

ALLEGHENY COUNTY COUNCIL

REGULAR MEETING

- - -

BEFORE:

John P. DeFazio	-	President, Council-At-Large
Nicholas Futules	-	Vice President, District 7
Samuel DeMarco, III	-	Council-At-Large
Thomas Baker	-	District 1
Cindy Kirk	-	District 2
Edward Kress	-	District 3
Michael J. Finnerty	-	District 4
Sue Means	-	District 5
John F. Palmiere	-	District 6
Dr. Charles J. Martoni	-	District 8
Robert J. Macey	-	District 9
DeWitt Walton	-	District 10
Paul Klein	-	District 11
James Ellenbogen	-	District 12
Denise Ranalli-Russell	-	District 13

Allegheny County Courthouse  
Fourth Floor, Gold Room  
436 Grant Street  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219

Tuesday, April 5, 2016 - 5:02 p.m.

SARGENT'S COURT REPORTING SERVICE, INC.  
429 Forbes Avenue, Suite 1300  
Pittsburgh, PA 15219  
(412) 232-3882 FAX (412) 471-8733

IN ATTENDANCE:

William McKain	-	Allegheny County Manager
Jared Barker	-	Director of Constituent Services
Joseph Catanese	-	Director of Legislative Services
Walter Szymanski	-	Budget Director
Jack Cambest	-	Council Solicitor

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: The meeting will come to order. Will you all arise for the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag and remain standing for silent prayer or reflection. After me ---.

(Pledge of Allegiance Recited.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Roll call.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Here.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Kirk?

MS. KIRK: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Present.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Here.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Here.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Ranalli-Russell?

MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: Here.

MR. BARKER: President DeFazio?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Here.

MR. BARKER: All 15 members are present.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9535-16, and the rest will be read into the record.

MR. BARKER: 9535-16. A Certificate of Achievement awarded to Mr. Luke Smith of Boy Scout Troop 1396 upon earning the rank of Eagle Scout. Sponsored by Council Member Baker.

9536-16. Proclamation declaring Tuesday, April 12th, 2016 to be Fashions for Kids' Sake Day in Allegheny County. Sponsored by Council Member Baker.

9537-16. Certificates of Achievement awarded to West Homestead Volunteer Fire Department Chief John Dindak, Rescue Captain Craig Siniawski, and neighbor Ken Hudak for their heroic actions on March 6th, 2016. Sponsored by Council Member Klein.

9538-16. Certificates of Achievement awarded to the Pittsburgh Chapter of the National Italian American Sports Hall of Fame 2016 honorees. Sponsored by Council Member Kress.

9539-16. Proclamation commending the City-County Federal Credit Union for being featured at the Credit Union National Association, Governmental Affairs Conference, February 21st through 25th, 2016 in Washington, DC and congratulating the credit union up on the occasion of its 75th anniversary. Sponsored by Council Member Macey.

MR. KRESS: Jared, excuse me for a second. Can you add my name to that, please?

MR. BARKER: Yes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Jared, while you're up there, 9538-16 put my name also as a co-sponsor.

MR. KRESS: I don't know if Dr. Martoni wanted on that, too?

DR. MARTONI: Yes.

MR. KRESS: And Palmiere. Anybody else?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. DEMARCO: Everybody.

MR. KRESS: Everybody is Italian. Okay.

MR. BARKER: Let me do it this way. Does anybody not wish to be added? Okay.

MR. BARKER: 9540-16. Proclamation congratulating the Mon/Yough Trail Council upon the occasion of its 25th anniversary. Sponsored by Council Member Macey.

9541-16. Proclamation congratulating Chief Richard Adams upon the occasion of his retirement from the Duquesne City Police Department after 51 years of dedicated service. Sponsored by Council Member Macey.

9542-16. Proclamations congratulating the graduates of the Local Government Academy's 2015-2016 Newly Elected Officials Course. Sponsored by Council Members Martoni, Means, Baker, DeFazio, DeMarco,

Ellenbogen, Finnerty, Futules, Kirk, Klein, Kress, Macey, Palmiere, Ranalli-Russell and Walton.

9543-16. Proclamation welcoming members of the A. Philip Randolph Institute Chapters attending the Northeast Regional Conference, April 8th through 10th, 2016 at the Westin Convention Center Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania. Sponsored by Council Member Walton.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Jared, put my name on there also.

MR. MACEY: Jared, me, too.

MR. BARKER: Okay. 9544-16. Proclamation recognizing The Writing our Own Narrative benefit reception and theatrical performance on Friday, April 8th, 2016 at the August Wilson Center for African-American Culture, and thanking the Pittsburgh A. Philip Randolph Institute Chapter for its steadfast commitment to social and economic justice. Sponsored by Council Member Walton.

9545-16. Proclamation honoring the Program to Aid Citizens Enterprise, PACE, for strengthening Allegheny County's disadvantaged communities and declaring Friday, April 8th, 2016 to be PACE Inclusion Voices Day in Allegheny County. Sponsored by Council Member Walton.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: At this time, I'm going to have the Allegheny County Government Review Commission Report. We moved that up. Okay? So are you guys prepared? Okay.

MR. FOERSTER: Thank you very much. My name is Mark Foerster, the Chairman of the Government Review Commission. This is Betsy Magley and Rick Schwartz. I'd like to thank Council for allowing us the opportunity to serve the County and to put together what we feel is a comprehensive of recommendations. We realize that some of us were appointed by you and some by the County Executive. But we put a lot of time and effort into this report, and we think you're going to find to be very thorough. There are 23 recommendations.

The process that we used was we met for one year. We met every month and we had sub-committees formed to digest and thoroughly investigate the entire County as a whole which, as you well know, is a very large entity and a lot of moving parts. So we had a lot of help from your staff, your County Council staff and the County Executive staff, not to get involved with the recommendations themselves, but to allow us the resources

of the County in order to have the intelligence to proceed with the report.

In addition to that, we had the help of a great staff of interns from Duquesne University Law School, thanks to Professor Joe Mistick. He and I'd like to recognize them at this point. If you guys would like to all stand up?

(Applause.)

MR. FOERSTER: They're not all here. Some are here and some are not, but Court Hower, Justin Leonelli, Chelsea Mague, Margaret McGannon, Emily Seelman and Elizabeth Tuttle. So these are the --- this is one of the great things that came from the Commission, is these are the best and brightest future of Allegheny County. And we want to thank you very much for your help. We could not have done without you.

(Applause.)

MR. FOERSTER: And another Commission member, Andrea Geraghty, has just arrived as well.

(Applause.)

MR. FOERSTER: So this evening, it's not our intent to get into the details of each of the recommendations, but I'd like to read them for the public since this our one opportunity and our report is to the people of Allegheny County. And through Council, if you will allow us to read the recommendations ---. So I'm going to read about the first five and then we could each read ---.

MR. SCHWARTZ: Just read them all.

MR. FOERSTER: Okay. Okay.

MS. MAGLEY: We'd have to get our reading glasses.

MR. FOERSTER: Oh, that's right. Okay. Well, I might have to as well.

Number One, Investigations of the Accountability, Conduct of the Ethics Commission.

Number Two, Restructuring of County Council Compensation.

Number Three, Amending Restrictions on Members of County Council or the Chief Executive Running for Another Public Office.

Number Four, Term Extension for Commission Members, meaning us.

Five, Mandatory Public Hearings on Findings and Recommendations.

Number Six, Investigations of the Accountably, Conduct and Ethics Commission Through the Amending of the Code.

Number Seven, Powers and Duties of Allegheny County Ethics Commission.

Number Eight, Staggered Sunset Review of each County or Department.

Number Nine, Reapportionment Commission.

Number Ten, Procedures for Adjusting Compensation of the County Executive.

Number 11, Employment Restrictions.

Number 12, County Departments Self-Reporting Diversity Reports.

Number 13, Sheriff's Department Costs Associated with Deputy Training.

Number 14, Government Involvement with Allegheny County Minority Women and Disadvantaged Businesses Enterprise.

Number 15, Centralization of Monies Coming into the County.

Number 16, Creation of the County Bond Board.

Number 17, County Economic Development Office Completing Affordable and Accessible Housing List.

Number 18, Increase Allotted Amount for Stipends.

Number 19, Improving Communication Between County Branches of Government.

Number 20, Committee to Review Proposed Merger of the County Police and Sheriff's Office.

Number 21, Salary of County Executives.

And Number 22, Voluntary Public Hearings on Findings and Recommendations.

So that we feel --- I can say we did our very best to bring the County the best recommendations we could at this time. We reviewed this. We realize the Commission only meets once every ten years. Two of the recommendations are to have Council come back to the people of Allegheny County on this report within one year or at a one-year interval and at a five-year interval to follow up on what Council and the Executive has done with these recommendations, if anything, at a one-year and five-year interval. We feel that that's a good increment instead of waiting the full ten years for a new report, to have a follow up in those periods of time.

We realize that some of the recommendations got more media attention than others. But we feel that all 22 recommendations are very important in their own right. And the good reasons to have all the recommendations. And again, we want to once again thank our interns, thank the staff of Allegheny County, Executive Rich Fitzgerald. You guys have been tremendous, County Council staff. Once again, we could not have done it without you. And I'd like to ask any Commission members if they would like to make any comments at this time.

MS. MAGLEY: I just have one. I think we all join Mark in our thanks to the staff and all the help we've had. But I also wanted to thank County Council. On a couple of occasions, we reached out to you and said we're talking about how you do your day-to-day work and we'd like your feedback, and you were really responsive to that. And that was very helpful. Thank you.

MS. GERAGHTY: My only addition to that, all of which I agree with, is that while we heard lots of complaints and problems and concerns, I think that one of the things that we all found, having listened to County --- listened to representatives of County Council and listening to the public and representatives of County government, is that we have a lot to be proud of in Allegheny County. You've done a fabulously good job and the County administration has done a very good job, and so you should be very proud of the work that you do. And we just encourage you to continue and encourage you to look at the recommendations we've made because we've thought about them very seriously and took our charge from you very seriously, and we appreciate your giving us the --- having the confidence in us that we could do that. Thank you.

MR. SCHWARTZ: It's so tempting just to say ditto, but the only thing that I'd like to add to it is there was a report done five years ago, and it pretty much never saw the light of day. So whether or not any of these recommendations are deemed worthy, necessary or whatever, I do think that the process and the very last recommendation is to add another step, and the step can be done in a couple of ways. It could be in the Administrative Code to look at the report in a year so it doesn't disappear. And then five years down the road, just see. There is --- I believe it's on the website. I think now it is on the website, the report that was done

five years ago. And once the report was dug out, it was a --- the Chief Executive staff did a very nice job in terms of taking that report line by line and showing what was done. And some of those things you'll see turn up again in this report here.

So we are very proud and pleased to be able to work there. I guess I felt a little unique as being on the very first County Council and seeing what has changed, what has gone on from here. And I do --- I agree that it's not as messed up as people think it is. It is working. It really is working. And a lot of the stuff is just being hammered out day to day, normal. It's growing pains. So I think that you'll find we actually --- there were probably, what would you say, maybe, if you boiled it down, 50, 75 recommendations, different things that people brought.

And as Betsy said, County Council was very helpful and very instrumental and brought quite a few issues to attention. But we had to boil those down, and we had to boil them down to things that we believe actually fell outside of their normal day-to-day duties, the Executive Branch's day-to-day duties, and that's what you'll have here in the document.

And once again, I thank you for the nomination and the privilege to serve. Thanks.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thanks. Let me say this while you're still standing there. I know we all want to thank you on the Committee and everyone else that worked with you. We know you worked awfully hard. We're going to meet on this pretty quickly. And we're going to take everything into account and we'll go from there.

But at this point, I have Nick Futules coming up. He has a proclamation for everyone he's going to read, so ---.

MR. SCHWARTZ: Well, thank you, and thanks for ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: He probably wants you guys to stay there while he ---.

MR. FINNERTY: Yeah. Thank you for all your hard work. We appreciate that.

MR. FUTULES: Recommendation 23, move the podium.

MR. SCHWARTZ: Put it out in the hall.

MR. FUTULES: Well, ---.



PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Get in there, Mary Esther. Austin, go ahead.

MR. FINNERTY: Bring Joe up, too.

MR. FUTULES: Getting a proclamation, Esther? Yeah, Joe. Come on, Joe. Your name is on here, too. I just want to thank the members of the Commission for their year's worth of due diligence and hard work, and our law students for putting together the paper. This proclamation commemorates that and it has all your names on it. And Rick, we promise that we will do our due diligence, and I'm sure that the President was going to put this in Government Reform ---

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. FUTULES: --- Committee. And we'll be discussing this on a regular basis issue by issue. And we will put out a report on what we find and recommendations as well. So your efforts will not go without someone doing anything, that's for sure, because when you do something and dedicate your time, your free time, like most people do in this Council --- so when you do that, we certainly believe in your due diligence and we'll make sure that we review this immediately. I have these proclamations to hand out, so it looks like I got a bunch of them for all of you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: What we want to also do after he passes out the proclamations, everybody come up front and we're all going to try to take a picture together with everybody.

MS. MEANS: Read the proclamation.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Nick, are you going to read the proclamation?

MR. FUTULES: Huh?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Are you going to read the proclamation?

MR. FUTULES: No. That's all right. It's pretty lengthy.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Well, read the one at the end.

MR. FUTULES: All right. I can.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: And Therefore, be it resolved ---.

MR. FUTULES: NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that Allegheny County Council does hereby acknowledge receipt of the final report and recommendations of the Allegheny Government Review Commission. And we thank

Commission Chair Mark Foerster, Vice-chair Aradhna --- oh boy, Oliphant, thank you, and member Andrea Geraghty, ---

MS. GERAGHTY: Geraghty (corrects pronunciation).

MR. FUTULES: --- Geraghty (changes pronunciation), thank you, Jay Hagerman, Betsy Bechtolt-Magley, Tracy McCants Lewis, Jim Nowac (sic) --- Nowalk, I'm sorry, Doug Price and Rick Schwartz.

And Furthermore, we thank the students of Duquesne University Law under the direction of the Professor Joe Sabino Mistick including the --- Court Hower, Justin Leonelli, Chelsa Mague, Margaret McGannon, Emily Seelman and Emily Tuttle, University of Pittsburgh Law Student Brian Andrew Nino, for the service and clerk, for the support and guidance provided by Joe Catanese, our staff. I wanted to thank them on behalf of Allegheny Council and Austin Davis, Mary Esther and Van Shura (phonetic) Edwards, ED. On behalf of the County Council, we thank you.

I hacked your names up pretty bad, but you know, I do okay. Sorry. I got one or two right there. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: You can walk up front. Yeah, come up front and we'll take a picture with all of us. Good job.

(Applause.)

(Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Public Comment on Agenda Items, we have none; right?

MR. BARKER: We have none.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Approval of Minutes, 9546-16.

MR. BARKER: Motion to approve the minutes of the March 8th, 2016 regular meeting of Council.

MR. PALMIERE: Move for approval.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes Respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it. Presentation of Appointments. 9531-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the reappointment of Barbara Parees to serve as a member of the Allegheny County HealthChoice, Inc. Board for a term to expire on December 31st, 2019. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That goes into Appointment Review Committee. 9532-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the reappointment of Councilman Michael Finnerty to serve as a member of the Conservation District Board for a term to expire on December 31st, 2019. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into the Appointment Review Committee. 9534. Did we do 33?

MR. BARKER: Thirty-three (33).

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thirty-three (33). 9533-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of Gregory Broujos to serve as a member of the Conservation District Board for a term to expire on December 31st, 2019. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into the Appointment Review Committee. 9534-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of Ruthann Omer to serve as a member of the Conservation District Board for a term to expire on December 31st, 2019. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into Appointment Review Committee. Unfinished Business, Committee on Appointment Review, Second Reading. 9449-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the reappointment of Alice Paylor-Dais to serve as a member of the Allegheny County Juvenile Detention Board of Advisors for a term to expire on December 31st, 2018. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Kress.

MR. KRESS: Thank you, Mr. President. Alice Paylor-Dais appeared before the Committee on Appointment Review on March 31st, 2016. The Committee made an affirmative recommendation for reappointment. I'd like to make a motion to approve.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes Respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it. 9501-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the reappointment of Daniel C. Connolly to serve as a member of the Allegheny County Industrial Development Authority, the Allegheny County Hospital Development Authority, the Allegheny County Higher Education Building Authority and the

Residential Finance Authority, each for a term to expire December 31st, 2020. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Kress?

MR. KRESS: Thank you, Mr. President. Daniel C. Connolly appeared before the Committee on Appointment Review on March 30th, 2016. At that time, there was an affirmative recommendation for his reappointment. I'd like to make a motion to approve.

MR. WALTON: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.  
9503-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the reappointment of M. Gayle Moss to serve as a member of the Allegheny County Jail Oversight Board of a term to expire on December 31st, 2016. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Kress.

MR. KRESS: Thank you, Mr. President. M. Gayle Moss appeared before the Committee on Review on March 30th, 2016. Her reappointment was affirmatively recommended. I'd like to make a motion to approve.

MR. PALMIERE: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.  
9522-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the reappointment of Dennis Floyd Jones to serve as a member of the Allegheny County Juvenile Detention Board of Advisors for a term to expire on December 31st, 2018. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Kress?

MR. KRESS: Thank you, Mr. President. Dennis Floyd Jones appeared before the Committee on Appointment Review on March 31st, 2016. At that time, there was an affirmative recommendation for his reappointment. I'd like to make a motion to approve.

MR. PALMIERE: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.  
9523-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of Dr. Andrew Hans Leuenberger to serve as a member of the Drug and Alcohol Planning Council of Allegheny County for a term to expire on December 31st, 2018. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Kress.

MR. KRESS: Thank you, Mr. President. Dr. Andrew Hans Leuenberger appeared before the Committee on Appointment Review on March 31st, 2016. At that time, the Committee made an affirmative recommendation for his appointment. I'd like to make a motion to approve.

MR. PALMIERE: Second.

MS. MEANS: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.  
9524-16.

MR. BARKER: Approving the reappointment of Jui Joshi to serve as a member of the Professional Services Review Committee for a term to expire on December 31st, 2019. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Kress.

MR. KRESS: Thank you, Mr. President. Jui Joshi appeared before the Committee on Appointment Review on March 31st, 2016. At that time, the Committee made an affirmative recommendation for a reappointment. I'd like to make a motion to approve.

MR. PALMIERE: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it. Under Liaison Reports, anyone? Representative Macey was first.

MR. MACEY: Thank you, Mr. President and members of Council. I just want to remind the community at large that on May 8th will be the first car cruise at West Mifflin Number Three Fire Hall, and that's at 3722 Rodeo Drive in West Mifflin near the County Airport. And for all you individuals who have a hot rod or you're a car buff, there's a lot of antiques there, as well as sport vehicles. We want you to come out and support us. And

the food out there is great and very affordable. So remember, May 8th starting at 5:30 'til 8:30, there'll be car cruises. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Baker, then I'll get you next, Sue.

MS. MEANS: Okay.

MR. BAKER: Thanks, Mr. President. I just want to report to our Council colleagues that we had a good time over lunch today. The County defeated the City in the Kane Foundation free throw contest. The County Staff did a good job. It was pretty close after that, but Councilman Walton and I were able to put us ahead. We defeated Councilman Gilman's team. With him, Councilman O'Connor and Councilman Burgess, we were up, and Councilman Klein's good work actually put us over the top to make sure that we won as a whole. The whole County beat the City. Most importantly, though --- and I'm sure Lexi's coverage of this will denote this --- most importantly, today's event raised \$4,000 for the Kane Foundation and the Kane Centers. And that's the most important thing out of the day, is that it got some good exposure for the Kane Foundation and the Kane Centers. I'd like thank, though, my colleagues, Councilman Walton and Councilman Klein, for their shooting skills. Councilman Walton was the second strongest shooter of the day. And I will say Andy Szefi is here as well, who showed off some pretty good skills as well shooting. And any team needs a good supporter, and Cindy Kirk might be the best advocate supporter of a free throw contest I've ever seen. So thanks, everyone. She was fantastic. So thanks to our colleagues for participating in the day. It was a lot of fun and got a lot of good awareness for an important organization and important cause. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Representative Means?

MS. MEANS: Yes. I just wanted to remind people that on April 26th is Election Day and that there will be an amendment to the State Constitution raising the age --- if people vote for it, raising the age of judges. Right now, judges have to retire at the age of 70. But if the voters agree, they can raise the age to 75 for judges before they have to retire. So my local newspaper keeps running every week this article about the background on the amendment, and so I just wanted to let the viewers, the citizens, know that this amendment is coming up.

And I also wanted to share with everyone that today is National Public Health Week from April 4th to the 10th. And yesterday, I had the honor and privilege to attend public --- the Public Health 3.0 in Wilkesburg at the Hosanna House. And we were very privileged to have the acting assistant Secretary for Health for the United States, Dr. Karen DeSalvo, join us. Also we were joined by the Pennsylvania Department of Health Secretary Dr. Karen Murphy, and of course, Dr. Karen Hacker also was there. It was an absolutely wonderful event. There was so much information that I gained, and there are so many different organizations working together to solve the public health problems in our community, in our America. But I just wanted to congratulate Dr. Hacker because she is on the cutting edge. And because she is doing such a great job in Allegheny County, there were only five cities chosen to have this special event in their city across the United States, and so they launched this special event, informational event, on public health called Public Health 3.0, and we were the first place they went. So the other cities are going to --- they're going to northern California, they're going to Nashville, Tennessee. They're going to Kansas City, Missouri, Spokane, Washington. And at the end of the day, they had like a free thinking coming up with ideas for how we can solve problems going forward.

But again, I wanted to congratulate the Health Department and Dr. Hacker for a wonderful event. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Who else had their hand raised? Anyone else? Seeing none, we will move on to New Business. 9547-16.

MR. BARKER: An Ordinance authorizing the County of Allegheny to grant a permanent license to Columbia Gas of Pennsylvania in order to provide Columbia Gas with a right of ingress and egress to County-owned property in the County's North Park for purposes of renewing, replacing, maintaining and servicing approximately 3,000 feet of an old and deteriorated gas transmission line in North Park at tax parcel Number 946-A-187, crossing North Ridge Road at three locations for the amount of \$15,000, as well as for the County to be reimbursed for the cost of replacing trees which will need to be removed in connection with the replacement of the gas transmission

line, which is estimated to be \$13,266.28. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into Parks Committee. 9548-16.

MR. BARKER: A Resolution of the County of Allegheny amending the Grants and Special Accounts Budget for 2016, Submission Number 02-16. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Budget and Finance. Do you have any, Mike, on that or ---?

MR. FINNERTY: I'm sorry. I wasn't --- I was looking ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9548-16.

MR. FINNERTY: Sorry. I don't think we have even --- let me check this out.

MR. BARKER: Correct. That's a new business item.

MR. FINNERTY: That's new business. I mean, I --- we didn't do this.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Why don't we just put it in ---?

MR. FINNERTY: It goes in Budget and Finance.

MR. BARKER: Right.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I just asked if you had a comment.

MR. FINNERTY: No. No.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All right. New Business motions, 9549-16.

MR. BARKER: Motion of the Council of Allegheny County urging the General Assembly to increase the minimum wage within the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania to at least \$10.15 per hour with all deliberate speed. Sponsored by Council Members Futules, Klein, Walton. I believe Mr. Finnerty has been added as well. I'm sorry, no. Yes. Mr. Finnerty has been added as well. And I believe that's everybody. Mr. Macey would like to be added. Dr. Martoni would like to be added. Mr. Palmiere would like to be added. Ms. Ranalli-Russell would like to be added and Mr. DeFazio would like to be added.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Mr. Futules. Representative Futules.

MR. FUTULES: It looks like everybody is a co-sponsor. I really don't need to say much, but I will. First of all, I didn't want to intentionally separate party lines by putting up a motion to support a minimum



wage bill. This is basically us telling the General Assembly that we agree that \$7.25 just doesn't cut it any more. Back in 2009 it was set at \$7.25. If you were to take three percent of the cost of living increase from 2009 'til today, it would be at \$9.50. In those years, the cost of living has certainly gone up a lot as far as groceries, gasoline, your gas bill, your electric bills, everything has practicably doubled in that time period. But yet your minimum wage remains the same.

I had heard from people talking to me and saying thank you for protecting us, was their comment. And when he said that to me, I thought to myself, I hadn't realized it, but it hit us, hit a very nerve with me because when people feel that people in government are looking out for you, it truly hits you in your heart. I've seen people working --- this particular woman working for a fast food chain in the morning. I was there for a breakfast sandwich. And it turns out that evening I had gone to a different fast food chain, and there she was, the same woman working a 6:00 to 2:00 shift, and I asked her what are you doing? I said I swore I saw you at McDonalds today. And she said, yeah. She goes I need two jobs. She goes I can't make it on minimum wage. So when I realized she worked a 6:00 to 2:00 job and then a 3:00 to 11:00 just to make ends meet, you know, when you see things like that you start to realize how lucky we are making a decent living. I'm a businessman. I've been in business for 40 years, and I've never paid anybody minimum wage because I feel the more you can pay your staff, the better they work. As a fact, I hire high school students and pay them the same rate as adults, but I tell them I understand you're a young person, but you're going to stand next to a adult, and you're going to work the same job and you're going to work just as hard as them. If you don't, I won't bring you back. But what happens is, the kids realize that they're getting a decent wage, and they work hard. And they were a part of my business. They were like a partner. And I respected them by giving them that type of wage. And I believe that --- I understand that there are businesses that still do minimum wage. I understand that. And for kids in high school it's great for them. I understand that. But I truly believe the State or the Federal government should follow the guidelines of the cost of living increases and not sit back from 2009 until today without any increase at all.

Not even \$.25 cents here, \$.10 cents there. It just remains stagnant. And I just think that's not fair because all of us in this world we get --- we get cost of living raises. And even places like --- I hate to use their name, Wal-Mart, Sam's Club, they don't start out at \$7.25. They pay people \$9, \$10, \$11, an hour to start because they understand you're not going to work for \$7.25. You can't. You can't make that kind of a living.

So I just want the Council here to understand where I'm coming from by that. We do understand. We're not actually voting on raising the minimum wage because it's not our jurisdiction. It's not part of what we do. But I'm just saying that and a lot of other members saying I support the fact that \$7.25 just isn't enough. And I support the fact that they should look into it. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative DeMarco.

MR. DEMARCO: Thank you, Mr. President. I would like to commend my colleague for paying more than the minimum wage to the folks who work in his establishment. And I appreciate that he did that voluntarily and not as result of a government mandate.

I, too, appreciate the fact that he's looking out for these individuals, this person that he spoke of that had worked at two fast food restaurants. But I'm trying to look out for the people of Allegheny County, and I'm going to look out for the 31,000 Pennsylvanians that the State's independent fiscal office said would lose their jobs if we raise the minimum wage from \$7.25 an hour to \$10.10 an hour.

Now, a little couple of facts about the minimum wage here. Only 2.3 percent of wage earners earn the Federal minimum wage. Most minimum wage earners are teenagers or young adults not heads of families. Only half --- or I'm sorry, excuse me, over half of minimum wage earners are between the ages of 16 and 24 and two-thirds work part-time so that's defined as less than 35 hours a week.

Now, the average family income of a minimum wage worker is \$53,000 a year, which is less than the national average of \$79,500, but well above the poverty level. And two-thirds of minimum wage workers live in families with incomes above 150 percent of the poverty line. And just four percent of the minimum wager workers are single

parents working full-time compared to 5.6 percent of all US workers.

I have a study here that was done by the National Bureau of Economic Research. They did a review of over 100 minimum wage studies and they found that the vast majority of concluded raising the minimum wage increases unemployment for low wage workers.

Now, here is where my concern comes in. A study that was done by economists William Evan and David McFearson found that a ten percent increase in the minimum wage decreases employment by 1.2 percent for Hispanic males without a diploma and 6.5 percent for black males without a diploma.

This wage increase to go from \$7.25 to \$10.15 is a 40 percent wage increase. So while the people who remain employed and get that wage increase, yes, they'll definitely benefit, but what about the 31,000 people who lose their jobs completely because businesses have to take and cut down? So that's my concern, Mr. President, and that's why I'll be a no on this motion.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Let me say this, Representative Futules. You didn't officially make a motion yet.

MR. FINNERTY: No, he hasn't.

MR. FUTULES: I'm sorry. I'd like to officially make a motion to accept my motion

MR. WALTON: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks. We're go on from here now. Is there any remarks? Representative Means.

MS. MEANS: Yes. I don't --- I hit him with my purse. Sorry. See, I think that if we raise minimum wage, why no, everything is going to cost more. And then because we raise minimum wage, then everything costs more and then inflation goes up, and then our money is worth less and then it hurts the senior citizens. I don't understand why we would want to hurt senior citizens because they're on a fixed income. They only get so much money a month. And even the money in the bank will be worth less because now money is worth less because of inflation. So I don't --- I will be a no vote because I just think it's going to --- I mean, it helps people get ahead for a short period of time, but then eventually everything costs more and then people really aren't ahead. So I will be a no vote. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Ranalli-Russell.

MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: I think like with the fast food chains and everything, if they raised the minimum wage they would be able to keep people. They would want to work there and give their all. And with it being raised, it also would put more into their Social Security, and they would get more when they retire. So that would also benefit the senior citizen, too.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Dewitt Walton?

MR. WALTON: Thank you, Mr. President. The issue that Member Futules raised in his proposed ordinance is significant, and significant in the fact that while he raises his proposal to raise the minimum wage for --- with state legislation, it doesn't go far enough. With all due respect to my fellow members, the reality is we can use a host of statistics to draw a picture, but the fact of the matter remains that businesses operate and continue to operate because they generate a profit, and that if they don't generate a profit, then they won't be in existence.

With all due respect, earlier in this meeting we propose and accepted a proclamation to the Pittsburgh A. Philip Randolph Institute for its northeast region --- northeast regional meeting that's being held this weekend. The basic premise behind the A. Philip Randolph Institute is the fight for economic social justice. In 1963, when Mr. Randolph coordinated his march on Washington, that was --- the issue of jobs and wages were one of the key tenants of that march. If we had established a national minimum wage at that point that he was proposing, which at that time was \$3 an hour, then when you count for inflation, the minimum wage would be well over \$12 an hour, now, almost \$13 an hour.

So if we do those kinds of analogies, look, there is no one on this --- at this table that is living or operating in poverty. But I see poverty every day. I see people as Member Futules described the lady who had to work two jobs in order to not drown. How can we, in good conscience, have someone working 16 hours a day not counting travel time to and from work in order to just exist, how is that individual suppose to have the time to take care of their family to ensure that their children get a quality education, know who their child is playing with.

We talk about all those ills and those challenges that we face in our communities, and to continue to force people to live in poverty raises the money that government spends for corrections, raises the money that we spend on supplemental assistance programs like SNAP. In good conscience, I respect everyone's choice that they make, but it is a moral sin, it is an ethical violation of what we are supposed to be about if we say work and live in poverty every day. We're just flat wrong to not support this.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any other ---? Okay. Let's start over with --- I got you. I'll get back to you. Who else? Okay. Go ahead, Representative Ellenbogen.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Those of you who have been on Council for a number of years know that I never liked any kinds of resolutions that weren't my job. You know, urging people to do this, that. You know, I'll support this out of the fact that I think Councilman Futules' heart is in the right place. However, you know, I have friends who have businesses that might not be able to afford to pay more. I have friends that need to make more money, that have children who need to make more money.

If the resolution just said, well, you know, you should take a look at the people who are responsible for it. Like I said, it's not my job. I don't get paid to decide this. And it just said, well, you know, the minimum wage should be raised, you know, but to just give it a number, \$10.15, where does that come from? We don't have the staff to decide what the small businesses can afford or what --- you know, all that.

So like I said, I think the heart is in the right place, but again, you know, we're going to sit here for an hour and we're going to argue about something that is not our job. I would rather us send the resolution to the Senate and the House and say it's your job. You know, why don't you look and see what the businesses can afford? Why don't you look and see that people are starving and need more money?

So that's just how I see it, but again, I support the fact that Councilman Futules --- I think his heart is in the right place. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Who else had their hand up? Let me start from the beginning. Representative Baker.

MR. BAKER: Thanks, Mr. President. To go off what Mr. Ellenbogen said, I agree with that 100 percent.

I think I've abstained from a lot of these urging of the state government to do different things when we're discussing them. I just don't see --- if it's not our role here to decide these things --- we're not Senator Furlow (sic) and I'm not Senator Vulakovich or Reschenthaler. It's not --- we can't decide these things here tonight. We work with close to a billion dollars as a county government that we do make the decisions on. So I just don't think it's our role. I will say I obviously, work with young people. The stats that I notice, and I know Mr. Walton said we were going to mention stats. The stats that I noticed that were that teenagers went from 42 percent working in our country to 32 percent after the last minimum wage increase, and a large theme park locally cut 70 employees while also raising their ticket prices after the last increase as well. So I'll be joining the fellow members of the caucus in voting no tonight. I'm sure it's going to be 10 to 5 vote or 10-4 to 1 and we're not going to always all agree.

And I would just note that I think it would be just as easily done if the members who are co-sponsoring, send a letter on behalf of the ten of them saying that they support it, and they want the state legislature to make it happen instead of it being a fully passed by the Council. That would just be my own recommendation.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Coming down the line, Representative DeMarco.

MR. DEMARCO: Thank you, Mr. President. I would like to add that I believe that my heart is in the right place here as well. And I'm concerned about the people that are in poverty, but studies have shown that the minimum wage does not reduce poverty. As a matter of fact, it's completely ineffective anti-poverty policy. But what I would have liked and what I would urge in the future for things like this, if we really want to help these folks, that as a Council let's get together, talk about it behind the scenes and come up with a policy that we can all agree upon so that we're united in whatever we pass and that we can all lobby both Democrats and Republicans in Harrisburg.

For example, if we're looking for policies that help poverty, we should be lobbying the Governor asking him to cut one percent, at least one percent off of the corporate net income tax. That will promote economic activity. That will track investment to the region which

will create jobs, competition for workers, will raise wages. We should reform welfare, restructure the welfare programs to reward work because right now there are arbitrary cutoffs so if someone makes a certain amount, they go from getting X amount in their SNAP benefits or in welfare to losing them completely. And those are a concern and I don't think we've taken that into account when we look and say, hey, let's give these people, you know, more money. Increase school choice. Let's insure the young people are as well educated as possible by offering them an alternative to failing school. These are the kinds of things that we could work together on and promote and proposing and work together as a Council.

And again, I just don't think the minimum wage motion here is going to achieve its desired intent or be effective here. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Finnerty.

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you. That was very well said. Those things should happen. We have a --- we have a state that could not pass a budget until a week or two ago that's two billion dollars in debt. And the budget they passed is remaining that way. So we're going to cut taxes. Now, we're not even talking about those items. We're talking about a minimum wage for people that if they get that amount of money, they're going to spend it because they have to spend it. To live, they have to spend it. To look at some statistic and say that there's been jobs lost because of minimum wage and the last time it was raised was 2009 is totally false. It depends whose statistics you're looking at. Our jobs have increased. Come on. I can go get a statistic that'll say that. It depends who it is. If it's Heartland, I know the statistics are going to agree with you. But if it's a liberal organization or progressive, I know they're going to agree with me.

The thing of it is, that these people need that, number one. If you got \$10 an hour, just \$10 an hour and you worked 40 hours every week, \$10 an hour is going to give you what, \$400 a week. Total wages for a year, if you worked every week, 52 weeks, is about \$21,000, which isn't a whole lot of money when you look at what's going on here. And to stop and say, hey, I think that there is going to be some jobs lost. I don't really believe that there's going to be jobs lost. If the person is making a profit, they're going to do it. And what drives this more

than anything else, what drives this, is corporations that want this to happen. You know, you can say whatever you want about it, but in the end run, if I'm paying someone \$7.25 an hour, they're getting welfare or they're not getting by. So what's happening here? We have corporate welfare because that person won't pay that person. Not only won't pay him, but probably doesn't even have hospitalization either, because they make sure they don't work 40 hours. They make sure they work 35 or 30 or whatever. And they have to get another job. That's what you're looking at.

We're not saying anything that I think is detrimental to anyone. I think it's very sound, very sound, that a person should be making more than \$10.15 an hour. I go into a supermarket and the cost of bread went up a \$1 a loaf in ten years. Now, how does that play out with a person who makes \$7.25 an hour? Think about it. Just think about it for a second. To come with statistics and say, hey, they're going to lose their job. If that person is making money, they're not losing their job. If the corporation is making millions of dollars and billions of dollars and not sharing it with anybody except for some other executive and some of their stock owners, I think we have to look at that, too. Maybe one of the best things would be that if they're going to make this amount of money, they share with the workers. Maybe that's what should be happening.

You know, you look at a lot of things, you know, that I look at and I say to myself, wait a second. You know, we look at things that, you know, --- the only reason why we're --- at least in my house, the only reason why I am where I am is because of railroads and unions. That's the only reason, because that wage went up because of it. Now, we turn around and in another angle, we're saying, well, unions are bad. Workers shouldn't be allowed to be organized. Well, wait a second, companies organize. They have their own groups, small business group, this small group and so on. That's fine. I mean, I look at this and say to myself, come on. Think about this. Think about it seriously. You know, don't give me some statistic that somebody pulled off a shelf somewhere because believe me, it didn't happen in 2009 even though it was said it was going to happen. It was said, and there's people that wrote about it and said it did happen, but it didn't happen. There was a recession at that time.



That's different. But ever since then we've been going up. And a lot of the people that are hiring right now --- McDonalds is probably one of them. They're not paying \$7.25 an hour. They're not doing that any more. They're paying \$8 and \$9 an hour.

I mean, this is something that --- these businesses should be doing this, but they're not. And it really aggravates me that government has to set something like this when businesses could be doing it to themselves. It's a supply and demand thing with me. If we had shortage on labor, I'll tell you what. Those wages would go up to get people. And that's what's happening at McDonalds. They have a shortage of labor. They can't get people to work there. They're raising the hourly wage.

And at the same time --- and I have one more thing I want to say since we're off on tangents here --- is ---

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Just one?

MR. FINNERTY: --- that --- well, I can do it, too. The big money is going to fight always moving minimum wage up. And this is my thought. I don't know if it's true, but it's my thought. That the reason why big money fights minimum wage is because they have workers that work in their house, cleaning it, taking care of their grass, et cetera, et cetera, et cetera. And if the minimum wage is raised, they have to pay it. So big money, billionaires, are going to put big money in any time to fight raising the wage because it hurts them. They'd sooner say, hey, it's Christmas. I'll give you a turkey. What a good guy I am. And then come around at Easter and give you --- give you a ham and say, oh, what a great guy I am. You know, you think about it, stop and think about it, who really fights minimum wage? Where does the big money come from? It's not coming from McDonalds. It's coming from people that are billionaires because they are against raising any wages for anyone. And that's my thoughts on the whole thing.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We're coming down ---.

MR. FINNERTY: And I apologize for taking to much time.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Futules, then we'll get you ---.

MR. FUTULES: Okay. I get a turn again. Thank you. I just want to thank everybody for participating and your comments. They are all actually great points,

really, on both sides. But I just want to remind us that this motion, it's like Jim said, we don't vote on it, but we're urging them to look at it. And at \$10.15 proposal is probably negotiable through the State and Senate what they think Pennsylvania should do. Not necessarily do you have to follow the federal guideline because in this motion it talks about other states. It talks about New Jersey, pays \$10.60. New York is \$9. Ohio is \$8.10. West Virginia, Maryland, both pay \$8.75. So it's not necessarily a federal law that each state can't change.

So this motion only tells the State of Pennsylvania please look into it. Please look at the fact that \$7.25 isn't enough. And if the legislation can come up with a different number, I would be ecstatic about that. Not necessarily will it be \$10.15, but when you negotiate something you have to start somewhere. Just like the budget, we start here and we end up here. That's all this is. And I appreciate everyone's comments and I want to thank you for your time.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Klein.

MR. KLEIN: Thank you, Mr. President. I think that's there's much that can be done to address the structural problems that contribute to poverty in this country. But I also think that while we continue to try to address those problems, and they are real and it's a battle that has to be fought on many fronts. We should really push the folks in Harrisburg to do the bare minimum, which is to raise the minimum wage. Sixteen (16) years ago, Barbara Ehrenreich, wrote a book that was actually a best seller entitled nicked and dined. And in that book she detailed the struggles of people living, trying to support a family on minimum and sometimes putting together two minimum wage jobs. It's a book that got a great read at the time and elicited a fair amount of response, and in some quarters a lot of surprise. But I think that as we consider this effort to move the state legislature in the right direction, her book is probably worth a reread because it really does detail the struggles of those who live in despair.

And so I think the responsible thing to do is to join in with Mr. Futules' motion and encourage the legislature to raise the minimum wage to \$10.15 an hour. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Kress.

MR. KRESS: Thank you, Mr. President. We spent a lot of time on this. And I'd like to echo sentiments of some of my other Council members who, you know, we're not --- I'm not in the General Assembly. And really, they get paid a lot better than us to do this. They actually have more facts before us. And again, as a Council person what I've been trying to do is trying to find jobs for the people in my district. And again, who's ever watching, if you need a job I've been having job fairs. I know Councilman Futules and I've had job fairs. Councilman DeFazio and I've had job fairs together. So if you're looking for a job, you can call me and I'll try to find you a job. And the thing is, a lot of the jobs that I've been find work for, I mean, they're \$18 an hour, like the bricklayers. They've been hiring for \$18 an hour. A lot of building and trades. And most of the people that come to our job fairs, they're paying more than minimum wage. They are. I mean, I don't know anybody ---.

And the other thing is, too, from my own personal experience a lot of people making minimum wage actually not really making minimum wage. They're making tips which aren't reported. I mean, there's people, valet parking, bus boys, there's different things like that. And a lot of people are --- some of the people are making minimum wage. I don't really run across minimum wage workers any more. I mean, the people that I've been talking to --- I actually didn't know what the minimum was because most of the people when they call me they're usually paying at least \$10 an hour, if not more. So that's what I wanted to say that at least.

And the problem that you had with minimum wage, too, I don't exactly know where they came up with the figure. I mean, it came up like \$10.15 an hour. I mean, where did that come from? So I really don't know what to say on this. I mean, the fact is I'm not a member of the General Assembly. So I'm going to abstain from it because again, I don't have all the facts here. And the fact is if you do raise the minimum wage too high it's obvious that people would lose their job. I mean, if somebody said, hey, it's \$15 or \$20 an hour that's kind of high. Some people can't pay that amount of money as a business, you know, as a business owner. And the fact is, too, if you're a small business owner, you may have family members working in your business you may --- put it this way, as a small business owner you may not get paid at all that

month. Okay? I mean, as a self-employed person, I mean, I've run across law firms with lawyers, the partners aren't making any money because they didn't bring in enough money, but their employees get paid. So it's tough. And that's the reason I'm going to abstain because there's not enough information. I'm not in the General Assembly. But thank you anyways for the spirited debate. Thank you very much.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Going down the line.

Remarks?

MR. MACEY: Thank you, Mr. President and members of Council, I support the minimum wage. I support anything we can do to help the downtrodden and to help those individuals in their quality of life. And in my neck of the woods, it's a little tough finding jobs and finding a job that pays well. So anything we can do to help those skilled workers as well as unskilled workers I'm voting for it.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Being that we've opened up this door, I think it's only fair to bring up another category of folks who are downtrodden. And this crosses the aisle of the Democrats and Republicans, and if you've been watching the voting trend of what's going on in this country --- and I have children in this age group, the thousands and thousands of 20 some year old kids who went to college, who got out of school, who owe \$100,000 plus in school loans and can't make it. And not to mention all the Democrat and Republican parents whose kids are living down in their basements, who are building extra rooms because the kids got to pay back the loans. So I just wanted to add their voice to all of this. So thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative DeMarco and I'll be back up here.

MR. DEMARCO: Thank you for recognizing me, Mr. President. I would just like, for the record, just state, that 64.2 percent of all private sector jobs created in this country are created in small business. So it's not huge corporations making million of dollars. And my fellow colleague here on Council also mentioned something. He talked about McDonalds is paying more today. They're paying \$8 and \$9 an hour because they can't get workers. And we already know Wal-Mart has increased their wages because they want to take and get better workers. And we just saw this past week that UPMC has come out and said

they're going to raise their minimum wage to \$15 an hour over a five year transition.

So I think my point here is that the market is already making these folks, making these adjustments in the wages. Why do we as government have to put a mandate which would create a barrier to entry to anybody or any new businesses that are trying to start up or to take hold here, because what we want to do, we want to get as many businesses to move into Allegheny County as possible, thereby creating jobs and giving these folks a chance to get started. So I thank you very much for listening to me.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Palmiere and then Representative Walton after him.

MR. PALMIERE: Mr. President, thank you. Colleagues, we're here --- if we're not willing to collaborate, to cooperate and to compromise, we don't belong here. This is a situation, I think, that demands compromise. And I think it demands collaboration and cooperation of all of us. And I'd like to see us in the future --- if anything like this comes up again, I'd like for us to really put --- exercise those forms of working together so that we can get something accomplished and not spend an hour and half debating one thing and another over and over and over again. Both sides have good points. Both sides have points that I think need worked on. And I liked in the future, if we could to do that, and cooperate, collaborate and compromise. Thank you, Mr. President.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Walton?

MR. WALTON: I don't want to belabor this discussion any longer than we've already gone. But I have to speak to some of the comments that continue to be made out of principle and conscience. We have a responsibility to shape public policy at the level that we do. We have a responsibility to lead. We have a responsibility to stand and to clearly enunciate our values, our goals, our aspirations and what we believe is right. So there is nothing wrong with having spirited debate about an issue that we believe in, that we're committed to. And the process to eliminate poverty is part of those policy responsibilities for all of us sitting at this table. So we need that. We need to clearly continue to lead.

In closing I will say this. As a Council member, if there is a corporation that wants to come to

Allegheny County and pay people poverty wages, I will do everything within my power to make sure that they don't come, that they don't continue to pile on the problem of poverty and denial of the residents of this County and the further burdens that already here. We have a responsibility to lead. I have no problem with standing up and saying that's what I'll do.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Seeing no more comment, being there's opposition on both sides, take a roll call vote.

MR. BARKER: On the motion to approve.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Baker.

MR. BAKER: No.

MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: No.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: (no response)

MR. BARKER: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Kirk?

MS. KIRK: No.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Abstain.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: No.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Ranalli-Russell?

MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: A vigorous yes.

MR. BARKER: President DeFazio?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ayes, 9; nays, 4, one abstention, and one member absent. The motion passes.

MS. KIRK: He's back.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I stepped away for a minute.  
Can I still vote?  
MR. CAMBEST: Go ahead.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Let him vote.  
MR. BARKER: I believe the Solicitor is correct.  
MR. ELLENBOGEN: I vote aye.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We're going down to  
Notification of Contracts.  
MR. BARKER: None.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We have none. Public  
Comment, we had one. James Love. Is there a James Love  
in the building?  
MR. BARKER: Not present.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Not present. Does someone  
want to make a motion to adjourn?  
MR. KLEIN: Make a motion to adjourn.  
MR. FINNERTY: Second.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Second. All those in favor  
signify by saying aye.  
(Ayes respond.)  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.  
Meeting adjourned.

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:15 P. M.

CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify, as the stenographic reporter, that the foregoing proceedings were taken stenographically by me, and thereafter reduced to typewriting by me or under my direction; and that this transcript is a true and accurate record to the best of my ability.

Valerie Gregory  
Court Reporter

Valerie Gregory