

ALLEGHENY COUNTY COUNCIL

REGULAR MEETING

- - -

BEFORE:

Patrick Catena	-	Chair, District 4
Robert Macey	-	Vice-President, District 9
Samuel DeMarco, III	-	Council-at-Large
Bethany Hallam	-	Council-at-Large
Jack Betkowski	-	District 1
Cindy Kirk	-	District 2
Anita Prizio	-	District 3
Tom Duerr	-	District 5
John Palmiere	-	District 6
Nicholas Futules	-	District 7
Michelle Naccarati-Chapkis	-	District 8
DeWitt Walton	-	District 10
Paul Klein	-	District 11
Robert Palmosina	-	District 12
Olivia Bennett	-	District 13

Allegheny County Courthouse
436 Grant Street
Fourth Floor Gold Room
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219

Tuesday, March 22, 2020 - 5:04 p.m.

SARGENT'S COURT REPORTING SERVICE, INC.
225 Ross Street Suite 202
Pittsburgh, PA 15219
(412) 232-3882 FAX (412) 471-8733

IN ATTENDANCE:

Jared Barker - Director of Legislative Services
Jack Cambest - Allegheny County Council Solicitor
Ken Varhola - Chief of Staff

PRESIDENT CATENA: I'd like to call this meeting of Allegheny County Council to order. Please rise for the pledge of allegiance.

(Pledge of Allegiance.)

PRESIDENT CATENA: Please remain standing for a moment of silent reflection. Thank you. Please be seated. Jared, please take roll.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Bennett?

MS. BENNETT: Here.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Betkowski?

MR. BETKOWSKI: Here.

JARED BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Here.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Duerr.

MR. DUERR: Here.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yeah.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Hallam?

MS. HALLAM: Here.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Kirk?

MS. KIRK: Here.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Here.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Here.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis?

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: Here.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Here.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Palmosina?

MR. PALMOSINA: Here.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Prizio?

MS. PRIZIO: Here.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: Here.

JARED BARKER: President Catena?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Here.

JARED BARKER: We have all 15 members present.

PRESIDENT CATENA: We'll begin with proclamations and certificates. 12246-22.

JARED BARKER: A proclamation recognizing International Women's Day that was celebrated on March 8th with the theme #BreakTheBias sponsored by Council Member Prizio.

MS. PRIZIO: Thank you so much for indulging me. At the last meeting this is what we should have done as proclamation but because of St. Patrick's Day and the importance of that event and the long meeting I have decided to do it today so I have Stephanie with me and let me read this proclamation.

Whereas United Nations Secretary General said on International Women's Day let us all pledge to do everything we can to overcome entrenchment, prejudice, support engagement and promote gender equality and women's empowerment and whereas international women's day is locally celebrated on March 8th by those who believe in gender equality and who seek to improve the lives of all women and girls through cultural, legal, economic and social change. Whereas the 2022 theme for International Women's Day is #BreakTheBias, the theme focuses on working towards a world that is equitable, inclusive, free from bias and discrimination so the playing field is level for women moving forward.

Whereas International Women's Day is a time to work toward a world where each woman and each girl can exercise her choice such as participating in politics, getting an education, having an income and living in society free from violence and discrimination and whereas the March 8th coalition is a new organization that was charged with organizing an international women's day rally. The coalition consists of women and otherwise gender oppressed organizers active in various causes and struggles in our community. Now, therefore be it resolved that I Allegheny County Council member Anita Prizio do hereby declare Tuesday March 8th, 2022 International Women's Day in Allegheny County and I commend the efforts of the March 8th coalition for their essential role and broad attention to the rights of women all over the Pittsburgh region. Thank you so much.

STEPHANIE PAVLICK: Thank you everyone for recognizing this extremely important event and day and the rights of women everywhere so thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: The remaining proclamations and certificates will be read into the record. 12247-22.

JARED BARKER: A proclamation recognizing Dr. Richard Grubb on the occasion of his 80th birthday sponsored by Council Member Catena.

PRESIDENT CATENA: 12248-22.

JARED BARKER: A certificate in recognition in honor of John Lewis on the occasion of his 100th birthday sponsored by Council Member Futules.

PRESIDENT CATENA: 12249-22.

JARED BARKER: A proclamation recognizing the week of April 3-9 as National Library Week sponsored by Council Member DeMarco.

MR. PALMIERE: Mr. President? Point of order. I'd like to sponsor that also please.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Okay. Anyone else?

MR. WALTON: Everybody.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Does anyone not want to be on it?

MR. FUTULES: That's an everybody.

PRESIDENT CATENA: That's an everybody. 12250-22.

JARED BARKER: A proclamation recognizing Boys and Girls Club of Western Pennsylvania for their Empower Her event that will be celebrated on March 26, 2022 sponsored by Council Member Bennett.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Okay. We're good with that. Is there any public comment on any agenda items?

JARED BARKER: We had one person sign up. Jodie Lincoln.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Approval of minutes.

JARED BARKER: We have none.

PRESIDENT CATENA: None? Okay. Now that we have the presentation of appointments. I talked to Councilman Walton and Councilwoman Bennett and these are all going to be sent to appointment review so 12236-22.

JARED BARKER: Approving the appointment of Daeja Baker to the Independent Police Review Board sponsored by Council Member Bennett.

PRESIDENT CATENA: 12237-22.

JARED BARKER: Approving the appointment of Lynn Banaszak to the Independent Police Review Board sponsored by Council Member Bennett.

PRESIDENT CATENA: 12238-22.

JARED BARKER: Approving the appointment of Candi Castelberry to the Independent Police Review Board sponsored by Council Member Bennett.

PRESIDENT CATENA: 12239-22.

JARED BARKER: Approving the appointment of Phyllis Comer to the Independent Police Review Board sponsored by Council Member Bennett.

PRESIDENT CATENA: 12240-22.

JARED BARKER: Approving the appointment of Richard Garland to the Independent Police Review board sponsored by Council Member Bennett.

PRESIDENT CATENA: 12241-22.

JARED BARKER: Approving the appointment of Stacey Hawthorne to the Independent Police Review Board sponsored by Council Member Walton.

PRESIDENT CATENA: 12242-22.

JARED BARKER: Approving the appointment of David Mayernik to the Independent Police Review Board sponsored by Council Member Walton.

PRESIDENT CATENA: 12243-22.

JARED BARKER: Approving the appointment of Robert Meinert to the Independent Police Review Board sponsored by Council Member Walton.

PRESIDENT CATENA: 12244-22.

JARED BARKER: Approving the appointment of Keith Murphy to the Independent Police Review Board sponsored by Council Member Walton.

PRESIDENT CATENA: 12245-22.

JARED BARKER: Approving the appointment of Thomas Shook to the independent Police Review Board sponsored by Council Member Bennett.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. We're now going to have unfinished business committee on appointment review. I am going to change the order on these. We're going to do the ALCOSAN appointments first so we'll begin with 12201-22.

JARED BARKER: Approving the re-appointment of Sylvia Wilson to the Allegheny County Sanitary Authority for a term to expire on December 31, 2026 sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis?

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: No.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Did you want to make a motion to approve or make ---?

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: I'd like to make a motion please to affirmatively recommend all of the appointments.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Is there a second?

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and second. Discussion? Any discussion?

MS. HALLAM: Wait. I'm sorry. Was that motion for all of them?

PRESIDENT CATENA: No. This was just for the one. 12201-22.

MR. WALTON: The appointment review committee chair specifically said all of the appointments.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Do you want to clarify or ---?

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: I'll clarify. May we do them individually?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Yes. 12201-22 is the first one. Go ahead, Jared. Read that one again.

JARED BARKER: Approving the re-appointment of Sylvia Wilson to the Allegheny County Sanitary Authority for a term to expire on December 31, 2026 sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Is there a second again?

MR. DUERR: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Okay. Motion has been made and seconded. Any discussion? Hearing no discussion, Jared, please take a roll call vote?

JARED BARKER: On the motion to approve. Ms. Bennett?

MS. BENNETT: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Betkowski?

MR. BETKOWSKI: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: It says they're affirmatively recommended. Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Duerr?

MR. DUERR: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Hallam?

MS. HALLAM: No.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Kirk?

MS. KIRK: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis?

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Palmosina?

MR. PALMOSINA: No.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Prizio?

MS. PRIZIO: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: Yes.

JARED BARKER: President Catena?

PRESIDENT CATENA: No.

JARED BARKER: Ayes 7, no's 8. The appointment fails.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Okay. 12202-22.

JARED BARKER: Approving the re-appointment of Representative Harry Readshaw (retired) to the Allegheny County Sanitary Authority for a term to expire on December 31, 2026 sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: I would like to note that this was taken before the appointment review committee and affirmatively recommended to council today.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Is there a second?

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. Any discussion? Hearing no discussion, Jared, please take a roll call vote.

JARED BARKER: On the motion to approve. Ms. Bennett?

MS. BENNETT: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Betkowski?

MR. BETKOWSKI: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Duerr?

MR. DUERR: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Hallam?

MS. HALLAM: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Kirk?

MS. KIRK: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis?

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Palmosina?

MR. PALMOSINA: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Prizio?

MS. PRIZIO: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: Yes.

JARED BARKER: President Catena?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ayes 15, no's 0. The appointment passes.

PRESIDENT CATENA: 12203-22.

JARED BARKER: Approving the re-appointment of Jack Shea to the Allegheny County Sanitary Authority for a term to expire on December 31, 2023 sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: This was also brought forward to the committee on appointment review on the 17th and affirmatively recommended.

MR. MACEY: Make a motion to approve.

MR. WALTON: Second.

MS. BENNETT: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. Is there any discussion? Hearing no discussion I believe we can just do an all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT CATENA: All those opposed? Motion carries. 12204-22.

JARED BARKER: Approving the re-appointment of the Honorable Nick Pisciotto to the Allegheny County Sanitary Authority for a term to expire on December 31, 2023 sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: This was brought forward to the committee on appointment review on March the 17th and affirmatively recommended.

MR. MACEY: Motion to approve.

MR. KLEIN: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. Jared --- is there any discussion? Jared, please take a roll call on this one.

JARED BARKER: On the motion to approve. Ms. Bennett?

MS. BENNETT: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Betkowski?

MR. BETKOWSKI: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Duerr?

MR. DUERR: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Hallam?

MS. HALLAM: No.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Kirk?

MS. KIRK: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis?

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Palmosina?

MR. PALMOSINA: No.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Prizio?

MS. PRIZIO: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: Yes.

JARED BARKER: President Catena?

PRESIDENT CATENA: No.

JARED BARKER: Ayes 7, no's 8. The appointment fails.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. We'll now go back to the regular order. Councilman Walton I believe ---.

MR. DEMARCO: Mr. President, point of personal privilege.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Yes.

MR. DEMARCO: Could I just ask for the benefit of myself and other members of council that may be confused here, what's going on? We have appointees that are affirmatively recommended by the appointment review board and then they come up here and then they're being voted down and the chairwoman of the appointment review board of where they were affirmatively recommended is now

voting no. There has been no communication to anybody on council or at least to us as to what the heck is happening and why.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Well, I believe it's actually the chair's prerogative to choose actually not to vote if I'm correct. As chairs it's not required that you vote. It's the actual committee that's actually making the endorsement not the actual chair itself so if individual members chose not to endorse that recommended committee person or that person then they chose not to.

MR. DEMARCO: Could I ask Chairwoman Naccarati-Chapkis did you vote in the committee --- appointment review committee for these folks?

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: I would have to look back at the minutes but I believe I did but since then have actually received information from constituents concerned about various appointments.

MR. DUERR: Mr. President, point of personal privilege.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Go ahead.

MR. DUERR: Sylvia Wilson and Representative Pisciotano are two of the finest public servants in our region. I would be hard pressed if we found anyone more deserving or more able to serve their positions on this board and I'm disappointed that my colleagues refuse or were unwilling or unprepared to bring forward any concerns they had in the appointment review process. It seems that these --- any concerns for these specific appointments should have brought up in that committee as that is what that committee is for so I would ask that the chair of the appointment review committee make sure that in the future if there are any --- it's in --- any significant concerns regarding any appointments that she share those concerns in committee along with any other members as well as any concerns from their constituents because I haven't got a single word about any of these appointments from my constituents and it's incredibly unlikely given my two years serving on county council that folks being unprompted would care very deeply about the appointment of state representative and the president of Pittsburgh Public School Board being serving on these boards.

MR. WALTON: Past president.

MR. DUERR: Past president. Thank you Councilman Walton. Thank you.

MR. WALTON: Point of privilege, Mr. Chair.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Go ahead.

MR. WALTON: I happened to be sitting in the room when those appointments --- thank you, Mr. Futules --- I happened to be sitting in the room and participate in the review committee meeting that day and there were no votes opposing those candidates, those nominees, nor were there any statements made to challenge their qualifications that day. I recognize that this is a deliberative and individual process and people have the ability to change their positions, but every member of the appointment review committee voted affirmatively even some of those who voted no today. I find that to be disingenuous and I also find it to be many of the reasons that people choose not to want to serve government today. We have different opinions, and we have different perspectives but I find it really disconcerting that members of council would continue to operate at a less than transparent manner and therein lies part of the challenge that we have on council today to operate in a forward looking manner. There's room for us to disagree, but it is really troubling for people to operate in such a disingenuous manner. Thank you.

MR. MACEY: Mr. Chair?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Go ahead, Councilman Macey.

MR. MACEY: Ladies first.

MS. KIRK: Thank you, Councilman Macey. I was going to just echo what Councilman Walton said. The meeting was just four days ago. I heard no negative comments from that and not all of us were shared with this new information that came out in the last four days so I'm quite flabbergasted also how this vote happened when no one said one thing, one negative thing at that meeting that was four days ago. It was just last Thursday, and that's just very confusing to me so I'm just going to sit here confused because nothing was shared and that's not transparency. Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Councilman Macey.

MR. MACEY: Thank you, Mr. President, members of council. I sat in that meeting as well and heard no conflicts from either of the candidates and Sylvia Wilson has been a long time public servant and she's served this area and her district very well. As far as the newcomer who's only been there a year and a half at this point, maybe a year. Nick Pisciotano is a constituent of mine. He is also a CPA and when we questioned him at the meeting

he had no conflicts and was very, very happy to serve. He is also a customer of the system, and I think that's what we want. We want people who understand what it's like to be a ratepayer, what it's like to represent people in that area that is being served by ALCOSAN, and I think he would have been a great, great addition to that authority. Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Anyone else? Hearing no one else we'll --- 12193-22.

JARED BARKER: Approving the appointment of the Honorable DeWitt Walton to the Authority for Improvements in Municipalities for a term to expire on December 31, 2026 sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: The committee on appointment review met on March the 17Tth, 2022 and affirmatively recommended.

MR. MACEY: Make a motion to approve.

MR. PALMIERE: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. Any discussion? Hearing no discussion all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT CATENA: All those opposed? Motion carries. 12194-22.

JARED BARKER: Approving the appointment of the Honorable DeWitt Walton to the Redevelopment Authority of Allegheny County for a term to expire on May 23, 2025 sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: The committee on appointment review met on March the 17th, 2022 and affirmatively recommended.

MR. MACEY: Make a motion to approve.

MR. FUTULES: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. Any discussion? Hearing no discussion all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT CATENA: All those opposed? Motion carries. 12195-22.

JARED BARKER: Approving the appointment of the Honorable DeWitt Walton to the Allegheny County Industrial Development Authority, the Allegheny County Hospital Development Authority, the Allegheny County Higher

Education Building Authority and the Allegheny County Residential Finance Authority for a term to expire on December 31, 2026 sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: The committee on appointment review met on March the 17th, 2022 and affirmatively recommended.

MR. MACEY: Make a motion to approve.

MR. DUERR: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. Any discussion? Hearing no discussion all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT CATENA: All those opposed? Motion carries. 12196-22.

JARED BARKER: Approving the re-appointment of LaShawn Burton-Faulk to the Community College of Allegheny County Board of Trustees for a term to expire on December 31, 2027 sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: The committee on appointment review met on March the 17th, 2022 and affirmatively recommended.

MR. PALMIERE: Motion to approve.

MS. HALLAM: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. Any discussion? Hearing no discussion all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT CATENA: All those opposed? Motion carries. 12197-22.

JARED BARKER: Approving the re-appointment of M. Gayle Moss to the Allegheny County Jail Oversight Board for a term to expire on December 31, 20254 sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: The committee on appointment review met on March the 17th, 2022 and affirmatively recommended.

MR. MACEY: Make a motion to approve.

MS. BENNETT: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. Any discussion? Hearing no discussion all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT CATENA: All those opposed. Motion carries. 12198-22.

JARED BARKER: Approving the appointment of William S. Stickman, III to the Allegheny County Jail Oversight Board for a term to expire on December 31, 2024 sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: The committee on appointment review met on March the 17th, 2022 and affirmatively recommended.

MR. MACEY: Motion to approve.

MR. DUERR: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. Is there any discussion? Okay.

MR. FUTULES: I have a question. Why are we on a roll call on some but just a voice vote on some others?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Because individuals have made it known to me as president that they might not be voting in favor of some of these so that's why I'm trying to streamline.

MR. FUTULES: So somebody told you in advance they were going to vote no? Okay. Thanks.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Some people told me that they might object. At this point in time, Jared, would you please take a roll call vote.

JARED BARKER: On the motion to approve for Mr. Stickman. Ms. Bennett?

MS. BENNETT: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Betkowski?

MR. BETKOWSKI: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Duerr?

MR. DUERR: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Hallam?

MS. HALLAM: No.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Kirk?

MS. KIRK: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis?

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Palmosina?

MR. PALMOSINA: No.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Prizio?

MS. PRIZIO: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: Yes.

JARED BARKER: President Catena, President
Catena?

PRESIDENT CATENA: No.

JARED BARKER: Ayes 6, no's 9. The motion fails
or the appointment fails.

PRESIDENT CATENA: 12199-22.

JARED BARKER: Approving the appointment of Anna
Battista to the Air Pollution Control Advisory Committee
for a term to expire on December 31, 2024 sponsored by the
chief executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: The committee on
appointment review met on March the 17th, 2022 and
affirmatively recommended.

MR. PALMIERE: Vote for approval.

MR. DUERR: I'll second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and
seconded. Is there any discussion? Hearing no
discussion, Jared, please take a roll call vote.

JARED BARKER: On the motion to approve. Ms.
Bennett?

MS. BENNETT: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Betkowski?

MR. BETKOWSKI: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Duerr?

MR. DUERR: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Hallam?

MS. HALLAM: No.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Kirk?

MS. KIRK: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis?

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Palmosina?

MR. PALMOSINA: No.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Prizio?

MS. PRIZIO: No.

JARED BARKER: I apologize. That's a no?

MS. PRIZO: No.

JARED BARKER: Thank you. Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: Yes.

JARED BARKER: President Catena, President
Catena?

PRESIDENT CATENA: No.

JARED BARKER: Ayes 8, no's 7. The appointment
passes.

PRESIDENT CATENA: 12100-22.

JARED BARKER: Approving the re-appointment of
the Honorable Sara Innamorato to the Allegheny County
Housing Authority for a term to expire on December 31,
2026 sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: The committee on
appointment review met on March 17, 2022 and affirmatively
recommended.

MR. FUTULES: Receive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Is there a second?

MS. BENNETT: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and
seconded. Any discussion? Hearing no discussion, Jared,
or all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT CATENA: All those opposed?

MR. DEMARCO: No.

PRESIDENT CATENA: There you go.

MR. DEMARCO: Well, if Representative
Pisciottano is not qualified for the ALCOSAN board, then I
question why Representative Sara Innamorato is qualified
to sit on this board so just want to spread that out.

PRESIDENT CATENA: So we have a no?

MR. DEMARCO: You have a no.

PRESIDENT CATENA: At this point in time so that finishes up all of the appointments. Liaison reports. Are there any liaison reports this evening? No liaison reports? We'll go into new business.

MR. FUTULES: I do have one.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Oh, you do have one? I'm sorry I didn't see you.

MR. FUTULES: I did. I didn't know I needed to tell you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: I didn't see you put a hand up.

MR. FUTULES: I didn't.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Okay.

MR. FUTULES: SCA met --- I make a specific attempt to send emails to all of you on projects. I hope that you got them all so I just want to let you know that all these projects at the SCA were last week, and I hope that you read them all so I won't go through it. Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: At this point in time, Ms. Bennett, I believe you circulated a non-agenda item.

MS. BENNETT: Yes.

PRESIDENT CATENA: For new business.

MS. BENNETT: Yeah. I would like to move to amend the agenda to add a motion allowing for public announcement for folks to apply their interest to the independent police review board.

MS. HALLAM: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and second. Is there any discussion?

MR. FUTULES: Oh, yeah.

MR. DEMARCO: Yes.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Councilman DeMarco.

MR. DEMARCO: I'm --- to use the term I think Councilwoman Kirk used earlier --- flabbergasted. Councilwoman Bennett had just recommended five appointments to the civilian police review board who were just assigned to the appointment review committee. Now, we have a motion that wants to open it up and advertise for more. County Council only gets four appointments to this review board. What are we doing?

MS. BENNETT: May I answer? So none of those appointments that --- all of those appointments are not my appointments. Those are appointments that were shared with Ken, and I made sure they made it to the agenda.

However, there has never been a time where we made public notice that we were ready to seek this board and add the public interest. In my view this is a public board. This was a board that was passed with major public advocacy and now that it's passed I don't believe that it is right for us to leave the public behind as we seek this board.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Okay. Just to be clear this is a motion just to amend the agenda. I mean the actual merits of the bill should be debated actually during that period so this is simply to amend so just to be clarified so. Has there been a second made?

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: The motion has been made and seconded. Is there any discussion on amending the agenda? Is there no discussion ---?

MR. WALTON: On the motion.

PRESIDENT CATENA: The question is on the motion. Go ahead, Jared. Roll call vote.

JARED BARKER: On the motion to amend the agenda. Ms. Bennett?

MS. BENNETT: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Betkowski?

MR. BETKOWSKI: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Duerr?

MR. DUERR: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: No.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Hallam?

MS. HALLAM: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Kirk?

MS. KIRK: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: No.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis?

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Pالموسينا?

MR. PALMOSINA: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Prizio?

MS. PRIZIO: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: No.

JARED BARKER: President Catena?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ayes 9 --- or I apologize --- ayes --- yes --- 9, no's 6. The motion passes. The agenda's been amended.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Okay. So at this point in time I believe you'd like to make the motion to add the bill, correct?

MS. BENNETT: Absolutely.

PRESIDENT CATENA: The motion has been made and seconded. Is there any additional discussion on the merits of the actual advertising or the ordinance? Go ahead, councilman.

MR. DUERR: Just to --- I wasn't sure if we exchanged the process of motions being required to go to committee. I don't know if that was something we discussed about. Did we ever put that change into the rules or not? Okay. I just wanted to make sure if we had a vote on to waive the second reading so that's fine.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Anyone else?

MR. WALTON: If I may. The --- in response to Councilman Duerr. There is no requirement under the rules of council that those appointments must go to committee. It was a unilateral decision by president of council to do that, and we can talk about the legitimacy or the lack of legitimacy as we deem appropriate, but that was a unilateral decision that the president made and I think without proper authority although I am not going to fight that issue here on the floor tonight.

MR. DUERR: Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: If you'd like to fight that issue on the floor tonight, I'd be more than happy to fight it because I'm sure the votes aren't there for it to pass so if we want to revisit that subject we more than likely can. Would you like to?

MR. WALTON: Pat, with all due respect, with all due respect I am trying as much as --- as disappointed and as frustrated as I am here with my members of council tonight I am trying to operate in a --- as collegial a manner as I can. Please do not push that button because I don't think you want to go down that road.

PRESIDENT CATENA: I appreciate that fact but before the meeting I advised you that I was sending this

to committee --- to the committee on appointment review. I thought --- and you said you're not going to fight that battle. I would have thought if you had a problem with it you would have told me at that point in time.

MR. WALTON: Mr. President, again, I repeat, I repeat, I am trying to operate in as collegial and as professional a manner as I can. I disagree, but I yield. Don't push that button, man. You don't want to go down that road.

PRESIDENT CATENA: I'm not pushing any button. I'm simply asking, simply telling you that I gave you that opportunity and you said you didn't want to fight that so what am I supposed to do if that's what you tell me, Councilman Walton?

MR. WALTON: I'm yielding. Take that win, and move on please.

PRESIDENT CATENA: I will take that win and move on. Thank you. Councilwoman Kirk?

MS. KIRK: I'm just a little confused. So we have ten people going to appointment review where we're going to say you're qualified but we have ten but we can only pick five then we might get another 30. We can still only pick five. How do we narrow them down? Do we have a process for that yet to decide how? Because we go to appointment review, I mean people barely ask any questions and how do we, like, rank stack and stack them when we have ten now and maybe how many later. Do we have a process for that yet?

MR. KLEIN: If appointment review, I suppose, works as it should then we should be able to ask questions of the nominees and I think the goal here is to cast a wide net and you're trying to make four appointments you want to interview more than four people and so you might have to interview five or ten or more.

So I think we do have the instrumentality for doing that and we can vet candidates in that way.

MS. KIRK: We already have ten going to appointment review and maybe how many will we get and how do you narrow it down to five or six. That process is a challenging process to be defined. It's like a job interview and that's not what appointment review does generally speaking, and I don't see how you get from 40 odd people to say 5 or 4. And we have ten going to appointment review, what are we going to do with them there?

MR. KLEIN: Well, is there an HR director in the house? But I would suggest in a hiring situation an HR director obviously would take a look at who had met whatever the criteria was and decide well, these are people that we certainly want to interview with them. These are people who we do not. It might be more fraught and more difficult given what we're talking about here so I don't have an easy answer for that.

MS. KIRK: So I don't know unless you take appointment review just does a pass/fail, you know, do you meet the minimum and then you almost have to have a major interview process.

MR. KLEIN: We could be busy.

MS. KIRK: It will take a little while.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Councilwoman Hallam. Sorry.

MS. HALLAM: Yeah. I just want to add I do think that appointment --- it should be a job interview process, right? That is the whole point for every board and authority and there are hundreds if not thousands of positions that come before us over and over again in the appointment review committee meeting and very often don't get asked any questions and get an affirmative recommendation anyways.

So I would propose a counterpoint to how are we hiring those people for jobs for all the years that county council's been in existence even though they're also not paying jobs --- but, but, but hold on one second I'm speaking. And so that's the point is that over and over again we find people for jobs on boards and authorities and commission without any interview process whatsoever with a unilateral rubber stamp to every appointment that comes through without any interview process.

So I have full confidence in Council Member Naccarati-Chapkis to conduct an appointment review committee meeting where, you know, in my suggestion we ask questions of every single appointment that comes forward and maybe it takes a couple meetings to do that. If that is what needs to happen, but that at the end of the day we all pick our top four and whoever gets the most votes for the top four that's who becomes the four appointments but I do not think it's fair that one council member or two council members get to pick the full council four appointments to the police review board and that's why I am in support of this motion.

MR. WALTON: If I may.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Hold on. Councilwoman Kirk, I believe, wanted to say something.

MS. KIRK: Yeah. I just think --- I think the appointment review the way the committees have been run is not a good process to do this and there's so many people. We've never had that before. We have three positions, three candidates. Now you're going to say four positions, 30, 40 candidates. Who knows how many candidates? That process is going to have to be developed and looked at very closely I think to really come down to the four that make the best fit for this position.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Something appointment review would have to decide.

MS. KIRK: Yeah. They have to come up with that process.

MR. DEMARCO: Mr. President?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Hold on. Councilman Walton.

MR. WALTON: Look. The language --- the legislation took effect in January. Every member of council should have been aware if they were not aware of the process of the timeframes of what goes on. If we claim that we weren't aware, then ignorance is no excuse and I'll end with this simple comment. Look how disingenuous our appointment review process just demonstrated itself in this meeting.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Councilman. Go ahead, Councilman, DeMarco.

MR. DEMARCO: Thank you, Mr. President. I just want to say we're not hiring these people. We are taking and appointing these people who are volunteers to serve in the community here on these boards and commissions. I would also say that one of the things before someone even becomes an appointment. They are preliminarily vetted by folks who then put them up or nominate them for appointment in the first place. So if you're going to open this up to the public and I agree the public should be noticed, given notice that these things are taking place but what are we going to do to vet those folks prior to even getting an appointment meaning for the appointment review board to ensure there is somebody qualified or whatever in the community to do so and I believe that's a legitimate question.

MR. KLEIN: I agree and I think that we might have to do since this is a new creation, the civilian police review board, we might have to think about, again,

creating a special committee and figuring out what guidelines will be in order to, you know, go through that vetting process. I guess the difference here between this and the appointment review process for nominees to boards and agencies is that the reality is that most of the nominees to these boards and authorities are nominated to by the executive and, you know, generally speaking there is some deference to those nominations and the reality is that most of us, like, 99 percent of the time vote to reappoint or confirm someone who has been nominated at least that has historically been the practice since we created this model of government I think but in this case we might have to consider putting together and staffing a special committee to conduct these interviews.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Councilwoman Hallam.

MS. HALLAM: Yes. So, you know, to answer the things that have been brought up my understanding is just because you submit a letter of intent does not mean that you automatically come on to our agenda. It's still my understanding that this is just the solicitation of the appointment and, you know, our sponsor Chairwoman Bennett could clarify if I'm wrong, but it's my understanding that anybody can submit a letter of intent but it is still up to the individual council members to do that vetting that you're talking about in order for that person to get on to the agenda. This is merely a notification to let people know that we are seeking these appointments to submit their letter to council and then I assume Ken, Jared, anyone will come to us and say here are the resumes, here's the people that have applied, here are the documents they turned in and it will still be up to the individual council members to vet them and decide if that is an appointment they want to put forward on the agenda so there is not --- we're not skipping the vetting process of the person who's putting forward the appointment. We are merely opening up the solicitation to the public and making it more accessible to the people and at the end of the day that's kind of our job as public servants.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Anyone else?

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: President Catena, I would just like to say that if I were aware of the --- that there would be nominations to the independent review board when I came on board on January 3rd I would have that day gone out to my district and constituents to make them aware of this process and I know that from district 8

there's lots of interest in the independent review board and I'm sure that there would be individuals who would like to submit their resume for consideration so with that said I do appreciate that there would be a process to provide for more opportunity for the public to express interest in these four positions.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Is there anyone else this evening? Hearing no one else at this point in time we'll do a roll call vote.

JARED BARKER: On the motion to approve Ms. Bennett's motion. Ms. Bennett?

MS. BENNETT: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Betkowski?

MR, BETKOWSKI: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Duerr?

MR. DUERR: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Hallam?

MS. HALLAM: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Kirk?

MS. KIRK: No.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis?

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Pamosina?

MR. PALMOSINA: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ms. Prizio?

MS. PRIZIO: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: No.

JARED BARKER: President Catena?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Yes.

JARED BARKER: Ayes 12, no's 3. The motion passes.

PRESIDENT CATENA: At this time I'd like to turn it over to Councilwoman Kirk who has an announcement to make.

MS. KIRK: Tonight ---.

JARED BARKER: I apologize. I don't mean to interrupt there's one more bill under new business ordinances resolutions.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Did I miss it? I'm sorry. 12251-22.

JARED BARKER: An ordinance of the county of Allegheny Commonwealth of Pennsylvania to allow Playtone & SF Studios to use certain county-owned real and personal property in connection with the filming a motion picture sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Is that parks or ---?

MR. PALMIERE: It's parks.

PRESIDENT CATENA: That's a parks one. Sorry. I'm missing that one on my agenda. Doesn't say is it a park or no?

Councilwoman Kirk?

MS. KIRK: Tonight I am announcing my resignation from Allegheny County Council effective at the end of the day tomorrow Wednesday March 29 to become a candidate for nomination for the newly redrawn 30th State House District. I want to express my sincere thanks to the staff, my fellow council members for the good work that we have been able to accomplish together while serving --- as a councilwoman since 2016. It's been an honor and a privilege to represent my North Hills neighbors in County Council District 2 and give a voice to those 100,000 residents who daily rely on our roads, bridges, public health system, public safety network, courts and more. We all here tonight show the satisfaction of our many accomplishments that working together bring. The many improvements to our other county parks and the significant county bridge infrastructure improvements all while never raising property taxes.

Working together we protected our environment by updating our storm water regulations while working to respect and protect individual property rights. As a nurse for many years I know how hard our first responders work, and I'd always work to support the police, our volunteer fire departments and other first responders while defending the autonomy of our communities.

I think our county parks have never looked better. In part because of the responsible energy development and the many benefits in brings to our communities and our country's energy independence. As a highlight each year,

I've been honored to sponsor nurse week in Allegheny County recognizing all the wonderful nurses that work in Allegheny County especially those who work for the county, and I know you all enjoyed those meetings.

My service on our county council has only magnified my desire for public service and to protect our families, conserve our values and to be a voice for the people. I'm sincerely grateful to the voters who gave me this opportunity to serve them and I will always cherish the relationships I have made on county council and look forward to continuing our work together towards making Allegheny County an even better place to live, work, raise a family and retire. Thank you. I'll miss you all.

MR. DEMARCO: Mr. President, for the record as the caucus chair here I would like to thank Councilwoman Kirk for the last seven years of service that she's put forth on county council committed to both the roll of council and to the constituents in her community. She's dedicated her time and brought significant zeal to the position as well as her experience. Her contributions on health and human services. I don't know that we would have been able to do many of the things that we were able to do without her, and I want to recognize her. She's going to be sorely missed and I want to just share that with my fellow members of council. She's worked here in a collegial and collaborative way to try to move forward legislation that is going to benefit the people of Allegheny County and, again, we're going to miss you. Thank you very much.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Councilman DeMarco, even though she might be resigning tonight I just invited her back to our next meeting so we can officially say our goodbyes and officially present her the plaque that she is dearly entitled to. Councilman Macey?

MR. MACEY: Thank you, Mr. President, members of council. It's been an honor and a privilege to work with Councilwoman Kirk and one of the things that I admire about her is that when we are elected and we become a body it wasn't about republican or democrat. It was about working for the constituents that we serve, and I respect her for that and I think we all ought to remember that that's our job. It has nothing to do with republican or democrat. Maybe to get elected but we have a responsibility to serve and I'm proud to say that she did serve quite well. Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Notification of contracts.

JARED BARKER: We have none.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Okay. Public comment on any general items.

JARED BARKER: We do have several of those. First up is Juliet Zavon.

JULIET ZAVON: So my issue is incorrect ballots to voters. It's an ongoing problem because of failures in the quality control system. Incorrect ballots are repeatedly sent to voters in Allegheny County. Just to give you two examples in 2020 as you know over 29,000 incorrect ballots went to voters in the November election.

In 2021 there was a serious printing error where ballots were actually printed with the voter's name and identification information on it and I photo --- I put a photo on your thing from the person who sent that to me. These are just two examples of many, and it's always voters that find these not the election division, not the mail house. That means there's a problem with quality control.

The elections division says it reviews 15 percent of ballot packets before they go out. Statistically that's adequate, but it's only adequate if those ballot packets are chosen randomly and they're really accurately checked. On that basis it is adequate. It should have picked up 8-10 of the 68 errors that the elections division has acknowledged. Once you have one error, you know there's a problem. You go to your system just like in industry. Hmm something's not working and you check it.

We have a problem here so the fact that the errors weren't detected by quality control at the mail house and then again not detected at the elections division something is wrong. There needs to be some attention to this.

As one of several examples of errors that have been reported to the election division and to the board of elections you have the photo that I put on the bottom. Monica got a ballot packet missing two envelopes and her name and barcode are printed on the ballot. I'm asking for your help in getting the documentation from the elections division. It should be contract language.

What is the mail house supposed to do to check quality control and then what is it specifically that the elections division does when they review these packets.

It should --- and just for context when the election division does an audit after an election, a risk limiting audit, the procedures they use, how many ballots, how they're selected, what they look at, that's public information. We need this kind of information for quality control on outgoing ballots. Thank you for your help. Thank you for your attention.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Anyone else?

JARED BARKER: We have next up is Monica Malik.

MS. HALLAM: Not here.

JARED BARKER: Who is not here. Next up is Tammy Martin.

TAMMY MARTIN: Hello. I'm Tammy Martin. I'm a resident of the North Side, and I'm going to be very brief. I don't have a speech or anything. I came to express some concerns with the vetting process and transparency and accessibility with the police --- civilian police review board. I have a couple questions. I did manage to see a post on Facebook, and that was last week Wednesday. On that post the public was also asked to submit their form for comments for the meeting and that was expected to be submitted the same day. There was no information in the post regarding submitting a letter of interest or submitting resume deadline to that post. I just have a lot of concerns and, Mr. DeWitt, it does seem very disingenuous to the public being a member of the public. I just have some questions on the process, the whole process, of vetting that you all discussed here today and the transparency issues and also accessibility to be able to be a part of --- the public to be a part of the process so if anyone can answer that is all I have today.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Adjourn? Anyone else?

JARED BARKER: Last up is Jacob Poole.

PRESIDENT CATENA: He's not here. Is there a motion to adjourn?

MS. HALLAM: So moved.

MR. MACEY: Motion.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. All those in favor say aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT CATENNA: All those opposed? Motion carries.

CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify, as the stenographic reporter, that the foregoing proceedings were taken stenographically by me, and thereafter reduced to typewriting by me or under my direction; and that this transcript is a true and accurate record to the best of my ability.

Dated the 8 day of June, 2022

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Jeremy Harris" is written over a horizontal line.

Jeremy Harris,

Court Reporter