

ALLEGHENY COUNTY COUNCIL

REGULAR MEETING

- - -

BEFORE:

John P. Defazio	-	President
Samuel DeMarco, III	-	Council-At-Large
Tom Baker	-	District 1
Cindy Kirk	-	District 2
Anita Prizio	-	District 3
Patrick Catena	-	District 4
Sue Means	-	District 5
John F. Palmiere	-	District 6
Robert J. Macey	-	District 9
Dewitt Walton	-	District 10
Paul Klein	-	District 11
Robert Palmosina	-	District 12
Denise Ranalli-Russell	-	District 13

Allegheny County Courthouse
Fourth Floor, Gold Room
436 Grant Street
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219

December 4, 2018 - 5:04 p.m.

SARGENT'S COURT REPORTING SERVICE, INC.
429 Forbes Avenue, Suite 1300
Pittsburgh, PA 15219
(412) 232-3882 FAX (412) 471-8733

IN ATTENDANCE:

Jared Barker - Director of Legislative Services
Samuel J. Dalfonso - Allegheny County Council
Solicitor
Ken Varhola - Chief of Staff
Sarah Roka - Budget Assistant

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: The meeting will come to order. Will you all rise for the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag and remain standing for silent prayer or reflection.

After me ---

(Pledge of Allegiance.)

(Silent prayer or reflection.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

We'll go with the roll call.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Catena?

MR. CATENA: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Futules?

(No response.)

MR. BARKER: Ms. Kirk?

MS. KIRK: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Here.

MR. BARKER: Dr. Martoni?

(No response.)

MR. BARKER: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmosina?

MR. PALMOSINA: Here.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Prizio?

MS. PRIZIO: Here.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Ranalli-Russell?

MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: Present.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Here.

MR. BARKER: We have 13 members currently present.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 10880-18.

MR. BARKER: A Proclamation congratulating the Jefferson Hills Library upon the occasion of being awarded the PA Forward Gold Star Award. Sponsored by Council Member Palmiere.

MR. PALMIERE: Hi everyone. Good evening, Mr. President, fellow Board Members, Council Members. I --- I don't do this very often but I thought this was a real good time to take time to honor a couple ladies here that run the Jefferson Hills library. And they just were awarded the Pennsylvania For --- Forward Gold Start Award. You know, you work up from the bronze, silver, gold. It doesn't get any better than this. And since the library is my second favorite place to read, my first is in my bed in my bedroom. And, I wanted to bring the ladies and they were kind enough to come down to be recognized.

And, we have --- let me get this right. I'm going to cheat. We have Jan Resenthaler and Jane Milner. Hey, holy mackerel, how about that. The wonders of the world haven't seized. I'm going to take time here to --- before the ladies have an opportunity to speak to you, I wanted to read the Proclamation. It says, and I --- and again, I want to thank Michelle for doing a great job on this.

WHEREAS, public libraries have long served as trusted and treasured institutions that fill efforts to better their communities, foster the free exchange of information and support the foundations of democracy and;

WHEREAS, in 1959, Jefferson Hills Library was founded by the joint efforts of the Jefferson Hills Borough Lions' Club and a group of private citizens. They envisioned a library that would meet the needs of all members of the community and give them an opportunity to grow intellectually with valuable free resources and services offered at the public library and;

WHEREAS, in the beginning, under the leadership and direction of Charlotte Hill and Madeline Conklin, volunteers were organized to staff the library. At that time, the library was financed by a yearly donation from the Borough Council, the Lions' Club, local businesses and citizens. Legislative grants were also received over the years and;

WHEREAS, in 1963, Joyce Schmidt was hired as the first librarian and she adamantly worked to help the library grow over the next 30 years. Today, under the leadership of an appointed Library Board and Library Director, Jan Resenthaler, the Jefferson Hills library is growing rapidly into the 21st Century. And as a result, was recently awarded the Pennsylvania Forward Star --- Gold Star Award;

WHEREAS, the Pennsylvania Forward Star Award program established in 2016, rewards Pennsylvania libraries with bronze, silver and gold stars for achieving bench marks in their programming, activities, services and resources. The Gold Star is the highest level of accomplishment in the program and;

WHEREAS, the Star program works through five key literacies; basic information, civic and social, health and financial to assist all residents in enhancing their overall quality of life. The Star library program recognition offers support to libraries who participate and integrate those literacies in the programming activities.

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, That I, John Palmiere, Allegheny Council Member do hereby honor and congratulate the Jefferson Hills Library upon the occasion of being awarded the Pennsylvania Forward Gold Star Award and we extend sincere gratitude to it's trustees, staff, friends, volunteers, past and present for accomplishments, commitment and dedication to the surrounding communities and it's residents. And also, my fellow Board Members all commend you. And --- and congratulations.

(Applause.)

MS. RESCHENTHALER: Thank you so much. The --- Mr. Palmiere has certainly said most of the things that are included in the PA Forward Star Program but I'll let our program coordinator, Jane Milner who was instrumental, in other words, she did most of the work, explain a little bit about some of the intricacies of the star program. Thank you.

MS. MILNER: Thank you. Thank you for this wonderful honor. We're so happy to be here today. A year ago, the Allegheny County Library Association challenged libraries in Western Pennsylvania to be part of this great program that's been going on for two years in Pennsylvania. And the idea about that is to offer programs and services that will make our libraries in the 21st Century, the center of community services and activities.

So they gave us these benchmarks in the different literacies; financial, social --- civic and social information and basic, and it was a great blueprint to help us to plan our programs around these literacies. We had so much fun this year going through this benchmarks and --- and it was a great program and it helped us to,

like I said make our --- a library a place where people want to be to learn to grow, to socialize, to find out anything they want to know. If you came to our library on any day, you could see us signing someone up for Access Taxi or providing a program about their finances and retirement. And, we've just had a great time and we thank you for this great honor.

(Applause.)

(Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 10882 and the rest will be read into the record.

MR. BARKER: I apologize, 10881?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah, that one and the rest whatever read into the record.

MR. BARKER: 10881-18. A Proclamation honoring the National Wrestling Alliance Heavyweight Championship upon the occasion of it's 70th Anniversary, and recognizing Keystone State Wrestling Alliance Pittsburgh for hosting the 2018 FanFest and welcoming NWA World Heavyweight Championship back to Pittsburgh. Sponsored by Council Member DeFazio.

10882-18 and the remainder, Ms. Means, I --- do you want to hold these or do you want to pursue them?

MS. MEANS: Hold them.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Means would like to hold the next four for the next meeting.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Oh, so we don't have any more then?

MR. BARKER: We're done.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All right. We're done with them till later. Public comment on agenda items?

MR. BARKER: We have none.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We have none. Approval of minutes, 10866-18.

MR. BARKER: A Motion to approve the minutes of the October 9th, 2018 regular meeting of Council.

MR. MACEY: So moved.

MR. DEMARCO: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

Opposed?

The ayes have it.

Okay.

Move down to Committee on Budget and Finance,
Second Reading. 10816 --- no, 10810-18.

MR. BARKER: An Ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, establishing the tax levy upon all real property subject to taxation within the limits of Allegheny County. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Klein?

MR. KLEIN: At it's --- at it's committee meeting on the 28th of November, 2018, sorry about that. The Committee on Budget and Finance considered and affirmatively recommended approval of this budget resolution. At this time, I offer a motion to Council asking for approval of this ordinance.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, we will go with the ---

MR. BARKER: Mr. Baker?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Roll call.

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Catena?

MR. CATENA: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Kirk?

MS. KIRK: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmosina?

MR. PALMOSINA: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Prizio?

MS. PRIZIO: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Ranalli-Russell?

MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: Yes.

MR. BARKER: President Defazio?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ayes 13, nos zero. The bill passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 10838-18.

MR. BARKER: A Resolution of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, adopting an Operating Budget pursuant to Article IV, Section 2 and Article VII, Section 4 of the Home Rule Charter, by setting forth appropriations to pay the expenses of conducting the public business of Allegheny County and for meeting debt charges for the fiscal year beginning January 1st, 2019 and ending December 31st, 2019. Sponsored by Council Member Klein.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Thank you, Mr. President. At it's meeting on November 28th, 2018 the Committee on Budget and Finance considered and affirmatively recommended approval of this budget resolution. At this time, I offer a motion to Council asking for approval of this resolution.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in --- oh, we'll have the roll call.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Catena?

MR. CATENA: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Kirk?

MS. KIRK: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmosina?

MR. PALMOSINA: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Prizio?

MS. PRIZIO: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Ranalli-Russell?

MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: Yes.

MR. BARKER: President Defazio?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ayes 13, nos zero. The bill passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 10839-18.

MR. BARKER: A Resolution of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, adopting a Capital Budget pursuant to Article IV, Section 2 and Article VII, Section 4 of the Home Rule Charter by setting forth appropriations to pay the expenses for capital expenditures during the fiscal year beginning January 1st, 2019 and ending December 31st, 2019. Sponsored by Council Member Klein.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We had a motion and a second, no?

MR. BARKER: Not yet.

MR. KLEIN: Not yet.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: What?

MR. BARKER: Not yet, Mr. President.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

Representative Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Thank --- thank you, Mr. President.

At --- at it's meeting on November 28th, 2018 the Committee on Budget and Finance considered and affirmatively recommended approval of this budget resolution. At this time, I offer a motion to Council asking for it's approval.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, we'll go with the roll call.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Catena?

MR. CATENA: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Kirk?

MS. KIRK: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmosina?
MR. PALMOSINA: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Prizio?
MS. PRIZIO: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Ranalli-Russell?
MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?
MR. WALTON: Yes.
MR. BARKER: President Defazio?
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ayes 13, nos zero. The bill

passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 10840-18.

MR. BARKER: A Resolution of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, adopting the Grants Budget, Special Accounts Budget and Agency Fund Budget, by setting forth appropriations to pay said expenses during the fiscal year beginning January 1st, 2019 and ending December 31st, 2019. Sponsored by Council Member Klein.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Thank you, Mr. President. At it's meeting on November 28th, 2018 the Committee on Budget and Finance considered and affirmatively recommended approval of this budget resolution. At this time, I offer a motion to Council asking for it's approval.

MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, we'll have the roll call vote.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Baker?
MR. BAKER: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Catena?
MR. CATENA: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?
MR. DEMARCO: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Kirk?
MS. KIRK: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Klein?
MR. KLEIN: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Means?
MS. MEANS: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmosina?
MR. PALMOSINA: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Prizio?
MS. PRIZIO: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Ranalli-Russell?
MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?
MR. WALTON: Yes.
MR. BARKER: President Defazio?
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ayes 13, nos zero. The bill

passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 10875-18.

MR. BARKER: A Resolution approving a project to benefit Carnegie Mellon University to be financed by the Allegheny County Higher Education Building Authority by the issuance of the Authority's tax-exempt revenue bonds, in two or more series, to be designated "Allegheny County Higher Education Building Authority, Carnegie Mellon University Revenue Bonds, Series A of 2019" and "Allegheny County Higher Education Building Authority, Carnegie Mellon University Revenue Bonds Series B of 2019" or such other designations as may be determined by the Authority and the University, in an aggregate principal amount not to exceed \$125,000,000 provided that the taxing power of the County of Allegheny, Pennsylvania shall not be obligated in any way with respect to the bonds and declaring the financing of such project as desirable for the health, safety and welfare of the people in the County. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Walton?

MR. WALTON: Mr. President, November 29th, 2018 the Committee on Economic Development and Housing held a committee meeting and it was affirmative --- affirmatively recommended by Council --- by committee, to bring it to Council with a recommendation for approval.

MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, we'll have the roll call.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Baker?
MR. BAKER: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Catena?
MR. CATENA: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Kirk?
MS. KIRK: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Klein?
MR. KLEIN: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Means?
MS. MEANS: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Pamosina?
MR. PALMOSINA: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Prizio?
MS. PRIZIO: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Ranalli-Russell?
MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?
MR. WALTON: Yes.
MR. BARKER: President Defazio?
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ayes 13, nos zero. The bill

passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 10837-18.

MR. BARKER: An Ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, authorizing use of real property in the County Settler's Cabin Park to install and maintain a passive treatment system and to stabilize the streambank at Pinkerton Run Stream, in collaboration with the Allegheny County Parks Foundation. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Thank you, Mr. President and Members of Council. This --- this ordinance would allow the Allegheny County Parks Foundation to install a passive water treatment system in order to mitigate acid mine drainage currently flowing into Pinkerton Run, the stream that's in Settlers Cabin. And, we met with affirmative recommendation by the committee and I move for approval.

MS. MEANS: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Oh, Representative --- I can't.

MS. MEANS: Means, that's okay.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Sue Means?

MS. MEANS: I was wondering, Mr. President if maybe the County manager or the Parks director could come up and talk about this project a little bit? I'm very excited about it and I think it's a wonderful project and I believe the project itself costs about almost \$500 --- half a million dollars, and it's going to take a stream that was polluting and it's going to clean the water in a passive treatment plant and --- and I want to thank the Allegheny County Parks Foundation because they went and helped get the grant from the EPA to fund this project.

MR. MCKAIN: You're right. As Council Member Means stated, it is a really exciting project. Andy Baechle came to the Parks Committee meeting and talked about it very enthusiastically and I think the members that were there would tell you that it's something he's wanted to do. So it's out at --- at Settler's Cabin, Pinkerton Run and it's stream bank stabilization project. It's in conjunction with the Parks Foundation. Caren Glotfelty, the Parks Foundation director led all of this as far as obtaining the grant. She really look at lead in it.

Some of the details are. There is an acid mine treatment system that would be constructed. It's stabilization of an eroding steam --- stream bank. The project will encompass 1,000 feet of Pinkerton Run Road. Andy was describing to me that when you come into the botanic garden and it's a, you know a beautiful project that they have. If you look to the left, it's in that area when you come through the entrance there. It will potentially improve water quality along the 2,900 feet of stream.

As Council Member Means said, it's --- it's near \$500,000. It's about \$473,000. Caren led the effort in conjunction with our Parks Department and got \$318,672 dollars of the \$473. So we're kicking in about \$132,000. We're working with the --- an environmental company. They're going to help with the AMD treatment design and engineering, stream bank stabilization design. Also, were partnering with the Allegheny County Conservation District who is going to help us with the permit reviews and also we're going to take water sampling analysis.

And if I remember, Andy kind of led --- ended his presentation telling all of us he hopes somebody we all can do some trout fishing there some day. So --- so it is a great project and --- and we appreciate full

Council's consideration but Mr. Palmiere will tell you it was a good exchange of information, something very exciting. It could enhance the visits to your park.

MS. MEANS: Mr. McKain, I --- I did attend the meeting and --- and there was one question I didn't think to ask. I notice that the Parks Foundation will help maintain ---- pay the costs of the maintaining the water treatment plan up until 2020 and do --- and then, what will happen after that?

MR. MCKAIN: After that, the County will assume the maintenance of that and I'll build that in --- in our program and future budgets.

MS. MEANS: And at this time, you don't have any idea how much that's going to be?

MR. MCKAIN: We don't. When they come back with a design, then we're going to ask them. Often, it's like 15 percent but it just depends but we'll incorporate that pm. Once it's installed, I'll be able to more informatively tell County Council what I think that is. It's something we can handle.

MS. MEANS: Well, thank you because ---

MR. MCKAIN: Thank you.

MS. MEANS: A lot of time you build something and then you don't maintain it.

MR. MCKAIN: No, we --- that's one --- I will tell you that's one of the mantras of this administration. If we build it, we agree with --- with Council, we should maintain it. Otherwise, we shouldn't build it. We either knock it down or we improve it and maintain it.

MS. MEANS: Thank you very much.

MR. WALTON: Mr. President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah?

MR. WALTON: I'd like to take this opportunity on this ordinance, to commend the role that the administration has played in terms of addressing a whole host of environmental challenges. Just recently, Secretary --- Director of Economic Development, Lance Chimka participated in a series of discussions that were hosted --- that was hosted at the united steelworkers addressing the issue of climate change and mitigation of environmental challenges here in Western Pa.

And just last week, the County Executive gave some really progressive comments at an issue --- at a meeting that was addressing the issue of climate change. We can't overstate the need for progressive actions that

mitigate environmental damage. And to --- for the role that the County is playing in addressing these --- these challenges that we can --- that we're confronted with play a huge role. Because again, many of the landslides, many of the --- with the collapse of US 30. There is a whole host of things and the floods and the issues that economic development has done in terms of the flooding issues that have come up over the last year.

The County has played an incredibly critical and progressive role in trying to mitigate some of those challenges. And I want to commend manager McKain and the administration for moving these processes forward. Thank you, sir.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any other remarks? Seeing none, we'll take the roll call vote.

MR. BARKER: On the motion to approve.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Catena?

MR. CATENA: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Kirk?

MS. KIRK: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmosina?

MR. PALMOSINA: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Prizio?

MS. PRIZIO: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Ranalli-Russell?

MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: Yes.

MR. BARKER: President Defazio?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ayes 13, noz zero. The bill passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Liaison reports, anyone?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MR. MACEY: Thank you, Mr. President and Member --- Members of Council. I'd just like to take this moment and have everybody, you know, join with me in the memory of George Herbert Walker Bush. You know, I know he's a Republican and I don't care about political persuasions of one way or another, but I think this guy was --- he was our President and he was an exceptional person, in my opinion. And that, we need to remember these kind of people who have made a difference. Not only in our lives, not only in our Country but in our world. And I just think that he was a different and special person. And, other than that I'd like to wish everybody a wonderful holiday season and that's it. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any other remarks, comments? We'll start with Representative Sue Means.

MS. MEANS: Thank you, Mr. President. I just wanted to add to Mr. Macey's comment and say that George Herbert Walker Bush was a veteran and in --- he was part of the greatest generation and served in World War II as a --- as a Navy pilot and he served his Country in many aspects. And even after he was President, he continued to do humanitarian work and be a loving, kind, caring person that really cared about America. And I thank Ms. --- Councilman Macey's first comments. Thank you very much, Mr. President.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

Who else? Go ahead, Representative Palmiere.

MR. PALMIERE: Thank you, Mr. President. While were complimenting people in administration, I --- there is a couple of things I wanted to mention today. Worthington Avenue has been closed out there on Oneida Road in Jefferson Hills since June --- June 14th this year. It's --- it's a Route 51 and Oneida Drive in --- in Jefferson Hills, so it's open for the first time in a long time and it reopened today with through traffic.

Even though it's going to be --- it's still going to be under construction but at least the traffic is going to be moving through there. I also wanted to mention that 100 Acres Road in South Park.

OPERATOR'S VOICE: Your request will be answered by the next available ---

MR. MACEY: And there you go.

MR. PALMIERE: Geez, thanks a lot lady. That was really --- oh well. 100 Acres Road in South Park has been closed since August 23rd, it reopened today and I wanted to compliment Mr. Shanley and his crew at Public Works to --- to tell them that we are very pleased with the work that they do and they do wonderful work and it's really appreciated. Thank you very much, Mr. President.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

Representative Palmosina, or no ---
Representative Baker.

MR. BAKER: All right. Thanks, Mr. President. Just a reminder, I shared this at the last meeting but our second annual District 1 Ross/Westview trivia night is tomorrow night. I'm looking at you Cindy Kirk because you grew up in Ross Township. She's not looking at me, but everyone is encouraged to come if their --- Cindy I was picking on you because you live --- you grew up in Ross but our second annual District 1 trivia --- that's right, trivia night is tomorrow night. And It's just a nice chance for folks from Ross and Westview within my District, get to do some trivia, learn what's --- a little bit about the history of our District and all of the good things that are going on.

Lots of other events going on within District 1 certainly in the next two weeks. One neat idea, I was at a Institute of Politics Education Committee meeting today and I've been curious, you know for my colleagues we can talk about this offline but I'd be curious to know that he was talking about if --- if any members of Council have ever held like an educational forum through all of the superintendent's principles, PTO presidents from throughout their District. I just thought it was a neat concept, maybe I can work on it with Kat and the other staff but I thought it was a neat idea to bring down --- bring together --- I did town halls over summer are bringing together a lot of commissioners and supervisors and Council Members but I thought the idea of specifically focusing on education and especially because we have an education committee was particularly interesting.

So, I'd love to collaborate with colleagues on that and maybe we could even do a joint District and District kind of event and maybe work with the administration as well on it. It could be excellent. So, lots of good stuff going on and I'll have lots more fun things to report next time. Thanks.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead, Representative Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Thank you, Mr. President. I'd just like to mention that on Thursday evening, this coming Thursday, December 6th from 7 to 9 --- 9 p.m. There is a public program, public forum and the title of it is, protecting our communities, environmental challenges from fossil fuel extraction in Southwestern Pennsylvania.

It is being sponsored by, I believe it's the Community of Caring and it's being held at the Jewish Community Center of Greater Pittsburgh on Forbes Avenue in Squirrel Hill. And, there are a number of elected officials who will be present in addition to individuals who can speak to some of the challenges that we face in this area and I think there will be a number of organizations that will be participating, will be present there. They will have, you know, tables set up. So, for those of you who have an interest in this important subject this is, again is Thursday, the 6th of December, this Thursday from 7 to 9 o'clock in the evening. So, thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Seeing no more, we'll move on. New business, 10887-18.

MR. BARKER: An Ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, authorizing the acceptance of approximately one and one half acres of land located adjacent to the County's White Oak Park. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll be referred to the Committee on Parks. 10888-18.

MR. BARKER: An Ordinance approving the sale of a parcel of property identified as 4991 Library Road, Bethel Park, PA, comprised of Block and Lots 392-F-225, 392-F-215, 392-F-175, 392-F-165, 392-G-110 and 392-F-200, to 25R624 Realty, LLC a Pennsylvania Limited Liability Company for the sale price of \$400,000. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll be referred to the Committee on Economic Development and Housing. 10889-18.

MR. BARKER: An Ordinance approving the sale of approximately 8.2031 gross acres, 7.9993 net acres of County property located on McIntyre Road in Ross Township, Pennsylvania, 15237 identified as a portion of Lot and Block Number 612-S-64 known as the John J. Kane Regional Center-Ross Township, to Regional Development Partners-

McKnight Road LP for the sale price of \$1.25 million dollars. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That will be referred to the Committee on Economic Development and Housing. 10890-18.

MR. BARKER: A Resolution of the Council of the County of Allegheny ratifying asbestos abatement permit application fee increases approved by the Allegheny County Health Department pursuant to the Allegheny County Code of Ordinances, Section 505-49C8. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll be referred to the Committee on Health and Human Services. New business motions, 10891-18.

MR. BARKER: A Motion of the Council of Allegheny County to continue the services of Attorney John F. Cambest to provide legal advice, representation and consultation to County Council. Sponsored by Council Member Walton.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Walton?

MR. WALTON: We believe that attorney Cambest provided solid service and we --- we would recommend that we approve a renewal of his contract.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Someone second?

MR. PALMIERE: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

Opposed?

MS. MEANS: I --- I oppose.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

One opposed. All right. So the ayes have it. Let's move down to notification of contracts?

MR. BARKER: We have none.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: None. Public comment on general items?

MR. BARKER: There is several signed up.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

Start --- you can start reading them off.

MR. BARKER: First up is Alison Fujito.

MS. FUJITO: I'd like to know what recourse the public has when some of us have highly relevant information on immense problems with the HPV vaccine issue but are limited to three minute public comments. Would it be possible for County Council to invite concerned citizens to give longer presentations as an agenda item at

the next public meeting, and could we please have a public hearing looking into the actions of the Board of Health over the last two and a half years regarding HPV vaccinations. They have gone way beyond oops, we forgot to be transparent.

There is a long chain of troubling actions here and three minutes is not enough time to inform you of the depth of the problems. As I understand it, weeks before the June 6th, 2016 Board of Health public forum on a potential HPC vaccine mandate. The Board of Health contacted dozens of doctors inviting them to speak in favor of a mandate. The public --- can --- can I have a little more time and I'll wait until everybody is paying attention?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.

MS. FUJITO: Thank you. The public, on the other hand learned about the forum on the morning news the day of the forum. One of the doctors, Miriam Kramer failed to disclose that she had received \$8,000 from MERC one month earlier for promotional speaking on Gardasil, the HPV vaccine. The Board of Health failed to disclose this also. I include a transcript of her public comment in binders, which I'll give you because it contains anecdotes of the kind that get dismissed when made by parents vaccine-injured kids and it contains claims of safety and efficacy that are simply not supported by the data.

On July 11th, 2016 UPMC held a press briefing in which they stated that in two days, the Allegheny County Board of Health would be need --- meeting to vote on the HPC vaccine requirement and, quote, it's decision will set the pace for other Counties, the State and hopefully the nation. That's still on their website. But on July 13th, it was clearly stated, during the meeting by Deputy Director Abby Wilson that the Board would not be voting that day on implementing a mandate and that's in the minutes as well.

Many of those in attendance at that meeting left at that point believing that the issue was now tabled, since some who had registered to speak were told that there was no time for them to come, that they would make their comments at the next meeting. And as soon as they left, a vote to implement mandate was called. Those still left in attendance called out that it violated protocol that public comment had not all been heard. And after a

hasty discussion, it was corroborated by the Board's constitutional attorney that indeed, they could not proceed to vote on mandate but none of that was written in the minutes. It is, however in the video of the public meeting.

Last month, the Board completely ignored letters addressed to them from mothers who's children died from HPV vaccine. They never even sent the mother's an acknowledgement and discussed only how to increase acceptance of this vaccine and voted on a resolution that was not on the agenda and shouted down someone who questioned procedure.

This is not about being pro-vaccine or anti-vaccine. This is about honesty, transparency and integrity. I can think of no greater way for the public to lose faith in both public health officials and the democratic process then what our Board of Health has done with the HPV vaccine issue. Thank you for letting me speak.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Do you have ---

MR. MACEY: Well, I --- with all do respect, ma'am. I have a doctor that's a nurse.

MS. FUJITO: Yes?

MR. MACEY: And I have --- my youngest daughter is a victim of HPV. I was ---

MS. FUJITO: Can we discuss?

MR. MACEY: No, no.

MS. FUJITO: I'm happy to answer questions.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No, we --- were not allowed.

MR. MACEY: So, I just wanted you to know that I --- it wasn't that I wasn't paying attention, I'm very familiar.

MS. FUJITO: Oh, I see what you mean.

MR. MACEY: Thank you.

MR. BARKER: Next up is Casey Bonidie.

MS. BONIDIE: Hello everyone. Thank you for your time and attention. Councilwoman Means, I wrote you an e-mail recently thanking you for your integrity. I took time out of our day to come and thank you in person. Thank you.

Many people share your feelings of shock and upset in regard to the potential violation of the Sunshine Act by the Board of Health when they chose to take a sudden vote, which was not on the agenda for a resolution to recommend the HPV vaccine. Why were they in such a

rush to take this vote, what is the motivation behind this? Could one or more of the Board Members potentially have a conflict of interest driving these questionable actions? When did the Board write the resolution? When did the Board of Health --- why did the Board of Health not read the resolution aloud and why was the public not given time to comment.

I'm only left to wonder and to stress. Where's the oversight? If it could be true that the Board of Health tried to sneak this vote past the public, what else might they choose to take a vote on without the proper protocol? The Human Papillomavirus is not transmitted in a school setting. It makes me furious that the Gardasil uptake rates are already being tracked when this is not a mandated vaccine.

The science that brought this vaccine to market is questionable at best. I've done my research on this vaccine. I've also seen what cancer can do to a person and do to a family. Recently, I watched my father's body wither away. I watched as his strong body faded thin. I made meals he could not keep down and I cleaned his vomit. I heard his moans of pain constantly and I wiped the blood from his forehead when he fell because his legs could no longer hold him up.

I quietly cried by his side when he refused to sleep as he fought off death. Those memories of my father's passing will live with me forever. I know what cancer does to people. I would never allow my children to receive this vaccine, ever. Serious adverse reactions occur after the Gardasil shots. Known victims of Gardasil have fainted after their injections, hit their head and died. Victims are ending up in wheelchairs because their legs can no longer hold them up.

These teens are on 20 different medications, managing symptoms and no one can help them. Members of the Council, I beg that you remove the Board of Health's resolution for a recommendation for the HPV vaccine. The benefit does not outweigh the risk. Thank you for your time, and I have a copy of this for all of you if you would like it.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Next?

MR. BARKER: Next is Francine Pugliese.

MS. PUGLIESE: Good evening. My name is Francine Pugliese. I'm here to comment about the Allegheny County Health Board. On September 14th, 2016 I

spoke at a regular scheduled meeting about my concerns of the HPV vaccine. At that time, I provided a binder to each Health Board member. The same binder that I am providing to each of you tonight. In this binder, you will see 50 cases of adverse effects linked to the HPV vaccine including my daughter's. Also included are three peer-review studies. This is a small fraction of the world-wide injuries of the HPV vaccine. All of these particular cases involve the dysfunction of the autonomic nervous system.

I picked these cases, in particular because my daughter also suffers from autonomic dysfunction posed by the HPV vaccine. Her vaccine injury occurred 11 years ago and till this day, every day is a struggle for her. As I spoke that day in 2018, I felt as though the Health Board had a predetermined decision about the HPV vaccine. The only time an eyebrow was raised was when I was closing in on my three minutes. I felt them counting down the clock rather than listening to my words.

I was trying to provide them with data to open up a conversation, to be productive of a talk on HPV vaccine. No one opened a binder, no one followed up with a phone call, an e-mail to investigate my concerns. As you well know, the bulk of the Health Board is made up of physicians. Physicians that should have an inherent empathy quality for anyone suffering. I saw no sign of empathy. I did see ignorance and I saw arrogance.

Fast forward to the most recent Board of Health meeting where a resolution was brought forth by Dr. Lee Harrison for the recommendation that, by the Health Board for every child in Allegheny County to receive an HPV vaccine. This resolution was not on the agenda. Concerned citizens called and asked if it would be on the agenda and were told no.

I am asking this Council, did the Allegheny County Board of Health violate the Sunshine Act? I believe they may and it certainly needs investigated. I am asking this Council to please do what is just. Why is there no conversation? Why is the Health Board trying to pass resolutions without proper process? There is a problem with this vaccine. It's very concerning and sad that the Health Board members, especially a physician would walk away from an injured child. This is not a Health Board that has Allegheny County residents in their best interest. Thank you very much.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

MR. BARKER: Next up is Josh Nymon.

MR. NYMON: Hello Council. Thank you for your time. The Allegheny County Board of Health has again received negative attention for their outright exclusion of the public in their passing of the resolution recommended the --- and they recommended the controversial HPV vaccine.

The vaccine has caused serious life-altering debilitation in many pre-teens and teens. We're asking you that you allow the public to have a hearing to give us an opportunity to express our concerns. To give experts and parents of injured children the opportunity to give input. Input on why the Board of Health needs public oversight and should not have ignored the public on this vaccine. Input on parents of children like Christopher Bunch, dying three weeks from acute disseminated myelitis, three weeks after he got the vaccination.

The Pennsylvania Sunshine Law is in place to force public agencies to be transparent. The public is supposed to be made aware of resolutions and allowed --- and allowed to give input before the --- a vote occurs. Discussions on resolutions are supposed to occur in the public eye and not behind closed doors. Who is overseeing the Board of Health? What consequence will the Board of Health face for ignoring the Sunshine Act? Who will stop this from happening again?

There are hundreds of vaccines in the works by pharmaceutical companies to be introduced in the future. How many of these vaccines will the Board of Health try to force on our kids in Allegheny County? When will it end? And lastly, why is there no parental choice mentioned in this resolution. Thank you guys for your time.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Next?

MR. BARKER: Last up is Jessica Fitzgerald.

MS. FITZGERALD: Hello. My name is Jessica Fitzgerald and thank you for allowing me to be here today to speak with you all. My --- I'm here, also with concerns of the Allegheny County Board of Health's lack of concern with the injuries and deaths caused by the HPV vaccine.

The Allegheny County Board of Health tried to mandate this vaccine two years ago, and just recently voted unannounced to us on a resolution to recommend this controversial vaccine. We heard testimonials from friends

and strangers all across the world who have been harmed by the HPV vaccine. We see countries like Japan, pulling their recommendation of this vaccine because of the many injuries and deaths. We also see over 59,000 reports on -- of injury and death in the vaccine adverse event reporting system, VARS which is --- actually it's estimated that only about one percent of the reactions are reported here. And with only about 50 percent of school children getting this vaccine right now, if recommended or mandated we can conclude that these injury and death rates will increase dramatically.

When we voiced these concerns to the Allegheny County Board of Health, they blatantly disregarded it and voted on a recommendation for HPV vaccine for our children. I don't believe they're taking us seriously, so we need help. In fact, one of the Allegheny County Board of Health members was on a Facebook video on a sparked page making trivial VARS reports of the HPV vaccine stating that folks will say, quote, oh but look at the VARS. There's 5,000 things in the VARS and that's why they're often talking about when they say there has been these adverse events. Then we say to them yes, but nobody actually investigated it, end quote.

I do not consider VARS --- I do not consider VARS a trivial thing. In fact, the CDC says, quote, on their website. The vaccine adverse events reporting system is a National Vaccine Safety Surveillance program run by the CDC and the Food and Drug Administration. VARS serves as an early warning system to detect possible safety issues and the U.S. vaccines by collecting information about adverse events, possible side effects and health problems that occur after a vaccination, end quote.

And to clarify the VAR --- the actual VARS count is 59,000 not 5,000 as the Allegheny County Board of Health member stated and this includes 438 deaths from this vaccine. Again, with all the testimonies around here, we know that this vaccine is a major problem and I'm not willing to see the children of Allegheny County be injured from an unsafe vaccine because the Allegheny County Board of Health is overreaching and recommending a vaccine and a vaccine of a disease that is not communicable and not even a public health issue.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All right. You're going to have to wrap it up in a sentence real quick?

MS. FITZGERALD: Thank you.
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Oh, okay. Thank you.
MR. BARKER: That's it.
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Does someone want to make a
motion to adjourn?
MR. CATENA: So moved.
MR. DEMARCO: Second.
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Second. All those in favor
signify by saying aye.
(Chorus of ayes.)
Opposed?
The ayes have it. Meeting adjourned. Thank
you.

MEETING CONCLUDED AT 5:59 P.M.

CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify, as the stenographic reporter, that the foregoing proceedings were taken stenographically by me, and thereafter reduced to typewriting by me or under my direction; and that this transcript is a true and accurate record to the best of my ability.

Dated the 21st day of January, 2019

A handwritten signature in cursive script, reading "Jeremy Harris", is written over a horizontal line.

Jeremy Harris,

Court Reporter