of member of council of the county of Allegheny.

SUZANNE FILIAGGI: The office of member of council of the county of Allegheny.

JUDGE SPURGEON: And will to the best of my ability.

SUZANNE FILIAGGI: And will to the best of my ability.

JUDGE SPURGEON: Preserve, protect, defend and obey.

SUZANNE FILIAGGI: Preserve, protect, defend and obey.

JUDGE SPURGEON: The Constitution of the United States.

SUZANNE FILIAGGI: The Constitution of the United States.

JUDGE SPURGEON: And the constitution and laws of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania.

SUZANNE FILIAGGI: And the constitution and laws of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania.

JUDGE SPURGEON: Congratulations.

MS. FILIAGGI: Thank you. Thank you, Judge David Spurgeon. I am blessed to have such an esteemed jurist and treasured friend to swear me in today. David and I and probably some other people in this room remember Judge Dower who was the president judge of Allegheny County and his office, his chambers was on the third floor and every time we would go in front of his bench to argue a case he had a big huge plaque that said blessed are the brief so here goes.

Members of council and staff, the county executive and staff and citizens of Allegheny County, I am honored and humbled to accept this appointment to the county council district 2 office. I first want to thank Councilwoman Cindy Kirk who has served exceptionally. We appreciate the time and effort that you have devoted to

this vital role as a leader in local government. Personally I am grateful that you have confidence in me to fill your shoes.

As I familiarize myself with our job under the home rule charter, the governing system comprised of 15 council members and executives, I see that it is an awesome responsibility. This system offers greater representation and our primary function is to be a bridge to our residents to ensure there are checks and balances to authority and to commit the efficient delivery of the county's vast services to all who reside here. Cindy, you have performed those duties admirably. My goal is to follow your lead with the same dignity and attention. I support you in your next courageous effort and election. Let's go Cindy.

Sam DeMarco, thank you for your recommendation to council. I would like to think that Sam felt comfortable nominating me to Cindy's seat because of my background. One that is rooted here, and one that finds me to be no stranger to leadership and service in Allegheny County. I am a lifelong resident of district 2. I'm a mom of three school age children and a former director of the North Allegheny School Board. I'm a business owner. My family business Sir Pizza has operated and served people of Allegheny County for 48 years.

I have legal experience as a trial attorney on both sides of the criminal bar first as a private criminal defense attorney and then as an assistant district attorney in the Allegheny County DA's office. I also served as a hearing officer and presided over probation cases right here in this very room and I sat in your seat, Mr. Catena, to make myself feel important. Sam, your record reflects a lifetime of commitment to service for the good of the people. I applaud your continued efforts and look forward to working and caucusing with you on council.

Finally to my colleagues on council and the people here. I want to convey how excited and proud I am for this opportunity to continue in my service. I assure you that I am here to serve, serve with integrity and independence. I am here to advocate for the taxpayers and stakeholders in my district and to be a worthy steward of their interests. I pledge to avoid the pursuit of being right and instead always strive to do the right thing. To all please know that I am here to work and work hard. I

know that concept. I am here to work with council on the executive branch exhibiting civility and respect for person and process and most importantly I intend to work for my constituents in district 2 and all of the citizens of Allegheny County. Thank you very much.

MR. DEMARCO: Welcome. Mr. President, point of personal privilege.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Go ahead.

MR. DEMARCO: I'd like to amend the agenda here to add a proclamation here recognizing our former colleague Councilwoman Cindy Kirk. I'd like to make a motion that we amend the agenda.

MR. DUERR: I'll second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. All those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT CATENA: All those opposed? Motion carries.

MR. DEMARCO: Thank you, Mr. President.

Folks, this is really a --- I don't want to say hard or different difficult moment. I first came on Allegheny County Council six and a half years ago and, when I did, I came together with Councilwoman Cindy Kirk. And together in these last six and a half years she and I have been a team so I am going to miss her very, very much. At the same time I wish her the very best in her future endeavors. This is one of those times where someone who can talk all the time is sort of, like, struggling for words, right? So I'm going to just go for the proclamation that we prepared for her.

Whereas throughout the history of Allegheny County and the commonwealth of Pennsylvania, talented officials who possess great knowledge and determination exhibit exemplary leadership in elected positions and contribute invaluable to our communities and whereas chosen by the residents of Allegheny County District 2 Cindy Kirk was elected to office on November 3, 2015 and was duly sworn in on January 4, 2016 and whereas while on council Cindy represented the residents of Bell Acres, Bradford Woods, Crescent, Edgeworth, Franklin Park, Leet, Leetsdale, Marshall, McCandless, Ohio, Pine, Richland, Sewickley, Sewickley Heights and Sewickley Hills and whereas during her time serving the residents of District 2 on county council Cindy served on several committees including parks, government reform, public works to name a

few as well as serving a time as the chair of the health and human services committee and whereas Cindy holds a master's degree in nursing administration from University of Pittsburgh and currently serves as a nurse administrator at UPMC at their Oakland campus. Throughout her nursing career, Cindy worked in several nursing specialties such as on the transplant unit and as a dialysis nurse. She later worked as a nurse researcher and in nursing informatics and, whereas Cindy's been a lifelong community volunteer and activist, she has served as a school PTA volunteer and president, a Boy Scouts of America volunteer, a Girl Scouts of America leader, a Jubilee Kitchen volunteer, president of the Southwestern Pennsylvania US Air Force Academy Parent's Association and served on the Northland Library foundation board.

As a grassroots political activist, Cindy works hard for her party and candidates affiliated with her party's local and state committees. And whereas as a nearly 40 year resident of the district, come on, you're not that old, Cindy lives in McCandless with her husband Bill. This is Bill. They are parents of two adult children. Chip and his wife Beth and Kim and a grandchild Natalie. Therefore be it resolved that the Allegheny County Council on behalf of the citizens of Allegheny County hereby recognizes the honorable Cindy Kirk for her contributions to Allegheny County Council and to the enhancements of the well-being of the county's citizens. Cindy always acted in the best interest of the constituents of Allegheny County and her unwavering commitment to council serves as an exemplary model of leadership.

This council thanks her for her years of dedicated public service and wish her well as she moves into the future. In witness thereof we have heretofore caused the seal of Allegheny County to be affixed this 12th day of April 2022.

CINDY KIRK: I even have a picture of everybody. Thank you. Thank you. As Suzanne said, brevity is great. I'm very humbled by this. It was my honor to serve, and the relationships I made, I mean, sometimes we'd argue and then we'd go to dinner, you know, that's what it's all about, you know, working together for the best of the residents of Allegheny County and I will miss that. I think I left it in capable hands with Suzanne. It was hard to find another left hander who sort of reminded me

of myself so we did. We're all covered. All the bases covered so it's the same person people voted for just a couple years ago so thank you so much. Every last one of you. We've always --- I can say at least at some point we've all agreed on things. Every one of us. Even though we philosophically might be a little different, we found areas that we were in total agreement of and that I respect all of you for so thank you again and thank you people who come in to our meetings. It's been very helpful to know so thank you all, and yeah. I will miss you all and just so you know, just a little tidbit, I had a map in my office of the county and I used to cut out the little pictures of everyone and put them in the county on little straight pins so I could always see at a glance who has the North Hills, who has the South Hills, who has this and all their little heads were right there except the at large. They were just off to the side. There was no room. There was no place. But I do have the map, I did take the map home with me so thanks again. I'll miss you all, and you all have my phone number so please reach out for anything, anything. I really would like that to keep up a little bit. You never know when you're going to see me back here.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Cindy, before you go, obviously it's been a pleasure serving with you. You've taught me so many different things being on council. The conversations, I can't thank you enough. I mean you were chair of health and human services and you managed to do a great job with a difficult bill of paid sick leave and I applaud you for all the efforts that you put in not only for your constituents but all of Allegheny County, and you'll truly be missed so thank you.

We'll now have proclamations and certificates
12258-22.

JARED BARKER: A proclamation recognizing April as Fair Housing Month in Allegheny County sponsored by Council Member Walton.

MR. WALTON: I'd to invite up Director Aggazio and Deputy Director Moore to join me please. Thank you. Thank you, Bev. Okay. Great. Whereas intended as a follow up to the Civil Rights Act of 1964 the Fair Housing Act of 1968 prohibited discrimination concerning the sale, rental and financing of housing based upon race, religion, national origin or sex. Initially the subject of a contentious debate in the senate, the bill passed quickly

by the House of Representatives in the days after the assassination of civil rights leader Martin Luther King, Jr. It is considered to be the final great legislative achievement of the civil rights era and whereas the Fair Housing Act guarantees the right of all Americans regardless of race, color, national origin, religion, familial status or disability to live in the neighborhoods of their choice and is one of the most important components of our national civil rights policy and whereas in Allegheny County those protections have been extended to include ancestry or place of birth, gender identity or expression, sexual orientation, marital status, age, use of a guide or support animal because of blindness or because the user is a handler or a trainer of support guide animals, or deafness or physical disability of any individual or independent contractor or because of the disability of an individual with whom the person is known to have an association with.

Whereas proper enforcement of non-discrimination policy requires the continued cooperation of all levels of government, the real estate and home building industries and private citizens throughout Allegheny County. The spirit of collaboration is evident through the efforts of our federal, state and local governments and with the support of county, community and non-profit organizations and whereas this county dedicates itself to promoting equal housing opportunity as an essential part of its larger mission of endorsing justice in all areas of life for all citizens. Allegheny County ensures its communities are open to all people and citizens may exercise freedom to choose where they live and whereas the month of April is set aside to acknowledge the 46th anniversary of the Fair Housing Act and the work with the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development, the Human Relations Commission in the county of Allegheny, the Pittsburgh Commission on Human Relations and the Fair Housing Partnership of Greater Pittsburgh which ensures the protection of Fair Housing Rights.

Now, therefore be it resolved that I Allegheny County Member DeWitt Walton proclaims April 2022 as fair housing month in Allegheny County. Further I recognize everyone shares in the future of this great nation and are grateful that laws like the Fair Housing Act remind citizens not to take these freedoms for granted. Thank you and with us we have the director of Allegheny County

Housing Authority Mr. Frank Aggazio and his deputy Bev Moore who I have worked with in the past on projects to empower residents of Allegheny County Housing Department, and we're going to continue to work to try to empower and ensure that equity and justice prevails. Thank you. Y'all get to talk.

FRANK AGGAZIO: Thank you, Councilman Walton. We're very honored to be here and to be presented with this proclamation. I do want to recognize somebody that's very special to us at the housing authority, our board chair Mark Foerster sitting in the front row.

There's certainly been a tremendous amount of progress over the years regarding equity in housing. Securing equal access to our programs is the core of what we do. We at the Allegheny County Housing Authority are proud to do our part in providing equal access to safe, affordable housing. We're very honored to be here and thank you.

BEV MOORE: I just want to say to everyone thank you so much for this award. What Frank Aggazio just said is what we live, what we love and how we serve, and we count that an honor and we count that a privilege. And to be recognized for it takes us to the next level of saying amen. Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: 12259-22. The remaining proclamations will be read into the record.

JARED BARKER: A proclamation recognizing Vietnam War Veterans Day in Allegheny County sponsored by Council Member DeMarco.

PRESIDENT CATENA: 12260-22.

JARED BARKER: A proclamation recognizing and honoring the retirement of James Hess from West Mifflin Borough Public Works Department sponsored by Council Member Macey.

PRESIDENT CATENA: 12261-22.

JARED BARKER: A proclamation recognizing and honoring the Penn Hills Rotary on the occasion of their 75th Anniversary sponsored by Council Member Futules.

PRESIDENT CATENA: 12262-22.

JARED BARKER: A proclamation honoring Zachary Handra on achieving the rank of Eagle Scout sponsored by Council Member Macey.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. We'll now have public comment on any agenda items.

JARED BARKER: The first individual who signed up is Tim Clougherty.

TIM CLOUGHERTY: Good afternoon everyone. My name is Tim Clougherty. I live in Mount Lebanon, and I am in the fifth council district and I am speaking to you today in regards to the motion to censure Councilman Tom Duerr. You know, the whole crux of this is that we had three qualified individuals who were being appointed to boards that were eminently qualified, that were voted down for reasons that were not given. Now, what Tom did, he got up and he spoke. He said some things that were unkind, but that was after the agenda, after the meeting had closed so this was in private time. What we're saying here is that he was speaking to try to understand why things were happening and I'm sorry I'm a little conflated here. I was expecting to go later, but my point is that he said things that were unkind but in saying those unkind things you are now motioning to censure him for that, for censuring him for asking for some clarity on why these individuals who were eminently qualified were not given an appointment. What in their background, what in their qualifications made them not qualified for these positions? Again, he said unkind words but you as council members should not be stifling those comments.

What this censure is to do is saying that Tom in bringing these issues up were undermining the respect and confidence in this council. In fact if this motion passes what you will in fact be doing is undermining the respect and the confidence of the council because you are saying that people are not allowed to raise questions. People are not allowed to object and with that I really would like to have you reject this motion to censure Tom. Thank you very much.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Next.

JARED BARKER: Next up is Charlene David.

CHARLENE DAVID: Hi there. My name is Charlene David of Pleasant Hills. I'm speaking about the council censure for Tom Duerr specifically to address the reasons behind that censure. I would first like to say that I really appreciate the hard work the great representation that I currently have in district 6 in Mr. John Palmiere. I'm not sure where he went off to, and I also respect and really like Bethany. I think that she's done a fabulous job on council. She's done some great things for the county. However, I just can't stand by without stating on

the record that I do not believe that it was proper to censure a council member, Council Member Duerr, for a private conversation that he had with my district 6 representative. I believe that it is more important to discuss on the record the reasons for that conversation. Specifically Mr. Duerr was asking Mr. Palmiere why he voted against ALCOSAN board member appointees that were just a few days prior voted out of council for nomination and then there was a vote. They voted them down without discussion, without reason. There's nothing on the record that says that these people were not qualified or why they were voted against. It makes no sense.

So there's nothing that said these people were unqualified. Therefore it appears to me and I don't know this for sure but since there's no transparency here it almost appears that there was some type of political favor or perhaps there was, you know, maybe these members were used as a political pawn for some reason. Again, the ALCOSAN board nomination qualifications were not discussed. In particular I would like to talk about my representative, my state representative Nick Pisciotano because I specifically know about his qualifications. I was very disappointed in how the board treated my representative.

He represents currently 38,000 residents that are served by ALCOSAN. His district represents about 60 percent of the boroughs served by ALCOSAN and of those districts entering into --- and all of his districts that he represents are entered into project z agreement with ALCOSAN which requires direct payment from the boroughs to ALCOSAN. Nick is a certified public accountant with years of auditing experience which is extremely important to ALCOSAN right now because they're going through a huge update which is going to cost us millions and millions of dollars.

So his auditing experience is needed. In addition he's also on the state council ---

PRESIDENT CATENA: If you could wrap it up.

CHARLENE DAVID: Okay. He's also on the state council that oversees utilities. Again, so there's no --- there's just no way that he is not qualified for this and I'm --- that's the injustice here. The injustice is --- the injustice is that he specifically was voted down not what Tom said.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Next.

JARED BARKER: Next up is Mikey Riti.

MIKEY RITI: I too am here to speak on behalf of my county councilman Tom Duerr who's being targeted for retaliation for voicing his outrage over the highly suspect manner in which Sylvia Wilson and State Representative Nick Pisciotto were denied positions on ALCOSAN's oversight board by members of this council. While I might have chosen other words to express it, I share his outrage that these two nominees who only days earlier had been unanimously recommended but voted down after four members of the review committee changed their votes.

No issue with the nominees had been raised at the review committee meeting nor in the ensuing days and there has since been no satisfactory explanation made publically as to why any of the eight voted against the appointment did so.

I have heard only specious excuses. Since there has been no transparency on how this evolved, I have to ask who benefits from these positions not being filled because it is certainly not the people of Allegheny County. The advisory board oversees the expenditure of a great deal of the public's money and the billions of dollars and it is critically important that honest and responsible individuals be in these roles.

One person who stands to benefit from positions not filled is our county treasurer John Weinstein who will remain in his seat on the board as long as there is a vacancy. I have to ask as well why Councilwoman At Large Bethany Hallam was meeting with Mr. Weinstein only a few days after orchestrating the rejection of these nominees.

Even if there was no actual impropriety, the appearance of it erodes the public's trust and is damaging to the health of the body politic. Tom Duerr's sharp words which was spoken after the council meeting ended and for which he has already apologized to Mr. Palmiere caused no such harm, and I ask that the motion to censure him be rescinded. If you proceed, the person you will have damaged is not Tom Duerr. This whole episode including this censure has not lessened the people of his district's faith in and respect for Tom. Rather it has irredeemably tarnished the rest of you and this governing body.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Next.

JARED BARKER: Next up is Elaine Kramer.

ELAINE KRAMER: Members of Council. I am from Mount Lebanon. My name is Elaine Kramer. My comments regard an action this council took at its March 22nd meeting and an agenda item tonight. Eight of you voted against three people nominated for county boards. Just days earlier those three people won unanimous approval by the appointment review committee. There was no comment at the committee meeting indicating any fault or flaw in the appropriateness of their appointment. The committee approved them unanimously. These three people do indeed seem quite qualified and worthy of the committee votes they received. Representative Pisciotto, Ms. Sylvia Wilson and Mr. William Stickman, III all received those unanimous votes. If something was inadequate with their resumes, why was this not brought up to the appointment review committee?

The March 22nd flip by four committee members and vote by four others on this council is nothing short of baffling. What led you eight members to suddenly say no? Was there airing of concerns? Where was the discussion of merit? How this looks to regular citizens like me is this, it looks shady. It smacks of a handshake backroom deal that people like me don't get to see. What other conclusions can a regular person draw? Moreover you have not been forthcoming when asked what your reasons were.

My council member Mr. Duerr asked you to account for your votes, and I have yet to see full responses in news coverage. I want you to know that I appreciate his stance on this. And about Mr. Duerr, tonight you're planning on the agenda a censure vote over comments made outside the meeting? That's a stretch. Here's what I think. I think you're upset that he called you out on your lack of transparency, and a censure vote is merely a shameful attempt at retribution. Here's what I expect from you as a regular citizen and constituent. Mr. Chairman, withdraw that censure motion. Eight council members, please provide clear and accurate reasons for your decisions regarding those nominees that you voted against on March 22nd. I join Mr. Duerr in his effort to call you out. I'm calling you out too.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Next.

JARED BARKER: Next up is Michelle Feingold.

MICHELLE FEINGOLD: An expletive was uttered in an exchange between two council members after the meeting had adjourned. I am deeply disturbed but not by this

unfortunate though hardly unprecedented and ultimately minor incident. Rather I am very disturbed by the behavior of other members of this council. The move to censure Councilman Duerr is a transparent deflection from too many council members' lack of transparency about abruptly changing their votes on nominees who had been unanimously approved in the committee on appointment review. It seems obvious that this expletive-gate brouhaha is being manufactured to draw attention away from the real issue. The sudden about face on the nominees and how it's been handled since. I am not here to comment on the merits of the nominees who were unexpectedly voted down but rather on the impenetrable process involved as well as the unacceptable broader pattern of voting for reasons that do not serve the public interest. Why were the votes abruptly changed?

Certainly individuals can change their mind for legitimate reasons but what was behind this sudden semi-collective reversal? The public deserves the truth. Instead we've been subjected to bald-faced lies such as false claims that State Representative and CPA Nick Pisciotto's constituents are not covered by ALCOSAN. Council members have refused to respond directly to constituents who contact them, have attacked constituents or asked them to justify why they think candidates are qualified or passed constituent concerns on to another council member to answer for them. That is not transparency and it is not good governance.

One reason often heard for council members' nay votes is that a proposal or individual in question is favored by County Chief Executive Rich Fitzgerald. Some council members openly seek to thwart him on principle at every turn. To be sure, I have at times vocally opposed some of Fitzgerald's moves but vindictiveness is hardly good governance, is it? Do what's best for the county and your constituents not what helps you stick it to Rich Fitzgerald. Isn't it also past time to start talking about another elephant in the room?

Why must Allegheny County residents be continually held hostage to the Weinstein Fitzgerald proxy wars? What role is ten-year ALCOSAN Board Member John Weinstein playing here? Is he behind these mysterious moves by council members? If so, to what purpose? Who's benefitting?

These are questions council should be acknowledging instead of hiding behind a motion to censure a member for a momentary reaction born of deep frustration.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Can you wrap it up?

MICHELLE FEINGOLD: I am. Maybe it wasn't his finest moment but the larger issues that gave rise to it must be addressed not deflected from. Be assured that no matter how you vote on this motion we see you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Next.

JARED BARKER: Next up is Marie Norman.

PRESIDENT CATENA: She's not here.

JARED BARKER: Then next up is Marco Attisano.

MARCO ATTISANO: Hi. Good evening. My name is Marco Attisano. I'm a resident of O'Hara Township. Councilwoman Prizo is my council representative. I'm here to talk about what everyone else is here to talk about tonight. The rejection of the ALCOSAN board members and really more of, like, kind of how it went down and then also to the issue of censuring Councilman Duerr.

It's easy to become cynical about government. I think we all know that. All of you campaigned and talked with voters. You've encountered that from time to time. And when council did what was done related to the ALCOSAN board members, you've only made it easier for people to be cynical about government. I've seen a lot of you out campaigning before. I've never heard any one of you encourage folks to be cynical about government. I've always heard you asking folks to believe that our public servants are always doing the best that they can and more importantly that our public servants believe what they tell us.

All of you tell us you believe in democracy. All of you tell us you believe in transparency. Well, transparency is democracy, okay? It is about putting up what you're doing to your constituents and letting them give you that feedback and it may change your mind from time to time. That's a good thing. That's democracy. That's transparency. I've seen many of you campaign. I explicitly have seen many of you tell voters when asking for their support I'm here because I care about transparency. I'm here because council's been doing it the wrong way, and I'm somebody who's going to do it in a more transparent manner.

And there are members of this council and you know who you are and other members know who they are who promote transparency when it's convenient for them but in this instance they decided transparency was not convenient for them so they sacrificed that to doing what is convenient to them and they did not promote transparency. It shows a lack of faith in democracy. It shows a lack of faith in your own constituents, and it shows a lack of integrity because when you're out voting, excuse me, when you're out campaigning I've never heard anyone say I believe in transparency except when it's inconvenient, except when someone might criticize me. And the other thing too is, you're all politicians. We know that. All your constituents are adults. We get it. You're going to make political moves at times. We can handle it. You can tell us that that's what's happening. Again, that's democracy. And lastly I would just ask that my council member, Prizio, I'd emailed you three times asking to publically address the issue. You seem to shake your head there or signify ---

MS. PRIZIO: I never got an email. I was called out on social media but that's not where the ---

MARCO ATTISANO: I'll print the emails and mail them to you or deliver them. Okay?

PRESIDENT CATENA: If you could wrap it up, sir.

MARCO ATTISANO: Sure. Additionally with respect to censure it's disproportionate and not consistent. Look back at the history of council. There have been members that have made public statements that have often encouraged rioting and said that in the public sphere and no action has been taken against them. Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Next.

JARED BARKER: Next up is Merriam Manion.

MERRIAM MANION: Good evening. My name is Merriam Manion. I am from White Hall. I am from Mr. Palmiere's district and regrettably he has stepped out of this meeting so he's not hearing these comments.

PRESIDENT CATENA: He had a family emergency. Just to clarify.

MERRIAM MANION: Thank you. Thank you for giving me this opportunity to speak to you. While I have requested to speak about motion 12263-22, I would like to broaden my discussion to put it in perspective and talk about the frustration I feel about what occurred to cause

Mr. Duerr's remarks for which you wish to censure him. My elected democratic representative in the PA house is Nick Pisciotto, and he is certainly qualified to serve on the ALCOSAN board. His constituents are by and large covered by ALCOSAN. He is a CPA and would have been the only CPA on the board, and he serves on the state committee that oversees public utilities. While I do not personally know Sylvia Wilson, she has been a long time member of the board and was selected to serve again by the new mayor and Pittsburgh City Council. Truly some respect was due to that selection. Two obviously qualified candidates yet we have democrats voting against democrats without a willingness to give reason other than that they were political appointments and that they were unqualified.

At the same time the committee for appointment review unanimously approved this prior to the vote here in council. All appointments are political and already we demonstrated that they are uniquely qualified to serve.

Bethany, the people in the South Hills including me worked hard for your election. You were so clear about not playing politics and the need for transparency. It is clear that the executive has the responsibility to make these appointments, and council has the responsibility to approve them. Why did you vote against well-qualified fellow democrats? And, Mr. Palmiere, I sent you an email several weeks ago regarding my concerns about this vote. I am a registered voter in your district, and you did not hesitate to ask me for my support when you ran previously. Yet I did not receive a response to my email.

As a group, you remind me of contentious US elected officials. Haven't we had enough of such mean-spirited elected officials? I would conclude by saying that ---

PRESIDENT CATENA: If you could wrap it up.

MERRIAM MANION: I conclude by saying I more than understand Mr. Duerr's frustration that prompted his remark. Please stop and think about your own actions before you censure him. Thank you for your time.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Next.

JARED BARKER: Next up is Mary Ann Raymer.

MARY ANN RAYMER: Good afternoon, Council Members. I'm Mary Ann Raymer, and I'm from Bethel Park. I'm here to comment on the censure motion. Councilman Duerr represents my municipality in council. I frequently work with him at community and with political events. He

has always handled himself in a professional way. He has never exhibited any behavior that would be considered detrimental to any organization. I understand that the private conversation that is referenced in the censure motion occurred following the adjournment of the council meeting. It was not a public conversation. I can't imagine that in private conversation things don't get heated at times between council members. It seems to me a vindictive attack because Councilman Duerr questioned why three prospective appointees to the ALCOSAN board that four days prior had been unanimously approved by the committee on appointment review were not approved by the council. In terms of transparency I now wonder why nominee Sylvia Wilson, a 20 year ALCOSAN board member and the first African American woman to serve as its chair, was not approved by Allegheny County Council especially since she was a joint appointment by Mayor Gainey and approved by Pittsburgh City Council. I hope someone on council can explain that no vote.

I ask that Council President Catena pull the censure motion against Councilman Duerr. It is inappropriate and a poor reflection on the council. Council members should be expected to explain their council votes. Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Anyone else?

JARED BARKER: One more. Last up is Anna Batista.

ANNA BATISTA: Thank you. I'm also here to talk to you all about the censure motion against Councilman Duerr. I'm here to speak against that motion and in support of Councilman Duerr. My name is Anna Batista and I am the appointee that was barely approved at that meeting on March 22nd. But whether you voted for my appointment or not is not the point. The important point is that discussion of my and others supposed lack of qualifications was done in secret without any issues raised publically to the county executive to any of us or at the appointment review committee. This led to the absurd situation where the appointment committee chairwoman in one breath stated her committee's full endorsement of candidates and in the next voted them down. Even after the fact we have not gotten any good-faith reasons for why these sudden no votes came about. Because there have been no good faith reasons or explanations, the

rest of us are left to assume that these were done in bad faith.

It's the smack of bad faith and the lack of transparency you have heard so much about tonight that has so angered your colleague Tom Duerr. Tom is a steadfast believer in the power of good government, and he is someone who entered politics for all the right reasons. Knowing what is said among politicians about each other on a regular basis it's hard for me to believe that any of you were truly offended by the way Councilman Duerr expressed his genuine outrage at the way this was conducted. It was outside of council which makes all of this feel like performative pearl clutching.

What was said behind closed doors on this matter? What's the message you hope to send by censuring someone who is defending good government which you're all supposed to represent? Is this really a chamber that embraces poor governance conducted in the shadows and condemns heated debate of good government out in the open? Or can we engage in some transparent discussion even if it's uncomfortable and maybe even if it gets a little rough around the edges. I hope you do not vote to censure Tom Duerr. Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Anyone else?

JARED BARKER: That's it.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Okay. We'll now have the approval of minutes.

JARED BARKER: We have none.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Okay. Presentation of appointments. 12257-22.

JARED BARKER: Approving the appointment of the Honorable Paul Klein to the ALCOSAN Board of Directors for a term to expire on December 31, 2023 sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: That will go to appointment review. We'll have unfinished business. Committee on appointment review for the second reading. If there are no objections, I would like to have Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis make a single motion to approve all of the unfinished business appointments and then once the motion is made and seconded have the clerk read them all and then conduct the vote. Is that satisfactory to everyone?

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: Yes.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Okay. Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis, go ahead.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: President Catena, the committee on appointment review met on April the 5th, 2022 and affirmatively recommended seven appointments and reappointments this evening. Would you like me to make a motion now?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Yes, please.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: That motion is made.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. Jared, would you go through them please?

JARED BARKER: The appointments at issue are bill number 12223-22 and 12224-22 the appointments of the Honorable Anthony Saveikis and Janet Craig to the Agricultural Land Preservation Board both for terms to expire on December 21st, 2024.

12225-22 approving the appointment of Daria Crawley to the community College of Allegheny County Board of Trustees for a term to expire on December 31, 2027.

12226 and 12227-22 approving the reappointments of Dr. Edith Shapira and Dr. Joylette Portlock respectively to the Allegheny County Board of Health both for terms to expire on January 12, 2024 and 12229-22 and 12230-22 approving the reappointments of Barbara Logan and Alice Mitinger respectively to the Carnegie Library Board for terms to expire December 31, 2024 all sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: The motion has been made and seconded. Is there any discussion on any of the appointments? Hearing no discussion all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT CATENA: All those opposed? Motion carries. We'll now have committee on Health and Human Services for the second reading. 12234-22.

JARED BARKER: An ordinance of the Council of the County of Allegheny ratifying amendments to Allegheny County Health Department Rules and Regulations pursuant to Section 12011 of the local health administration law sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Councilman Klein.

MR. KLEIN: Thank you, Mr. President. At its meeting on April 7, 2022 the committee met and affirmatively recommended this ordinance.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Is there a second?

MR. PALMOSINA: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. Is there any discussion? Councilman DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Yes. Thank you, Mr. President. I was very pleased to see that the health department put this legislation back to us to address what we felt was left out here when it came before us before but I think in the future they need to do another amendment here to address school districts. You know, one of the things that's lost here we're talking about construction unions and things like that, but there are school districts that have substitute teachers that may only work a day or two days here that sort of fall into the same type of situation that these folks are so I'm in support of this piece of legislation but I'd like to administration to talk to the health department about potentially addressing the concerns of the school districts that were brought to us as well. Thank you, Mr. President.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Any further discussion? Hearing none, Jared please take a roll call vote.

JARED BARKER: On the motion to approve. Ms. Bennett?

MS. BENNETT: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Betkowski?

MS. BETKOWSKI: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Duerr?

MR. DUERR: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Filiaggi?

MS. FILIAGGI: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Hallam?

MS. HALLAM: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis?

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Palmiere? Mr. Palmosina?

MR. PALMOSINA: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Prizio?

MS. PRIZIO: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: After a long and arduous battle, effort and a significant amount of work definitely yes.

JARED BARKER: President Catena?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ayes 13, no's 0. The bill passes.

PRESIDENT CATENA: 12235-22.

JARED BARKER: An ordinance of the Council of the County of Allegheny ratifying amendments to the Allegheny County Health Department's Rules and regulations Article XV plumbing and building drainage sponsored by the chief executive

PRESIDENT CATENA: Councilman Klein.

MR. KLEIN: Thank you, Mr. President. On April 7, 2022 the committee on health and human services met to consider this ordinance and upon consideration it was affirmatively recommended and is before the full council today.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Is there a second?

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. Is there any discussion? Councilman?

MR. DEMARCO: Thank you, Mr. President. On this particular bill I don't sit on the health and human services committee so I wasn't in the committee meetings that took place so I have questions and concerns. And those basically revolved around what we were doing as far as allowing a residential customer, somebody that owns their own home, you know, were we interfering with their ability to change a faucet or, you know, a commode or things like that within their home. We all understand if you're changing a plumbing system and pipes and things like that would be different.

So I spoke with the county manager today who put me in touch with the health department. I spoke with Patrick Dowd the chief operating officer today, and I had him pull up the universal construction code for the state of Pennsylvania because one of the things that concerned me was the penalties that were in this if you didn't get your permit or didn't pay for your permit, you know, the potential for fines or potentially imprisonment. And he read from the uniform or excuse me, the universal construction code and said that these penalties and these fines its language that's identical to what's in the UCC code here at the state level so based upon that and the

fact that we have to abide by the state regulations and registrations or, excuse me, regulations I'm prepared to support this but I wanted to make it clear that it was based upon the discussions I had with the administration and with the health department in telling me that this language is within the state's UCC code so I just want to put that on the record. Thank you Mr. President.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thanks. Is there anyone else? Hearing no one else, Jared would you please take a roll call vote?

JARED BARKER: On the motion to approve. Ms. Bennett?

MS. BENNETT: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Betkowski?

MS. BETKOWSKI: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Duerr?

MR. DUERR: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Filiaggi?

MS. FILIAGGI: Due to the complex nature of this particular motion, I am going to abstain. I am grateful that Councilman DeMarco has done his due diligence to be able to reconcile his vote and find out about the UCC code and the compliance issues and being in the same standards. I hope to be able to do the same on another day, but at this point I think it's best if I abstain.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Hallam? Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis?

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Palmiere? Mr. Palmosina?

MR. PALMOSINA: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Prizio?

MS. PRIZIO: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: Yes.

JARED BARKER: President Catena?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ayes 11, no's 0 with one abstention. The bill passes.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Okay. Liaison reports. Anyone have a liaison report this evening? Councilman Duerr.

MR. DUERR: I just wanted to thank as County Council's representative of the ALAM board everyone who took time to go to the ALAM yearly convention up at Seven Springs. I know there was quite a few council members who made the trek up there this past weekend. I was working. I could not go, but I have heard from a number of the council members who went in addition to quite a few of the municipal officials in my district who went said that the experience was yet another very successful one and, if anyone has any suggestions on how we can make that an even better one going forward, please let me know. I'd be happy to bring those up in the next ALAM board meetings so thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Anyone else this evening?

MR. WALTON: I have a comment. We are coming out of COVID we believe and, as a result of that, I have been working with the office of the public defender and the courts. We are looking at putting on an expungement clinic on May 21st at the Kaufman Auditorium, and we will also expand it into a job fair for all open positions in Allegheny County government where'll it will be entered on where they'll be taking applications and potentially doing interviews and we're working with a number of other employers externally to the county to participate in that job fair as well. We think that there is a lot of work that's going on, a lot of effort, but it shows that there are a host of organizations and that this county is dedicated to transparency, to opportunity, to equity for all of its residents and ensuring that we can have a second chance for so many people that deserve such so I'm really excited about doing that. I will be making regular reports to council until that event takes place and post event. I'm really excited about it, and I want to thank the county manager and the county executive for working with me and ensuring that this thing takes place.

PRESIDENT CATENA: How are we getting the word out about that, Councilman Walton?

MR. WALTON: It is --- we're trying to close the door on the site. We've had verbal agreement, and we will be putting it on the county website, we'll be putting it on county council web site, we'll be putting it on the A

Phillip Randolph Institute web site and any other organization that wants to promote the activity because we really want it to be an incredibly successful and well-attended event.

PRESIDENT CATENA: It sounds like a worthwhile effort so thank you for doing that.

MS. BENNETT: President Catena?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Yes.

MS. BENNETT: May I ask a question?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Councilwoman Bennett?

MS. BENNETT: Can you please --- are you able to --- if you're able to --- if you could make a flyer that we can share out to our folks, that would be very helpful. I have a huge List serv of partners in the county that I would love to share that with.

MR. WALTON: We'll do that.

MS. BENNETT: Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Anyone else this evening? Seeing no one else this evening we'll do new business. 12263-22.

MR. WALTON: Point of order, Mr. President?

PRESIDENT CATENA: The motion hasn't been read yet.

MR. WALTON: Okay. Go ahead.

JARED BARKER: A motion of the council of Allegheny County censuring Council Member Thomas Duerr for conduct detrimental to County Council specifically his actions immediately following the March 22, 2022 regular meeting of council sponsored by Council Member Catena.

PRESIDENT CATENA: That will go to government reform. Yes.

MR. WALTON: No, no, no, no, no, no. I made my effort point of order before you did this. I am suggesting that we waive the second reading and we debate this on the floor tonight.

PRESIDENT CATENA: It's already been sent to committee.

MR. WALTON: No. Bullshit.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Oooh.

MR. WALTON: Ooooh. Yeah. Bullshit.

PRESIDENT CATENA: I'm going to ask you to kindly refrain from using foul language at a county council meeting.

MR. WALTON: Well, censure me. Censure me. I'm trying to operate in an honorable and transparent manner,

and you're being very disingenuous. You are continuing your practice of playing crap, playing bullshit games.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Again, I'm not going to warn you again about your language.

MR. WALTON: So put me out. Have me arrested.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Do you want me to have you removed, Councilman Walton?

MR. WALTON: Have me removed.

PRESIDENT CATENA: If you want me ---

MR. WALTON: Have me --- hey, I'm telling you -- - I'm telling you that I call for a point of order you can't refuse and --- I challenge the decision of the chair.

PRESIDENT CATENA: That's fine. You're more than entitled to challenge the decision of the chair. If you want to pull that from committee, it takes a vote. If you want to make that motion, go right ahead.

MR. WALTON: I move that we waive the second reading and that we debate the motion tonight.

PRESIDENT CATENA: It's already been sent to committee.

MR. WALTON: Again, I challenge the decision of the chair.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Solicitor Cambest, once it's been sent to committee ---

JACK CAMBEST: He's challenging your decision so you can vote on that. He has the right to do that.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Okay. So that requires what?

JACK CAMBEST: Majority.

MR. WALTON: Simple majority.

PRESIDENT CATENA: So do we want to --- so make the motion to allow that. He made the motion. Is there a second?

MR. DUERR: I'll second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: So, Jared, please take --- Jack, Solicitor Cambest, I thought once the motion ---

JACK CAMBEST: He made a motion to challenge the chair. You won't recognize his point of personal privilege that's the motion. It's not to pull the second reading. If he's successful in challenging the chair, then somebody could make a motion to pull --- waive the second reading, but the motion is totally different.

MR. WALTON: By Robert's Rules of Order you have no choice but to yield the chair and the second in command --- and the second highest officer conducts a vote to

determine whether or not my challenge is upheld or not. You have no choice.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Okay. Again, but I'm going to kindly ask you to refrain from using foul language.

MR. WALTON: Well, you're foul.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Again, Councilman Walton, please use some decorum.

MR. WALTON: You're foul.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Again, Councilman Walton, please respect Robert's Rules of Order and have some decorum this evening. Thank you. Jared?

JARED BARKER: At this point I'd like to defer to the solicitor. What is the motion we're voting at this point?

JACK CAMBEST: He is motioning the chair. That is what he doing right now so that's the motion so we need to have a roll call vote on his questioning of your decision to send it to --- or I'm sorry --- questioning his ---

MR. WALTON: My claim of a point of order.

JACK CAMBEST: That's all we're doing.

MR. DUERR: Solicitor Cambest, would there be given our general rules about these things would there be allowed of discussion prior to this vote?

MR. WALTON: No.

MR. DUERR: Challenging?

MR. WALTON: No.

JACK CAMBEST: He's correct.

JARED BARKER: On the motion to question the Chair on the point of order. Ms. Bennett?

MS. BENNETT: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Betkowski?

MS. BETKOWSKI: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Duerr?

MR. DUERR: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Filiaggi?

MS. FILIAGGI: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Hallam?

MS. HALLAM: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis?

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Palmiere? Mr. Palmosina?

MR. PALMOSINA: No.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Prizio?

MS. PRIZIO: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: Yes.

JARED BARKER: President Catena?

PRESIDENT CATENA: No.

JARED BARKER: Ayes 8, no's 5 with a couple of members absent. The motion to question the chair on the point of order does pass.

MR. WALTON: So, Mr. Chair.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Go ahead.

MR. WALTON: Again, as I said, I move we debate the issue on the floor. We waive the second reading. We debate the issue on the floor, and I'll offer a compromise for you if you're willing to operate in a transparent manner. You withdraw the motion, you withdraw the motion and we don't have to go through it. You don't? We debate it on the floor.

PRESIDENT CATENA: I'll withdraw the motion if Councilman Duerr makes an apology to Councilman Palmiere. It's that simple.

MR. WALTON: No. You're not negotiating. Either you withdraw it or we debate it on the floor.

MR. KLEIN: I think that has happened, the apology. It might not have happened in the manner that you deemed appropriate, but he did communicate with Mr. Palmiere and did apologize.

PRESIDENT CATENA: For clarification he did send him an email but if he makes a personal apology this evening saying what he did was wrong, he lost his temper and what he did was wrong, I will withdraw the motion. It's that simple.

MR. KLEIN: I'm sorry, but I think that that kind of compelled statement seems disingenuous at this point and I think that Mr. Duerr made a good faith effort to reach out albeit he did send an email but he did what you were hoping that he would do which was to extend an apology and I think that that should be sufficient.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Would you have done that, Councilman Klein, or would you have picked up the phone?

MR. KLEIN: It doesn't matter. I mean that is what he did. I'm satisfied with what he's done, and I have a vote here so I am satisfied how he responded, how he --- what he ultimately did.

PRESIDENT CATENA: I'll gladly withdraw the motion if he simply apologizes. Councilman Duerr, will you apologize for making an error in judgement?

MR. DUERR: So, President Catena, as --- so can't believe it's gotten to this point. I haven't said anything yet. So as Mr. Walton mentioned, I have corresponded with Mr. Palmiere and I have apologized to him for the sharpness of my words. I will not for one second apologize for holding any member of this council accountable to acting in a transparent and an aboveboard manner. This censure is a joke. If DeWitt got censured every time he said a swear word behind closed doors, all we would do is censure council members, and I'm sorry, President Catena, but you let the cat out of the bag with this. This has gone on --- this has spread far and wide in terms of across the press and I'm sorry if my comments were a little bit sharper than what Councilman Palmiere would have preferred, but they were indicative of the frustration that myself and clearly my constituents feel right now.

MR. PALMOSINA: Excuse me. Can I step here in for one second?

MR. DUERR: Hold on. I'm not done, Bob. Not done.

MR. PALMOSINA: Tom, can I just say something. Once again you're losing control and you're starting to scream. That's exactly what happened --- let me just talk because I don't say too much. I was here when it happened, Tom. You were rude and very disrespectful to almost an 80-year-old man. You stuck your finger in his face which was totally uncalled for. I know things happen. They should happen behind closed doors not out here. This isn't a three ring circus. This man deserves respect.

The other question I have for you. Why attack only him? There were seven other people voted, Tom.

MR. DUERR: You're right. You're right, Bob.

MR. PALMOSINA: I think --- I just want to finish. I think you're a good councilman. I don't think asking for a phone call to a gentleman that deserves respect and just say you know what I might have lost my

temper a little bit. I don't think he's asking too much. I appreciate your people coming down here, and I would think my people would have done the same but I think this has gone on too long and I don't think what President Catena's asking you to do I don't think it's that far-fetched so I think this man deserves respect is all I got to say.

MR. DUERR: What I would say to that Councilman Palmosina is the reason why I was the most frustrated with Councilman Palmiere is he is one of the longest serving members of this body. He should know better than to conduct himself with official business the way these votes were handled in the March 22nd meeting. Every four of the contested appointment review votes should have been discussed either in appointment review committee or on the floor. Period end of story, and John should know better.

And the second bit is you want respect, I will show respect to every member of this body when they show respect to the legislative process that this council is founded upon. A transparent and open process so the moment, the moment, Councilman Palmiere indicates to his constituents who showed up here tonight and to me why he voted the way he did and why every single one of these council members decided to skirt public procedure from this body we'll have a discussion.

And I would also like to mention very quickly that, President Catena, I had to find out about this censure motion not from you, not from Councilman Palmiere, not from any other members of council, but from the agenda being released on Friday. If you really wanted to help patch things up, foster a healthy relationship on county council between fellow council members, you should reach out to me. Happy to talk with John, happy to have a conversation with you and John in public or behind closed doors. Happy to do it. But you didn't do that.

You put this motion on the agenda without discussing with me. Why? Why? And I'm the only member on this council that has consistently since the 22nd meeting been calling every one of these eight members to account for their lack of transparency on these votes. I'm sorry. It's too coincidental to not line up and, as Councilman Klein mentioned, as Council Walton has mentioned tonight, I am fine with either pulling this. I'm fine with talking with John. If he was here, I'd just

say let's have a conversation after the meeting, clearly he's not.

MR. PALMOSINA: Councilman, why did that not happen? Why an email and not a phone call?

MR. WALTON: Because ---

PRESIDENT CATENA: Hold on. Let him answer. It's a question.

MR. WALTON: No. Wait a minute.

MR. PALMOSINA: Can I get the floor one second and I still didn't get the answer. One, you pointed in the gentleman's face and why only him?

MR. DUERR: I answered why only him.

MR. PALMOSINA: Would the outcome have been the same or did you pinpoint Mr. Palmiere?

MR. DUERR: I answered why it was only him. It's because I --- John is one of the longest serving members of this body. He should know better, Bob. He should know better. With all due respect, you know, I know how certain members are going to vote when I walk in this room. I do. We all do. We know that, but John I know John should know better. And if he was going to vote against his own state representative for the ALSOCAN board, he should have the courtesy to bring up his concerns in the appointment review meeting on the floor of council, and speaking of calling, or had the due courtesy to call him before voting against him on this body and that never happened, Bob. That never happened.

MR. PALMOSINA: I get that, but I think there's two things going on here and first off he has the right to vote whatever way he wants to vote.

MR. DUERR: Correct.

MR. PALMOSINA: That's number one. It's not us to ask him why. That's on John or any of us.

MR. WALTON: So as we said earlier, there is an opportunity to withdraw your motion, Mr. Chairman or we have a floor debate tonight.

PRESIDENT CATENA: The debate's sort of already happening, DeWitt.

MR. WALON: No it has not. Oh, no it has not. So an opportunity is in front of you, sir.

PRESIDENT CATENA: And the opportunity is in front of Mr. Duerr.

MR. WALTON: You're not negotiating with Duerr. This is me, bruh. Wait a minute. It is just like the garbage that you played and tried to smirk at me at the

last meeting. I told you to take your win and go on about your business. Now, I'm telling you --- I'm telling you we either do it or we do it.

PRESIDENT CATENA: I'm telling you as president of council I'm asking Councilman Duerr a question.

MR. WALTON: Whoa, whoa, whoa. You don't have the chair anymore. You had to relieve the chair.

PRESIDENT CATENA: I relieved the chair for that one vote.

MR. WALTON: No, no. You have to relieve the chair until the issue is resolved.

MR. DUERR: Mr. President, may I?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Yes.

MR. DUERR: With all due respect, I'll just do both. I will gladly talk to Mr. Palmiere but a lot of folks here tonight are here because of the censure motion and there's been a lot said in the press the past couple days about the censure motion. I say we have this discussion tonight.

PRESIDENT CATENA: You want to have the debate tonight?

MR. DUERR: Oh, yeah.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Okay. We're going to have the debate tonight then.

MR. WALTON: Got you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Go right ahead.

MR. DUERR: Thank you, Mr. President.

MR. WALTON: So why? If I may have the floor, why was the censure of Mr. Duerr put forth?

PRESIDENT CATENA: That's a question for me?

MR. WALTON: No. Look.

PRESIDENT CATENA: That wasn't it a question for me?

MR. WALTON: No.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Okay.

JACK CAMBEST: Mr. President?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Yes.

JACK CAMBEST: Are we taking the motion and waiving the second reading and beginning discussion?

MR. WALTON: With all due respect, Mr. Solicitor, apparently the --- he continues to try to usurp his authority and he's teach fully yielded and waived the rules of council without following the rules of council so we haven't taken a vote. We haven't taken a vote first off as ---

PRESIDENT CATENA: And I asked you if you wanted to make that?

MR. WALTON: Wait, wait, wait, wait, hold on. Again, you are not the chair. Until the issue is resolved, you have yielded the chair. Read Robert's Rules of Order, dog.

JACK CAMBEST: Somebody needs to make a motion to waive the second reading. Does he want to continue the debate?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Who wants to make that motion to waive the second reading?

MR. WALTON: I'll make the motion that we rescind your unilateral decision in violation of my right to --- we bring it back from the committee and we debate and we waive the second reading for tonight. Can I get a second?

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Roll?

JACK CAMBEST: Is there any discussion on the motion to waive the second reading?

PRESIDENT CATENA: So is there any discussion?

JACK CAMBEST: Pull it from committee and waive the second reading. They go together.

MR. PALMOSINA: Councilman, can I ask a question? I'm sorry. I'm sorry. Go ahead. You haven't talked.

MS. BENNETT: Well, being on the other end of one of Councilman Duerr's tirades I feel that we do need to actually say something because this is a --- this is not a one-time occurrence. It's happened with me. It's happened with former Councilwoman Kirk and I think that's unacceptable and we need to make it clear on what the conduct of council is. It is written in our conduct that we shall not do such things and so I do believe this was --- though I understand why. I get what everybody was saying and I understand the transparency and the transparency was not fully ---

MR. WALTON: Liv, with all due respect.

MS. BENNETT: We have to have some type of respectability when we are addressing each other. I did not cuss anybody.

MR. WALTON: Member Bennett. Member Bennett.

MS. BENNETT: Yes.

MR. WALTON: With all due respect. You have the ability, you have the ability to, to share those issues

that concern you and that are important to you that you just raised, but I think that this is not the appropriate time in the discussion to do that. The issue on the floor, the issue in front of us is whether or not, whether or not we waive the second reading and we have the discussion on the floor. You have the --- the issue that you're raising is a substantive issue if we're having the discussion on the floor tonight.

MS. BENNETT: I thought we were having the discussion on the floor tonight.

MR. WALTON: We have not. We have to take a vote first.

PRESIDENT CATENA: We need ten votes for that to happen.

MR. WALTON: Nope. Simple majority.

MS. BENNETT: To waive a second reading is a super majority I thought.

MR. WALTON: Solicitor?

JACK CAMBEST: Yes.

MR. WALTON: Super majority or simple majority.

JACK CAMBEST: Super.

MR. WALTON: Super? Oh, super majority.

MR. PALMOSINA: President?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Yes.

MR. PALMOSINA: Can I just ask one question. Councilman Duerr, did you just not say you would call him?

MR. DUERR: I'll call him. I did.

MR. PALMOSINA: This matter is over.

MR. DUERR: I did say I'd call him. I did say if folks want to have a debate that's fine too.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Could you, I and him sit down and work this out?

MR. DUERR: Sure.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Would that be appropriate?

MR. DUERR: Very quickly though.

MR. WALTON: Withdraw your motion.

MR. DUERR: Before we get to that point if I may one more thing. My frustration towards Councilman Palmiere and the other seven members here was borne out of what I think is a legitimate concern.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Could we separate the two then for tonight?

MR. DUERR: I want to have your word right now publically that we will talk about in addition to my

conversation with Councilman Palmiere, but also the votes surrounding the four contested appointment review votes.

PRESIDENT CATENA: I'll tell you my thoughts exactly.

MR. DUERR: Okay.

PRESIDENT CATENA: No problem.

MR. DUERR: We will also share those comments and I ask every one of the members of those eight who voted against ---

PRESIDENT CATENA: I can't make the other eight ---

MR. DUERR: No. I'm asking just in general to please make an effort in addressing your constituent's concerns regarding those votes and to do better in the future because to be quite honest, President Catena, you know, I don't want to spend the next year and a half on this body having to debate transparency. It's not why I ran. It's not why --- and I know every member on this body has the ability to make the right decision when it comes to the votes we take and how we take them. I do.

And my frustration is --- like I said I told Bob --- I said my frustration towards Councilman Palmiere was because he was one of the longest serving members of council, but I was frustrated with every single one of the members who voted that way that night and it's not because of, you know, I've had people say it's not because of the vote ended not my way. It was that there was no discussion.

I have been on this council. We've been on the opposite sides of votes. I've been on the opposite side of the vote pretty much of every single one of these members of council. At some point, you know, there are some I'm sure I've supported one hundred percent of the time, but I will never get upset or frustrated if folks have a good reason for voting the way they do and they can convey that to me and their constituents and that is why I was frustrated and that is why I will continue to be frustrated until that is made a core foundation of this council's business going forward.

PRESIDENT CATENA: I can understand your frustration toward that but to call someone in a blanking --- I mean you realize that was obviously wrong.

MR. DUERR: Like I said, President Catena, I have said adamantly that I should have chosen my words

more carefully that night. Really I should have. I have said adamantly that.

PRESIDENT CATENA: And we have a level of decorum that --- we should have a level of decorum to respect at meetings. I mean according to our rules.

MR. DUERR: So let's get together. So let's go home because I'm tired.

PRESIDENT CATENA: We all are.

MR. WALTON: Withdraw the motion.

MS. BENNETT: And, Councilman Duerr, I never got a call from you but I'm happy to tell you why I voted the way I did.

MR. WALTON: On the motion.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Calm down. We're getting there.

MR. DUERR: So, Mr. President, if that's the case will you please remove your motion if that is --- if we are in agreement with that.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Yes, Councilman Duerr. I'll withdraw.

MR. DUERR: Excellent.

MR. DEMARCO: Mr. President?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Councilman?

MR. DEMARCO: Point of personal privilege here. You know, I sit on this council. I've been here for six and a half years, and in those six in a half years we're in the minority so infrequently differing in votes but we have to have some degree of decorum here where we have to be able to disagree with each other but we have to do it in a respectful way. I understand frustration. Trust me. Plenty of times. But the point is from a maturity perspective --- I mean we're Allegheny County Council. We need to be the adults not just in the room but in this county. We need to take and carry ourselves as such. I would say that part of doing that is helping to limit the frustrations that folks feel. Not just members of council but constituents and that's being able to explain why the actions that we take get taken, you know, and as I have brought up at the March 22nd meeting it was like what is going on here, you know? We have a list of appointments and like tonight the motion was made that we take and just read them all off and approve them in one motion but as all this stuff started changing. We started going to different places. Stuff happens. There's different

reasons why people make the decisions in the votes that they do.

We get that, but as a body and this is between all of my colleagues. Okay? We have to comport ourselves in a professional manner. We have to have respect for each other and behave in a professional manner because once that starts breaking down relationships are damaged, you're unable to work together, you're unable to build any kind of consensus, you know, moving forward so I just want to throw that out there as food for thought, you know, when we go home and ultimately come back to the next meeting we're prepared to work together and collaborate in a productive manner and get past all of this. Thank you, Mr. President.

PRESIDENT CATENA: And not use any foul language at public meetings.

MR. DEMARCO: I'm not asking for the impossible. I'd like to see less, but let's start with little victories before we ask for the big ones. Thank you, Mr. President.

MR. KLEIN: I think George Carlin had something to say on that point.

MR. WALTON: Thank you, Paul and George Carlin.

PRESIDENT CATENA: And now we'll go back to the regular scheduled business. 12264-22.

JARED BARKER: A motion of the council of Allegheny County amending and supplementing the rules of council article III in order to improve the efficiency and transparency with which items are placed on agendas for regular meetings of council sponsored by Council Member Palmiere.

PRESIDENT CATENA: As these rule changes were already discussed and recommended by the executive committee during its March 30th meeting, Mr. Palmosina, would you like to make the motion to approve?

MR. PALMOSINA: Sure. Thank you, Mr. President. The committee met on March 30th. I make a motion to approve.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. Is there any discussion?

MR. DUERR: Mr. President, I'm sorry. I was not able to attend that meeting, and Mr. Palmiere's not here. Would anyone who attended that meeting quickly express

briefly these changes before the vote tonight? Very, very quickly.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Jared, can you summarize what the changes were?

JARED BARKER: There are three changes that are all geared towards the procedure for placing items on the agenda. They place a timeline on approval of items for agenda submission by council members, and there is a pair of technical corrections to bring rules of council into more accordance with the Sunshine Act for adding non-agenda items on or amending agendas.

MR. DUERR: Got it. Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Any other discussion? Hearing none all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT CATENA: All those opposed? Motion carries. Notification of contracts. 12265-22.

JARED BARKER: A communication summarizing approved executive actions for the month of February 2022.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Is there a motion to receive?

MR. MACEY: Receive and file.

MS. BENNETT: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Is there any discussion? All those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion carries. 12266-22.

JARED BARKER: A communication summarizing approved executive actions for the month of March 2022.

MR. MACEY: Receive and file.

MR. DUERR: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Any discussion? Hearing none all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT CATENA: Public comment on general items.

JARED BARKER: We have a number of individuals who signed up but some of them submitted written comments. The first person who signed up was Todd Madema who appears to not be here. Second is Angelo Turanto.

ANGELO TURANTO: Thank you for the opportunity to speak. My name is Angelo Turanto and I am a member of Allegheny County Clean Air Now, ACCAN. ACCAN is a non-profit that works with residents in communities in the Neville Island area to advocate for cleaner air by holding polluting industries accountable. ACCAN is calling on

Allegheny County Executive Rich Fitzgerald to reduce unlawful pollution from Metalico a metal recycler on Neville Island and establish procedures that will alert nearby residents to industrial incidents like the April 14, 2021 Metalico fire. We presented county executive with a petition with over 200 signatures today to hold Metalico responsible for ongoing toxic air pollution. We are asking you to hold the county executive and the health department accountable for their inaction.

Since 2017, ACCAN has been monitoring Metalico. The operation of their metal shredder is a source of most of their air pollution which includes smoke emissions, strong odors of burning plastic, rubber, metal and petroleum products, house shaking explosions at the shredder and dust.

Since 2018, ACCAN has documented over 350 Metalico pollution events. Already frustrated by years of harmful air pollution from Metalico, inaction by the health department, the community was outraged by the April 14, 2021 Metalico fire. It took fire departments over six hours to put the fire out. During that time large clouds of toxic smoke blew into neighboring communities making many residents sick and forcing some of them out of their homes for the night. No alerts were sent to the community about what was happening or what they should do to protect themselves.

In contrast to the health department's inaction, EPA has responded to the community's concerns by issuing a notice of violation to Metalico on October 4, 2021. Therefore we are making the following requests of the Allegheny County Health Department in the attached petition.

Increase inspections of Metalico. Stop allowing the company to operate in a way that creates its air pollution and creates the conditions that caused the April 14 fire. Emsworth residents and others in the Ohio Valley should not be subjected to the harmful air pollution that Metalico produces. And finally establish procedures that would alert county residents about industrial incidents like the April 14 fire that create the conditions hazardous to their health. Thank you very much.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Next.

JARED BARKER: Next up is Thaddeus Popovich.

THADDEUS POPOVICH: I have some handouts. How do I get them to you? Would you do that for me? I'm referencing my old comments.

Thank you. My name is Thaddeus Popovich cofounder of Allegheny County Clean Air Now and Protect Franklin Park residing at 1654 Stone Mansion Drive Franklin Park Borough. I have passed out a special edition of H the magazine of the Heinz Endowments. Most of you have that. I ran short unfortunately called of truth action is needed to address environmental crises before time runs out. An opening essay by Heinz Endowments President Grant Oliphant eloquently spells out where we have been and where we need to be. The essay is followed by ten articles helping us to develop awareness of the seriousness of our climate and environmental issues.

Please take note of a section entitled air sickness on pages 26, 27. You can see me there. Also the section entitled change makers featuring my colleague Angelo Turanto. You will find a first person account of how air pollution harmed my health while living in Ben Avon near the DPE Shenango coke works which thank God is gone now. I was told that air pollution made a 50 percent contribution to my heart disease and the need for quintuple heart bypass surgery in 2012. How am I doing?

I'm still kicking. I was able to move away to a cleaner place in the county. That was Franklin Park. Meanwhile Doreen Anderson who's also talked about is a in a woefully different first person account living in Clairton home to the largest coke plant in the country owned by US Steel. She talks about how coke works emissions have affected her families' health and she would like to move out but does not have the money to do so and she's worried about keeping her family together.

I have inserted inside the magazine a press release of Southwest Pennsylvania's sixth virtual residential town hall with a program video. We are members of the resident led grass roots town hall meetings. I meet every week. The steelworkers' voice town hall held on Tuesday night April 5 was by far the most powerful statement yet on the urgency of addressing our poor air quality in Allegheny County. I encourage you to watch the video.

Presently Allegheny County ranks as having some of the dirtiest air in the country due to violations by US

Steel operating two steel mills and a coke plant in the Monongahela River Valley. The county ranks in the top two percent of cancer episodes and is due to this dirty air.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Sir, if you could wrap it up.

THADDEUS POPOVICH: Okay. Meanwhile you have the Shell Petrochemical Plant coming on the scene. That's not going to help us. Two million tons of CO2 per year and the fight for clean air keeps on happening doesn't it? We need your help. We need leaders in our county. We don't have them. Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Next.

JARED BARKER: Next up would be Thomas Pike.

THOMAS PIKE: My name is Tom Pike. I live in Forrest Hills District 7. Like several others I am here today to urge you to pass Bill 12162-22 out of committee and put it up for a vote. This bill would ban fracking and industrial activity in our parks. Our parks exist for the public benefit and not for the profits of private petrochemical companies. I'm also here to urge you to reform your public comment process since many folks who wanted to comment here today were unaware that there was a 24 hour cutoff before the meeting to sign up. You shouldn't have a policy that cuts off people from public comments. Anyone should be able to walk in here and give a comment. Most governments will just have a clipboard by the door.

This is a new policy since it used to be during the pandemic that anybody who submitted a digital comment would have that comment read out loud. We sent in dozens of comments on this and the very next meeting that was the first meeting where those comments weren't going to be read.

Whether coincidence or not kind of fits with a pattern where people who have concerns about this issue have had trouble getting heard. I can't help but notice Councilman Palmiere who chairs the committee that this bill is currently held up in is not here today. We urge you to move this out of committee and because some people cannot give comment tonight I would like for a show of hands from folks who came here tonight to speak about this. Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Next.

JARED BARKER: Next is Matthew Nemeth.

MATTHEW NEMETH: Good evening. My name is Matt Nemeth and I am a resident of McCandless, a lifelong

resident of McCandless in District 2. This evening I am voicing my support for Bill Number 12162-22 which would prohibit industrial activity in Allegheny County's public lands. These lands are becoming increasingly more fractured and valuable as private business in cooperation with local government develop more commercial and residential infrastructure in the suburban and more rural areas of our county. We are already regularly ranked among the worst counties in the country for air pollution due to our enormous industrial facilities particularly in the Mon Valley. Our air is only projected to worsen as the nearby Shell Cracker plant and greater regional petrochemical hub come online.

Our parks are not zones for profit-driven exploitation and destructive extraction practices. They are where families recreate and relax and where children play, where local wildlife lives and escapes human development.

One of the greatest dangers our parks currently face is fracking. A process that requires immense quantities of water, creates immense quantities of toxic, radioactive waste and frequently leads to waterway contamination. We have over a decade of history that proves corporations are unable to frack without polluting the environment and poisoning people whether in the shadow of well pads or near wherever the waste is dumped.

We have over a decade of history that proves state and local governments are incapable of properly regulating the fracking industry to keep residents safe. Even local studies in Deer Lakes Park have shown the water there has been impacted by fracking.

There are alternatives to dirty industry but there are no alternatives to clean air and water. The public should not have to be forced to choose between clean air and water or job opportunities. I call upon the members of county council including my new councilwoman in district 2 to do what is right for all people, wildlife and park land in our county by voting to pass bill 1216-22 and please move it out of committee and schedule the vote. It's been sitting and collecting dust for over a year perhaps two by now, and I think we deserve some action on this so thank you for this opportunity to speak.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Next.

JARED BARKER: Next up we have Rachel Neffshade who is apparently not here and last up would be Ed Grystar. Also apparently not here.

MR. WALTON: He's not here either.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Is there a motion to adjourn?

MR. DUERR: So moved.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Second?

MS. BENNETT: Yes.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT CATENA: All those opposed? Motion carries. Thank you everyone.

WRITTEN COMMENTS:

Marie Norman City of Pittsburgh.

Re the proposal to censure Tom Duerr. A number of County Council members ran for office because they did not like the machine nature of Allegheny politics and the tight hold the County Executive appeared to have over this body. I applaud their willingness to step up, get involved, and challenge the powers that be. However, it seems like the pendulum has now swung in the other direction, with anyone remotely connected to the County Executive treated as toxic, no matter their qualifications. This is evidenced, it would seem, by the votes against Nick Pisciotto and Sylvia Wilson for ALCOSAN board and against Anna Batista for the Air Quality Advisory Board, votes which Council members barely bothered to justify. I have to ask how is this way of doing business any better than the old-style cronyism? Where is the transparency we were promised? And are we just swapping one set of insular power brokers for another?

To those of us watching from home, it is beginning to look like Council is more interested in acting on grudges than in truly advancing the interests of Allegheny County. In this context, Council's move to censor Tom Duerr seems petty and retaliatory driven more by bruised egos than a desire for professionalism. We have had high hopes for County Council. We want to see clear-eyed, fact-based, transparent decision-making, with fewer cliques, fewer grudges, and more work. We need you to do better, Council.

Todd Medema City of Pittsburgh

Regarding bill number 12162-22: We must ban fracking in our public parks. It is the only responsible option for our local communities and our species. Why destroy our area's natural beauty for a few quick dollars, especially when we know that fracking creates fewer jobs and less tax revenue than their original claims? To permit further fracking is an insult to our children and the innocent civilians dying in Ukraine whose war is paid for by fossil fuel consumption.

Thomas Pike Forest Hills.

I wish to voice my strong support for bill number 12162-22, which would ban fracking and other industrial activities on our public lands. This bill should be passed out of committee and into law quickly.

Matthew Nemeth City of Pittsburgh.

I wish to voice my support for Bill number 12162-22, which would prohibit industrial activity in Allegheny County's public lands.

Rachel Neffshade Plum Borough.

I am voicing my support of Bill number L2L62-2L Public parks belong to the residents of Allegheny County and should be preserved for our continued enjoyment. Hydraulic fracturing is an industrial practice that harms natural resources and human health. It has no place in spaces that belong to the people of this county.

Ed Grystar Oakmont Borough.

Bill No. 12162-22 - Dear County Council, My name is Ed Grystar, and I reside in the Borough of Oakmont. I strongly support the passage of the bill to ban fracking in our County Parks. These public spaces should remain free of drilling or other industrial uses. This is not the purpose of a park or proper use of a public space where people gather for recreation and leisure. In Oakmont, I am proud to say that the citizenry of the Borough through a strong grassroots campaign was successful in passing a stronger gas and oil ordinance that was sorely needed to give greater recognition to the health and safety of the residents when the possibility of drilling surfaced a few years ago. You on Council must take the right course and pass this bill in the public

interest. Clean air and water are rights stated in the Pennsylvania Constitution.

CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify, as the stenographic reporter, that the foregoing proceedings were taken stenographically by me, and thereafter reduced to typewriting by me or under my direction; and that this transcript is a true and accurate record to the best of my ability.

Dated the 20 day of June, 2022

A handwritten signature in cursive script, reading "Jeremy Harris", is written over a horizontal line.

Jeremy Harris,

Court Reporter