

ALLEGHENY COUNTY COUNCIL

REGULAR MEETING

- - -

BEFORE:

John P. DeFazio	-	President, Council-At-Large
Nicholas Futules	-	Vice President, District 7
Samuel DeMarco	-	Council-At-Large
Tom Baker	-	District 1
Cindy Kirk	-	District 2
Ed Kress	-	District 3
Michael J. Finnerty	-	District 4
Sue Means	-	District 5 (Via Telephone)
John F. Palmiere	-	District 6
Dr. Charles J. Martoni	-	District 8
Robert J. Macey	-	District 9
DeWitt Walton	-	District 10
Paul Klein	-	District 11
James Ellenbogen	-	District 12
Denise Ranalli-Russell	-	District 13

Allegheny County Courthouse  
Fourth Floor, Gold Room  
436 Grant Street  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219

Tuesday, July 12, 2016 - 5:09 p.m.

SARGENT'S COURT REPORTING SERVICE, INC.  
429 Forbes Avenue, Suite 1300  
Pittsburgh, PA 15219  
(412) 232-3882 FAX (412) 471-8733

IN ATTENDANCE:

William McKain	-	Allegheny County Manager
Jared Barker	-	Director of Constituent Services
Joseph Catanese	-	Director of Legislative Services
Jack Cambest	-	Council Solicitor

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: The meeting will come to order. Will you all rise for the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag and remain standing for silent prayer or reflection? After me ---.

(Pledge of Allegiance recited.)

(Moment of Silent Prayer or Reflection.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We'll have the roll call.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Here.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Kirk?

MS. KIRK: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Kress?

(No response.)

MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Present.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Here.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Here.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Ranalli-Russell?

MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: Here.

MR. BARKER: President DeFazio?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Here.

MR. BARKER: We have 14 members present at the moment.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9745-16.

MR. BARKER: Proclamation recognizing Pittsburgh's 3rd Annual DreamOn Festival in downtown Pittsburgh's Market Square from August 5th through 6th, 2016 and thanking everyone involved with the festival for

bringing the community together. Sponsored by Council member Walton and Controller Wagner.

MS. Wagner was not able to be here tonight.

MR. WALTON: I would like to call the participants forward who are going to represent this; Joshua Pollard, Emily Hammers, Usmah Abdul-Ghaffar, is it Laiken (pronouncing) Brown, Diego Davidson, Emmanuel Davis, Jomar Davis, Delaja Evans, Anthony Harris, Jr. and Niya Ingram.

It is with a distinct amount of pleasure that we're able to do this this evening because this organization does a real service to our community. The DreamOn Festival began not too long ago. And they do great work and on top of it the business creates entrepreneurs, and they give back to our community in so many ways. So with that being said ---

WHEREAS, since its conception, the DreamOn Festival has become a one of a kind annual Allegheny County tradition drawing more than 50,000 visitors to Market Square in downtown Pittsburgh to enjoy music, art and ice cream.

AND WHEREAS, the free admission, family friendly DreamOn Fest is a celebration of the region's homegrown talent showcasing over 20 musical acts and representing a variety of genres. The event is also an opportunity to support the dreams of community members by purchasing any of the 20 flavors from Pittsburgh Dream Cream Ice Cream parlor, and ---

WHEREAS, the DreamOn Fest provides a unique opportunity for public high school students to receive entrepreneurship training from DreamOn Fest founder Mr. Joshua Pollard, CEO and co-founder of Omicelo, a consultancy for small and future business. Through Omicelo Cares, students use real estate principles and a sustainable business curriculum to plan and organize the high profile citywide event.

AND WHEREAS, events such as DreamOn Fest would not be possible without the talents, efforts and support of volunteers, donors and sponsors. Allegheny County Council, along with Allegheny County Controller Chelsea Wagner does hereby thank all of these contributors, as well those visiting the DreamOn Festival working to make this annual event possible and in the years ahead.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Allegheny Council, in conjunction with Allegheny County

Controller Chelsea Wagner, does hereby recognize and thank Pittsburgh's third DreamOn Festival, August 5th and 7th, 2016 for bringing the community together, and its dedication to mentoring and aspiring youth, thereby enhancing the quality of life in Pittsburgh and Allegheny Council. Sponsored by myself and Controller Wagner and presented this 12th day of June (sic). Signed by Council President John DeFazio and attested to by Chief of Staff Joe Cantanese.

Joshua, with that, thank you. And comments, --- (Applause.)

MR. POLLARD: Thank you, my brother.

MR. WALTON: --- brief ---.

MR. POLLARD: I will make this very brief so that the students can have a just a few, very brief moments to speak. I want to thank you, President DeFazio, Mr. Walton, also Controller Wagner. At the end of day, I grew up in Braddock, Pennsylvania. One of the wealthiest men in our county took a shot on me and allowed me to go to Sewickley Academy. As a result I, by the age of 25, was about to run Equity Research for Goldman Sachs in the world of real estate. And I came back to Pittsburgh with one very specific mission, to allow bright, young students like the ones that are in front of you have an opportunity to be business owners, to be a part of the great promise of our growing county. You'll hear just a very brief few moments from them, and I want to thank you guys for all the great work that you're doing in our county. We're going to succeed.

(Applause.)

MR. DAVIDSON: My name is Deigo Davidson. I'm 16 years old and I attend Barack Obama Academy. And I'd just like to say that Omicelo Cares has affected my life in many ways to get me ready for the future. I've been able to gain entrepreneurial experience through our weekly meetings planning the DreamOn Festival. I've been --- we all have gotten to learn about accounting, finance and business operations and more.

I feel that we've gotten a historical learning of what it takes to run a business through the process of developing it from beginning to end.

In addition, we all get to break apart and working on skills we like such as budget. Then we come together as a group and learn how to collaborate on ideas and improve our interpersonal skills.

Personally, I want to work in real estate myself and ultimately want to run my own company. This opportunity helps me understand business more by communicating, budgeting and planning for the DreamOn Festival. And I'll pass it to my peer, Emmanuel.  
(Applause.)

MR. DAVIS: My name is Emmanuel Davis, and I'm starting a company soon with my friends, and Omicelo Cares has given me more competence and knowledge to put together a well-organized business. And also, I've gotten to use my digital media skills to do some design work for the festival, which I'm really proud of. Thank you.  
(Applause.)

MS. EVANS: Hello, everybody. My name is Delaja Evans, and I believe that our experience with Omicelo Cares --- can you lower this, please? I believe our experience with Omicelo Cares will help us go to college and give us an advantage to be build our résumés. In the long run, we all hope to own --- we all hope to be entrepreneurs and possibly own our own businesses. The DreamOn Festival not only benefits us, but we think it benefits the entire Pittsburgh community. And it brings us all together. The festival gathers diverse crowds to celebrate and become inspired by different cultures and ways of thinking. We believe it provides an eventful day that can keep the youth out of trouble, parents happy and project a better image of Pittsburgh. Overall, the DreamOn Festival provides new experiences and a happy and positive atmosphere. We thank you again for giving us this Proclamation and the opportunity to be here.  
(Applause.)

MR. WALTON: Thank you. We need to come up front and take a picture.  
(Pictures taken.)

MR. FINNERTY: Do you mind if I co-sponsor?

MR. WALTON: Yes, sir. Any ---.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I will.

MR. BARKER: Does anyone not want to be added? Everybody is on? Okay.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Everybody is on board. It's a good day.

MR. FINNERTY: Absolutely. It's a great day.  
(Pictures taken.)  
(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9747-16.

MR. BARKER: Proclamation welcoming the 81st National Convention for the Italian American War Veterans at the Wyndham Grand Hotel in downtown Pittsburgh from August 4th through the 6th, 2016. Sponsored by Council members DeFazio, Futules and Martoni and Palmiere.

MR. DEMARCO: I'd like to co-sponsor that as well.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: (Indicating.)

MR. FINNERTY: (Indicating.)

MR. BARKER: Anybody not want to be added at this point? Everybody again; okay.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Is anyone coming up for the --- okay. I'm going to read the Proclamation and then you guys, if you want to say something. Then Jerry's coming back on the next one.

WHEREAS, Allegheny County is pleased to welcome the Italian American War Veterans of the United States for its 81st National Convention at the Wyndham Grand Hotel in downtown Pittsburgh from August 4th through August 6th, 2016.

AND WHEREAS, founded in Hanford (sic), Connecticut --- I don't need my glasses for that --- yeah, Connecticut in 1932 and chartered by Congress on November 20th, 1981. The Italian American War Veterans of United States and Women's Auxiliary assist American veterans of both genders and all national origins.

AND WHEREAS, with chartered posts in Connecticut, Florida, Illinois, Massachusetts, New Jersey, New York, Ohio, Pennsylvania and Rhode Island, the Italian War Veterans is established for the purpose of caring for fellow veterans and their families, to foster patriotism in the community and to strengthen the ideals of God and Country.

AND WHEREAS, the Italian American War Veterans of the United States volunteers thousands of man hours annually to help hospitalized veterans.

AND WHEREAS, the post of the Italian American War Veterans of the United States participate in local celebrations of Memorial Day, the 4th of July, Veterans Day any other patriotic events.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Allegheny County Council does hereby extend a warm welcome to the members and families of the Italian American War Veterans of the United States upon the occasion of its 81st National Convention, August 4th through 6th, 2016.

And we invite the group to return to Allegheny County for future conventions. Sponsored by myself, Nick Futules, and I think Chuck Martoni.

So any of you guys want to say a couple of words before I bring up Jerry? Go ahead.

MR. CHIAPPINELLI: On behalf of the members all over the United States of the Italian American War Vets, it is 33 year --- 35 years I've been a member. And I worked my way up through the chairs. The Italian American War Vets do work, and they have a list of the purposes of the organization; to aid and assist veterans and their families, to uphold the integrity of the United States, to promote patriotism and civic affairs and encourage benevolence and stability within the organizations that they have touched.

I have the honor of being a National Commander, and I've changed the organization to a modern organization, and it's going to grow here in Pittsburgh, enormously, because the Italian War Vets is, right now, in the process of looking for a location for a national headquarters and a National Italian American Museum and Historic Society. So thank you very much on behalf of all our members and God bless each and every one of you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Nick didn't want to say anything. Wait until the next one. 9748-16.

MR. BARKER: Proclamation honoring Jerry Genaro Chiappinelli, National Commander of the Italian American War Veterans, for his lifetime achievements. Sponsored by Council members DeFazio, Futules and Martoni and presumably the rest of the body as well.

MR. BAKER: I'd like to be added, too.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Before I read this Proclamation, I'd like to say a few words about Jerry Chiappinelli. I've seen him at all the --- throughout the years, going way back, at all the different parades and different events, different political meetings, all kind of different meetings. He seems to go everywhere. If people invite him, he comes, unless he's busy out of town or whatever, but he's everywhere. He does a good job. I never met ---

MR. VICARI: Tony Vicari (phonetic).

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: --- Tony. Tonight is the first time I met Tony. Tonight is the first night I met him so I can't say too much about him, but if Jerry says he's a good guy, he must be a good guy.

MR. CHIAPPINELLI: A good guy. He's the National Quartermaster.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Then he's good.

MR. KRUTSICK: He's from McKees Rocks. We won't hold that against him.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I'm going to read this Proclamation.

WHEREAS, Jerry Chiappinelli of Penn Hills will become the National Commander of the Italian American War Veterans of United States at their 81st National Convention in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania on August 4th through 6th, 2016.

AND WHEREAS, Mr. Chiappinelli grew up in East Liberty and graduated from Central Catholic High School. In 1965 he joined the U.S. Army and served as a staff sergeant during the Vietnam era.

AND WHEREAS, Mr. Chiappinelli, has been a member of the Italian American War Veterans of the United States since 1982. He served on the Board of Managers, of Soldiers and Sailors Memorial Hall and Museum from 1988 until 1995. He is the chairman of the ITAM Washington Conference, commander of the ITAM Post 1, Allegheny County, a life member of the Disabled American Veterans and the American Legion. He served as president of the Italian Sons and Daughters of America, Progressive Lodge 104 and as a veteran behalf --- as a veteran behalf coordinator.

AND WHEREAS, Mr. Chiappinelli, an insurance agent with Chiappinelli and Associates, is founder and owner of the Steel City Angels and a professional dance company. And he has produced countless stage shows throughout Allegheny County.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, the Allegheny County Council does hereby congratulate Mr. Jerry Chiappinelli upon the occasion of being named the National Commander of the Italian American War Veterans of United States. And we recognize Mr. Chiappinelli for his lifetime achievements and service to our country, the Italian American War Veterans of United States and Allegheny County. Sponsored by myself, Nick Futules and now actually sponsored by --- everybody agreed to sponsor this.

So Jerry, before I ask you to say a few words, I'm going to ask Nick Futules if he wants to say a few

words while he's up here. He probably wants you to dance. He said you're ---.

MR. CHIAPPINELLI: We didn't bring the girls in.

MR. FUTULES: Sure. How can you not talk about Jerry Chiappinelli? I've known Jerry for years and years and years. The Steel City, how many years has that been?

MR. CHIAPPINELLI: Steel City is 36 years.

MR. FUTULES: Thirty-six (36) years and still going strong. So you see them in the parades with the gold outfits, and they do well with all that loud music. And there's Jerry out in front of them the whole time. And Jerry is from Penn Hills, by the way. And that is my hometown where I've grown up and lived most of my life. This year, early, I met a man by the name of Dale Barnett. Dale Barnett was the National Commander for the American Legion. And I had given him a Proclamation in Springdale where he had visited. There were several hundred members of all the organizations that come. And he had asked me a question. He asked me if I was a veteran and I said, no, I'm not. He said was your father a veteran? I said, yes, he was. He says great. You're the son of a veteran. You can join the American Legion. So that night I joined the American Legion before I gave him the Proclamation. And when I was finished, he announced to everybody that I was the newest member of the American Legion. And after his speech, he made us all realize what the importance of the American Legion is to everybody in the United States. The war veterans and how important it is for everybody to support that group. And that was his mission. And I asked him how often does he do it? He says I'm on the road 330 days a year. And it's a one-year term. I'm not sure what year yours is.

MR. CHIAPPINELLI: One --- two year.

MR. FUTULES: Two year. And he's only home basically one day a week, on Sundays. So it's a six-day job. And they go around promoting the importance, like I said, of the American Legion. And I'm sure Jerry will be very worthy of that position as well here, and I congratulate him for that because I've known him for years. And I know he's one of those guys that will --- he's already said it. He's actually changed the way they do things. So I'm proud to have him as my constituent and my friend. Thank you.

MR. CHIAPPINELLI: Thanks, Nick. I want to say something because I'm never sure of the words. By the

way, I've known Mr. DeFazio way back in the East Liberty days. Mr. Futules, I've known probably 30, 40 years. A lot of you gentlemen and ladies I know very well. I'm just a poor Italian boy from Larimer Avenue. I mean, everybody always says that. You see these people say I'm just a poor farm boy and all that. I fell in love with veterans and patriotism when I was in East Liberty, and there was a Sergeant Basilone Club right down the street. And I'm sure some of you remember. And Sergeant Basilone was the first Italian American, I think, to win the Medal of Honor. And then as I grew up, I had the privilege of meeting --- and my dad and everybody knows that we were all in politics. I met Mike Musmanno. And that was another inspiration. And I got this --- your cousin, I know --- he's from McKees Rocks. This is Tony Vacari. He's my National Quartermaster and my right hand, so we worked very hard and close together.

But the idea --- when I went to the service, I enjoyed the camaraderie. And I was never a Boy Scout so this was the first time wore a different uniform. But in East Liberty, that was not --- there was no Boy Scouts. East Liberty, you gained the --- by the time I went to basic training, ladies and gentlemen, I said to the sergeant the second day, when is the hard part because it was --- we lived in a tough neighborhood. And Johnny lived in that neighborhood.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: For a while.

MR. CHIAPPINELLI: For a while, short while a long, long time ago.

MR. FUTULES: It was too tough for him, he moved.

MR. CHIAPPINELLI: It was too tough, he moved. We all moved out in the '60s. But the Italian American War Vets, I joined in 1982. My uncle Lou LaCivita told me and I said, what are we doing? And long story short, we reorganized them here. We went to Florida, got the charter. It disappeared for Mike Musmanno. We had to reconstitute. We had to get the seats on the Soldiers and Sailors Hall. And the Italian War Vets led the fight to save Soldiers and Sailors Hall. And we do a lot of stuff. We don't really advertise a lot, but if we get the program that we want to bring to Pittsburgh, it'll be an Italian heritage museum which has been my goal for years. There's other nationalities that have their museums here and

showcases, but I am so proud of being an Italian American and all my other members.

By the way, we do accept people that are not Italian. We have people that are non-Italian. We have Polish. We have Irish. And we have all nationalities in the Italian War Vets. We look forward to expanding in Pittsburgh. I want to thank the County Council for your time and effort, Mr. DeFazio for being at the parade with me and bringing up the subject. And we look forward to bringing the national convention here in August. And ironically, we booked it in Decembers, ladies and gentlemen, and the Regatta is right out our front door. It's now going to be right in our front door. And if the Italian War Vets can help you in any way --- and I'd like to thank Joe Catanese and Stephanie for all their cooperation. And everyone that helped the Italian War Vets. Thank you very much.

(Applause.)

(Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: What are we down to?  
9749-16.

MR. BARKER: Before proceeding, please let the record reflect that Mr. Kress is now present.

9749-16. Certificate of Recognition presented to Busy Beaver Building Centers upon the occasion of the grand opening of its first True Value hardware store in Moon Township. Sponsored by Council member Baker.

9750-16. Proclamation congratulating the Scott Dairy Farm in Oakdale for receiving the 2016 Bicentennial Farm Award from the Pennsylvania Department of Agriculture. Sponsored by Council member Finnerty.

MR. DEMARCO: Jared, I'd like to be added to that, please.

MR. BARKER: And Mr. DeMarco.

MR. DEMARCO: Thank you.

MR. BAKER: Me, too, please, Jared.

MR. BARKER: Okay. Sponsored by Council members Finnerty, DeMarco, Baker and DeFazio.

9751-16. Proclamation welcoming the Washington-Finch Family Reunion to North Park on July 22nd, 2016. Sponsored by Council member Kirk.

9752-16. Certificate of Achievement awarded to Mr. Jack Ryan Johnston of Boy Scout Troop 4 for earning the rank of Eagle Scout. Sponsored by Council member Means.

9754-16. Certificate of Achievement awarded to Mr. Agostino Liberto of Boy Scout Troop 138 for earning the rank of Eagle Scout. Sponsored by Council member Ranalli-Russell.

9755-16. Certificate of Recognition congratulating Ms. Nan Moone Currington upon the occasion of her 100th birthday. Sponsored by Council member Walton.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Public Comment? We have none?

MR. BARKER: We have none on the agenda.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Approval of Minutes. 9743-16.

MR. BARKER: Motion to approve the minutes of the June 7th, 2016 regular meeting of Council.

MR. FINNERTY: So moved.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.  
(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it. Presentation of Appointments. 9739-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of Dr. Robert H. Potter, Jr. to serve as a member of the Council of Friends organization, North Park, for a term to expire on July 12th, 2018. Sponsored by Council member Kirk.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Kirk?

MS. KIRK: I move for approval.

MR. MACEY: Second.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.  
(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it. 9740-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of Dr. Cynthia N. Potter to serve as a member of the Council of Friends, North Park, for a term to expire on July 12th, 2018. Sponsored by Council member Kirk.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Kirk?

MS. KIRK: I move for approval.

MR. MACEY: Second.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.  
9742-16.

MR. BARKER: I'm sorry, 9741?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Oh, 41.

MR. BARKER: Okay. Approving the appointment of Kenneth G. Doerbecker to serve as a member of the Council of Friends organization, North Park, for a term to expire on July 12th, 2018. Sponsored by Council member Kirk.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Kirk?

MS. KIRK: I move for approval.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.  
9742-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of Mary Hays Warmbrodt to serve as a member of the Council of Friends, North Park, for a term to expire on July 12th, 2018. Sponsored by Council member Kirk.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Kirk?

MS. KIRK: I move for approval.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.  
Committee on Appointment Review, 9706-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of Cara Ciminillo to serve as a member of the Children Youth and Families Advisory Committee for a term to expire on December 31st, 2018. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Finnerty, did you chair that meeting?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes, I did chair that meeting for Councilman Kress. I'd like to make a motion to approve that appointment.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing no remarks, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.  
9707-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the reappointment of Floreda Taylor to serve as a member of the Allegheny County Juvenile Detention Board of Advisors for a term to expire on December 31st, 2018. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you. I'd like to make a motion for the reappointment of Floreda Taylor.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.  
(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.  
9729-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the reappointment of Caroline Mitchell to serve as a member of the Allegheny County Board of Health for a term to expire on January 13th, 2020. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: I'd like to make a motion for the reappointment of Caroline Mitchell.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.  
(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.  
9732-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the reappointment of Joylette L. Portlock to serve as a member of the Allegheny County Board of Health for at term to expire on January 13th, 2020. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: I'd like to make a motion to reappoint Joylette Portlock.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.  
(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.  
9733-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the reappointment of William Youngblood to serve as a member of the Allegheny County Board of Health for a term to expire on January 13th, 2020. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: I'd like to make a motion to reappoint William Youngblood.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.  
(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.  
9712-16.

MR. BARKER: A resolution ratifying certain year-end transfers pursuant to Section 805.03 of the Administrative Code. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you. I'd like to make a motion to approve that.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Second. And under remarks?  
Have a roll call vote.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Kirk?

MS. KIRK: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Ranalli-Russell?

MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: Yes.

MR. BARKER: President DeFazio?  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Ayes, 15; no's 0. The bill passes.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9713-16.  
MR. BARKER: A Resolution of the County of Allegheny amending the Grants and Special Accounts Budget for 2016, Submission #06-16. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Finnerty?  
MR. FINNERTY: Thank you. I'd like to make a motion to approve that.  
MR. MACEY: Second.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, let's take the roll.  
MR. BARKER: Mr. Baker?  
MR. BAKER: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?  
MR. DEMARCO: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Mr. Ellenbogen?  
MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.  
MR. BARKER: Mr. Finnerty?  
MR. FINNERTY: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Mr. Futules?  
MR. FUTULES: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Ms. Kirk?  
MS. KIRK: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Mr. Klein?  
MR. KLEIN: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Mr. Kress?  
MR. KRESS: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?  
MR. MACEY: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Mr. Martoni?  
DR. MARTONI: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Ms. Means?  
MS. MEANS: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?  
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Ms. Ranalli-Russell?  
MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?  
MR. WALTON: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: President DeFazio?  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Ayes, 15; no's 0. The bill passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9683-16.

MR. BARKER: Motion of the Council of Allegheny County authorizing a cooperative partnership between Allegheny County Council and the Career Development Center to identify candidates who have suffered from long term unemployment for employment with the Office of County Council. Sponsored by Council member Kress.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That was Nick?

MR. FINNERTY: Yeah.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Nick.

MR. FUTULES: We had met the Executive Committee and we actually released it from Committee with a neutral recommendation. We thought it would be best for the Council members to all weigh in before we made a decision so ---. I make a motion to approve.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Nothing?

MR. KRESS: Do you want me to talk about ---?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No. It's up to you. It's yours.

MR. KRESS: Well, I just want to say what's going on is the Career Development Center --- actually I just got an e-mail just last week. What they're trying to do is people who have been unemployed for 27 weeks or more, they're trying to get people back into the workforce and find these people permanent jobs. And what'll happen is with some of these people --- for example, we had a woman. She explained to me she had breast cancer. Okay? She's got a gap in her résumé. And she sends these résumés out to people and they won't give her an interview. So we have people who are having trouble finding jobs.

What they're doing is they're creating a program now to bring people back into the workforce. And also, too, when you're older, it's more difficult to find jobs. So again, the longer you're unemployed, the harder it is to find a job. So what they're going to do is help these people. They said they got about 200 people down there looking for jobs. They've been unemployed for 27 weeks or more. It sounds like a great program. What they're going to do --- and they've changed it. Before it was four weeks, they'd pay 100 percent, and then the other four weeks would be 50 percent. Now it'll be six weeks to work for you for free. They'll pay for it. It won't even be

on your payroll. And they'll bring somebody out there highly qualified. It'll be somebody who's professional.

And the other problem we have, too, is that professional ---. These are professional people. They're former vice presidents of companies. They're attorneys. And what they're going to do is bring them and say, look, you know, we have somebody who is highly qualified --- instead of working maybe at Wal-Mart, we have somebody highly qualified. We want you to try this person at the job. And I think it's just an extraordinary program. And I don't know, again, if the County Council itself is actually going to hire anybody or bring anybody in or not. We have to look at these résumés. There's no obligation from us to utilize these people. But I just think it's such a great program. I wanted the County Council to be a part of it and everyone, everybody here to vote on something positive.

You know, that, hey, we're trying to help people get jobs and reintegrate them into our workforce. I just think it's a great program. And that's the reason why I brought it forward before County Council, so ---.

MR. FINNERTY: Mr. DeFazio?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah. Representative --- how had their hand up?

MR. FUTULES: Somebody else?

MR. FINNERTY: Go ahead. You're good.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead, Nick.

MR. FUTULES: I just want everyone to know that I support Ed Kress in this measure. And I think it's a good thing for us to give everyone an opportunity for a job, regardless of their age, sex, religion, whatever. So I truly believe that this is a good thing for us. And I will vote yes for this.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you. No disrespect to Councilman Kress, but this is something I really can't see. And the reason I can't see it is because that person or that group could, obviously, put a résumé in when we advertise like anyone else in Allegheny County. And to maneuver ourselves into a position where we're giving preferential treatment I don't think is a good thing. I think if the person is qualified and they come up and go through the process that they could be hired. But I think that's an important thing. And I applaud the people down there for what they're doing in relation to this. But at

the same time I think that if the person is qualified and if they get through, then mostly likely we'll hire them. And I think they're in the ball game with everybody else from Allegheny County. And that's how I feel about it. And no disrespect to the person down there or ---. I think she does a hell of a job and I think that --- we advertise everything, and they can apply just like anyone else. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Ellenbogen. Then I'll give you ---.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Before I make my remarks, if I could ask the sponsor of the bill, is there not a part of this bill that says that we're talking about people that are over age 50? Is that how it goes?

MR. KRESS: No. Excuse me, no. What this is --- basically the program is anybody that's unemployed for 27 weeks or more.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Uh-huh (yes).

MR. KRESS: It's just the way she explained it, though. As you get older, sometimes it's harder for people to find jobs. But it could be somebody in their 20s or 30s. It's anybody who is having trouble finding a job, who has been unemployed for 27 weeks or more, and this is what the program is about.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Explain to me --- and you just said it, as you get older, what does that mean in reference to this bill?

MR. KRESS: Well, no. I'm just saying that some of the people she had referenced who are working down there, I mean, that she's working with. Some of them were actually older because they were having trouble finding jobs or maybe some of them had been sick. There's different reasons why people are maybe chronically unemployed for 27 weeks or more. And some of the examples she brought up at the meeting were, hey, you know, these are people maybe a little bit older. They were having trouble finding work. Maybe there's people --- but they're going to take anybody, anybody 27 weeks or more. But she had people who were there --- she said about 200 people or so. And a lot of these people were highly qualified. Again, the woman she was talking about, for example, who had the breast cancer, she was a vice --- you know, a former vice president somewhere. And she said that, you know, you can't put like you're sick on a résumé. You know, that's the problem you have. The way

she explained it you send a résumé out, they have these gaps in the résumé, they don't even want to give you an interview.

So what the program is trying to do is trying to fill in the gaps. And I thought it was such a great program that, you know, maybe we can help out and maybe utilize some of these people for our office.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Well, first of all, I know your heart is in the right place with this. I do because I know how you are. We have a very small staff, and we actually have a committee who vets every person who applies for a job. If you look at the component of this Council, I doubt very much that anybody who is older is going to get discriminated against. If you look at anybody who has had health issues, if you look at the component of some of the things that some of us have been through, I doubt very much that there's going to be any type of prejudice of any sort.

That being said, anybody who has served up here for as long as me will tell you that I've always had a stickle, for lack of a better word, for unnecessary bills. You know, that aggravates me probably more than anything. You know, fixing something that's not broke, creating legislation that just --- really, you really don't need it. I have to concur, although again, I know your heart is in the right place with this. I know you're trying to help people, but it's unnecessary in a staff for less than ten that is vetted by Mr. Futules' Executive Committee which grills people of every age, every component of them, and they try to be through as they can.

I don't see a need for this, and I have to concur on that with Councilman Finnerty. Although again, I know your heart is in the right place. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative DeMarco is next.

MR. DEMARCO: Thank you, Mr. President for recognizing me. I think when we heard the County Executive give his quarterly address here recently he talked about the website [imaginepittsburgh.com](http://imaginepittsburgh.com). It's a website that's out there in conjunction with the Pittsburgh Chamber of Commerce, the Allegheny Conference, to try to find folks in the Allegheny County region jobs. And he said that there are almost 30,000 jobs that are on there right now that are unfilled because we're having

difficulty matching people up with the appropriate skill sets there.

In the interest of trying to find any Allegheny County resident who wants a job, a job, if there's the opportunity to just provide somebody the opportunity to burnish their skills or to bring them current, maybe somebody that's been unemployed for a while, that would allow them to then qualify to apply for one of those jobs --- and it's not going to cost County Council any money. Then in that particular case, understanding where Councilman Kress is coming from, I can go along with this.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I think you didn't have one. Go ahead, Representative Klein and then we'll ---.

MR. KLEIN: I support Mr. Kress' effort. I think that I would agree with Mr. Finnerty, that clearly anyone who is interested in employment opportunities would be considered by the County. But I think what Mr. Kress, with his effort, is attempting to do is something to call our attention to, to remind us that there are people who are chronically unemployed and maybe put a spotlight on that. And so I will support his effort.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I think Futules was next. Representative Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Thank you. I just want to clarify --- as the Committee process went through, that we're under no obligation to hire anyone in that organization. It's like Mike said. We'll put résumés or advertise for an intern, and if someone in that organization seems to come to the top and we feel we should hire them, then we certainly would. But we're under no obligation to hire anyone just because they're in the organization. I want to make that very clear. So we are really doing --- proactive in searching for someone. But we're telling the organization, yes, have your people apply for the job as well, and we'll see how things turn out. That's it. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Well, I was hoping that I wouldn't have to get into the logistics of it, but okay, somebody has to. It's always nice to do feel good stuff up here to make people feel that, you know, this is good, you know, we're helping people. But logistically, we have an obligation to the 5,000 other county employees to treat our employees who are county employees equally as we would the other county employees.

That being said, if you're going to put a bill like this forward, then you need to put a bill like this forward for the entire county population of employees, not less than ten.

Furthermore, as Councilman Finnerty articulated it's not fair for one organization to be given an in to even know that job exists as opposed to the 1,300,000 people who live in this county who should have the same opportunity to read it as it's advertised, not to get a special in to that. I think that that's fair. And I think that we as a Council from that standpoint have an obligation to vote this bill down. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Sam?

MR. DEMARCO: Mr. President, thank you for recognizing me. I think I agree with Mr. Finnerty in that if we're looking at somebody coming aboard as an employee of County Council, as a member of staff, then they need to follow the processes that we have in place for everyone else. Maybe I'm wrong, but I didn't think that's what this was. I thought that this was an opportunity for folks to come and provide additional support to our staff being paid by the Career Development Center for a period of time in which they would then be recognized as having, --- you know, burnish this skills, refresh them, whatever you call them, that they can then go on somewhere else. So I wasn't --- under my understanding, I could be wrong, Councilman Ellenbogen, but under my understanding was this wasn't an in to give them an in or anybody an in to a county job and circumventing a process. So thank you, Mr. President.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Wait a minute. I think Chuck, Representative Martoni, had a question.

DR. MARTONI: Yeah. I think this particular item has some merit in the sense that it's sort of an infant to something that happened years ago with County Commissioner Foerster, who started a program called the Dislocated Workers Program, which actually made possible for 10,000 people --- let me say that number again, okay, 10,000 people to become employable. Okay. It's probably something we can't do now because it cost a lot of money, and Commissioner Foerster worked really hard to provide that money through the County and other agencies.

But what I think about this --- this is an infant event, but at least it's a step in the direction of getting people to work. There's nothing more important

than people working for a living. Okay? And don't kid yourself for one second because nothing is more important. There's nothing except your health, obviously --- people have to be gainfully employed. To me, this is only a midget step in that direction, but it's a step. So for that reason, I'll be voting for it.

MR. KRESS: Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead, Representative Ellenbogen.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: With all due respect to this Council, I can see the direction that people are feeling about this. It's a feel good thing. But let me ask you something. This is one organization out of hundreds. There are people in the Hill District who, groups, people can't get jobs. People in the South Hills. All these groups. Is it fair, in a sense of emotion, to, number one, take less than ten employees out of 5,000 and direct this at them as opposed to --- everybody needs jobs. Why is this not expanded to across the hall to include not only the County employees, but the County Authorities and the County airport and the Port Authority? If you're going to do a sense of motion, then do it. You know, ten jobs. We're talking 7,000 jobs here. If you're going to do it --- I would take a look doing it for everybody. I mean, that's what's going on here.

And like I said, you know, a sense of motion for just a small group gives this group the opportunity to know something that the other 1,200,000, 1,300,000 people do not know. And that's not fair. Regardless of how good it makes people feel to say, you know what? You're unemployed. Fine. Well, if you're unemployed, then let everybody have the opportunity who's not working to apply for any county --- or for that matter of fact, across the city also, those jobs. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Kress.

MR. KRESS: Sure. First of all, we will have control. We don't have to pick anybody. I mean, we have a hiring process here. They will go, bring the résumés in. The Executive Committee can figure out what we want to do. So it's not like, hey, they're going to send us résumé and then somebody is just going to show up the next day. That's the first thing.

The second thing, it's a program everybody can apply for in the County. It's not regulated to people in the North Hills or the South Hills, age. It could be

anybody in the County who's having trouble finding a job. So they can go down to the Career Development Center and I actually would advocate, if anybody is watching or needs a job, to go down to the Career Development Center and talk to Sara Welch. I think it's a great program.

The other thing is it helps out with the taxpayers. I mean, they're sending us somebody who can help make County Council a better council. Maybe help us out around here. You know, there are so many people out there. They told me about the different people they had down there. We can maybe get somebody who is an accountant. Maybe get somebody who is a lawyer. I don't know. I don't know what we need here. But again, it's the Council itself that makes that decision. Nobody else. And that's the thing. And in regards to the County as a whole, I don't know what the County is going to do as a whole, but I'm a County Council member. This is our County Council and we can make a decision on what we're going to do. I can't --- I'm not going to tell Rich Fitzgerald or Willy McKain what to do. But I think as a Council body, we have to control our own destiny here and say, hey, this is what we'd like to do in regards as to the Council body itself. I just think it's a great program.

And just another aside, though. I mean, when I ran for office, I mean, it was like I didn't run just to be on Council. I ran to try to help people out. And people in my community, I mean, the North Hills, wherever else, they come up to me and they're looking for jobs all the time. I just thought this was a great program to help out with people looking for employment. And that's all I can say. I think it's a great program. I just thought it'd be a nice thing for everybody on this Council to say, hey, we're helping people. You know, we're not here criticizing each other. We're actually trying to make a positive difference in somebody's life. So thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All right. We're going to get Representative Kirk and then I'm going down here.

MS. KIRK: Thank you. I just want to make a point to follow what Councilman Martoni said, that maybe we can be the role model for the rest. We can try it. Do it as a pilot and see how it works out. And then if it works well, then maybe other places might want to try it, and we can be the leaders in it. That's all I wanted to say.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Russell.

MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Yes. Thank you, Mr. President. For this career development, they're not just specifically finding employees for County Council. It's everywhere; correct?

MR. KRESS: Yeah. There's many corporations they can go to.

MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: That are involved?

MR. KRESS: Right.

MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Okay. And I at one time was in the displaced homemakers, and it was a great program. And if it's something that can help, and Mr. Kress also did help a friend of mine to find a job after he was out of work for quite some time. So I am going to vote yes.

MR. KRESS: Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Wait a minute.  
Representative DeWitt Walton.

MR. WALTON: Thank you, Mr. President. I have to concur with Member Martoni that having meaningful family-sustaining employment is so critical to one's life, one's home, one's family's life and the community which we live. It's really important. But I have a couple of questions that I'd like to ask of Member Kress and because when this issue came to Council initially, it was specifically driven and spoken to being focusing on people above 50 years of age. And that we would give some semblance of advantage to those individuals above those age numbers. And that my question --- if I'm correct, that's what I heard and then we referred it back to committee. And then today, it seems to be that we've taken that age component off of it, and I want to know is --- are we giving a preferential or a bonus component to an individual that may come from that specific operation?

MR. KRESS: May I answer, Mr. President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MR. KRESS: No. Career Development, basically what they explained to me, it's anybody that's been unemployed for 27 weeks or more. There is nothing in regards to age. It's just that so happens that you may have more people there who are maybe in their 50s and 60s.

MR. WALTON: Does Career Development also coordinate with the WIB, the Workforce Investment Board, because there are processes in place through the Workforce Investment Board that individuals who --- and having

spending a lot of time in workforce development, I know there are a host of programs that are there through the WIB that addresses the challenges of long-term employment and some specialized training for that, along with opportunities for individual training accounts, stipends for on-the-job training account --- on-the-job training grants for employers that look for individuals with long-term employment barriers and the like as well.

So as a individual and a member of Council, I really --- I know the importance of finding family sustaining employment. And I know how critical it is to communities. But I just wonder, is the path that we're traveling with this in the best interest of all of Allegheny County? I don't know. I have some concerns and while I don't want to oppose it, I'm not really comfortable with what I've seen ---

MR. KRESS: Okay.

MR. WALTON: --- and heard.

MR. KRESS: All I have is the information she gave me. She said basically what this is --- again, the official name of the program is called Platform to Employment. And basically the program comes through the Three Rivers Workforce Investment Board, while the Career Development Center is funded through several grants and foundations with primary funding from United Way of Southwestern Pennsylvania and additional funding provided by Trees Charitable Trust, the Birmingham Foundation, the Fine Foundation, the Pittsburgh Foundation, the Patterson Foundation, the City of Pittsburgh Community Block Grant Program. But specifically, though again, the Platform to Employment Program comes through Three Rivers Workforce Investment Board.

MR. WALTON: With the permission of Mr. President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah. Go ahead.

MR. WALTON: That begins to address a number of the concerns that I may --- that I had, and so --- and having worked with a number of those organizations, whether it's the WIB, the Pittsburgh Foundation, and so ---. And last but not least, Council --- I need to be real comfortable with this, that Council is not mandated to take an individual from the Career Development Center, number one.

Number two, that they --- that having --- if someone does, in fact, become an intern or a temporary

employee of Council, that that does not give them a priority placement or preference for potential employment going forward with Council, because I am --- clearly, I have some issues that I will address at our next session of Council in caucus, and I had hoped to deal with it today, but I won't. I won't raise that issue today. But I just want to make sure that there's equity in employment across the spectrum.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Real quick. And I don't usually say anything. Look, at the end of the day, if this isn't true, what's in black and white, Council has the last decision. We don't have to hire anyone, you know, that's the main thing. So if it doesn't work out and she's not telling the truth or this isn't truthful we'll just say forget it. We ain't hiring, you know. But go ahead. Representative Ellenbogen was first.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: You know, I've listened very carefully what all the various members have said and for the public, I'm going to make one final comment and everybody can do what they need to do.

First of all, this is a motion of Council. I have sat on this Council for almost ten years, and when we do a motion of Council, we do a motion of Council. We go to the State where we have no say, but we want to include everyone. When we go to whatever organization. When we do a motion of Council, it's a motion of Council because we don't have control. With all due respect to the members, if you really meant it and like out of some of the words of the people sitting here, we have control because it's Council ---. Well, if you really mean it then make it a bill. Don't make it a motion of Council. If you just want to feel good and say it's a motion of Council, then include everyone. But if you really mean you want to do this, then make it a bill and then I'll support it. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Wait a minute. Representative Macey. He hasn't spoken yet.

MR. MACEY: Thank you, Mr. President and members of Council. I look at this as a program that's a win-win situation. We have to keep in mind that the money that's being used is not coming out of Council or taxpayers' coffers. Yeah. There's other organizations out there like Career Link. But here's an opportunity for us to support another organization who is funded by various organizations and nonprofits. So at lot of times we have

to realize that it isn't just bringing these people on board to help others. It's also supporting an organization that shows a need. And when that need is there, that's when the foundations step up to the plate. So if we can show there is a need, the foundations will certainly continue to fund it.

I think to add clarity and importance to it, the Three Rivers Employment Investment Board is a part of it. They're a known quantity. We're not pulling something out of the sky or digging up something that isn't going to be helpful to others. And this is an opportunity for us also to save time on interviewing process because when the organization sends these people to us, we've already --- it's been vetted. We already know these people are qualified and can do the work that's needed.

You know, in the past we've used employment agencies. What is the difference here, except that we're not paying for it? I think it's a great opportunity for us to support those people that aren't employed. No, we're not going to employ tens of thousands of people or even hundreds. But any time you can help one person, we're doing our job. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I think Representative DeMarco, you had your hand up.

MR. DEMARCO: Thank you, Mr. President. I would just say that one of the great things about trying this in this fashion as opposed to a full motion advocating the entire County do it is it's basically like a beta test or proof of concept; okay? Let's see if it works. Why try to foist it on the entire County or ask everyone else to do it if we're not certain that it's a good idea and it would be effective? So for that reason, that's why I support it. And that's why I would like to make a motion to call the question and end the debate.

MR. BAKER: Second.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? Okay.

MR. BAKER: I seconded it.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: He seconded it. That was more --- that was ten or more so ---.

MR. BARKER: I heard no nays.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Let's take --- this is a motion I could --- do you want to take a roll call? Take the roll call.

MR. BARKER: On the motion to approve. Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?  
MR. DEMARCO: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Mr. Ellenbogen?  
MR. ELLENBOGEN: No.  
MR. BARKER: Mr. Finnerty?  
MR. FINNERTY: No.  
MR. BARKER: Mr. Futules?  
MR. FUTULES: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Ms. Kirk?  
MS. KIRK: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Mr. Klein?  
MR. KLEIN: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Mr. Kress?  
MR. KRESS: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?  
MR. MACEY: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Mr. Martoni?  
DR. MARTONI: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Ms. Means?  
MS. MEANS: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?  
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Ms. Ranalli-Russell?  
MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?  
MR. WALTON: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: President DeFazio?  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.  
MR. BARKER: Ayes, 13; no's 2. The bill passes.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. That was a weak yes.  
MR. KLEIN: Was that a Clark Kent yes?  
MR. FINNERTY: Inside voice.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Liaison ---.  
DR. MARTONI: Mr. DeFazio?  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.

DR. MARTONI: That was an excellent debate and probably one of the only times in the last 15 years that we've been here, very few times we talked about real issues, real people. This is a real issue and real

people. So I congratulate all of us for at least talking about it.

MR. MACEY: Here. Here.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That's right. Let's go on with Liaison Reports. Representative Finnerty.

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you. I have a number of things. Soldiers and Sailors is having an event July the 22nd from 6:00 p.m. to 8:00 p.m., and it's called the Museum Comes Alive. And that's a \$5 charge, but it's well worth it. If you go out there, the theme is going to be Hawaii and Pearl Harbor, so it should be a lot of fun. I don't know if they're going to have hula girls or not, but ---.

Also, Oakdale Firemen's carnival is coming up. It's July the 23rd to the 30th. McKees Rocks has their festival. It's August the 2nd. Kennedy Community Days are August the 10th to the 13th, and I say that because we don't have another meeting 'til the third week of August, I believe.

All right. So if you're in the market for things to do, there's a lot out there in the suburbs and the City. The Regatta is coming also.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I have been called a lot of things, but that's a new one. Rellenbogen?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Ellenbogen.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I thought you said R.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No. I thought you changed your name on me. Go ahead.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I may have to. On a serious note, as the Public Safety Chairman, for the last almost ten years I've sat here and I've pleaded with the public about the issue I'm going to talk about and here we are again. It's summer. People are having a good time. Yesterday I heard of a young man who drowned. And by the end of summer, I know in my hearts of heart, God forbid, that there's going to be some grandparent, some parent, somebody who let their kid go for a second and tragedy. We had a tragedy and thank goodness to the people in Scott Township that saved the child the other day. You know, watch your kids. Watch your grandkids. You can't let them go for a second. Avoid something you can never get back. You know, I would ask the County Manager to take this and, you know, announce it. I'd ask the media announce it again and again and again because if you save

one kid --- if you get one parent to maybe take another look. Let's save these kids from drowning in the summer. Please. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any other liaison, liaison reports? Seeing none, let's move on to New Business, Ordinances, 9746-16.

MR. BARKER: An Ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, establishing new fees for the County Fire Marshal's administration and enforcement of the Commonwealth's Combustible and Flammable Liquids Act's rules and regulations. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go to Budget and Finance. 9753-16.

MR. BARKER: A Resolution of the County of Allegheny amending the Grants and Special Accounts Budget for 2016, Submission #07-16. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go to Budget and Finance. 9756-16.

MR. BARKER: A Resolution of the Council of the County of Allegheny pursuant to Section 505-49-C (8)(d) of the Allegheny County Code of Ordinances approving an increase in asbestos abatement permit application fees previously approved by the Allegheny County Health Department's Board of Health. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That would go to Budget and Finance, although there's a little question on the Health so I don't know, Budget and Finance unless John or you guys want to ---?

MR. FINNERTY: That's fine with me. It's up to ---.

MR. PALMIERE: I'll take it.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: What? Okay. We'll send it to Health and Human Services. All right. Moving down, New Business, Motions.

MR. FUTULES: Mr. DeFazio?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes, Mr. Futules.

MR. FUTULES: I have a motion. Council members had met and we want to make a motion or I want to make a motion that we give the cost of living, three percent cost of living increase, to our legislative director and to be paid retroactive back from June when the rest of the staff received it. I'm making a motion to approve.

MS. KIRK: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: There's a second. Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.

MS. MEANS: No.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: The ayes have it.

Notification of Contracts, 9744-16.

MR. BARKER: Communication summarizing approved Executive Actions from June 1st, 2016 through June 30th, 2016.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Communications ---.

MR. FINNERTY: Receive and file.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Someone want to second receive and file?

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it. Public Comment. Is there a Creighton Rabs? Lester Ludwig?

MR. KRESS: No Lester.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Not here. Amy Rafferty.

MS. RAFFERTY: Hello. My name is Amy Rafferty and I'm from Council District 2. And I'm reading a letter for a friend of mine who is not able leave her home very often because of an injured daughter. My comments here today are concerning what's happening at the Health Board right now. The Department of Health considering the HPV vaccination mandate. So I'd just like to have you consider from the side of a parent who has a vaccine injured child.

Hello, my name is Kelly Sotomayor. Before I share my daughter's Gardasil injury story, you should know that she was a bright student earning straight As, and she was very active and played summer soccer. She loved being outdoors playing with her younger sister, roller blading, rock climbing and being carefree. That all changed on October 17th, 2006. My daughter, Sarah Sotomayor, received just one dose of the Gardasil vaccine on this date. She was 13 years old. Directly after the needle left her arm, she began screaming and crying. We were told that this was the normal reaction from the Gardasil

vaccine. So we went home thinking everything was okay. Two days went by and no improvement in the pain in her arm. Unfortunately, that was just the beginning of the downfall into the abyss of Sara's life threatening health issues.

I am now Sara's 24/7 caretaker. She does not have the use of her wrists or legs due to hypertonia. She's 23 years old now and should have graduated college and been able to live a healthy independent life. Instead she's confined to a bed and collects Social Security disability. She's in constant pain as she watches her future slip by. Her once perfect life and health was stolen from her, and she will never get those years back.

Having my daughter get the Gardasil vaccine is a decision that I will regret for the rest of my life. That was an uninformed choice that I made. If the Allegheny Health Department takes away a parent's right to decide, then you will have so many injured boys and girls with parents dealing with the aftermath of the physical, emotional and financial devastation of trying to recover their child's health. Please do not add the HPV Gardasil vaccination to the adolescent required vaccine schedule as Sara is proof of the devastation it causes. Thank you for your time and God Bless You. Kelly and Sara Sotomayor.

Here's her pictures before when she was --- 12, I think. And this is a picture after her injury. Her hands and legs are hypertonic, I think, is the correct word. And she has been bedridden for four and a half years.

DR. MARTONI: Can we pass those around so we can see it closer?

MS. RAFFERTY: Yes. She did ask me that I not leave photographs, but I may show them, so I will pass that around. She did have a list here. I didn't want to --- I didn't know if I would have time to read some of her health conditions that she suffered from the vaccine. Severe nosebleeds, trouble walking, severe inflammation in her joints, mid-brain encephalopathy.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: You know what, your time frame ran out.

MS. RAFFERTY: Am I up? Am I out of time?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: You're out of time.

MS. RAFFERTY: I'm sorry.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: If you have a sentence real quick ---.

MS. RAFFERTY: That's okay. Thank you for your time.

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Mr. President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Point of personal privilege.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah, go ahead.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Those of us that served for a few years on this Council know that when it gets to be in the public eye and it gets pretty bad, it ends up in here, you know. And being the Public Safety Chair, I have a strange feeling this is going to end up in here. And what I would like the members to do is think about the issue in terms of me having a committee meeting to talk about these things and some of the issues. I know we have some healthcare people on this Council. Give it some thought and some ideas, and I'd appreciate if you'd get back to me because I'm seriously think about trying to --- before we get --- you guys know what I'm talking about, what happens up here. Before we get swamped and we end up on the back side of this so ---. Thank you. Appreciate it. Thank you, Mr. President.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead, Cindy.  
Representative Kirk.

MS. KIRK: The only thing that I'd like to say to that, Jim, is there's no mandate yet. They may never come to that, so we might want to wait until, at least, until they decide they're going to head that way. And I think there's some discussion on that tomorrow.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I recognize that, but I don't want the roof to fall in and then I don't know what I'm doing. Just like you said, I want information from you folks before ---. Maybe it won't ever happen, but I'd rather be prepared if it does. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Mr. President, I would just like to emphasize for the folks who would like to comment on this that it's extremely important that they direct those comments to the Department, the Health Department, and also to the Board of Health. I can tell you firsthand that I probably received upwards of 140 e-mails on this, but they're not necessarily getting to the Health Department where they're being counted, being catalogued and being registered. And I had a conversation with Dr. Hacker yesterday. And Dr. Hacker told me that the

comments that she was getting, there were more pro comments than cons. And that was astounding to me because out of the 140 e-mails that I have, there was only one and the rest were con. So I want to make sure that the people who want to weigh in on this are directing their comments to the right place. And those e-mail addresses are --- and I'm not the fastest guy here. The e-mail addresses are, one word, [publichealthcomment@allegHENYcounty.us](mailto:publichealthcomment@allegHENYcounty.us) and to the Board at [boardofhealth@allegHENYcounty.us](mailto:boardofhealth@allegHENYcounty.us). Thank you, Mr. President.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: At this point, would someone want to make a motion to adjourn?

MR. DEMARCO: There's four more, John.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Oh, I didn't look on the back. Oh, jeez. I'm sorry. I didn't turn it over. Sarah Kimbro. I'm sorry. I didn't turn it over. Go ahead.

MS. KIMBRO: Thank you. Good afternoon, Council members. Before I start, what I was going to say here, I do want to add that I have sent e-mails to you guys. I've also sent e-mails to the Board of Health. I will be attending their meeting tomorrow, but unfortunately my request to speak there was rejected.

So my name is Sarah Kimbro. In 2006 I graduated from West Virginia University with a Bachelor of Science degree in nursing. I worked for years as a registered nurse before becoming a stay-at-home mom. I currently live in Scott Township with my husband and three-year old daughter. I'm not new to the medical field, but would like to disclose that I make no income from the manufacturing, distribution or selling of vaccines.

I'm here today with a fellow community members to publicly object to the proposed HPV vaccine mandate if it does make it to you guys. There are no counties currently within the U.S. that have mandated the administration of any medical procedures or treatments, and I beg you not to be the first.

While gathering information on this vaccine, I became very overwhelmed. I could stand here and read to you the names of children adversely affected by this vaccine, but that would take hours. As of June 24th of this year, over 44,633 adverse reaction reports were filed concerning this vaccine. It is voluntary so that's only a fraction.

Instead of discussing the numerous issues, from flawed and abandoned safety studies to the detrimental and sometimes deadly side effects of this drug, I'm going to take a different approach. In 2011, the U.S. Supreme Court ruled that all vaccines are unavoidably unsafe. It is our basic human right to care for and protect ourselves as well as our children.

When a child in America is taken to their doctor, that child's parent or legal guardian is required to give informed consent prior to the administration of any vaccines or other medical procedures. The doctrine of informed consent --- oh, boy. The doctrine of informed consent is based upon the right of every individual to determine what shall be done to his or her body in connection with medical treatment.

This proposed mandate would breach our universal human rights by denying our fundamental right to informed consent. Regardless of how you feel about the safety and effectiveness of this vaccine, you must allow the citizens of Allegheny County to make their own healthcare decisions. These decisions should be made in homes, doctors' offices, hospitals and clinics and not in a courtroom.

I thank you for the opportunity to be here and address my opposition to this proposed mandate. I pray that if it does come this far to you guys where you will be voting on it, you will protect the fundamental rights of the citizens that you were elected to serve. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Allison Fujito.

MS. FUJITO: Do you want to hand them out so they can follow along?

MR. BARKER: Do you want me to hand them out first or start the clock first?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I didn't hear you.

MR. BARKER: Would you like me to hand them out first or start the clock?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No. Go ahead. Hand them out first.

MS. KIRK: I just want to make a point. For everyone going to the Department of Health meeting tomorrow night, the location has changed to this room because it's a little larger. I just don't want you showing up down there and being late for the meeting.

MS. FUJITO: Thank you. I understand that several people in our group have been turned down for commenting and told that there was not enough room for them to comment.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. You can start.

MS. FUJITO: So ladies and gentlemen, all three of my kids had severe adverse reactions to vaccines, and that's why I think this is so terribly important that I'm back here again to talk to you.

Today, I'd like to quote statements all made in the last three months by scientists and agencies who have played a huge part in HPV vaccine policy. Diane Harper, M.D., a lead researcher in early clinical trials with HPV vaccine stated this year there are no long-term follow-up studies that show that cancers will be averted. The American Society of Clinical Oncology on April 11th of this year stated many years of follow up are needed for the ongoing trials to demonstrate a significant reduction in HPV related cancers. Both vaccines, Gardasil and Cervarix, have a known duration of protection of at least five years.

Additional research is needed to evaluate duration of protection to determine if booster doses are required. So that's worth remembering the next time someone says the science has settled the vaccine is effective.

Dr. Harold Bailey, Director of the University of Wisconsin's Cancer Center on HPV vaccine reported adverse events said, I would be very reluctant right now to shut down the goals of vaccination over what has been reported. Maybe if it was my daughter, I would feel differently. So he's fine with someone else's daughter shouldering the load.

Six weeks ago, the Nordic Cochrane Center, a branch of the most prestigious international medical review group, filed an official complaint over the handling of safety issues concerning HPV vaccines, noting that the manufacturers used their own data, were never independently checked for accuracy of that data, substituted a suspected neurotoxin for placebo in safety trials and have a huge vested interest in not finding possible harms.

And finally, I have permission from Dr. Karsten Juhl Jorgensen, Deputy Director of the Cochrane Nordic Center, to read to you his e-mail to me specifically

concerning the proposed mandate of HPV vaccines here in Allegheny County. Quote, I am absolutely outraged to hear about this proposal, which goes against everything that medicine is and should be. As doctors, we can suggest treatments to patients, but they are at full liberty to decline this offer.

And this is a vaccine that is now put on hold in Japan due to concerns for adverse events and has led the Danish health authorities to file an inquiry to European Medical Association as well as the Danish government setting aside a million US dollars for independent research into these suspicions of severe adverse reactions.

We would all like medicine to be straightforward and consist of easy choices. But that is not the way it is, not with this vaccine and not with many other interventions. We need to be open and transparent about this. Anything else will undermine trust in the medical profession and in this case possibly in other important vaccines. Because this is not about being anti-vaccine. The HPV vaccine has known harms stipulated in the product information. There is a balance between benefit and harm. This is a value judgment and no authority can make that judgment better than those who are offered the intervention.

So thank you for the opportunity to voice my concerns, and please let me know if you have any questions. My e-mail address is on the bottom of that form.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Next is Karen Woytowitz.

MS. WOYTOWITZ: Good afternoon, Council members. My name is Karen Woytowitz and I live in Wexford, Pennsylvania. I oppose the proposed HPV vaccine mandate for the seventh grade students. First, let me state that I am not anti-vaccine. My three sons were all vaccinated according to the CDC's recommended immunization schedule. I have never filed an exemption of any type for them, primarily because as a pharmacist I trusted that adequate safety science was in place, and my children were all full term, healthy babies with no family history of any major conditions.

With that being said, if I had to do it again, I would delay vaccinating until they were old enough to determine whether or not their immune systems were

functioning normally. Two of my sons have immune deficiencies, one being Common Variable Immune Deficiency for which live virus vaccines are contraindicated. He should have never received oral polio, the MMR or chicken pox. The other son had IgG subclass deficiencies and IGM deficiency. My oldest son developed a complex autoimmune illness involving ocular myasthenia gravis, a low white blood cell count, postural orthostatic tachycardia syndrome or POTS, and an enlarged left ventricle of his heart. He suffered from a lifelong severe autoimmune neuropsychiatric disorder with elevated anti-basal ganglia antibodies which destroyed his life and took him from us at the age of 21. Another son is being treated for mitochondrial dysfunction and associated fatigue and attention issues. Nowhere in previous generations on either side of our families is there a history of disabling autoimmunity or severe psychiatric illness.

From my personal experience, it is clear that the CDC immunization schedule in its entirety is not the right choice for every child. Each person has a unique set of factors including genetic susceptibility to vaccine injury such as autoimmunity. Every vaccine can kill or harm, and there is no way to predict who is at risk. For these reasons, the decision of whether or not to vaccinate for HPV, which poses no threat in a school setting, as with all medical decisions, must be made between a physician and a fully informed consenting patient or their representative. Thank you for your time.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Erin Rodgers.

MS. RODGERS: Good evening, Council members. My name is Erin Rodgers, and I am entering my senior year at Chatham University in a science program. I am also here to speak in opposition to the HPV mandate. I think the people who have spoke prior to me effectively covered the fact that there are always risk of adverse reaction, but with these vaccines in particular. And just a quick internet search will yield a lot of results on that subject.

But moreover, there are about 20 million carriers of HPV. And in the population, the risk increases when you are sexually active with multiple partners at a young age. Obviously, we hope this doesn't apply to most 11 and 12 year olds. And furthermore, this level of intrusion in medicine and personal rights is well

outside of the bounds that are set by our Constitution. Our founders never would have envisioned something like this even coming to pass.

So this is a decision that's best left to the families. They can decide whether the risk is warranted. And the studies regarding safety and advocacy, it took 30 years for the dangers of cigarettes to be brought to life by mainstream science. Now, the pharmaceutical industry makes the tobacco industry look like child's play today with their lobbying power and their political contributions. So even the safety studies --- it's difficult to get funding for a study that would refute the safety or the efficiency of any given product. So there's been a rush to judgment in this matter. And I would implore you to not allow this. Thank you so much. Have a wonderful night.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. At this point, would someone like to make a motion to adjourn?

MR. DEMARCO: (Indicating.)

MR. FUTULES: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Second. All those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it. Meeting adjourned.

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:36 P.M.

CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify, as the stenographic reporter, that the foregoing proceedings were taken stenographically by me, and thereafter reduced to typewriting by me or under my direction; and that this transcript is a true and accurate record to the best of my ability.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Court Reporter

Sarah Hunt