

ALLEGHENY COUNTY COUNCIL

REGULAR MEETING

- - -

BEFORE:

John P. DeFazio	-	President, Council-At-Large
Nicholas Futules	-	Vice President, District 7
Heather S. Heidelbaugh	-	Council-At-Large
Thomas Baker	-	District 1
Jan Rea	-	District 2
Edward Kress	-	District 3
Michael J. Finnerty	-	District 4
Sue Means	-	District 5
John F. Palmiere	-	District 6
Dr. Charles J. Martoni	-	District 8
Robert J. Macey	-	District 9
William Russell Robinson	-	District 10
Terri Klein	-	District 11
James Ellenbogen	-	District 12
Amanda Green Hawkins	-	District 13

Allegheny County Courthouse  
Fourth Floor, Gold Room  
436 Grant Street  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219

Tuesday, July 7, 2015 - 5:05 p.m.

SARGENT'S COURT REPORTING SERVICE, INC.  
429 Forbes Avenue, Suite 1300  
Pittsburgh, PA 15219  
(412) 232-3882 FAX (412) 471-8733

IN ATTENDANCE:

William McKain	-	County Manager
Joseph Catanese	-	Director of Constituent Services
Jared Barker	-	Director of Legislative Services
Walter Szymanski	-	Budget Director
Jack Cambest	-	Solicitor

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: The meeting will come to order. Will you all rise for the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag and remain standing for silent prayer or reflections. After me with the Pledge of Allegiance.

(Pledge of Allegiance recited.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Roll call.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

(No response.)

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Klein?

MS. KLEIN: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rae?

MS. RAE: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Present.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Here.

MR. CATANESE: 14 members currently present.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: proclamations and Certificates. 9051-15.

MR. CATANESE: proclamation recognizing Jennifer England, Gisele Fetterman and Leah Lizarondo for cutting waste and relieving hunger through the establishment of 412 Food Rescue. Sponsored by Council Member Heidelbaugh.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: So we're really lucky today. We have three Allegheny County citizens, our neighbors and

colleagues, who are with us today, and I'm going to try and get all these names correct, but I've already asked for a pre-apology. To my right is Jennifer England, Gisele Fetterman and Leah Lizarondo. Is that close enough? Thank you. Okay. And I recently read about these just wonderful women in the newspaper. What they decided to do, they got together. They had worked for some food agencies, and they recognized that many of the organizations that we typically go to dispose of food. And they are required to dispose of the food because the expiration dates are --- they just --- they have too much of it.

So what these women who live amongst us in our communities realized is that we have neighbors who are hungry. The food bank and other organizations are looking to feed their populations and we're just throwing food away.

So these three very, very busy women got together and they decided to come up with a new organization called 412 Food Rescue. And they, much better than I, can describe to all of us what it is that they're doing. They're searching for additional volunteers. And I think that this is a great thing for all of us to volunteer and to be cognizant that these folks are trying to help our neighbors with food insecurity.

So who would like to go first?

MS. LIZARONDO: On behalf of 412 Food Rescue and all our volunteers we'd like to thank the County for the proclamation and recognition of the good work that all our volunteers are doing.

We founded 412 Food Rescue in response to the fact that 40 percent of our food is wasted, almost half, while one in six go hungry. So there is a big disconnect that, for us, is unacceptable in this time where a lot of people are needing sustenance. So we have been rescuing food on our own, and we thought if we created an organization that would match donors and recipients and have people like every one of us in this room participate in the fight against hunger by picking up food and delivering it, then we could make a dent in food insecurity. And we have only been running for less than six months, and using only the power of volunteers we have moved over 40,000 pounds of food, providing 33,000 meals to individuals all over the county. And we are looking

forward to growing and eliminating food insecurity in the county. Thank you.

(Applause.)

MS. ENGLAND: As Leah said, we've done this using volunteers. And I really want to take a moment to recognize both our donors and volunteers. Our donors range from big national chains like Costco, Whole Foods, Target and Gordon Food Services all the way down to --- the local food co-op and the Carson Street Deli are national donors. However, it's often a local person. It's somebody that works there that sees things being thrown away and says I know that some of my neighbors are hungry. I know that some of my neighbors don't have enough to eat. I don't want to see this thrown away. And they have come to us and asked to work with us so that we can rescue the food. And it's really that local connection, that neighbor-to-neighbor connection that is making Food Rescue work.

On our volunteer side, we have done most of our organizing through Facebook. Believe it or not, when we say we have, you know, 16 cases of mushrooms that need to be picked up tomorrow and delivered to an organization that feeds food insecure individuals, within five minutes we often have two to three people again that --- from our community, just everyday regular people, that say, oh, I can do that. I can take a half an hour, an hour out of my day tomorrow and go pick up some mushrooms or some asparagus or some bread and make sure that that is used to feed my neighbors. And that happens over and over again every day.

And in fact, I think the 40,000 number was --- 40,000 pounds was last week. I think this week we're probably up to 43,000 or 44,000 pounds. And every week it just goes up and up and up. And again, it's all happening because of the amazing energy and the amazing work of people in our communities that are saying it's not right. We need to take care of each other. Thank you.

(Applause.)

MS. FETTERMAN: We started this in Braddock, small scale, and with one partnership which started as Costco, we were able to essentially eradicate food insecurity in our community of Braddock. And then we partnered to grow this through the county, so we were --- if we're able to do this in one community, and we know the size and its control, with only one donor, we said that

we're going to do this for the whole county. And we're looking to grow that and we're looking to create a model that can be taken nationally. And we can say that it started here. It started in Allegheny County. And now, this will hopefully be a model that's used around the entire country.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Tell us how to volunteer.

MS. FETTERMAN: I'm sorry?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Tell us how to volunteer.

MS. FETTERMAN: If you'd like to volunteer, you can find us --- we're on Twitter as 412 Food Rescue. We're on Facebook. You can just send us a note or just like us on Facebook and you'll get a message. It will say we have a pick-up today or what is your availability. And as soon as there is something that matches your need we will find you. We are also working on an app. We won the Steel City Cold Fest so there is an app that is actually being developed that will actually allow you to get these notifications on your smartphone. And it can be geographically. So if you're a mile away from a pick-up and two miles from a delivery, we'll find you and you guys can do that pick-up for us. Thank you.

(Applause.)

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Let me read the proclamation real quick and then we'll take our pictures.

WHEREAS, on average 40 percent of food in the United States is wasted which translates to 20 pounds of food per person worth \$165 billion a year. According to Feeding America, 171,660 people in Allegheny County are food insecure, 43,000 of whom are children. 412 Food Rescue works with food retailers and other food providers to distribute directly to communities in need. 412 is a rapid response organization that utilizes technology to aggregate and match food,

WHEREAS, through 412 Food Rescue, Ms. Fetterman, Ms. Lizarondo and project leader Jennifer England directly impact our community's health and sustainably by cutting waste and relieving hunger,

THEREFORE, on behalf of all the citizens of Allegheny County, I do hereby thank you for trying to alleviate hunger for our neighbors. Thank you so much.

(Applause.)

(Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9052-15.

MR. CATANESE: Let the record show that Councilwoman Green Hawkins is present.

Proclamation celebrating the PicklesBURGH Festival produced by the Pittsburgh Downtown Partnership on July 17th through the 18th, 2015 on the Rachel Carson Bridge. Sponsored by Council Member Kress.

MR. KRESS: It's an honor and a pleasure, first of all, to have Russell Howard here from the Pittsburgh Downtown Partnership because what we're doing --- again, this is something I've been an advocate of, is utilizing our bridges in a way not just for traffic or for travel, but for venues, to have events on them. And that's something I've been a big advocate for. Because Pittsburgh is rather unique in how we have our rivers and the skyline. And can we (sic) do something that no other city can do in America, that is, use our bridges for events. And I think that's something I'm very proud of, to be from this area. But also to have an event coming up here called PicklesBURGH. And Russell Howard is going to tell you a little bit about what they're going to be doing. So thank you.

MR. HOWARD: We're very excited to be presenting the first PicklesBURGH Festival on the bridge. And we want to thank the County for making that possible, particularly Kevin Evanto, the CMO, has been especially helpful. And of course, Rich Fitzgerald has been critical in our ability to get this through. Mayor Peduto and the City have also --- being key allies in this process.

But really, when we step back to question the why to do this, and it's --- you know, Pittsburgh Downtown Partnership mounts these events as a way to activate downtown and cultivate a vibrant downtown neighborhood. And we wanted to do something that was going to spotlight the City's riverfront as well as the bridges. And we wanted to do something that was very special and very Pittsburgh, you know. And as we talked about what to do, the idea for a Pickle Festival came up as the Home of Heinz. And the centerpiece of this festival is going to be a 35-foot flying Heinz Pickle in the middle of the bridge. And for those of you who remember the duck, I think you'll know that many people are going to turn out for that. It's a real sort of nod to the Heinz Pickle Pin which, of course, people relish. Sorry, can't help it, because we talked about the festival being a really big

dill. So we've got lots and lots of bad puns. This is a festival of bad puns.

We also want to thank Heinz for the support to make this possible as well as Whole Foods Market which is sponsoring the demonstration area, as well as BNY Mellon which is sponsoring a live music stage to highlight local musicians. So we're looking at this as a chance not to activate the waterfront, but really try to draw some attention to the City from outside.

We believe that the flying pickle will be worthy of some national media. We're making efforts to reach out to some of the national news networks and have gotten some interest already. So we're hoping that will happen, and that this is going to be the start of an annual festival that we would like to have on the bridge every year.

So we very much appreciate the recognition and the support from this body and from Ed in particular. And we hope to see you down there. It's July 17th and 18th from 3:00 to 10:00 on Friday, from 11:00 to 10:00 on Saturday. And it's going to be a good time.

And just to mention, it's not a pickle on a stick stuff. We're going to have --- we're going to be featuring foods that highlight the works of local chefs. Restaurants serving fresh brisket with homemade pickles. We're going to be also featuring farm stands that do a lot of their own jarring. So this ties into both the home canning movement as well as to the foodie movement that's sort of gripping the city --- as well as the restaurant scene continues to elevate it.

So really, this is an event that is meant to sort of cut across demographics, cut across communities, cut across age groups and we think its going to bring a lot of people in to share this experience. So again, thank you very much.

MR. KRESS: I've got to read the proclamation.

MR. HOWARD: Pardon?

MR. KRESS: I've got to read the proclamation.

MR. HOWARD: Please do.

MR. KRESS: He's taking my proclamation.

WHEREAS, on July 17th/18th, 2015 on the Rachel Carson Bridge, 9th Street Bridge, the Pittsburgh Downtown Partnership will host a new annual festival named PicklesBURGH showcasing downtown Pittsburgh's riverfront and celebrating all things pickled.

AND WHEREAS, the PicklesBURGH Festival will feature international dishes, hand-crafted foods and artisan cocktails with pickled ingredients from local restaurants and embrace the farm-to-table movement and the rising popularity of canning. Informative how-to demonstrations, author discussions, event memorabilia, pickled themed gifts, pickle juice drinking contest and live entertainment on the BNY Mellon Stage.

AND WHEREAS, a giant Heinz pickle balloon will fly over the Rachel Carson Bridge and serve as a reminder of Pittsburgh's proud pickle roots. The presenting sponsor of the PicklesBURGH Festival, the Heinz Company was founded in Sharpsburg in 1869. And popular tours of the H.J. Heinz factory also ended with a pickle pin, one of Pittsburgh's most beloved collectibles.

AND WHEREAS, the Pittsburgh Downtown Partnership is designed --- excuse me, the PicklesBURGH Festival will appeal to a wide audience from the greater Pittsburgh community.

NOW, THEREFORE, be it resolved that Allegheny County Council does hereby thank the Pittsburgh Downtown Partnership for creating the PicklesBURGH Festival, and we encourage the residents of Pittsburgh and Allegheny County to visit and celebrate the PicklesBURGH Festival. Thank you.

(Applause.)

(Pictures taken.)

MR. FINNERTY: Hey, Joe (indicating.)

MR. KRESS: If someone wants to sponsor ---.

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: (Indicating.)

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Add me, Joe.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Joe, (indicating.)

9053-15. And the rest will be read into the record.

MR. CATANESE: Proclamation recognizing the Woodlands Foundation Notes from the Heart Music Concert and declaring Friday, July 27th, 2015 to be Woodlands Day in Allegheny County. Sponsored by Council Member Baker.

9054-15. Proclamation congratulating former Pittsburgh Steelers running back Jerome Abram Bettis, Sr. for his induction into the Pro Football Hall of Fame in Canton, Ohio on August 8th, 2015. Sponsored by Council Members Ellenbogen, Baker, DeFazio, Finnerty, Futules, Green Hawkins, Klein, Kress, Macey, Martoni, Means,

Palmiere, Rae, Robinson, the Chief Executive and the Treasurer of Allegheny County.

9055-15. Proclamation thanking the 1,400 certified tree tenders across Pittsburgh and Allegheny County during the inaugural Tree Tender Symposium on Saturday, July 18th, 2015 at the August Wilson Center. Sponsored by Council Members Finnerty, DeFazio, Ellenbogen, Futules, Heidelbaugh, Klein, Macey, Martoni, Palmiere, Rae, Robinson and Means.

9056-15. Proclamation honoring in memoriam the dedicated service of Heidelberg Police Canine Officer Rocky. Sponsored by Council Member Finnerty.

9057-15. Proclamation congratulating SS. Simon & Jude Parish of Scott Township upon the occasion of its 60th anniversary. Sponsored by Council Member Finnerty.

9058-15. Certificate of Achievement awarded to the 2015 Allegheny County Marbles Tournament Championships: King Eli Murphy, Runner-up Bobby Narr, Queen Sierra Ricci and Runner-up Lauren Shuty. Sponsored by Council members Green Hawkins, Klein, Kress, Baker, DeFazio, Ellenbogen, Finnerty, Futules, Heidelbaugh, Macey, Martoni, Means, Palmiere, Rae and Robinson.

9059-15. Certificate of Achievement awarded to Junior Girl Scout Troop 55127 in the Deer Lakes School District for earning a Bronze Award for creating a farm-to-food bank program in West Deer Township. Sponsored by Council Member Kress.

9060-15. Certificate of Recognition presented to Mr. and Mrs. Frank and Louise Bonadio upon the occasion of their 65th wedding anniversary. Sponsored by Council Member Macey.

9061-15. Proclamation thanking Ms. Colleen Felentzer for her 13 years of service as the Director of Communications and Events for the Allegheny League of Municipalities, ALOM, and congratulating her as the new Executive Director of the Allegheny Kiski Strong Chamber. Sponsored by Council Member Martoni.

9062-15. Proclamation congratulating the Big Brothers, Big Sisters of Greater Pittsburgh for earning the Big Brothers, Big Sisters of America 2015 Midsize Agency of the Year award. Sponsored by Council Members Means, Macey, Baker, DeFazio, Ellenbogen, Finnerty, Futules, Green Hawkins, Heidelbaugh, Klein, Kress, Martoni, Palmiere, Rae and Robinson.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Public Comment, we have none. Approval of Minutes. 9064-15.

MR. CATANESE: Motion to approve the minutes of the Regular Meeting of Allegheny County held on May 20th, 2015.

MR. FUTULES: So moved.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes Respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it. Unfinished Business. Seeing none, we'll move down to Liaison Reports. John.

MR. PALMIERE: Thank you, Mr. President. I just wanted to take a moment to thank my colleagues for coming on the 4th of July to help celebrate Brentwood's 100th anniversary. We had a fun time. And I thank all of you personally for attending and I guess that's about it, Mr. President. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: You're welcome. Go ahead.

MS. KLEIN: I would just like to --- get my little notes. Thank you. I would just like to announce that for any Council members who are --- is that better? I just want to announce for any Council members who are interested, tomorrow at ten o'clock we will be having a tour at --- for the program for female offenders in West Homestead. So if anyone wants information, please contact me. I'll be happy to give you the address.

And also at one o'clock we'll be touring the jail for any Council members who wasn't able to make it to the last meeting. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Thank you. Any other Liaison Reports? Seeing none, we'll move on to new business, Ordinances and Resolutions.

MR. MACEY: Mr. President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes?

MR. MACEY: A point of personal privilege.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: What's your point?

MR. MACEY: The Public Works Committee met at four o'clock today, and there are some issues that deal with some timeliness and progress within the City of Pittsburgh and Allegheny County. We will be going into our summer break which means that the first two weeks of July we have meetings, and we're off for four weeks until the last two weeks of August. Therefore, we won't be able

to act on any of these particular ordinances unless we pull them. So I am now going to make a motion to pull Bill 8957-15 from committee.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

MR. FUTULES: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks. Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

MR. MACEY: Wait a minute.

MR. FINNERTY: See what it is.

MR. MACEY: We've got to know what it is. They're going to pass it out and see what it is.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Oh, I thought ---.

MR. MACEY: I'm sorry.

MR. FINNERTY: I already know.

MR. MACEY: Please, ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah, you're going to have to do that.

MR. MACEY: And if I might, Mr. President, this particular bill is about an easement to the Tenth Street Bridge. There's going to be about \$16 million worth of work done at the Tenth Street Bridge, and we need access to that bridge. There has been offers to the current property owners with no response, and we may have to go by eminent domain. However, we would like to see this particular ordinance move forward for the progress of repairing and rehabbing the bridge, the 10th Street Bridge. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Is that the only one you had?

MR. MACEY: That'll come up again. One at a time.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

MR. CATANESE: Do you want me to read?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MR. CATANESE: It's an Ordinance authorizing the County of Allegheny to acquire by condemnation a certain permanent bridge structure, access easement and temporary construction easement required to reconstruct the South Tenth Street Philip Murray Bridge, Phase 2, carrying South Tenth Street over the Monongahela River in the 1st and 17th Wards of the City of Pittsburgh, MA11-3511, and to take such further action as may be necessary under applicable law, including Pennsylvania Eminent Domain Code. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah. What's your point?

MS. MEANS: My point of order is we have a motion to pull and we have to vote on that first before we discuss the bill. Isn't that correct?

MR. CATANESE: You are correct.

DR. FUTULES: We are. We are.

MR. MACEY: Mr. President, ---

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MR. MACEY: --- I still think it was applicable to at least let people know what the bill was.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah. That's all we're doing now. We have to see about pulling ---. If the people, the majority agree about pulling it. Any other comments?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: The comments are about pulling; right?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: So you know, I just think it's curious that we're going to vote to pull a bill here, yet I voted to pull a bill that has been pending for a year.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Heather, hold it. Heather. Look, the majority of the people will rule. If they vote for or against whatever you had, we go with that. If they vote for or against what he says, we go with that. So you can't say, you know, they didn't pull mine, but they're pulling his or vice a versa. It has nothing to do with it. So either you don't want to go with this or you do want to go with it. Go ahead.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Thank you for allowing me to finish and not interrupting me. So my point is that I've tried to pull bills out of committee for three and a half years and we just can't do that. It's not just allowed. But we're about to do that now. I just think it's strange ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Heather. Under the rules, no, we're allowed to do that. That's where you're wrong. Okay? We're allowed to do that. We go by the vote. I don't think you understand that. I keep telling you that. Okay. Any other comment?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Excuse me, Mr. DeFazio.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I made a ruling on it.  
Okay.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: What is the ruling? You're telling me to shut up?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No. The ruling is I heard your comment and that's it.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: You didn't hear my comments.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes, I did. You said ---.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No. You're being rude to me.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: You started --- I'm not being rude. I'm telling you the correct rules. Okay? I'm telling you the correct rules. You said they voted against you. That has nothing to do with his --- what he's bringing up. There's two different things.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Mr. DeFazio, you cannot tell me my opinion is wrong.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: You gave your opinion. I said under the rules you're wrong. Yeah, you're wrong. Okay?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No, I'm not wrong.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. As the Chairman, I'm saying now --- you're out of order right now. I heard your point. I made a decision. Let's move on.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Okay.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Who's next? Go ahead.

MR. FINNERTY: I have a question also. And my question is is have we voted to have this on the floor?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No.

MR. FINNERTY: I don't think we have.

MR. MACEY: I made a motion.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: He made a motion.

MR. FINNERTY: He made a motion.

MR. FUTULES: It was seconded.

MR. FINNERTY: It was seconded. We have to vote on it.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Right.

MR. FINNERTY: We shouldn't be talking about the bill.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I wasn't talking about the bill.

MR. FINNERTY: No, I was not talking about ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Hold it.

MR. FINNERTY: All right. And then we can talk about that. All right? I'm not talking about you, Heather, at all. It has nothing to do with you. It has to do with what Councilwoman Means said.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

MR. FINNERTY: It's exactly right. We got to get it on the floor before we talk about it. So let's get it on the floor.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Councilwoman Means?

MS. MEANS: Thank you for recognizing me, President DeFazio. My question is to have some clarification. I'm not quite sure. I know in the past there's been discussion that we can't discuss the bill that we're going to pull. Or we are allowed to discuss the bill. And sometimes you say you're only allowed to give the number. But so we are allowed to know the content of the bill that we're going to pull. Is that correct, Mr. DeFazio?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Well, we have to know what we're going to vote on. That's all he's bringing up. We have to know what we're voting on. We can't vote on the blind, you know.

MR. FINNERTY: Can I answer that?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MR. FINNERTY: This is some of my discussion, I believe. What you said about it being on the floor, it has to be on the floor before you can discuss it. And we don't have it on the floor at the moment. And the other thing I was discussing or contemplating actually putting an ordinance out in --- was that if something is in committee, whatever it is, 1820 or whatever it is, dash 15, who knows, but anyhow, if it's in committee and say I want to pull that bill, now in your packet you could have what that bill is. But on the agenda you shouldn't have what it is because that bill --- what you're doing is that's a pull. So the only thing that's actually in a pull is the pull. There is no content. It's the pull. It doesn't say what the bill is. And that's what my argument was. All right? And that's what I was arguing. That's the point. The point is that when we get --- when that agenda is put out, it should not have a paragraph that tells you what's in that bill that's being pulled because it's not on the floor. It's an ordinance to pull or a resolution to pull. And so whatever it is, that should be it.

And we've gone through this a number of times, that, hey, I can't talk about this because the only thing I can talk about is timeliness. We need to do this because of timeliness. All right? That's the only reason to pull a bill, is timeliness. It says it right in our rules. All right? So that's been my discussion on it continually. All right?

So we still have not got this on the floor.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We didn't vote. Yeah, we didn't do it yet. Anyone else? Hand vote, or I mean, a voice vote with everybody.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Klein?

MS. KLEIN: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rae?

MS. RAE: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 15; nos, 0. The bill can be ---.

MR. FINNERTY: Mr. President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. FINNERTY: Is it on the floor? Can we talk about it?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah, now it is.

MR. FINNERTY: I would like the people from Public Works to come forward in regard to this bill, so we can see the cartoon, et cetera, in regard to this.

MR. MACEY: No, that's what they're called.

MR. FINNERTY: That's what it's called. These are called cartoons.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: As far as the motion goes, did we have a second and everything on the motion?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. FINNERTY: Oh, yeah. Futules seconded it. It's on the bill.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Okay.

MR. FINNERTY: And I only do this, Mr.

President, because I think it's important that everybody understands what going on. And I know we had, what, five, six people at the Public Works meeting and we understand it, but I think it's important that not only we understand it, but that the public understand what we're doing and why we're doing it. So if you want to explain exactly what this is. Let the TV see it. We have it here.

MR. SHANLEY: It's this area down here so it's over in the South Side area. What we need is to get access. We're looking at rehabilitating the Phase 2 on the South Tenth Street Bridge. We need a permanent access to get --- to maintain our walls along the structure and get into our vaults. So what you have in front of you is a drawing to show access areas we need to get from this condemnation and then a temporary construction easement.

MR. WRIGHT: Yeah, a small sliver next to the bridge, too, in addition to the permanent access.

MR. SHANLEY: And with this, this will allow us to maintain our structure in the future. We don't have it at the time, so we want to have permanent access so we can maintain the bridge.

MR. FINNERTY: Okay. Thank you. I have no other questions at this time.

MR. KRESS: Could you face us, please? Thank you.

MR. FINNERTY: Don't you have this in front of you?

MR. KRESS: He was speaking. You were turned away from us. We couldn't see what you were talking about.

MR. FINNERTY: He wants you to speak into the microphone.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I have a question for you. The first I have is this bridge was built all these years ago, and from what I'm gathering from you, there was never any

egress ever granted or no right of egress when the bridge was there all these years now?

MR. SHANLEY: That is correct. We're trying to get it now so we have it in the future.

MR. MCKAIN: To your point, Councilman, the reason why we want to do this --- so if they would ever change ownership and we need to repair it we wouldn't have to ---.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I'm sure it's usually ---.

MR. MCKAIN: Yeah. It's the right thing to do to have this done. It wasn't done before.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: That's all I needed to know. Thank you.

MR. MCKAIN: Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Representative Means?

MS. MEANS: Just for points of clarification, I did attend the meeting. But so there is a easement, a temporary easement. What we will be voting on is the temporary easement for construction, the work on the bridge and a permanent easement so that any time you need to go and work on the bridge that you can. So that in the future if there's work that needs to be done, if they sell the property, if the present owner sells the property, then there'll always be a way to access the abutment to work on the bridge. Is that true?

MR. MCKAIN: That is correct.

MS. MEANS: That's correct. And you tried to amicably work it out with the present owner to pay him a sum of money, \$85,000; is that correct?

MR. MCKAIN: \$85,800.

MS. MEANS: \$800. And you did have one conversation with him, and then you never heard again from this individual which is Mr. Mistick, Robert Mistick, I believe that is.

MR. MCKAIN: We have a log of 18 communications to him.

MS. MEANS: Eighteen (18).

MR. MCKAIN: Since September of 2014.

MS. MEANS: Okay.

MR. MCKAIN: And even though we have not reached an agreement, the full amount of the offer, \$85,800, will be made available to them after the declaration of taking is filed without jeopardizing or waiving his rights to petition the Court for a hearing. So we're just moving

forward because it's a \$16 million project and we can't wait any more after 18 attempts.

MR. MACEY: Mr. President?

MS. MEANS: I'm not finished with my questions.

MR. MACEY: Point of order. I'd like to make a motion that we approve 8957-15 from the Public Works Committee.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Did we make a motion?

MR. MACEY: No. I just made a motion to approve.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Someone make a second?

MR. ROBINSON: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Second. Okay. Under remarks. Sue, she had the floor. Go ahead.

MS. MEANS: So my --- okay. So you have made 18 attempts since September, correct, to touch base with Robert Mistick? Is that what you just said, Mr. McKain?

MR. MCKAIN: Just contact him.

MS. MEANS: Contact him.

MR. MCKAIN: His representative.

MS. MEANS: Am I allowed to ask like what does that mean? A letter? A phone call? You knocked on his door?

MR. MCKAIN: It could be e-mails, letters, calls.

MR. SHANLEY: He kept a log of how many times he reached him.

MS. MEANS: And then this is considered eminent domain, how we will acquire this permanent access; is that true? And then I did hear testimony in committee that PennDOT has guidelines when we proceed this way and we're following their guidelines; is this true?

MR. MCKAIN: That's all true.

MS. MEANS: And wait. There was two questions. Now I forget. The one was PennDOT; right?

MR. MCKAIN: Those questions are true.

MS. MEANS: Okay. And so we're following their guidelines. And this is my last comment. Okay. I just feel like I know I don't want to hold up a \$16 million project. I know it's a good thing to have access to the bridge. But here we are in the 11th hour and we have to make a decision now or we hold something up. I wish this would have been presented to us a month ago or two months ago because the County has been planning this for probably years. And I am the type of person that when the salesman

says the deal is today and you can --- you know, if you don't buy the car today the price goes away. When they pressure hard to buy something, I walk away from the deal. So I feel very uncomfortable with eminent domain. I feel uncomfortable with the 11th hour. And I am very conflicted with my vote. But thank you for answering my questions, and thank you for making 18 attempts to get in touch with Mr. Mistick. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Finnerty.

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you. I do agree with you, Councilwoamn Means. It would be nice if we would have got this before, but we didn't. And I think --- we don't know if eminent domain is going to be used at this time. It's possible, but nobody said it's a for-sure thing. I mean, a person might --- and probably will come around once we okay it. I would think that would put some pressure on him. And I just think --- and I don't want to use eminent domain either. That's the last resort. And I'm sure that's the last resort for our Public Works director and his assistant, his deputy. All right? So thank you. I will be voting for this.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I just wanted to say that I don't have a problem voting for this, but I would ask you, in the future, when it comes to these bridges to try to be a little more communicating. For instance, there's a bicycle lane on the Sixth Street Bridge, and it's my understanding that anything that happens on these bridges we have to approve. It just appeared one day. I had no knowledge of it. Mr. Kress did a nice proclamation for these gentlemen. I didn't know anything about that either. So I'm not saying I disagree with any of it. I'm just saying a little heads up because it's really in our purview. So we would appreciate it. I'm sure I speak for a lot of my colleagues, we'd like to know what's going on a little bit ahead of time. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Seeing no other questions, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

MR. FINNERTY: No. No. You got to take a roll call.

MR. CATANESE: Roll call.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: He had a motion on here. If we could go by a hand vote. Go ahead.

MR. FINNERTY: I think that's right.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: The paper --- look, the paper that was given to me said the motion of Council of Allegheny County pulling bill 8975.

MR. KRESS: We did that.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Is that it?

MR. KRESS: Yeah, we already did that.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. So now we're going with the Ordinance.

MR. FINNERTY: Now, we're voting on the Ordinance.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Let's go with ---.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Klein?

MS. KLEIN: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rae?

MS. RAE: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 14; no, 1. The bill passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Joe, ---.

MR. MACEY: Mr. President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead. That was --- what number was that you just read?

MR. CATANESE: That would be 8957. That's not on the agenda.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

MR. CATANESE: That's the bill that was pulled.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All right. Go ahead.

MR. MACEY: In the same --- thank you, Mr. President and Members of Council. In that same Public Works meeting, we have the same situation with the timeliness factor with the vacation time, the break, the two weeks in July and the last two weeks in August. It was very important that we move this forward for the purpose of, as I said, timeliness. And I would like to pull bill 9042-15 from the committee.

MR. ROBINSON: Second.

MR. FUTULES: Second. Somebody else do it?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Someone second it? Did you second it? Okay. Under remarks. Sue?

MS. MEANS: Thank you, Mr. President. So we're voting --- we're going to vote now on the motion to pull the bill ---

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Pull.

MS. MEANS: --- because it's under 60 days. Okay. Thank you very much.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

MR. FINNERTY: Let's vote. Timeliness. This is in ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead, Amanda.

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: I understand the need for efficiency and all the other stuff, but we have members of the public here. We have members of the public watching. It would be helpful and respectful, I believe, to let the public know what 9042-15 is so that we're not essentially speaking in code, before we vote to pull or not to pull. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Joe?

MR. CATANESE: Read it?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead. We can read it.

MR. CATANESE: 9042-15. And Ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, authorizing the conveyance of the County of Allegheny's interest in four vacant parcels currently owned by Allegheny County, the City of Pittsburgh and the School

District of Pittsburgh to the School District of Pittsburgh. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Now, under remarks.

MR. FINNERTY: We're voting to pull.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

MR. CATANESE: we need a motion to pull.

MR. FINNERTY: We have it.

MR. MACEY: I made a motion.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Let's vote on that. Do you want to have a ---?

MR. CATANESE: Do you want a roll call?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Klein?

MS. KLEIN: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rae?

MS. RAE: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 15: no's 0. Pull the bill.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MR. MACEY: I make a motion that we move and approve 9042-15.

MR. ROBINSON: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks. Go ahead, Mike.

MR. FINNERTY: I would like Economic Development to come forward, please.

MS. COLLINGE: Good afternoon. Jared is handing out a handout that we handed out at the committee meeting earlier today. It shows a picture of the parking lot that the school district proposes to build on the site which includes the four --- three taxing body owned properties as well as some other properties that were already acquired by the school district. Before you tonight as was read is the conveyance of the County's one-third interest in four parcels to the school district. The City has already agreed to convey their one-third interest and the school district will be the recipient. So they have approved that. They have already assembled the site. They acquired lots from PennDOT and the Urban Redevelopment Authority, so they're ready to go to build the parking lot. The parking lot is across the street from an elementary school. That's a Pittsburgh public school. And the parking lot will take cars off of the street so that the residents have a place to park. We had a support letter from the Manchester Citizens Council which is the community group in that area speaking about how this will be a great improvement to their area.

And the school district will also let the public use this lot when it's not in use by the teachers and staff of the school.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Representative Finnerty.

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you. Exactly where is this?

MS. COLLINGE: It's located in Manchester on the North Side of the City of Pittsburgh.

MR. FINNERTY: And you said it was right across from a school?

MS. COLLINGE: An elementary school, yes.

MR. FINNERTY: All right. That's all the questions I have.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any other comments?

MR. FINNERTY: Oh, I do have one more.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MR. FINNERTY: Excuse me. Why is --- why is this so timely? We pulled it and that's the reason we pulled it. Why is this timely?

MS. COLLINGE: The school would like to get the parking lot complete in time for the start of the school year so the teachers can start the year parking on the new parking lot.

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Wait a minute. Go ahead.  
Representative Ellenbogen.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Yeah. I see that they're going to give us like over \$3,000 for it. What is the property assessed for?

MS. COLLINGE: The assessed values --- actually the values that we came to were based on some comps that we ran in the area which values all four parcels at about \$14,000. How we came to that \$3,000 figure is that's based on the County's millage rate percentage compared to the City and the school district. They're assessed at about \$2,000 each with the exception of one which is assessed at zero because it was acquired in 1950 by a public body.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I'm just curious. How did this come to be County property? What was there before? Does anybody know? I mean, is there anything ---?

MS. COLLINGE: My understanding of how the three taxing body structure works is that one of the taxing bodies, in this case, usually the school district or the City, would be the one initially initiating a sheriff's sale process for back taxes, and there is no bidder at the sale so then it goes --- it reverts into the name of the three taxing bodies.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Let's take the roll call.

MR. CATANESE: It's to vote on Bill 9042-15.  
Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?  
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Klein?  
MS. KLEIN: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?  
MR. KRESS: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?  
MR. MACEY: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?  
DR. MARTONI: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?  
MS. MEANS: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?  
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rae?  
MS. RAE: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?  
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 15; no, 0. The bill

passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9065-15.

MS. COLLINGE: Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. 9065-15.

MR. CATANESE: An Ordinance approving the sale of approximately 2.2508 acres of County property located on Library Road in the Municipality of Bethel Park, Pennsylvania, 15102, identified as Lot and Block Nos. 392-F-225 and 392-F-175 and collectively known as the Department of Public Works District 5 Warehouse, for the sale price of \$325,000 to First Link of Pennsylvania, LP, a Pennsylvania Limited Partnership. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go to Public Works. 9066-15.

MR. CATANESE: A Resolution of the County of Allegheny amending the Grants and Special Accounts Budget for 2015, Subadmission 06-15. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go to Budget and Finance. 9067-15.

MR. CATANESE: A resolution amending the New Home Construction/Improvement Program enacted May 23, 1996

by the Board of Commissioners of Allegheny County at Agenda No. 700-96, subsequently amended by Resolution Nos. 22-00, 6-01, 61-02, 04-04-RE, 49-05-RE, 07-08-RE, 25-09-RE, 30-11-RE and 6-14-RE by providing for the continuation of the Allegheny County New Home Construction/Improvement Exemption Program. Sponsored by Council Member Means.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go to Budget and Finance.

MS. MEANS: President DeFazio?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MS. MEANS: May I just make a few comments on my bill? Yes. I just --- to share with my colleagues that new home construction is down by 9 percent from 2013 to 2014. And when a family lives their dream of building a home and moves into Allegheny County, they contribute to the tax --- not only the tax base, but they buy goods and services and stimulate the economy. So I hope that I can count on my fellow Council members to support this legislation and support the vital industry of new home construction. Thank you very much.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Jan, do you have ---?

MS. RAE: Yes, point of order.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes. Go ahead.

MS. RAE: I'd like pull a motion, please, and put it on the floor.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

MS. RAE: I make a motion to pull Bill 8392-14.

MR. ROBINSON: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: What's that number?

MS. RAE: 8392-14. I have a motion and a second. We need a voice vote.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: They're passing that out.

MS. MEANS: Point of order.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.

MS. MEANS: Mr. Chairman, thank you for recognizing me. So we're going to pull this from committee; is that correct? And we only need a simple majority or is that --- is that what's happening right now, the first vote that we take?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MS. MEANS: Okay. Thank you.

MR. FINNERTY: Let's vote.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any remarks?

MR. FINNERTY: No.

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Are we going to have Mr. Catanese read it so the public knows what is going on?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We could. We normally don't.

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: So the public knows what we're voting on.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. We'll go ---. Yeah.

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: So they know what 8392-14 is.

MR. FINNERTY: They will as soon as we pull it.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah, we're going to ---. This is the --- pull it first. Go ahead and read it.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the reappointment of Dr. Ronald Stone to serve as a Member of the Accountability, Conduct and Ethics Ace Commission for a term to expire on December 3rd, 2018 from Committee for an immediate and final vote.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. We're voting to take it ---.

MS. RAE: Yes. Mr. President, I'd like the motion to reappoint Dr. Ronald Stone ---.

MR. FINNERTY: Whoa. Whoa. We got it to get it on the floor.

MS. RAE: I'm sorry.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That's all right.

MS. RAE: I'm sorry.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: This is a motion to pull it.

MR. FINNERTY: Right.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Klein?

MS. KLEIN: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?  
DR. MARTONI: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?  
MS. MEANS: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?  
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rae?  
MS. RAE: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?  
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 14: nos, 1. The bill is

pulled.

MS. RAE: Mr. President, now I make a motion to have Dr. Ronald Stone reappointed to the Ethics Commission.

MR. ROBINSON: Second.

MR. FUTULES: Second.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Remarks? Heather?  
Representative Heidelbaugh.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: So as I recollect on Thursday, September 11th, 2014, there was an appointment review. And Mr. Stone came before the Committee at that time.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Are you on the mic?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I'm on the mic, yeah. He appeared and then there was a meeting of this County Council on Tuesday, September 23rd. And I believe the --- a motion was made by Ms. Rae to waive the 45-day rule stated in the rules of Council. There was a second by Mr. Finnerty, and the motion passed. And the President referred the appointment back to the committee.

Now, since that time, we have not --- the Appointment Review Committee has not had an opportunity to interview Dr. Stone. Dr. Stone, as well as the other members of the Commission, issued a ruling which we all received which was in the newspapers. This now is coming --- he's coming up for reappointment, yet no ---.

MR. FINNERTY: Excuse me. I don't know what this is all about.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: So we're having a motion to pull. He's currently in the committee, and we have not voted on this for almost --- what will be nine months. So

I am very much opposed to pulling this out of committee, to not reinterviewing these people after they've issued a holding in regard to one of our colleagues, and in which there was an enormous amount of controversy by this Council President rendering the bill by Ms. Means moot.

So I have copies here which I would like to have Jared assist me handing --- to hand out to everyone, which is the meeting minutes from the Appointment Review and the agenda synopsis from Tuesday, September 23rd. Can you hand --- I have them. I made the copies myself. Just one each.

So you know, I just think this is very improvident that we would be voting on these people to serve on a very important commission with having --- without having spoken to them since they issued their report.

Further, their report says shall. This Council shall issue a censure motion. We ignored that. And I want to ask them what their next step is considering that their report requires us to do something and we haven't done it.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any other questions? Go ahead.

MR. KRESS: No, wait a minute. She just said they ignored it.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MR. KRESS: The motion was not ignored. I mean, it was considered to be moot, but they did respond. Am I not correct, the President did send the letter? They had to respond to the ACE Commission to that report, and did not the President send a letter to the ACE Commission responding to the report. I want to make sure. Did you ---?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.

MR. KRESS: We sent that; correct? So we actually did respond. We did what they were supposed to do. Correct. Let me ask maybe the parliamentarian, did we do what we were supposed to do under the ACE Commission?

MR. CAMBEST: And they have no further jurisdiction, so they can't to anything else.

MR. KRESS: Okay. So we responded to their report. I wanted to make sure. Okay. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I disagree with what Councilman Kress has just said. We did not do what the ACE Commission told us to do. It said we shall censure Mr. Macey and we didn't do it, and we didn't consider it because the President ruled the bill moot.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: You know, you take what I said as a ruling, but we went to our parliamentarian and everyone else and they agreed ---.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: It's not your role.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Well, he gives the recommendation.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Your role is not to tell ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Heather. Heather.

MR. CAMBEST: You had a question about should Dr. Ronald Stone or any other ACE Commission do anything further? I answered that. It was, no, they have no jurisdiction.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: What you said was get going. That's not your role, Mr. Cambest, to tell us to get going.

MR. CAMBEST: I didn't say to keep going.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: He didn't say nothing to me.

MR. FINNERTY: What are you talking about?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Let's move on. Does anybody else have a question? I'm not going to stand here just to fight over nothing. Okay. Let's read Heather's ---. Okay. Not Heather's. It's Jan Rae's ---.

MS. RAE: No, Ms. Means has a ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Go ahead.

MS. MEANS: I just want to share, again, I kind of --- I mean, Mr. Stone is a very --- I was present in the interview. He's a very knowledgeable man. I mean, actually, he astounded us with his wisdom and knowledge. And they did an extensive research on this project. And I'm --- just say I'm conflicted because it has been a long time and maybe they should return to us and be interviewed again. But I just wanted to make that comment. Thank you very much.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All right. Let's take the ---. We'll go. You want to say something?

MR. KRESS: I want to say something. No. I served with Mr. Stone on the ACE Commission, the only person here actually served on the Ethic Commission with him. And I can't say enough good things about him. Totally apolitical unlike some things that occur here.

All I can say is that's the type of people we need in government. And I wholeheartedly support his reappointment to this commission. So I can personally vouch for this individual. So that's all I wanted to say. So thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Heidelbaugh.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: My comments have nothing to do with Dr. Stone in terms of his ability to serve or his credentials. So to the extent that my comments were misunderstood to relate to that, I apologize. My comments are that he has --- he and the other people that will be pulled tonight have not come back to the Appointment Review since the issuance of their opinion. And this has been held in committee for over nine months. And now it's being pulled at the last minute and it wasn't on the agenda.

My objection is to process, that we ought to have an opportunity to talk to him again and ask him questions. And we ought to be able to then have a vote in the Appointment Review and then consider it here. And it should have been on the agenda.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: As our Solicitor, is there anything wrong with what we're doing?

MR. CAMBEST: There's nothing in the rules that require that to come back. I understand Representative Heidelbaugh is making a request. It's not an unreasonable request, but there's nothing that requires you to do that. If you feel comfortable with the first interview and his qualifications, you don't need to bring him back. There's not a requirement to do so. That's all I'm saying.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All right. I think Council should vote now then.

MS. RAE: Well, I made a motion to move him forward. I need a second.

MR. ROBINSON: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Second.

MR. FINNERTY: There was a bunch of seconds.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Take the roll.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?  
MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?  
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Klein?  
MS. KLEIN: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?  
MR. KRESS: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?  
MR. MACEY: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?  
DR. MARTONI: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?  
MS. MEANS: No.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?  
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rae?  
MS. RAE: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?  
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 13; no's 2. Reappointment.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.  
MS. RAE: Mr. President.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.  
MS. RAE: I would also like to pull a motion,  
Bill Number 8393-14 from the Appointment Review Committee.  
MR. FINNERTY: Second.  
MS. MEANS: Point of order.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.  
MS. MEANS: I want to jump the gun before Amanda  
Green Hawkins asks for the content of the bill to be  
please read into the record for the public as well. Thank  
you.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah. Okay. We intended to  
do it. Go ahead.  
MR. CATANESE: Approving the reappointment of  
Daniel Garcia to serve as a Member of the Accountability,  
Conduct and Ethics ACE Commission for a term to expire on  
December 3, 2017 from committee for an immediate and final  
vote.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We have a motion to pull  
this. Do you want to take the vote?

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?  
MR. BAKER: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?  
MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?  
MR. FINNERTY: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?  
MR. FUTULES: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?  
MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?  
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Abstain.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Klein?  
MS. KLEIN: Yes  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?  
MR. KRESS: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?  
MR. MACEY: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?  
DR. MARTONI: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?  
MS. MEANS: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?  
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rae?  
MS. RAE: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?  
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 14; no's 0 with one  
abstention.  
MR. MACEY: Mr. President?  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.  
MR. MACEY: I'd like to make a motion to approve  
8393-14.  
MR. ROBINSON: Second.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Under remarks?  
Representative Heidelbaugh.  
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Mr. Garcia is employed in my  
law firm as an associate. When I determined --- when I  
first realized --- he had just been employed --- I have  
abstained from any discussions in regard to him. I do  
want to make it as a matter of public record that the  
first time I saw him the law firm, after I realized he was

on this Commission, I instructed him, because I'm a partner at the firm, to never discuss with me any matter before County Council or any matter of public interest before County Council or any matter at the ACE Commission, and he abided by that request. I've never spoken to him about anything. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No other ---? Go ahead, Sue.

MS. MEANS: Mr. Garcia is indeed my appointment and I feel very strongly that he's a very qualified person of high integrity. I think they did a fantastic job with the investigation, the recent investigation. But I'm probably going to vote against it just merely because I think they should return to Committee. So thank you for acknowledging me, Mr. President.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Seeing no more remarks, let's take ---.

MR. BAKER: Mr. President, I have a quick question.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MR. BAKER: This is probably for our parliamentarian. If somebody is just a personal friend, are you still allowed to vote for them? How does that ---?

MR. CAMBEST: Certainly.

MR. BAKER: I just wasn't sure. Like if you double date with them, ---.

MR. FINNERTY: Whoa, wait a second.

MR. BAKER: No, that's the truth. I give you ---.

MR. FINNERTY: I don't need all those details.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MR. KRESS: I just want to say that Mr. Garcia --- I'm a strong advocate. I also know Mr. Garcia. I don't actually double date with him, but I do know him. And I have to say he's a man of strong character. He is a person that I think will do an exceptional job. He's already done an exceptional job on this committee, and I advocate his appointment to it. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Let's take the vote.

MR. CATANESE: So on 8393-14. Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?  
MR. FUTULES: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?  
MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?  
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Abstain.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Klein?  
MS. KLEIN: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?  
MR. KRESS: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?  
MR. MACEY: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?  
DR. MARTONI: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?  
MS. MEANS: No.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?  
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rae?  
MS. RAE: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?  
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 13; nos, 1 with one abstention. The bill passes.

MS. RAE: Mr. President, I have one more motion to pull, 8459-14, and Mr. Catanese can read it to Council.

MR. ROBINSON: Second.

MS. RAE: A motion and a second. He hasn't mentioned a second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: And he seconded it?

MS. RAE: Yes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: There was a motion and Robinson seconded it to pull.

MS. RAE: Joe has to read it.

MR. CATANESE: Read it. Approving the appointment of Tonya B. Johnson to serve as a Member of the Accountability, Conduct and Ethics, the ACE Commission, for a term to expire on December 31st, 2015, from committee for an immediate and final vote.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any remarks?

MR. MACEY: I make a motion that we approve 8459-14.

MS. MEANS: We had a motion to pull.

MR. MACEY: My apologies.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Let's vote on the motion to pull.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Klein?

MS. KLEIN: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rae?

MS. RAE: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 14; nos, 1. Pulled from Committee.

MS. RAE. I'll make a motion to appoint Tonya B. Johnson to the Ethics Commission.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Second. Under remarks? Seeing none --- oh, Sue.

MS. MEANS: Again, I was present when we interviewed Ms. Tonya Johnson, and I feel like she is a very knowledgeable person of high ethics, but I will be

voting against her just not --- because I would like her to return to the Committee to be reinterviewed and not because she isn't a person of high integrity. So thank you very much.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Seeing no more, let's take the vote.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Klein?

MS. KLEIN: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rae?

MS. RAE: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 13; nos, 2. The bill passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: New business. Motion ---. Do you have something?

MR. KRESS: Yes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MR. KRESS: I have a motion to appoint Kristine Minnick to serve on the Council of Friends Organization for Deer Lakes Park. We've been through this before

so it's not actually ---. Do I have to do a motion to pull or just a motion to ---. There's no pull. There's no pull.

MR. FINNERTY: You got to get it on the agenda.

MR. KRESS: Just a motion to place it on the agenda. Okay.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none. Let's try a motion. All those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes Respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Opposed.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We have one, so that's okay.

MS. MEANS: Point of order.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.

MS. MEANS: Can I have a minute to read Ms. Minnick's résumé? A couple of minutes? No?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We already passed that.

MS. MEANS: I thought we were voting to add her to the agenda.

MR. KRESS: We were putting her ---.

MS. MEANS: I thought we just voted to add her to the agenda.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes, we did.

MS. MEANS: Okay. But we didn't appoint her yet. Okay. That's what I'd like a minute to ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead. Why not? We voted to pull it now; right?

MR. KRESS: No, we voted to place it.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I mean, place it on the agenda.

MR. KRESS: Yes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: This one don't need pulled. This is on the agenda. This is the Council of Friends.

MR. FINNERTY: Yeah, Council of Friends.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Do you want to ---?

MR. KRESS: I'd just like to say I spoke to Kristine Scranton Minnick. She's a wonderful person and has a great interest in the parks. We've having trouble actually getting some people for the Friends of the Parks for Deer Lakes. And I think she cares about our community. And I think she'd be a great person to be on the Friends Group because, again, this is another park I'd like to see some progress with. Maybe we're getting some

from the drilling, and I think there's a lot of good things that could happen to this park, so ---.

MR. MACEY: Make a motion.

MR. KRESS: I make a motion to appoint Kristine Scranton Minnick to the Council of Friends Organization for Deer Lakes Park for a term to expire on July 7th, 2017.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I have one.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I have a question. Why was this not put on the agenda?

MR. KRESS: I called yesterday, and it was a little late so I wanted to get this done because the next meeting is not until August. And I just wanted to put her on the Friends Group.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: So can I make a comment?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I just think that we do so little here in terms of real legislating that it really does the public and our body a disservice when we don't follow the rules. This isn't urgent. This isn't an emergency. Her name should be put up in the regular course of business. I don't know this woman. I'm sure she's delightful. I'm sure she'll serve Allegheny County. But we spent --- we've had five bills here tonight --- today that we didn't put on the agenda that we pushed through. It's just not a good practice to do it that way.

MR. KRESS: Well, all I'm going to say is this, is that we have a break, and I called on Monday and it was a little late, I guess. I don't know what time I called, 10:30, 11:00 o'clock. And again, I didn't think it was going to be a problem. We're just dealing with Friends Groups. And the fact is that I sit on the Friends Group, and first of all, you should just be happy you can find people willing to take their time out to participate.

And I have this person, I spoke to her in June and I would like to just place her on the agenda and pass her and put her on the agenda and put her on the committee, because again, this is Deer Lakes, and I would like to see something done in that park, so ---. Everyone --- you can object to it, but that's just the way it's going to work out, unfortunately. So thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Why don't you make a motion?

MR. KRESS: I thought I made a motion to ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Make a motion. You got to change the rules.

MR. KRESS: Pardon me?

MR. FINNERTY: No, I ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: She's talking about the rules. Did you want to make a motion?

MR. KRESS: I thought we already ---. Okay. A motion to make ---.

MR. FINNERTY: What about discussion?

MR. KRESS: I make a motion to change the rules. What motion? Excuse me. I know this is like --- what motion am I supposed to make, please?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: She's questioning the timeliness of him putting it in. He said with the ---.

MR. CAMBEST: She isn't questioning the rules. She's questioning whether or not this is a good policy to do that. This is permitted under the rules.

MR. KRESS: Okay.

MR. CAMBEST: She's just questioning whether it's good procedure.

MR. KRESS: Okay.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All right. Just vote on it.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I have a question.

MR. FINNERTY: Usually in the Friends, when we're putting up Friends, a person on the Friends, it's usually customary for the other Councilmen to vote for that Councilman's person that they put up. I think that I could see the questioning of timeliness here. I'm still going to vote for it, but I could see that. And I think that's important that we think about this type of maneuvers when we do things like this because we should be following a set pattern that we do. We can't just stop and say, hey, you know, there was timeliness involved in everything else. This isn't timely. This is something that --- as personal privilege, though, it is personal privilege of a Council person to put somebody on the Friends, just like I put people on the Friends for Settlers. So I understand that, too.

And I know it's not easy to get people to come forward. Yes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Ellenbogen.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Yeah, this has nothing to do with the gentle lady. I just have a question. In the nine years that I've been here, there's a form attached

here that says nomination of appointment, and then it says --- there's different categories, labor and education. And I don't understand. I've never seen one of these before and I want to know ---.

MR. FINNERTY: Yeah, that's Friends. Always Friends, yeah.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: No, but I'm saying I've never seen this form before. And it's like ---.

MR. FUTULES: I didn't either.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: And you know, and it says that if there's an X by education. Is that like her ---? I don't know.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Well, wait a minute.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Why is education checked and the others aren't?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I just want to say, I don't oppose this woman. I don't oppose the concept of my colleague, Mr. Finnerty, to give your colleague, you know, leeway in appointments. I don't oppose any of that. I've never voted against a Friends member. What I'm just saying is what he said, which we ought to follow procedure if it's not an urgent matter.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Sue. Representative Means.

MS. MEANS: May I address Council Member Ellenbogen's comment about this form? I just wanted to say that when I applied to be on the Friends of South Park I filled out the same form, so it's been a while. I think they ask you to check things because they're trying to figure out how you would like to serve in your capacity, what is your point of interest? And that's why I checked different things, so ---.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I appreciate the explanation. Thank you.

MS. MEANS: You're welcome.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any other comments? Seeing none, we have a motion on for ---. Yeah. Just have a roll call. Or actually, try it the other way first. All those in favor, signify by saying aye.

(Ayes Respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Abstain.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: The ayes have it.

MR. FINNERTY: One abstention.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. What else do you have?

MR. KRESS: I had another person. I got two more appointments. Motion ---.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Two?

MR. KRESS: Yeah, two. Motion to add to the agenda the appointment of Renae Vivaldi-Breskovich so serve as a member of the Council of Friends Organization of Hartwood Acres for a term to expire on July 7th, 2017.

MR. FINNERTY: I'm getting a cup of coffee.

MR. KRESS: I'd like to make that motion to add it to the agenda.

MR. FUTULES: Second.

MR. KRESS: Okay.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Just one more remark.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: The point of putting this on the Public Agenda is --- I'm sure this, again, is a person of quality. I'm sure you're vouching for her. But when we put a name on the agenda, let's say that this --- you know, somebody whose name was on the agenda had a history of performing badly or was against what we're trying to appoint here. You know, then the public would have a chance to come in here and comment on the agenda. When we do this, and if we do this as a regular matter of course, we're eliminating all of that. And while it may seem inconsequential on a Council of Friends' appointment it will not be inconsequential on other matters.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Well, this is the first time for the Council of Friends of the Parks. Yes. There's a motion to pull.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes Respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No. One --- Representative Heidelbaugh ---.

MR. KRESS: Now, what do I do?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Make a motion for the ---.

MR. KRESS: I make a motion to approve Renae Vivaldi-Breskovich to serve as a member of the Council of

Friends Organization of Hartwood Acres for her term to expire on July 7th, 2017.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Go ahead, Sue. Representative Means.

MS. MEANS: Thank you for recognizing me. I want to agree with Councilwoman Heidelbaugh having --- gosh, it's a long day and I'm mispronouncing your name. Sorry, Heather Heidelbaugh. So just add to that comment that when I see a name on the agenda, as you all probably remember, I do a Google search to check people out. And I would like to make the point that an appointment to the Friends is not inconsequential because they raise money and some of the Friends Group raise a significant amount of funds. And so just to remind people we need to check these people out and give the public time to comment on them. I would hope it would never happen, but I've seen librarians and the cheerleading associations embezzle money. So this is not an inconsequential appointment.

This lady could end up being the president or the treasurer of Friends, so I just agree, it's not a matter of urgency. These appointments should be put on the agenda. Thank you.

MR. KRESS: Again, may I say something?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MR. KRESS: Again, this is --- there was a break. There's things that go on at Hartwood Acres. I wanted to put them on there. It was one of these things where I don't know if they may not have a quorum or not to actually do business at Hartwood Acres. And I felt again, it's a volunteer. This isn't like somebody that's controlling like billions of dollars or million of dollars. This is a volunteer position at the park. And I'm just glad that this person wanted to do it.

Unfortunately, I called on Monday and normally I can get --- you know, I called in the morning, but --- and they said I could just add this to the agenda. It shouldn't be a problem. But unfortunately, some people view it as a problem.

But again, this is a volunteer. And I want to get things working at these parks. The person has volunteered, spent her time on this, and I don't think it's a huge deal or a huge problem to do it this way. And I understand if I miss the rules, its fine. But again, it would only have been on the agenda for yesterday. It

would have only been one day. Okay? Again, because of what's going on with our compressed schedule, I wanted to get this in before the summer so they can do whatever they need to do at Hartwood Acres. So that's the reason why it happened today. So thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We'll take a roll call.

MR. FINNERTY: You can do a voice vote.

MR. CATANESE: You want it as a roll call?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah, because there was a couple of ---. Well, we'll try it the other way if you want. All those in favor, signify by saying aye.

(Ayes Respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? Okay. Pass. You got one more?

MR. KRESS: Yeah, I got one more. Motion to add to the agenda approving the appointment of Richard Barnes to serve as a member of the Council of Friends Organization of Hartwood Acres Park for a term to expire on July 7th, 2017.

MS. RAE: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Do you want to read it, Joe?

MR. CATANESE: I don't have a paper.

MS. MEANS: We have to vote on that.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: You don't have it. Get Joe one.

MR. CATANESE: It's his appointment. He wants to read the appointment. I don't have it yet.

MR. BARKER: I got an extra one.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the appointment of Richard Barnes to serve as a member of the Council of Friends Organization, Hartwood Acres Park, for a term to expire on July 7th, 2017. Sponsored by Council Member Kress.

MS. MEANS: A point of order. Aren't we going to vote to add ---

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We did.

MS. MEANS: --- this person to the agenda?

MR. FINNERTY: We're supposed to put him on the agenda, but he read it first.

MS. MEANS: Okay.

MR. FINNERTY: Did you make a motion to put that on the agenda?

MR. KRESS: I did a motion.

MR. MACEY: He did a motion and I seconded it.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes Respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Opposed.

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Abstain. Follow the rules ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We had two; one abstain and one no.

MR. MACEY: Amanda, you're correct. Amanda, we did.

MR. CATANESE: Now make the motion.

MR. KRESS: Here we go. Motion approving the appointment of Richard Barnes to serve as a member of the Council of Friends Organization, Hartwood Acres Park, for a term to expire on July 7th, 2017.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Did you make the motion?

MR. KRESS: Yeah. I did make the motion.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: And he seconded it. Any remarks?

MR. KRESS: I just want to make a comment.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes Respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.  
90 -- what is that? 68? 88?

MR. FINNERTY: 68, you're correct.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Mine got written on.  
9068-15.

MR. CATANESE: Motion expressing the Sense of the Council of Allegheny County urging the Chief Executive to conduct a review on the residency status of all current County employees not subject to a residency requirement exception. Sponsored by Council Member Means.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We're going to put that in Government Reform. 9069-15.

MR. CATANESE: Executive Action for all departments from 6/1/2015 through 6/10/15 (sic) to be received and filed.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: 6/30.

MR. FINNERTY: 6/30.

MR. CATANESE: I'm sorry, 6/30/15. I'm sorry.  
Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Someone want to make a motion.

MR. FINNERTY: Make a motion

MR. ROBINSON: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes Respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.

MR. FINNERTY: Could I have a moment of personal privilege, please?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: What is it?

MR. FINNERTY: I have two items I'd like to talk about.

The first one is the real estate property tax and we're talking about school district tax. Many, many people in Allegheny County don't understand that they're actually getting some money back from the gambling. And if you look on your real estate for --- this is Chartiers Valley. This is mine. You will see that it'll give you a millage rate. In Chartiers Valley, the millage rate is 16.2175. It will also give you your assessed value of your house and mine is \$201,000. And then it will say Homestead Exclusion. Now, that is the money that you're getting from a gambling tax. And the exclusion for mine is \$6,338. And that brings my taxable value down for the school district we're talking about to \$194,762. And that gives you a break of about \$102.79 actually.

So if you have a homestead, and you must have a homestead to get this break, you could --- it's usually between \$100 and \$200 depending on how expensive your house is. So I just want to make sure that the people understand that it is on your tax --- your real estate tax, for the school district, not for the municipality. All right? The municipality is full value unless your municipality gives you a break and mine doesn't. So that's one thing I wanted to say.

The other thing is we've been going around and around here about a senior tax freeze. And that senior tax freeze, it's in my committee, by the way, Budget and Finance. I think some people thought it was somewhere else, but it isn't. It was put up on 4/22/14. I usually have a meeting promptly in regard to something. And I had a meeting 4/30/14, but the sponsor didn't show up.

Now, we had a number of people there that day, and no one has ever come to me and asked me to please put

it on again. The way I run my committee --- it would actually be our committee, is if I put it up and you don't show up, I'm not going to do it again unless you come and ask me and then I will. Because at least I know for sure you're going to come. At least I think so.

Now, there was no phone call. There was nothing in regard to the person not coming. I know the person knew about it because our director actually talked to the person and said it was there. Now, there's been a lot of fuss about that, and I don't see why. But the thing of it is --- that in my committee we have a number of bills and there's been articles in the paper in regard to these bills. And in my committee, anyhow, in our committee, I should say, because I don't own it, every one of these bills that are in my committee has been on my agenda and the sponsor did not show up.

Now, unless the sponsor is there to defend and tell you the purpose of the bill, you don't run it. We hold it or I --- or we hold it in committee. And we have for the last --- this is my third term. And that's what we've done. And if you really care and if you really want your bill heard, and you did not come to the meeting and you knew about it --- and you knew about it because you get e-mails about it. And you should at least call. I mean, it wasn't fair that we had six people sitting there and the sponsor doesn't show up. That's all I have to say about it.

I mean, I've looked at many things that have gone on around here. And I happened to go to Government Commission and heard that we don't do anything here. Well, we do a lot of things here, a lot of things. A lot of things are routine that we do that are sent by the Chief Executive. And a lot of things are important, extremely important; the budget, the tax levy, the grants and special budget, the capital budget. These are things that are very important. We do discuss them. We looked at many things again today that were important. I might not agree with the way it was done, but they're all important.

And I think that when somebody, our own person, attacks us in such a way that is totally uncalled for, especially if you would go back and find out exactly what is routine and what isn't routine that goes on here ---. Some things are routine. We get an extra \$600,000 for our capital budget to help us with the road from EQT. The

Chief Executive sends it over in an ordinance. So we can accept the money because that's part of our job. Now, we could say no, but I don't think that's a wise way to go. And we could question it and we do and we have. Why are they doing this? Blah, blah, et cetera and that's important. And that's part of legislation. That's part of being a legislator.

I have a bunch of problems and one of them is the 90-day rule. I want you to think about this and I'm not saying one way or another, but think about this. As a chairman, the people that are chairmen here, as a chairman, if in your committee you have a bill and you put it on the agenda, and you have a quorum there so that it can be amended one way or another, and the people in your committee will not let it out ---. Say you --- I think I have nine members on my committee, so say the vote is six to three not to let it out. And 90 days go by. What are you going to do? I mean, the people on the committee don't want it out. They voted against it. There's a problem with that rule. I mean, if it's me, as a chairman holding it, it's different. But if your committee is voting against it, there's another story to this tale here.

And I just want to make sure everybody knows that. I mean, some chairmen haven't run their bills, that's fine, but I --- we have a meeting pretty often in Budget and Finance. And in Budget and Finance, I think we have a very good discussion about many things that come through. I mean, I might not agree with everything you say and you might not agree with everything I say, but I believe in order. And I believe there's a certain way of doing it. And I try to go by that. That's why I agreed with some people today because it was disorder. And I hate disorder.

And I'm an educator. And I spent 30 years teaching, teaching the people that had a lot of problems and teaching the people who were the brightest in the school, both ways. And one thing I've learned in regard to teaching and as far as I'm concerned, I'm just a big kid. And you cannot reward bad behavior. If you start rewarding bad behavior, you have a big, big problem. And that is what I have to say about it. I think it's important. It's extremely important that this body is respected, that our colleagues are respected. Not disrespected. That if you want something changed, then

you should talk to us about it. And if you're going to make claims, claims better be right because there's a little saying about the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth, so help me God. And I believe in it. And I went back and it caused me a lot of --- it caused a lot of people a lot of trouble here because I had a lot of people working on this --- to look at voting records, to look at what's going on.

And I think it's important that people understand that. You know, I can give you a lot of information and I could talk forever about this because I really get frustrated when things aren't going in an orderly fashion because I don't believe in chaos. I don't believe in that theory. I'm an order kind of person. And I like to know we're going to go bang, bang, bang, bang. That's part of coaching, I guess, because I coached for 23 years. But I mean, this is stuff you have to do. And that's really all I have to say. I think I appreciate everybody's opinion. I do. But I also think that my opinion counts, too. And I think everybody's up here counts. And I don't intend to degrade this body in any way or any person on it, even if I don't agree with them. But I think it's extremely important that we stop and consider this, consider what has been going on. Thank you very much. I appreciate it.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Seeing no more comments on anything, does someone want to make a motion to adjourn?

MR. FINNERTY: Motion.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Second?

(Chorus of seconds.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes Respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.

MEETING ADJOURNED at 6:40 P.M.

CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify, as the stenographic reporter, that the foregoing proceedings were taken stenographically by me, and thereafter reduced to typewriting by me or under my direction; and that this transcript is a true and accurate record to the best of my ability.

  
Court Reporter

Barbara J. Jones