

ALLEGHENY COUNTY COUNCIL

REGULAR MEETING

- - -

BEFORE:

|                          |   |                             |
|--------------------------|---|-----------------------------|
| John P. DeFazio          | - | President, Council-at-Large |
| Nicholas Futules         | - | Vice President, District 7  |
| Heather S. Heidelbaugh   | - | Council-At-Large            |
| Thomas Baker             | - | District 1                  |
| Jan Rea                  | - | District 2                  |
| Edward Kress             | - | District 3                  |
| Michael J. Finnerty      | - | District 4                  |
| Sue Means                | - | District 5                  |
| John F. Palmiere         | - | District 6                  |
| Dr. Charles J. Martoni   | - | District 8                  |
| Robert J. Macey          | - | District 9                  |
| William Russell Robinson | - | District 10 (Via telephone) |
| Barbara Daly Danko       | - | District 11                 |
| James Ellenbogen         | - | District 12                 |
| Amanda Green Hawkins     | - | District 13                 |

Allegheny County Courthouse  
Fourth Floor, Gold Room  
436 Grant Street  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219

Tuesday, February 3, 2015 - 5:04 p.m.

SARGENT'S COURT REPORTING SERVICE, INC.  
429 Forbes Avenue, Suite 1300  
Pittsburgh, PA 15219  
(412) 232-3882 FAX (412) 471-8733

IN ATTENDANCE:

William McKain - County Manager  
Joseph Catanese - Director of Constituent Services  
Jared Barker - Director of Legislative Services  
Walter Szymanski - Budget Director  
Jack Cambest - County Council Solicitor

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We will come to order. Will you all rise for the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag and remaining standing for silent prayer and reflection?

(Pledge of Allegiance.)

(Moment of silent prayer.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Roll call.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Ms Danko?

MS. DANKO: (No response).

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Present.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?

MS. REA: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: How about them Buckeyes?

Present.

MR. CATANESE: We got that. Mr. DeFazio, President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Fourteen (14) members currently present.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 8755-15.

MR. CATANESE: Proclamation honoring Mr. Warren S. Finkel upon the occasion of his retirement from Allegheny County after 45 years of dedicated service to the Budget and Finance Department. Sponsored by Council

members Finnerty, Baker, Danko, DeFazio, Ellenbogen, Futules, Green Hawkins, Heidelbaugh, Kress, Macey, Martoni, Means, Palmiere, Rea and Robinson.

MR. FINNERTY: Oh, we're actually on. Okay. Thank you, Mr. President. Warren, if you would come up, please, and if you'd bring your wife Claudia and son Robert? Warren is our go-to man. Does the budget every year. We drive him out of his mind for about two months, but he answers all of our questions. But we still ask him more and some of them are the same. And we really appreciate your patience and the great work you've done for the County of Allegheny.

MR. FINKEL: Thank you.

MR. FINNERTY: And let me read your proclamation.

Whereas, we, the Allegheny County Council, take pride and pleasure in joining your friends, family members, co-workers and members of the community at large in congratulating Mr. Warren S. Finkel on his 45 years of service to Allegheny County and his richly deserved retirement.

Whereas, since 1970, Mr. Finkel has served nine Allegheny County administrations, six Boards of Commissioners and three County Executives and eight budget directors. And that's a miracle in itself.

And Whereas, during his tenure with the County, Mr. Finkel has served with the Department of Budget and Finance as Director since 2012 to 2015, the present, Senior Deputy Director from 2002 to 2012, Deputy Director from 1994 to 2002, Assistant Director from 1988 to 1994 and Manager, Budget Systems, from 1985 to 1987 and Grants Manager from 1978 to 1985. No wonder you know everything.

Whereas, Mr. Finkel has been an invaluable asset to the County as evidenced by his many notable accomplishments. Among them include the preparation of the first County-wide cost allegation plan in 1976 enabling the County to receive federal and state reimbursements for indirect costs. The establishment of procedures for calculating the interest on variable rate debt, preparing the annual operating budget request files and monthly physical forecasting that has been in place for over 15 years. And oversight of the 2014 re-financing of the GO loans series C-57, which was the most successful in terms of actual debt service savings and net present value percentage of all time.

And Whereas, throughout Mr. Finkel's tender with the County he has been responsible for countless productivity, efficiency and system improvements within the Budget and Finance Department.

Now, Therefore, be it resolved that Allegheny County Council does hereby thank Mr. Warren S. Finkel for his 45 years of exceptional service to Allegheny County. And we wish Warren the very best as he retires from public service, and also wish him health and happiness in all of his further endeavors. And as we say, may the sun always shine upon you.

MR. FINKEL: Thank you very much, Mike. Thank you, members of Council. Thank you, Councilman Finnerty. I don't know where the 45 years went. It just blew right by. I'm truly humbled and honored with this proclamation. I will truly remember this as long as I live. And I think from --- as the years go by, I will look fondly back to the times that I addressed Council in this large forum and at the large table in the --- in front of the Budget and Finance Committee meeting, and from time to time with the individual members of Council. I am very proud of the fact that the County has increased its financial position markedly in the last three years. That really weighed on my mind considerably when I became director, and good things have happened in the last three years. I think the best things are still to come.

So I want to thank --- first of all, I want to thank the support staff of Council, the three amigos at the front here, Joe and Jared and Walt. And the support staff of Council, they see me coming in every day getting coffee, Steffi and Lori and Aaron and Aaron. I hope I didn't forget anybody.

MR. FINNERTY: Stacy.

MR. FINKEL: Stacy. All right. I'm very proud of my staff. We have a wonderful budget staff. They're very professional, professional and knowledgeable. I think the County is going to be in good stead in the years to come. They're really fine people, and I would be remiss if I didn't thank the Executive for entrusting me with the leadership of the Budget and Finance Division three years ago, so thanks again. This is more than I expected. Thanks. Thank you very much.

(Applause.)

MR. FINNERTY: Anybody else want to join us feel free to come down.

MR. FUTULES: I think we all do.

MR. FINNERTY: Come on down.

(Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 8756-15.

MR. CATANESE: Proclamation congratulating KDKA-TV reporter Ms. Mary Robb Jackson upon the occasion of her retirement after 40 years of delivering the news to the residents of Western Pennsylvania. Sponsored by Council members Macey, Means, Baker, Danko, DeFazio, Ellenbogen, Finnerty, Futules, Green Hawkins, Heidelbaugh, Kress, Martoni, Palmiere, Rea and Robinson.

MR. MACEY: Well, it's certainly an honor and a privilege to be here, but also to specifically recognize a person that we all know from the media. Now, back in the day, and I can't say exactly what that day is because it was a while ago, but we saw Mary Robb Jackson, we saw Lynn Sawyer and we saw Patti Burns. And if you didn't know, you would think they were all sisters. That's how they --- they kind of looked alike. But my first meeting with Mary Robb was back when the steel mills closed and we were having a softball tournament. And Mary Robb came down to report on us and to see what the heck we were up to. I really think a lot of people that came there didn't come for the fundraiser. I think they came to see Mary Robb to be quite honest. But in the interests of time, because this is a Council meeting and we've got quite a few speakers, I would just like to read the proclamation. Incidentally --- please stand up. And your daughter, Mary Ellen. Okay.

Whereas, on the December 31st, 2014, long-time KDKA-TV anchor/reporter, Ms. Mary Robb Jackson retired a --- from television news after 40 years --- 40 years, where did it go --- of bringing the news to residents of western Pennsylvania.

And Whereas, Ms. Jackson began her television career in the 1970s as part of the studio crew at WPXI which used to be WIIC. After five years with Channel 11, Ms. Jackson joined KDKA on June 16, 1980 as a general assignment editor.

And Whereas, throughout the years, Ms. Jackson has served as the weekend anchor, field reporter, host of Evening Magazine and lifestyles reporter.

And Whereas, among her many achievements, Ms. Jackson won a 1996 mid-Atlantic Emmy Award for her series of reports from Vietnam entitled Vietnam, Finding Peace.

That's tough. I had some buddies that were there. Stories told through local veterans, eyes 20 years after the fall of Saigon.

And Whereas, Ms. Jackson is an active member of the community and supports a variety of causes including helping children, breast cancer patients, victims of domestic violence and veterans.

Now, Therefore, be it resolved that the Allegheny County Council hereby congratulates and thanks Ms. Mary Robb Jackson for her 40 years of dedicated service to the residents of western Pennsylvania. And we wish her well in her future endeavors.

Furthermore, although Ms. Jackson is retiring she will always be remembered as a kind, considerate and loyal individual dedicated to both her profession and community. Congratulations.

MS. ROBB JACKSON: Thank you so much.

MR. MACEY: In your great reporter style, please.

MS. ROBB JACKSON: Thank you so much. It's so nice to be in this room, not to be on deadline. Let me tell you, this is like a whole new experience, this retirement business. Thank you so much.

MR. MACEY: You're welcome.

MS. ROBB JACKSON: When I got the letter from Bob about this evening I was really overwhelmed. For a home-town girl, this really means a great deal. And in my job over these four decades, I guess, nearly four decades, I have always had to depend, as the playwright said, on the kindness of strangers. People have opened their hearts and their homes and have shared their stories with me for all these years. And it has been the most profound education that any human being could ever want because I have seen people in their most glorious, and I've seen people when you talk about Vietnam and we talk about the most recent wars in the small towns in western Pennsylvania, in the suburbs, in all of the communities here who have lost people. And it reminds you --- you are reminded again and again and again how this country is still about the goodness of people and about commitment and about patriotism. It's all still here because of good parents and good men and women.

I have just had --- it was all serendipity. I don't know how I ended up in the job, but I have had the time of my life. And I also hope that in the time to come

that I can continue to serve this community of Allegheny County, Pittsburgh and Allegheny County and western Pennsylvania, because if I have learned one thing, it is that we all have to care as much about all the neighborhoods, all the communities and the children who live there as much as we care about our own. And if we can do that, I know, as an old hippie, that we will have a better world. Thank you so much.

(Applause.)

MS. ROBB JACKSON: Oh, one more thing. This is my daughter, as you know. My husband is behind the KDKA camera, Michael.

(Applause.)

MR. FINNERTY: Does anybody else have any story? Is he coming up to get his picture taken?

MR. FUTULES: He's taking the picture.

MS. ROBB JACKSON: It's a family affair.

(Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 8757-15.

MR. CATANESE: Proclamation congratulating Pink Steel for earning second place in the world and first place in the nation at the International Breast Cancer Paddlers' Commission Participatory Dragon Boat Festival in Sarasota, Florida on October 24th to 25th, 2014 sponsored by Council member Baker.

MR. BAKER: All right. Great. Pink Steel, you have 100 percent approval rating in this room. That's pretty good. All right. Lynne and Melissa, if you could you join me up here? And all the members of the Pink Steel that are here in the crowd tonight, the team members, come on up. And one thing in this, I guess, focused week on sports and in competition, I think something that a lot of folks probably don't know is that here in Pittsburgh we have the number one team in the country. We have the number two team in the world for dragon boat racing, which is incredible. So Pink Steel ---

(Applause.)

MR. BAKER: Right, it's pretty --- yeah. Thank you. So there are 101 teams in the world that this group paddled against, and out of all those teams, this group, this team, came in second place, again, in the world, first out of America, which is absolutely incredible. I've known Melissa Adams for probably about five or six years now and have been friends with her husband, Bud

Adams, and just have been so inspired and touched by all the work that Melissa does, not just with this team, but also with her efforts through CFP, the cancer fighting princess. She is a rock star in herself and --- so proud in everything that she's doing. Congrats to Lynne, who started this team ten years ago; right, Lynne, 2005?

MS. FRANKS-MEINERT: 2005.

MR. BAKER: 2005. So it's an amazing group of women. We're going to get a chance to know them in just a minute or two. With that, I want to read the proclamation and make it your day in Allegheny County.

Whereas, dragon boat racing is an ancient Chinese tradition that became associated with breast cancer in 1996 when a Canadian sports medicine specialist, Dr. Don McKenzie, encouraged patients to try the sport for gaining upper body strength.

And Whereas, Pink Steel is a breast cancer survivor dragon boat and racing team within the Steel City Dragon Boat Association here in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania.

And Whereas, in 2005, Lynne Franks-Meinert founded the Pink Steel Dragon Boat Racing team to honor a friend who died of breast cancer with the purpose of promoting health, fitness and overall wellness within the breast cancer survivor community.

And Whereas, Pink Steel, based out of the Fox Chapel Yacht Club, competes in regional, national and international competitions. In 2010, Pink Steel won the gold medal in the U.S. Dragon Boat Federation club crew nationals and in 2013, Pink Steel earned a silver medal in those same --- those nationals.

Whereas, the Pink Steel team participated in the International Breast Cancer Paddlers Commission participatory Dragon Boat Festival in Sarasota, Florida on October 24th through the 26th, where they competed against teams from all over the world, including here from the United States, Canada, Ireland, Australia, Singapore and other countries. Pink Steel ranked number two in the world and first place in the United States.

Now, Therefore, be it resolved that Allegheny County Council does hereby congratulate Lynne, Melissa, the whole team from Pink Steel, for earning second place in the world and for earning the title of best in the nation. And we recognize its members for their courage, strength, determination, spirit of adventure and fight against breast cancer. Sponsored by myself and all my

colleagues here on Allegheny County Council and presented this 3rd day of February, 2015. Congratulations.

MS. ADAMS: So I had actually prepared something, but it seems like somebody stole my thunder.

MR. BAKER: Oh, sorry.

MS. ADAMS: That's okay. And I actually had to write it because I'm not as poised up here speaking just kind of speaking off the cuff so ---. On behalf of Pink Steel, I would like to say thank you. We are truly honored to receive this proclamation today. It means so much for our team to be recognized by all of you for all of the hard work that we have done over the course of our time actually being paddlers for Pink Steel.

As Tom had said, Pink Steel was founded in 2005 by our coach, Lynne Franks-Meinert, after losing a friend with breast cancer. And we started out with about five team members at that point in time, and we have grown to over 45 team members at this point. And all of our team members are breast cancer survivors. We range in age from 38 to 72 years young. Many of our team members have battled cancer multiple times, and yet they still find it within themselves to get out there on the boat and paddle with us. Getting a diagnosis of cancer and going through all of the treatments leaves many of us feeling lost as we kind of struggle to pick up the pieces and rebuild our lives. And we try to regain some semblance of normalcy, if there is any normalcy to be obtained after a cancer diagnosis and treatment.

Many of us come to Pink Steel feeling weak and uncertain of ourselves, feeling uncertain of what life has to offer after breast cancer. But what we come for is for that support in others that have walked the journey before us. What we come out with is so much more. Our coach does not treat us like victims. She doesn't treat us like patients. Some of you might want to try paddling with her sometime --- but she's great. She pushes us physically and she pushes us mentally. We learn that we are more than survivors. We are warriors, we are competitors and we are athletes. We become empowered, and we realize that we are more than just breast cancer survivors. As Tom had said, we traveled to Sarasota, Florida in October to participate in the Breast Cancer Dragon Boating Festival. And that was done through the donations of very many or lots of generous people within our community, that we were able to do that. And we did compete against 101 teams, as

Tom said, from all over the world and came out second in the United States --- or first in the United States, second in the world. And we are very, very excited to say and consider ourselves now to be part of the family of City of Champions.

(Applause.)

(Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 8758-15.

MR. CATANESE: Certificates of Achievement awarded to the 2014-2015 Ellis School Girls' Field Hockey Team in recognition of winning the WPIAL Class AA Girls' Field Hockey Championship. Sponsored by Council member Danko and Council member Green Hawkins.

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: I'm just going to invite Genny Kozusko, the head coach, and Sharon Jackson, the team manager to the podium with me.

MS. KOZUSKO: Do you want the kids to come up now?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: If you want, yeah. Let's have the team come up as well.

MS. KOZUSKO: Come on up, girls.

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: We can have them introduce themselves, too.

MS. KOZUSKO: Okay. Come on over. I'm sorry. Come on over here.

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: I'm just going to read the Certificate of Achievement. This Certificate of Achievement is awarded to the 2014-2015 Ellis School Girls' Field Hockey team in recognition of winning the 2014 WPIAL Class AA Girls' Field Hockey Championship. We commend and recognize each player and coach whose determination and resolve led to this achievement. The team has set a positive example of excellence for all of Allegheny County, continuing evidence that this is the County of Champions. This achievement has conferred honor on this County and is an accomplishment in which the entire community can be proud. Sponsored this 3rd day of April (sic) by myself, Amanda Green Hawkins and County Councilwoman Barbara Daly Danko.

MS. KOZUSKO: Thank you. Thank you very much. First of all, thank you to Allegheny County Council for this honor. We are delighted to be here and we were so happy to win the WPIAL this year. It was a thrill. The best part about coaching this team --- and I've been coaching hockey for 31 years now. The best part of

coaching these girls is they truly were a team. It wasn't just one or two individuals. Thanks to the leadership of all three captains, we were lucky enough and talented enough to go on and win in the WPIAL AA Championships. So thank you folks for recognizing us. And thank you to the parents and all the people that supported us throughout the year. Now, I'd like for the girls to introduce themselves, please, and then line up in front of the seal over there. Thank you.

MS. HANEY:, I'm Mackenzie Haney. I'm in 12th grade and I was one of the captains this year.

MS. KING: My name is Beatrice King. I'm a senior at Ellis and I was also one of the captains.

LEAH: Hi, I'm Leah. I'm in 9th grade and I was not one of the captains.

ANGELINA: Hi, I'm Angelina and I was also not one of the captains.

MS. OGOT: Hi, I'm Sophia Ogot. I'm a junior and I was the sweep for the team.

MS. BALDWIN: Hi, I'm Courtney Baldwin. I'm a sophomore and I was one of the goalies.

MS. HARTMAN: Hi, I'm Corinne Hartman. I'm a freshman and I was a front line player.

MS. SIMON: Hi, I'm Lilia (phonetic) Simon. I'm a freshman and I was one of the front line players.

MS. BOSELLO: Hi, I'm Emily Bosello (phonetic). I was a defensive player.

MS. RYANS: Hi, I'm Layla Ryans (phonetic) and I was one of the goalies and I'm a junior.

MS. FORSYTHE: Hi, I'm Charlotte Forsythe. I was a junior and a midfielder.

MS. ELLIS: I'm Brittany Ellis. I'm a senior and I was one of the captains and the goalie.

MS. SEEFIS: Hi, I'm Nija Seefis (phonetic). I am a sophomore and I was a front line player.

(Applause.)

(Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 8759-15. The rest will be read into the record.

MR. CATANESE: Proclamation recognizing the Pennsylvania Center for Women and Politics of Chatham University for hosting the 4th Annual Ready to Run Campaign Training for Women and proclaiming January 31, 2015 as Ready to Run Day in Allegheny County. Sponsored by Council members Baker, DeFazio, Finnerty, Futules,

Green Hawkins, Heidelbaugh, Kress, Macey, Martoni, Means, Palmiere and Rea.

8760-15: Proclamation recognizing the 2014-2015 Duquesne Women's Basketball Team for their dedication in the classroom and on the court. Sponsored by Council member Baker.

8761-15: Certificates of Achievement awarded to the 2014-2015 Pittsburgh Brashear High School Football Team for winning the City League Football Championship. Sponsored by Council member Ellenbogen.

8762-15: Proclamation naming the month of February "Black History Month" in Allegheny County. Sponsored by Council members Green Hawkins, Robinson, Baker, Danko, DeFazio, Ellenbogen, Finnerty, Futules, Heidelbaugh, Kress, Macey, Martoni, Means, Palmiere and Rea.

8763-15: Certificate of Recognition awarded to Mr. and Mrs. Howard and Jessie Gonzales upon the momentous occasion of their 50th wedding anniversary. Sponsored by Council member Macey.

8764-15: Certificate of Recognition awarded to Benjamin Benson, Carmen Carulli, Wayne Harper, Darryl Roher and Walter Zamosky recognizing their 50 plus years of dedicated service to the Fire Department of North Versailles. Sponsored by Council member Macey.

8765-15: Proclamation honoring the Jefferson Hills Volunteer Fire Company 885 and the Jefferson Hills Area Ambulance Association for saving a resident's life on October 2nd, 2014. Sponsored by Council member Palmiere.

8766-15: Certificate of Recognition awarded to Mr. and Mrs. Felix and Carol Bucci upon the momentous occasion of their 69th wedding anniversary. Sponsored by Council member Palmiere.

8767-15: Certificates of Achievement awarded to the 2014-2015 North Allegheny Senior High School boys' cross country team for winning the PIAA Class AAA boys' cross country championship. Sponsored by Council member Rea.

8786-15: Certificates of Achievement awarded to the 2014-2015 North Allegheny Senior High School girls' field hockey team for winning the WPIAL Class AAA girls' field hockey championship. Sponsored by Council member Rea.

8769-15: Certificates of Achievement awarded to the 2014-2015 North Allegheny Senior High School girls'

tennis team for winning the PIAA and WPIAL Class AAA girls' team tennis championship. Sponsored by Council member Rea.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Next we have public comment. Right now the first one is Mel Packer.

MR. PACKER: Mel Packer, 623 Kirtland Street, Pittsburgh, 15208, referring to 8569-14. A few months ago, Allegheny County Executive Rich Fitzgerald took a big gamble and bet on a guy named Tom Wolf to be the next Pennsylvania governor. Fitzgerald, in backing Wolf early, proclaimed that Wolf had the wisdom and knowledge to lead the State of Pennsylvania forward into better times. Within days of taking office, Governor Wolf announced a moratorium on all new leasing of state owned public lands, parks and forests for gas exploration. What happened to Fitzgerald's belief that Wolf was a wise man and a leader to follow. Why, while the Governor of our state has decided that wisdom demands a moratorium on fracking of public lands because they are there for the enjoyment of the public and not for industrial exploitation, does Fitzgerald cling to the idea that parks must be open for fracking instead of keeping them for our children?

In our neighboring State of New York, there was recently ordered a total ban on fracking based on research done by the State Health Department Commissioner who said if he could not prove fracking was safe for his own children, then he was obligated to recommend a ban on exposure to the toxic process for all of New York's children. Subsequently, the New York Governor, despite massive pressure from the industry and enough money given to pro-fracking legislators to float a third world nation, banned fracking from the State of New York.

But Rich Fitzgerald, who is taking massive financial donations from the frackers, has made it clear that he wished to retain the opportunity to frack all publicly owned county parks despite polls showing the public is opposed to this.

Instead of standing on the side of democracy, he tells us that he has no current plans to frack the remaining parks and that we should trust his word on that. Well, if we could always trust the word of leaders, we might all be in better shape. Our world is rich with examples of broken pledges by leaders. For example, Native Americans would still have land. Jews, Catholics, labor unionists and gay people would not have been

exterminated in Hitler's holocaust. Workers would not need unions.

Right now, oil worker members of the United Steel Workers are waging a strike against some of the richest energy companies in the world whose CEOs insist that workers should trust them and their words. If we are expected to take Rich Fitzgerald at his word, would we suggest that oil workers take the word of the energy CEOs and go back without a contract?

Of course not, because history has taught us that the words of leaders are all too often lies told to advance the goals of those who bankroll them.

We demand that those leaders put their words into print to give us a contract to which we can hold them.

The bill before you simply puts into writing the pledge of our Chief Executive. We will hold off on fracking our remaining parks for a brief period in our history. It does not ban, it does not forbid forever. It simply says time for caution. The gas isn't going anywhere. It has no bags to pack, no planes to catch, no highways on which it may ride away. We know there's gas sitting underground. If it is ever proven safe to extract, Council can consider doing so again.

But for now, our public lands should remain in the hands and hearts of the people of Allegheny County and not be handed over to those who see it as simply another piece of property to plunder for profit.

As has been voiced by many great people including Martin Luther King, the arc of history is long, but it bends toward moral justice. History is on our side. People seek moral justice and you have a chance to deliver that today. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Dana Dolney.  
Dana?

MS. DOLNEY: I've been here a couple times before. My last time wasn't very nice so I'm hoping for attention this time from my elected leaders here. After my battle with cancer, I, too, chose to devote myself to preventing cancer, just like many of those ladies up here today. So as a breast cancer survivor, I'm here telling you why I do the work that I do. Unfortunately, my work again tomorrow involves going down to Cross Creek Park, a place that you're all familiar with because you were told

it's a wonderful bastion of fracking wonderland where everything is, according to Range Resources, perfect.

Unfortunately, for a number of families that are living there, me and a small group of people called Friends of the Harmed are their only actual support right now because they have been living without potable water for years. And when I say years, I mean at least five years, many of which had to continue to bathe in non-potable water for all of these years because they couldn't afford to even get a buffalo for their home.

Tomorrow I'm going down with the charge trying to convince a 92-year old woman to leave her home of 60 years because we can't keep her water buffalo not frozen during these winter months. We can't afford to actually rewire the entire house or get the money together to actually have them stay insulated and heated through the winter. So our only choice at this point is to try to convince a brother of the family to take the mother in.

I've invited all of you before in the past to come down and see some of these families with me, but none of you chose to with the exception of one. And I want to thank Ms. Heidelbaugh for doing that because she actually saw firsthand what many of these families are living with. And it is not anecdotal. If it were anecdotal, I wouldn't be spending all of my free time and energy when I could otherwise be doing things with my friends and family as well, trying to help these people.

Dr. Eli Avila was quoted this summer in an AP article. He states that he believes that PA has failed to address the public concerns related to natural gas development. He states that the lack of any action speaks volumes. He says don't BS the public. Their health should come first.

I'm asking you once again to put the public's health and safety first. I know that Mel just ran through a bunch of things that were very difficult to hear, but it bears repeating and I'm going to say it again. Howard Zucker, the actual Health Department, New York Health Department Commissioner, said --- and listen to these words carefully. I have considered all of the data --- which many of us have provided from Pennsylvania to them in New York --- because they came down, their elected officials, to see what people were living with firsthand.

And they read our book, Shalefield Stories, which we presented to many of you which I don't even know

if all you read. But he said I have considered all of the data and find significant questions and risks to public health which of yet are unanswered. I think it would be reckless to proceed in New York until a more authoritative research was done. I asked myself would I let my family live in a community with fracking. The answer is no. I therefore cannot recommend anyone else's family to live in such a community either. I just ask why you are allowing our residents and our community to live through what others find unacceptable for their own children. Thanks.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Joni Rabinowitz.

MS. RABINOWITZ: I'm Joni Rabinowitz. I live at 7721 Edgerton Avenue in Pittsburgh, 15221. After the Deer Lakes vote last May, when we were preparing this ordinance that we're talking about tonight, we approached several Council members who agreed that a wait and see policy towards further fracking was prudent and reasonable which is why we undertook this grassroots campaign to talk to you about wait and see.

So we wrote an ordinance we thought you would be happy with that complied with the statements some of you made. It includes specific requirements for air and water monitoring and evaluation of the costs to the county.

Some people have asked us why didn't you get a Council member to sponsor it? Well, for two reasons. First, we wanted to build up our grassroots movement to protect our parks and we found a way to do that and hear the opinions of the residents. Second, we were eager to try out a never used provision in your charter written in 1998 which gives voters a mechanism to speak out and have their own ordinance taken seriously and considered and voted on by you.

By the way, the charter also includes another seldom used provision, separation of legislative and executive powers.

This section of the charter allows 500 registered voters of Allegheny County to place an ordinance on Council's agenda. So we took up the challenge. About 30 volunteers came forth to circulate petitions and over the next two and a half weeks more people volunteered and by the time we were done we had 58 volunteers going out to every corner of this county asking residents if they supported an ordinance to wait and see, to conduct some testing before further fracking at county parks.

The response was overwhelming. No fracking in our parks, people said. Our parks are for the people and for the children to play, not for industrial sites.

Residents of 75 municipalities and all of the 11 council districts spoke, and as I'm sure you know we turned in four times the required number of signatures, 1,900.

We spoke at your government reform committee last week. We had a good conversation and several members praised the citizens' efforts and we thank you for that.

Now, you Council members have a choice, you can vote with the citizens of the County to wait and see or you can ignore the separation of powers, your legislative responsibility and your 1998 charter and vote like Rich Fitzgerald wants you to.

It would be helpful if in your discussions tonight Council members told us the reasons why you have decided to vote a certain way.

It's election year, and we see Fitzgerald out there throwing big ticket parties for Council members who have no opposition. We know he's pressuring you and that he has power over some of you. I hope eight of you have the backbone to buck him and do the right thing tonight. Vote yes.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Jason McCullough. Is Jason here? Okay. Aaron Booz?

MR. BOOZ: Aaron Booz, 3181 Bel Air Drive, Whitehall. I'm here to speak this evening about messages sent and unsent. We were told by the County Executive that the citizens' ordinance would, quote, send the wrong message. This seems to imply that we should trust him to send the right message. We were also told that there were, quote, no plans to lease any other park lands. But that was the same thing that we were told in the case of the airports and in the case of Deer Lakes. And then very quickly there was a request for proposals. And the timeline between the first formal introduction and the final vote in each case was about one month with no formal study and a few very stage managed opportunities for public participation.

We've asked you through this citizens sponsored ordinance procedure in the County charter to put a hold on any future parks leasing. And we've done that in part because many, including myself, don't trust anymore the

messages sent by our County Executive. He's made too many false statements around the issue of fracking public lands, too many to detail here, in fact. But just one example of those was his bragging as recently as yesterday about the unusually strong environmental protections included in Deer Lakes' lease when, in fact, it turns out to be a very standard oil and gas lease when you get right down to what is actually required of Range Resources.

To the point of the effects of fracking public property, residents of Findlay Township have recently started to describe their serious concerns about the fumes, noise, heavy truck traffic and property degradation. And before you leased Deer Lakes Park, there were several citizens who took this microphone to tell you about how the environment and scenic character of Cross Creek Park in Washington County had indeed been harmed by fracking and was not what you had been told or shown at the time that County Council members visited last year.

Now, when it comes to the harms experienced by residents, is there a significant difference between having the multi-acre frack on private as opposed to public land, as Mr. Fitzgerald implies? My own research suggests that the answer is clearly no. But the citizens ordinance gives the industry, the family who lease and Mr. Fitzgerald a chance to be proven correct. From his perspective, if he really believes that fracking our parks is a great deal for us, why not send that message, unequivocally, by proving it over time?

So in conclusion, there's a number of different reasons you could personally give us as to why you voted yes on this hold ordinance tonight. You can tell your constituents that you will allow drilling at Deer Lakes Park, but not other parks. You can say that no piece of legislation is completely permanent and vote yes to put our ordinance in place now. You could tell Mr. Fitzgerald you've gone a certain distance with him, but you recognize the will of the people and you'll vote yes on this one.

Or you can vote no. Voting no will send a clear message to this public, your constituents, that you want the flexibility to lease any park at any time. It means you echo the County Executive's message that our public lands are open for private exploitation. And either vote sends a very clear message to those of us who are looking to see which leaders to support in future races. We will

be watching. Please send the right message and protect our parks.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Barbara Pace.

MS. PACE: My name is Barbara Pace. I live in the borough of Emsworth. WESA radio's Essential Pittsburgh at noon yesterday interviewed Joni Rabinowitz and John Detwiler from the environmental group Protect our Parks. There were numerous calls taken from citizens, a cross section of our region. There was only one in support of fracking. Not only did he support fracking under our parks, but anywhere where profits could be made. It was stated numerous times throughout the evening that our Allegheny County's Executive Director, Rich Fitzgerald, had declined to be part of the program and issued a statement that was read a few times. I tried to participate in this format. I was surprised how nervous I could become as I recalled that it was actually three years to the day that I buried my 97-year-old father. If you've ever had the misfortune to have a loved one succumb to the disease of Alzheimer's, you'll be able to relate to the extreme forgetfulness that's a major part of this lifelong taking illness.

I actually worked with a few of your wives in Allegheny County. I worked for ten years in the Department of Records. I had naively tried to sustain a full working schedule while trying to take care of my father's diminishing capacities. Almost daily, he would call into the Department of Records and whomever answered the phone would call out, Barb, your dad can't find his teeth. Barb, your dad can't find his glasses. I can look back now and laugh, but it was not funny at the time. He was a great reader of the daily paper. I repeatedly would have to sit down with him, slowly explain that the word that he had just read in the paper, fracking, was not the word he believed they had misprinted. The word fracking made him angry, that daily news would include this ugly word which he had avoided using his entire life in my presence. It was only after his death that I could devote equal energies to the frightening word and all it represents.

Not only was I working within a very political environment, but I became a committeewoman when I lived in Observatory Hill. My spare time before I took on the care of my father was diligently working on numerous campaigns

in the evenings and weekends. I was devastated when one of the more hardworking, honest lawyers I had come to know from his dealings within our office, lost the election. I was told by those who had many more years of experience in politics than I the reason he had not won was because he was too honest. He didn't know how to play the game of scratch my back and I'll scratch yours. That's why I've to come to admire your Council member Heather Heidelbaugh. I've watched her for years on WQED, Friday evening, 4802 with monitor Chris Moore. The show has two Democrats, two Republicans, sometimes a Libertarian and they discuss various issues. The discussions are heated, lively and often full of humor. She had the strength to stand up to those in power. I've no doubt she's paid a price for being true to her convictions. It's apparent Heather does her research before she takes counter positions.

I implore you all on Council to invest in your highest principles when you reach a decision on this current ordinance 8659-14. I strongly encourage you to access the viewing of the recently locally produced The Power of One Voice. It's a very powerful production of Rachel Carson, and if she could work with breast cancer to come to positive decisions, I think you could, too. Thank you for your time.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Stephanie Ulmer.

MS. ULMER: Hello, Stephanie Ulmer of 427 Elmer Street, Edgewood. A few months ago, the Post-Gazette carried an article about the original agreement between ---.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Pull the mic down.

MS. ULMER: Lower it? I'll get closer. Is that good? A few months ago, the Post-Gazette carried an article about the original agreement between the airport and US Airways. A former county official was quoted as saying for a while we were fat, happy and dumb, but nobody had checked our exposure. Allegheny County's deal with Range Resources to drill under Deer Lakes Park is an example of again not checking our exposure. This time, however, it's because we can't check our exposure. There's just too much we don't know.

According to a review by Bloomberg Business News of hundreds of regulatory and legal filings against the gas companies, in most cases, homeowners must agree to sealed settlements, a strategy which keeps data from

regulators, policymakers, the news media and health researchers, and makes it difficult to challenge the industry's, in my view, ludicrous claim that fracking has never taken anyone's water.

Here is something else that prevents us from calculating our exposure. There is no state funded research of the health impacts of shale operations. And to top it off, Pennsylvania doctors are prevented by law from pooling their collective knowledge about illnesses that could be potentially caused by fracking.

But here's something we do know. Range Resources commits one violation for every five wells that it drills. And last year, the National Academy of Sciences released a study of well water samples taken in northeastern PA. For homes within 3,000 feet from a natural gas well, the NAS found average concentrations of methane six times higher than in homes which were outside of the half-mile range. Methane concentrations were 23 times higher. Propane concentrations were elevated as well.

Also, in the 2014 study, this time from the National Institutes of Health, researchers in Colorado found that if you are pregnant and live within ten miles of a fracked natural gas well, your chances of giving birth to a child with congenital heart, brain, spinal cord or spine defect increases significantly. And the closer to the well you live and the more drilling there is in your area the higher your chances are. Chilling.

And the studies are just beginning to roll in. Polluted water, birth defects, we don't have to go down this route. There are roughly 400 green businesses in the Pittsburgh area alone. Let's support green energy so that we do not have to plunder our parks and poison our citizens in the future. And let's support the wait and see ordinance now to protect us and our parks in the present. Thank you.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Our next speaker sent a letter and she's sick. And I've granted, unless somebody has a problem, someone else --- she's already had --- her testimony to the next speaker.

MR. HAER: Thank you, Mr. President, for permitting me to read the testimony of Kim Eichenlaub, 219 Arborwood Drive in Gibsonia.

MR. CATANESE: Could you give your name, please?

MR. HAER: My name is John Haer, H-A-E-R, 7721 Edgerton Avenue, Pittsburgh. In December, Governor Andrew Cuomo announced his administration would ban hydraulic fracking in New York State because of concerns about health risks. Originally, Cuomo had been inclined to embrace fracking for depressed communities along New York's border with Pennsylvania, but during frequent visits there, he encountered strong opposition from groups worried about fracking effects on the water supply, tourism, vineyards and the quality of life.

Dozens of communities across New York have passed moratoriums and bans on fracking, all of which have stood up when reviewed by the State's Court of Appeals.

All of this led to the Governor to acknowledge, as he put it, I've never had anyone say to me, quote, I believe fracking is great. Not a single person in these communities. What I get is I have no alternative but fracking.

Then, in a cabinet presentation, the acting state health commissioner, Dr. Howard A. Zucker, as several people have already testified, said the years of studies New York has performed found significant public health risks associated with fracking. He said there was insufficient scientific evidence to affirm the safety of fracking. He said his review boiled down to a simple question. Would he want his family to live in a community where fracking was taking place? His answer was no. We cannot afford to make a mistake, he said. The potential risks are too great. In fact, they are not even fully known.

Vermont's governor signed a bill banning fracking last May. Governor Peter Shumlin stated this bill will ensure that we do not inject chemicals into the groundwater in a desperate pursuit for energy.

Although Vermont is not really in the heart of any shale configuration, their ban protects the state from fracking-related hazards such as storage of radioactive waste which is a serious problem here. Our DEP instituted a new policy as of January 1 aimed at controlling frack waste radioactivity, radon, in landfills that eventually became the ground on which new homes are constructed.

One, there will be monthly caps on the amounts of radioactive flowback sludge allowed. Two, each ton of fracking flowback sludge will be counted as three tons

because of the toxicity of radon, the second leading cause of lung cancer.

Newly elected Governor Wolf, as we all know, has now revived the ban, at least a ban on any further fracking in our state parks and forests.

All we're asking you to do, County Council members, is protect our county parks. Wait and see what the harms are. Wait and see if the revenues outweigh the harms. We're asking you to vote yes on the ordinance tonight.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Terri Supowitz.

MS. SUPOWITZ: I'm Terri Supowitz. I live at 310 Hay Street, Wilkinsburg. I want to believe that all of you want to do the right thing. I want to believe --- well, I do believe that you're all smart. To say no to fracking takes courage, particularly in light of Fitzgerald's position and his bullying tactics. I'm asking you to be your best self, your most moral, your most courageous, because the residents of Allegheny County are counting on you.

I wanted to remind you of the Pennsylvania Constitution where it says people have a right to clean air, pure water and to the preservation of the natural scenic, historic and aesthetic values of the environment. Pennsylvania's public natural resources are the common property of all of the people, all of you up there who are using your cell phones as well, including generations yet to come. As trustees of these resources, the Commonwealth shall conserve and maintain them for the benefit of all the people. This is your job.

As you know, the State of New York banned fracking in 2014, just this past December. Cuomo's ban rests on two conclusions. One, the risk it poses to the environment and human health have been dangerously understated while its economic benefits have been unrealistically exaggerated. Cuomo said fracking presents an unacceptable risk to public health. If it's not good for New Yorkers, how could it possibly be good for us in Pennsylvania? They did their research looking at what was going on in Pennsylvania.

Revealing risk is something all publicly-traded companies are required to do. This is a quote from a gas company prospectus. This is going in and out. Okay. Oil and natural gas operations are subject --- this is what a

gas companies is saying --- to many risks including well blowouts, craterings, explosions, uncontrollable flows of oil, natural gas and well fluids, fires, formations with abnormal pressures, pipeline ruptures or spills, pollution, releases of toxic natural gas and other environmental hazards and risks. The gas company is saying this.

Which brings me to the ordinance that is before you, which is to enact a hold on drilling and exploration for natural gas. Take a wait and see attitude. The gas isn't going anywhere. We're asking you to prove to us and the other residents of Allegheny County that fracking is safe.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Edward Chute.

MR. CHUTE: Ed Chute, 904 Valleyview Road, Mount Lebanon. We, the people of Allegheny County, Pennsylvania, believe that a home rule government will transfer substantial authority over our country government from the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania to the people of Allegheny County. So begins the Home Rule Charter of Allegheny County. The preamble goes on to say that the separation of, quote, the legislative and executive functions previously vested solely in the Board of County Commissioners will provide checks and balances on the powers of government and protect the rights, privileges and powers reserved or guaranteed to the people. The preamble points out that the County Council is the legislature for County government, representing our County's citizens, and that a home rule government that permits initiative and referendum will respond to the concerns of its citizens.

Tonight, you are presented an opportunity and a choice. An opportunity to respond positively to an initiative of the citizens of Allegheny County or another chance to abrogate your legislative duty to the Chief Executive. Citizen's Ordinance Number 8659-14 doesn't do anything that any reliable businessperson, academic or professional researcher, or even responsible politician should do with each and every project they encounter. I ask you once again to show your independence from the chief executive and to be responsive to those whom you represent, namely, we the citizens of Allegheny County.

We citizens expect you to consider first, whether or not you are favoring the will of the people

rather than the whim of the county executive. Second, whether or not you are blindly accepting the county executive's threatened veto as an inevitable consequence of the people's ordinance. Third, whether or not you are passing Cicero's smell test or simply second rate politicians acquiescing to the call of Mammon. Whether or not you are free men and women who think independently and deliberate honestly or politically expedient rejecters of your responsibility under the Home Rule Charter to protect the people of Allegheny County.

In short, are you just elected political hacks who don't listen honestly and fairly to the people's voices? Or can you fulfill your oaths of office to respond the concerns of the people of Allegheny County? You are under obligation to do the chief executive's dirty work for him. Supposedly, he is a big boy and can take responsibility for his own actions. At least that's how the Home Rule Charter describes the role of county executive. You, on the other hand, are under your own personal oaths and obligations to protect the people of Allegheny County.

Therefore, I, as a member of we the people of Allegheny County, call upon you individually and collectively to do your duty for the citizens who elected you and whom you represent. Vote yes on the people's proposed wait and see Ordinance Number 8659-14.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Gwen Chute.

MS. CHUTE: Gwen Chute, 904 Valleyview Road, Mount Lebanon. I speak for 5,000 Sierra Club members here in southwestern Pennsylvania and am a member of the Protect Our Parks.

I would like, first of all, to thank the members of the Government Reform Committee for passing the Citizen's Ordinance, out of committee with a neutral recommendation. Of course, I would have much preferred and I do believe that the ordinance deserved a positive vote. This ordinance is a first and therefore, a precedent setting piece of history, for never before has a citizens' ordinance been successfully presented to this Council. It speaks to the depth and breadth of the citizens' concerns with regard to the issue of using our parks for the risky and polluting industrial activity of fracking. This ordinance, developed and presented to you by your constituents, deserves your serious, thoughtful

and sincere consideration of a vote in favor of the wait and see approach.

Over the past couple of years, you have heard testimony from many concerned citizens who have told you about how fracking has affected their health. You have been given volumes of information about the polluting emissions, contaminating spills and leaks, explosions and earthquakes and declining property values that have been documented everywhere that fracking is being pursued. It's no coincidence that the governor of New York has recently banned fracking in that state and Governor Tom Wolf, in one of his very first actions as Pennsylvania's chief executive, has reinstated the ban on fracking in Pennsylvania state parks and forests. But the majority of this body have steadfastly ignored the information or simply refused to hear it. Like the executives from big tobacco, you deny, deny and deny. But your denial of the truth has not changed it. These incidents have not stopped. Just a few days ago a leak from a ruptured pipe in North Dakota spilled three million gallons of toxic fracking fluid into the river that supplies drinking water to a small community there.

The ordinance before you today does not call for any radical action on your part. Your decision to support it or not should not be difficult. It simply asks that you wait and see before moving ahead with more of the same. Remember, the land in question does not belong to the county or the County Executive. It belongs to the people. You are the stewards of that land and are charged with protecting it on behalf of the people to whom it does belong. Allow yourselves to act according to your consciences and vote in support of the citizens' Ordinance 8659-14. You know it's the right thing to do. Just do it.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: William Hendricks?

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Jason McCullough is here. He was called earlier, by the way. I thought I'd let you know.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We'll get back to him, then.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Thank you.

MR. HENDRICKS: I'm Bill Hendricks, 219 Valley Drive, from O'Hara. Good evening, Council members. I'm here today to urge you to vote in favor of the citizens' sponsored ordinance banning all fossil fuel exploration

and extraction in Allegheny County parks, aside from Deer Lakes Park, for the next two years. Ideally, I'd prefer no fracking or other drilling at all ever in any county parks since the results of such activity at other sites in Pennsylvania have often been disastrous; polluted air, poisonous wells and aquifers, the spoiled land, as well as health effects and plunging property values.

Even so, I acknowledge, given current political and legal realities, that a two-year study period of actual environmental effects at Deer Lakes is the best that's likely to be achieved right now. And I note that approving the wait and see ordinance also seems to me to be in harmony with the Governor's recent reaffirmation of his opposition to fossil fuel exploration and drilling in Pennsylvania's state park system.

And then there's money. I count myself among the growing number of Pennsylvanians who believe that no amount of money is worth the price of destroying our environment. In the long run, cleaning up the mess is going to cost more anyhow. Thank you.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. We're going to go back. We missed Jason McCullough. I'll let you come up now.

MR. MCCULLOUGH: Hello. My name is Jason McCullough and I'm a resident of the Point Breeze neighborhood of Pittsburgh. I am here again to inform you, as I did when I spoke before you on May 6th, 2014, that once drilling begins in Allegheny County public leases I'll be sending Chelsea Wagner, the Allegheny County Controller, an invoice for each drilled well. I'll be doing this also, annually, for each operator and lessor of every fracking well that affects myself any/or my children.

The majority of this industry's costs are burdened on the general public. I personally refuse any more to subsidize fracking with the money, deteriorating health and lives of myself and my young children. Deer Creek is barely --- drains four miles into the Allegheny River above where PWSA takes the water for my community and most of Pittsburgh. All wells fail over time, a few percentage, six or seven percent immediately, about half of them over 15 years. There aren't enough testers to go around to ensure that the poisons aren't leaking into Deer Lakes, turning into bromides and turning into carcinogens

in our water supply. There's basically nothing PWSA can do about it. These molecules are as small as water molecules. Chlorine turns them into carcinogens. We drink them. Cancer rates are going to go up.

Your lease with --- currently it's with Range Resources --- requires no tracing fluids to prove whether or not the fracking operations are poisoning the water, so that I am now putting the burden of proof on Allegheny County, Range Resources and the other lessors to prove that it is not harming us because the method to prove that it is has been taken away.

So as you consider whether or not to put a moratorium on other parks, just think, more wells mean more invoices. And I can leave a copy of the invoice that I do intend to send to Chelsea Wager for the leases. Out of 15 wells, I've only seeing permits for about six of them so far, but as drilling begins, one of these will be going to Chelsea each time. Thank you.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: David Senita. Maybe I'm not pronouncing ---.

MR. SENITA: I'm Dave Senita from Ross Township. I have a --- specific proposals. Facts matter. And yesterday's solutions create the problems of today. It's been true forever and ever. And the first proposal, fracking two plugs will fail. The majority of scientists --- I believe Scientific American had a cover story on fracking and they said they will fail. The question is when. That New York group said that the --- you know, six percent of brand new wells will leak. All the wells, they will leak at some time. Pray to God they'll last 80 years, but if it's like the bell curve of reality, then some wells are going to fail. A low percentage will fail at four to seven years. More might fail at 27 years. Pray to God 80 percent will last 60 years. But eventually, they all will fail.

Proposal number one, since we already have thousands of fracking wells that have already been drilled ---. Above the Supreme Court it says equal justice under law. And it makes --- Americans, it's right and just that if you drive a car you have insurance. It's right and just if you get sick you have health insurance. We've finally gotten that across.

As a child driving up to my coal miner --- my dad's coal miner father up in Cambria County, Patton, PA,

for two hours I'd drive past dead, blood red, orange, brick red, dead streams, the stench of burning bony piles, of desert strip mines. And people put up with that because of the --- people put up with that so they didn't starve because it's terrible, but we might freeze and starve next winter. We're here because William Penn went to Chief Tammany and said, hey, here's --- please let us live down there at the art museum. Here's three dozen Dutch ovens, pole axes and wool blankets and you'll be able --- your mother, grandmothers and babies won't have to starve and freeze to death. You'll be able to more easily keep them from starving and freezing to death next winter.

So I propose, one, that you set up an insurance fund. If you're making \$17,000 a month royalties because there's three acres of fracking lines --- they aren't supposedly taking any from your land. By God, you should pay a --- set a percentage up into a water cleanup fund that for a century ---. Okay. Proposal Number Two.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Try to wrap it up.

MR. SENITA: Okay. Proposal Number Two, put solar panels --- if the government won't do it, put solar panels on your house. Proposal Number Three, insulate. They proved --- in \$600 of insulation on a leaky old low income person's house cut their annual utility bills 30 percent. So grandma can spend 30 cents of her utility bill supporting local businesses, helping herself and the community around her.

Proposal Number Three, in Fussen, Germany, southern Germany, the hausfraus put up solar panels on their roofs. They couldn't run their electric washing machine, but they could recharge their cell phone battery. They could run a hot plate and stay in their house whenever 10,000 people in Maine or 10,000 --- they've got to go sleep on a gym floor at the middle school for the next six months, six weeks.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. All right. We have your ---.

MR. SENITA: Okay. I'll write it down. I'm sorry I'm such a poor presenter.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No, look, usually everybody falls under the limit. We'll let you go a little bit.

(Applause.)

MR. SENITA: Balance. Makes money from burning. Spend money to reduce money spent burning by increasing

efficiency. Benny Franklin said, waste not, want not, by God. There are too many people dying because of greed and we got to maximize the next quarter profits.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Judith Ruszkowski.

MS. RUSZKOWSKI: Good evening. My name is Judith Ruszkowski. I live at 6465 Jackson Street in the Highland Park neighborhood of the City of Pittsburgh.

And I am here today to ask that you endorse the creation of Article 707 and amend the County's Administration Code to provide a two year hold on any additional natural gas extraction activities in county parks. As an engaged voter, I circulated the petitions for this amendment. I spoke with family, friends, my book group, leaders in the women's community, volunteer naturalists with the Audubon Society and strangers about the issues addressed by this petition. Of everyone whom I approached, only one declined to sign.

The dictionary defines prudence as wisdom, care, foresightedness, farsightedness. Proverbs states the prudent man looketh well to his going. We are here today to ask you to vote for this amendment and provide that caution to action that this situation requires.

Deer Lakes is part of the Lower Allegheny River Watershed. As someone who grew up along the Allegheny, I am particularly concerned about water quality issues for this river. Recently, a Duke University led study found ammonium and iodide in wastewater discharges from three treatment plants in the Allegheny River watershed. Avner Vengosh, a professor of geochemistry and water quality stated that the data clearly showed that the current brine treatment practice in Pennsylvania is not sufficient to remove these contaminants. And worst of all, according to a Post-Gazette January 30th article, the Pittsburgh Water and Sewer Authority does not even test for these chemicals. Ammonium when dissolved in water can convert to ammonia which is toxic to aquatic life and iodide can react with chemicals used in public drinking water treatment plants to produce toxic chemical byproducts. This is the water we drink.

We look to you, as our civic leaders, to exercise some prudence in this situation, amend the county code and provide us with the public analysis we need on the impact of drilling in county parks before any new leases are signed. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Robert Nishikawa.

MR. NISHIKAWA: Hello. I'm Robert Nishikawa. I live at 125 Woodshire Drive in O'Hara Township and I've come to talk about the citizens ordinance. Most citizens of this County don't know what happens in the County Council, and frankly, most of them don't care or don't have time to find out. I'm not very different from most citizens in that regard, but I do know about this issue so I will vote in the next and following elections based solely on how you vote today.

But in one important regard I'm different than most people in the county. I'm willing to use my time to inform my fellow voters. So while there are maybe only 50 or 60 of us here in this room, we are 60 people, 60 passionate people. We are 60 people who inform as many voters that we can on how you vote today. And if the only to protect our parks is to vote you out, then that's what we'll do.

I was one of the people getting signatures in support of the petition. Although the time was short, it was not very difficult to do. No one I asked refused to sign. We only needed 500 signatures, we got 1,800, and we could have got a lot more.

Further, I've not talked to a single person in the last 16 months who thinks drilling under the parks is a good idea. Most people didn't know you voted to allow drilling under the park. And when we told them you did they were outraged. Even the people --- even the people I know who are in favor of fracking think that fracking under the parks is a bad idea. I will tell these people and many more how you vote today. So I'm asking you today to please vote in favor of the ordinance so that I can support you when you're up for re-election. Thank you very much.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: John Detwiler.

MR. DETWILER: John Detwiler, 5723 Solway Street, Pittsburgh speaking in support of the wait and see ordinance. First, I want to thank the government reform committee and Chairman DeFazio for their warm welcome at the meeting last week. It's fitting that this precedent setting group of people should be brought together by this particular issue which is clearly of deep concern to a great many county residents. And since the committee made no recommendations either for or against the measure,

Council might want more information than usual before voting on it, so Protect our Parks is happy to respond to any questions again tonight.

Now, I want to address two bad arguments that we've heard against this legislation. Number one, a threat from the Executive's office to veto the ordinance also claims that he, quote, wants to see how the current drilling operations will play out before moving forward. Now, that position sounds like just what this ordinance does. But there is one critical difference. In the Executive's version, he will see how fracking plays out, not Council, not the public, but Rich Fitzgerald. And then he will, quote, move forward. Well, we already knew Mr. Fitzgerald's blanket position on fracking, but he doesn't vote on this matter. You do.

And that brings me to the second bad argument, this one from a member of Council, although interestingly the Executive used exactly the same words. And that is that the ordinance ties Council's hands and should be defeated so that opportunities can be, quote, considered on a case-by-case basis.

Now, this bill has two parts, wait and see. We wait so that we can see what fracking does to our community by objective criteria that anyone can follow. A gas lease commits the County, literally, forever. The consequences will last for generations. To say that you do this on a case-by-case basis says nothing because case-by-case basis is no basis at all. So would your basis be money? The pay out for fracking Deer Lakes Park is about \$50 per County Council. That's not \$50 a year. That's one \$50 check. Or would your basis be jobs? Range Resources told you that it will create no jobs at all. So what is the basis? On a case-by-case basis, a silent man acts going through life with no ethical or business standards, falling for whoever blows in his ear. This ordinance is less about fracking than it is about governance. Who will make decisions about the parks, on what basis and with what facts? Will we have transparent government or will we find irrevocable decisions made case-by-case in the back room?

The wait and see ordinance promises that we will at least try to know more what we're doing with our parks. Thank you again for your thoughtful consideration of this people's ordinance.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Dianne Peterson.

MS. PETERSON: I'm here with all my props. Hi. I'm Dianne Peterson from 125 Woodshire, O'Hara Township. When I spoke here a year ago for the very first time I was so new to Pittsburgh that I belonged as well in Chicago. And I stood here and I asked you to support the moratorium on fracking under our county parks. My husband spoke the same night, and the first words out of his mouth were that he was in support of fracking as long as it was proven safe. Needless to say, I was pretty much in shock. Since that time, I've worked to educate myself reading, listening to both sides, attending conferences and presentations and gathering all kinds of good information that say the pros and cons. And I've learned that if safe are crucial words in this issue. I've learned that the risk and the problems that --- proven and theorized are vast. You've heard a sampling tonight and there are so many that impact human health and environmental hazards that I can't begin to even allude to them in three minutes. But listening to industry, all I can hear that's even something worth listening to, besides the money, is the jobs. The University of Massachusetts provided me with this data. And it shows that basically that's a fallacy. Speaking specifically about Deer Lakes, we have heard in this room from the people that are going to frack it will create zero jobs.

So I'm not the only one who's being educated and acting on the information. Fracking is being banned all over the place, just last week or this week, rather, in Scotland. And also in countries --- in Germany, France, Bulgaria, Romania, South Africa, Czech Republic and in states such as New York and Hawaii and New Mexico, parts of Canada, Spain, Switzerland, Austria, Italy, the Netherlands, Ohio, California, towns in West Virginia, Virginia. The list goes on for 30 pages. I couldn't print them all and bring them, but if you would ask me I will provide that information and cite my sources.

The one that interests me the most is Denton Texas, a town of 123,000 people. Why does that interest me so much? Because that's the very town where hydraulic fracking was invented. And they have banned it in their town. And in Pennsylvania, 58 percent of Pennsylvanians support a state wide moratorium. Wolf, you know what he's done. He's reinstated the moratorium on our state park lands. And Bill Peduto, our mayor, says no way in

Pittsburgh. And yet you the Council members in this room, at least nine of you, voted to lease fracking rights under Deer Lakes Park. You have said this is the only park and you will wait and see the results of the fracking at Deer Lakes Park before considering fracking under other parks.

So vote yes tonight on the citizens ordinance and try and validate what you have already promised to us. 1,900 people, 1,900 citizens of Allegheny County have signed on to ask this of you. John DeFazio, I pulled this from the county page and it says right here you see yourself as a man of the people, and you'd like to be more accountable to the people and try to do what the people want. This is on the county page. This is your words. What is your job as Council members? In part it is to hold our natural resources and trust and people for the land of Allegheny County you must --- you are managing the land on our behalf. This is something of interest. This is all your faces. The pink hearts are the people that have been prudent in protecting our state or sorry county parks and have either voted to --- for the moratorium on the state parks or have voted to be ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: You've got to wrap it up.

MS. PETERSON: okay. I'm sorry. I'll be very quick. The ones with the yellow around are people up for election this year. The people with the red Xs are the people who have voted to frack under Deer Lakes or voted they're against the moratorium. Anyway, ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Wait a minute. We have rules, and I've been lenient, pretty lenient. Will you please respect our rules, please?

MS. PETERSON: I got one more sentence.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No. This --- please.

MS. PETERSON: Okay.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I mean, the thing is, you know, respect doesn't go one way, it's both sides.

MS. PETERSON: I understand.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We respect all the work you people are doing. Please respect us and the rules that we have.

MS. PETERSON: I'm sorry.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I don't make the rules.

Okay?

MS. PETERSON: Yes, I'm sorry. I practiced really hard to talk really fast and I didn't make it.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That's all right.

MS. PETERSON: I just want to say that we are ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We understand everything you're saying. The other people, too. Okay.

MS. PETERSON: Okay. Thank you.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Jennifer Myers.

MS. MYERS: Hello. Here we go again. I promise this time I won't use a curse word. Remember? That was very embarrassing. Well, I did that last time because I spoke from my heart emotionally because this is my way of supporting Protect our Parks and being in solidarity with these people who I think are outstanding citizens on a level that is absolutely remarkable and completely unparalleled. I've never lived anywhere where I've met people with so much absolute dignity and passion about protecting what's all of ours. And there are a million or so people in this county and there's only this many here. But you always have to remember that that's who you're working for. And I wish you could see all of them. Wouldn't that be cool if somehow you could see all those people and how much they love their land and these parks that's so important to us and have such a history.

So all I can say is speaking from the heart we keep coming to these crossroads together and it's kind of amazing, these historic moments. And this absolutely is another historic moment where the citizens ordinance is before us. And what you can do is just vote yes.

And the thing is like --- if I let myself get really upset right now, we've been through this and you basically guaranteed to us that you wouldn't frack any other parks. Remember? We've been through this. And then you took Deer Lakes and that was like the --- what you took. So at least let us have the others. I don't understand what other evidence you need except I really want to say thank you to Joni and John especially and to everybody who keeps working so hard.

(Applause.)

MS. MYERS: You're unstoppable. I've gotten so depressed and you don't. You keep going and it's so totally inspiring. And I just wanted to say something to think about like tonight or tomorrow or when you're going to sleep, just what is a park worth? It's a question I've been asking myself. What is it actually worth? What is a single leaf worth? What is a single tree worth? Like

these are things that we can't put into monetary value. It's something that's like beyond language. It's something that's pristine and sacred and deserves our attention and utmost respect. And what's cool is you have that chance to do that and you would make history again, so please vote yes.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Robert Alexander? Robert not here? Next would be Tim Ludwig.

MR. LUDWIG: Tim Ludwig, 18 Greismere Street in Etna.

So when I started coming to these meetings a year and a half ago, I thought this would be an easy task to convince 15 people that cared deeply about these communities to stop a harmful industry from moving into our parks. Well, it's been a little tougher than I thought and the process has given me a sour taste of how government works. The one example I thought of is we had to bring pictures of bathrooms to prove they existed in the park and Mr. Fitzgerald still won't admit they exist.

This ordinance in front of you tonight is something that many people think is impossible to do. The thing isn't to stop fracking. Many communities have done that around the world and in the U.S. It's not to stand up to big money or bullies either. Many communities have done that. The thing I'm talking about is holding a politician to his or her word. That seems to be impossible. Numerous politicians that represent Allegheny County have stated that they want to wait and see what happens at the airport and Deer Lakes Park. This ordinance holds them to their word. I wish it was stricter. I wish I could say there's some secret language in there that's going to stop fracking at Deer Lakes and all these other parks and all these other areas, but there isn't.

It's simple. We have an experiment in the corner of our county in a beautiful park. Let's just wait two years of the expected 30 years of productivity to see if any other problems come up. That's less than seven percent of well life. When you put it that way, two years doesn't sound like enough. But that's what the citizens are asking for. Let's wait and see a measly percentage of well life to see if there's any problems.

Please vote yes on the citizens ordinance.  
Thank you.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. 8770-15.

MR. CATANESE: Motion to approve the minutes of the Regular Meeting of Allegheny County Council held on January 6, 2015.

MR. MACEY: So moved.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it. Presentation of Appointments. 8751-15.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the reappointment of Eva Bednar to serve as a member of the Allegheny County Mental Health/Intellectual Disability Advisory Board for a term of to expire on December 31, 2017. Sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That's go to the Committee on Appointment Review. 8752-15.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the reappointment of Kurt Kondrich to serve as a member of the Allegheny County Mental Health/Intellectual Disability Advisory Board for a term to expire on December 31, 2017. Sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go to the Committee on Appointment Review. 8753-15.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the reappointment of Theresa Edwards to serve as a member of the Drug and Alcohol Planning Council of Allegheny County for a term to expire on December 31, 2017. Sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go to the Appointment Review Committee. 8754-15.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the reappointment of Valerie J. Ketter to serve as a member of the Drug and Alcohol Planning Council of Allegheny County for a term to expire on December 31, 2017. Sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go to the Committee on Appointment Review. Let's see. We're down to unfinished business. Committee on Budge and Finance, Second Reading. 8737-15.

MR. CATANESE: A Resolution of the County Of Allegheny amending the 2014 Capital Budget for Allegheny County. Sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Mike?

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you. Yes. We received \$809,276 from PennDOT to use for our roads and that's why we're amending our Capital Budget. Move for approval.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any remarks? Seeing none, we'll have a roll call.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Danko?

(No response.)

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?

(No response.)

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 13 (sic). Nos 0. The bill passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 8738-15.

MR. CATANESE: A Resolution of the County of Allegheny amending the 2013 Capital Budget for Allegheny County. Sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Mike?

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you. This also was approved by the Budget and Finance Committee and moved to the full Council. It entails \$907,000 that was from PennDOT in relation to the Mansfield Bridge rehabilitation. The railing had to be replaced. Thank you. Move for approval.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in ---. We'll have the roll call.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms Danko?

(No response).

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?

MS. REA: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 13 (sic). No, 0. The bill passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 8659-14.

MR. CATANESE: An Ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, supplementing the Administrative Code of Allegheny County, Part 7,

Properties, and creating a new Article 707 entitled County Parks, to enact a hold on drilling and exploration for a natural gas on Allegheny County park land, with the exception of Deer Lakes Park. Sponsored by the Citizens of Allegheny County.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Well, that was --- yeah. That was in government reform, and it was recommended to take it to the full floor with a --- no, we didn't take vote so it's up to the floor here.

MR. FINNERTY: Neutral.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah. Well, it was a neutral, just you didn't take a position. So that's where we stand. Well, someone has to make a motion. No one made a motion.

MR. FINNERTY: I make a motion for approval.

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All right. Under remarks? Now, we can discuss it. Go ahead. Go ahead, Sue.

MS. MEANS: First of all, I want to congratulate the Citizens of Allegheny County for your great efforts in getting all the signatures. I love it when people participate in the political process and it's a historical event, so I am really proud of your efforts. I do appreciate some of the data collection that you put in your legislation. I think it's really admirable and it's a well crafted piece of legislation. I would like to know if there --- Mr. Chairman, if it would be possible for someone from the Administration to answer a few questions, particularly, have they begun drilling at Deer Lakes Park? That was my one question. And also, to know what kind of data they are collecting onsite.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Well, really --- we're dealing with this particular issue here, and I don't think we can start getting into all that right now.

MS. MEANS: Okay.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Why don't we just deal with what we have in front of us?

MS. MEANS: Okay. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Anybody else have any remarks? Tom? Seeing none --- okay. Go ahead, Heather.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Thank you, Mr. President. Today I wrote an editorial in the Tribune Review regarding this Council and this government being stewards of democracy. In that vein, I'd like to congratulate those who are here tonight and who circulated petitions, and I'd

like to congratulate those who signed the petitions to get 8659 on the Agenda for tonight, the first ever effort by citizens in the form of government. The last time the issue of gas extraction arose before this Council, those who oppose gas extraction were not accorded due process, nor did they witness this body being stewards of democracy.

On this occasion, your proper bill was vetted and okayed the legal department. It was placed on the agenda properly. Your bill received due consideration which has not been accorded 90 percent of the bills that I have introduced into this Council.

In terms of procedural due process, I believe you --- of which I have been a protector over the last three years, I believe you have received procedural due process.

Now, I'd like to discuss the substance of the measure and my view. Several of you indicated that we should provide you the reasons for our vote. I agree. Many of you rightly believe that Rich Fitzgerald unduly pressures Council members on their votes. I can assure you that not only has he not called me on this vote, but he cannot pressure me. He cannot make me violate my conscience, although he has tried. So tonight it is not for me a vote about not violating my conscience. It is about doing what I feel is right. I philosophically, as most of you know, do not oppose the extraction of gas by the method of fracking. I support environmental protections and regulation of the industry. For those who do not protect the environment, they must be legally held responsible.

This Council has now been presented with four bills on this issue. The first was regarding the airport. I was in favor of drilling at the airport, but I could not vote because of a conflict presented by my law firm. The second vote a measure introduced by my colleague, Barbara Daly Danko, which requested a moratorium. I voted no. I don't believe, with much respect to someone who I very much respect, Mr. Detwiler, I do not believe tying my hands is an invalid argument.

On Deer Lakes drilling, I voted no. I voted no and enunciated my concerns in a lengthy editorial in the Tribune Review I voted no on the lease for a variety of reasons including the lack of environmental protections.

I will vote no on your bill tonight. I am not against gas extraction by fracking, and I do not --- but I do not want to tie my predecessors because I'm not running for re-election on this vote.

I'd like to speak for a moment about gas extraction. What I'm about to say may --- many of you may ridicule, but I'm going to say it anyway. When I was young I lived in an apartment in which we were --- our fuel, our heat was fueled by oil. And because of the oil embargo, we had no oil. And I spent in excess of a decade sleeping in an apartment in a sleeping bag. I grew up in a sleeping bag. We did not have heat in my home and we had ice on the inside of my windows. I grew up in poverty, and so one of the concerns that I have is for cheap and available resources for people who are poor in this county and throughout the country.

When gas extraction first came to be in our country, I thought it was the panacea. It may not be. I thought that it was cleaner than oil and coal and cheaper. I accept the fact that this industry has risks, as do all industries. I do not discount that argument. This vote will no doubt disappoint many of you, and for that disappointment, I accept whatever the consequences are. Please know as I proceed in my public life I am a person, perhaps through my legal training, that looks at each particular situation. As each situation presents, I judge the facts for each situation. I do believe that it is good for the democracy that the people here tonight and the people who have presented their honest and fervent views is great for the democracy. I also believe that the ying and the yang of the gas companies and your views are good for the citizens.

In closing, let me say I respect deeply your care, your concern, your diligence and your passion for the environment. I have never marginalized your voices and I would never do so in the future.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Any other?  
Amanda, then we'll go down to you.

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Thank you, Mr. President. This ordinance before Council, this proposal before Council, this proposal before Council tonight is a matter of first impression for us. And I do recognize and appreciate all of the work and the effort put into this by members of our public. And because of that I think it's extremely important that we, particularly, I, as a Council

member speak to you about the reason why I'm voting the way that I am voting. You deserve at least that much respect for your efforts. And I have spoken with a couple of you about this citizens ordinance. And I do recall saying that this wait and see approach that you were promised, not by me, but by the administration, should this administration be held accountable for its promises to you?

However, a policy statement is just that. A policy statement is not anything that can be relied on, necessarily, because policies change all the time. And I think that the policy now has changed. So the basis for the ordinance has essentially disappeared. And so I predicted that, and members of your organization spoke with me about that and --- when going in, that things could possibly change on you.

Also, as elected officials, we're elected to make tough decisions and informed decisions. And I know that there is a lot of questions about whether or not Council members are fully informed when they make decisions. However, that's what we're elected to do, make decisions. And by agreeing to a moratorium, what Council does is denies the opportunity for Council to make decisions in the future about an issue. And particularly with this being an election year and the members of Council changing, all of us will be facing some change here, there will be others whom you elect to make decisions for you. And I do hope that you follow what goes on here on Council and make decisions as voters based on what you see here tonight and what you see throughout our tenure here on Council. We need to have people in office who will do what you expect them to do and what you want them to do. And the power that you have is your vote. And I'm glad that you exercise it. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Council member --- well, wait a minute. I think I was Jimmy.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Thank you, Mr. President. You know, ladies and gentleman, I've had a lot of time to think about a lot of this. And many of you, as you've gotten to know me over the months, I could probably take this sheet and it makes me --- wander around the room and put a name tag on probably most of you. I've heard most of you speak. A lot of you probably feel I'm a little rough edged. You know, in my day job I carry a badge, so maybe it comes from that. But to those of you who have

articulately and respectfully came up here and passionately gave your arguments, I have great respect for. To those of you who have come up here that have just enjoyed calling us names and trying to intimidate us, I can't speak for my colleagues because that don't work with me. So that being said, although I respect the fact the hard work put in, particularly in the weather you had to deal with to get these signatures, I for one am somebody who does not want to have my hands tied in terms of what I do.

Now, many of you think, oh, wow, that means he's this and that. I voted for the Deer Lakes drilling. But I have not heard one person from this group mention the fact that I was one of the ones who opposed the drilling at the County Airport for the same reasons that you folks bring to us. The amount of people that were there, the traffic, the unsafety of the trucks, you know, the possibility of, you know, the contamination and the huge population there. You know, some of you have demonized us a group. You know, we all have children, many of us have grandchildren. And we love them every bit as much as you folks do. So what I say to you is, you know, don't give up on the fact that, you know, some of us that don't agree with this bill, just want to be able to take this a case by case.

Now, some of you --- and I'll be honest with you, some of you are real disingenuous about this bill because the reality of it is you don't want no moratorium. You don't want it at all. The bill that should be in front of us should say you don't want it at all. But some of you have just settled with the fact that --- so you know, if you want to be genuous or disingenuous about something, I mean, that's the reality of the situation, so you know ---. But at the same time, too, I have to think about the 1,300,000 people that need their bridges fixed and their roads fixed and this and that and this salt and whatnot. You know, you got 1,900 signatures. When they put the drink tax up there, there we had almost 60,000 signatures. And not to disrespect or to diminish the work that you folks have done --- it's great work and I respect you for it and I respect your passion. But the point is, you know, is there a way that maybe some of this stuff could be safe maybe in two years or three? I don't know. But I know in my heart, when I vote, there's nobody tells me how to vote. And some of these folks have known me for

over 30 years, you know. I don't agree all the time with the chief executive, but we don't stand out in the street and yell at each other. I voted --- like I said, I voted against drilling at the County Airport because it's a bad thing to do. There's just too many people there.

But again, there are those of you who just prefer to demonize me as some lap dog to somebody. Well, you know what? Anybody that knows me knows that that's not the case. And you know what? The thing that got me elected in the 12th District --- if you really knew the blue-collar district that I represent. That's why they elected me because I don't care. I do what I think is right and nobody intimidates me, whether it be you folks or anybody else. I was the only Democrat that voted against the drink tax, and if I think something is wrong in my heart, I'm going to do it.

Now, I have one final point I want to bring up. My people were coal miners. They died in the mines, black lung, watching my grandfather, you know, --- but it was going to happen. So I have something in the back my mind that says to myself, if the powers of this country are going to make this happen, I would just as soon --- trying to like make it as safe as possible. Now, that concept may be a little foreign to some folks, but if it's a reality, I'd rather just wait and see and, you know, try to make it as safe as we can and try to keep it away from the populous as we can.

And in closing, I'd like to say to those of you like Mel Packer and Joni Rabinowitz and you who've worked really hard and articulately argued your cases, I have great respect for. So thank you, everyone.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Councilman Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Am I next?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah, I called you.

MR. FUTULES: Okay. I'm sorry. I thought I was after someone else. I think --- and I believe Heather and Amanda and Jim really summed it up. They really did. In fact, I think Heather did a great job of really giving a detailed explanation as to the reason why we do what we do and why we're up here. Yeah, I'm up for re-election, sure, but that's --- we make the tough decisions. That's why you elected me. I don't like what I do all the time. Sometimes I love what I do. We make decisions based on each individual opportunity that comes before us. We look at the facts and we make those decisions. Voting for a

moratorium is more or less avoiding the issues. So that's something I'll probably never do. I believe every Council member up here agrees with the fact that we all have the ability to think for ourselves and vote the way we feel necessary for the people. And just for that, I just want to thank everybody for coming here and giving your opinion.

And I've made comments to some members of your Sierra Club that --- at least we know you care. You know, a lot of people in Allegheny County just don't care. But a lot of people here tonight come here on a regular basis. At least we know you care about things, and that's a good thing, you know. If we don't agree with you, that's fine. But you know, at least we know you care. And we care. We really do. We have jobs and a lot of times --- sometimes we just make those decisions that make everybody happy and that's part of politics. So I just want to thank everybody for coming in and let's --- I'm done. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Seeing no other --- oh, I'm sorry. Councilman Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you. I'd just like to say that the reason why I'm going to vote against it is very simple. I think that we, as has been said by a number of people up here, have decisions to make and we should make those decisions. We shouldn't hide behind something. That's what we have to do. That's what we're elected to do. I also would like to give you all a pat on the back for coming out and doing all that work and everything in regard to that. I think it's very important that we are in a dialogue about things and that we understand each other and what we're going. So that's all I have to say. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Councilman Macey?

MR. MACEY: Thank you, President DeFazio and members of Council. I also want to thank everybody who has done their due diligence and brought their information to us. And I know there was a question posed to us that if you vote a certain --- why did you vote that certain way? Well, I represent District 9 which has 14 communities. Over 70 percent of those communities are either drilling or under contact for drilling. In the Mon Valley, we have issues, the crumbling infrastructure. We have problems with crime, education, unemployment. And

what we're trying to do is revitalize our area. I have yet to have someone from my district come to me and say no fracking. No drilling.

Our people in the Mon Valley are supporting fracking. That's Elizabeth Township, Forward Township where they're drilling. McKeesport. Now, these are already under --- most of them are under contract. The south Allegheny School District which includes Liberty, Glassport, Lincoln and Port Vue, North Versailles, West Mifflin, White Oak. The communities that aren't, are pretty obvious why they're not. The City of Duquesne, there's no room. South Versailles, it's a small little town, 351 people. Versailles Borough, no room. And Dravosburg, no place to drill. But where there are areas to drill, they're accepting it. They're embracing it. I represent those 95,000, 96,000 people. I'm voting as you would like me to vote. In your opinion, I'm voting their wishes. So please respect my situation, please respect my position and please respect the 96,000 people in my district. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Seeing no other comments, will you please call the roll?

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

Mr. BAKER: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms Danko?

(No response).

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: No.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?  
MS. REA: No.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?  
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No.  
MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 1, Nos, 13. Bill fails.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Second Reading of  
Committee on Parks, 8695-15.  
MR. CATANESE: Ordinance of the County of  
Allegheny granting authorization to demolish the North  
Park House Barn --- Horse Barn, excuse me, located on  
McKinney Road. Sponsored by the chief executive.  
MR. FUTULES: The Parks Committee met on January  
20th and we voted for an affirmative recommendation. I  
make a motion to approve.  
MR. FINNERTY: Second.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Go ahead.  
MS. REA: I just would like to thank the  
Administration and Council for supporting this because  
there are many buildings in our parks that I think that it  
is more cost effective to take down than it is to try to  
maintain. And this is certainly a perfect example of one  
that really needs to come down. Thank you.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Hearing no more remarks,  
we'll have a roll call.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?  
MR. BAKER: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms Danko?  
(No response).  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?  
MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?  
MR. FINNERTY: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?  
MR. FUTULES: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?  
MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?  
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?  
MR. KRESS: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?  
MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?  
DR. MARTONI: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?  
MS. MEANS: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?  
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?  
MS. REA: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?  
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 14, Nos, 0. Bill passes.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 8728-15.

MR. CATANESE: An Ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, authorizing an Agreement to extend a lease with the Amateur Astronomers Association of Pittsburgh, the AAAP, for the continued operation and maintenance of Wagman Observatory in Deer Lakes Park. Sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Mr. Futules.

MR. FUTULES: This was also presented in Committee on January 20th, and it was voted with an affirmative recommendation to take it to the full Council. I make a motion to approve.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, we'll take a roll call.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?  
MR. BAKER: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms Danko?  
(No response).  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?  
MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?  
MR. FINNERTY: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?  
MR. FUTULES: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?  
MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?  
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?  
MR. KRESS: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?  
DR. MARTONI: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?  
MS. MEANS: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?  
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?  
MS. REA: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?  
(No response.)  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.  
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.  
MR. FINNERTY: Now I heard his vote.  
MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 14. Nos 0. Bill passes.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 8729-15.

MR. CATANESE: An Ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, permitting the use by Allegheny County Budo-Kai for the operation and management of Martial Arts Center. Sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: The same evening on January 20th, the Committee discussed this information and we also recommended this to the full Council with an affirmative recommendation and I make a motion to approve.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Motion seconded.

MR. FUTULES: Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, we'll take the roll call.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?  
MR. BAKER: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms Danko?  
(No response)  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?  
MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?  
MR. FINNERTY: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?  
MR. FUTULES: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?  
MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?  
MR. KRESS: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?  
MR. MACEY: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?  
DR. MARTONI: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?  
MS. MEANS: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?  
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?  
MS. REA: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?  
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 13 (sic). Nos, 0. Bill

passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 8730-15.

MR. CATANESE: An Ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, authorizing an Agreement between the County of Allegheny and Family Links, Inc. for leasing of a house and surrounding property located in Boyce Park. Sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Same thing. On January 20th, the Parks Committee met. We made a recommendation, an affirmative recommendation, to send it to full Council and make a motion to approve.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, we'll take the roll.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?  
MR. BAKER: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms Danko?  
(No response.)  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?  
MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?  
MR. FINNERTY: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?  
MR. FUTULES: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?  
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?  
MR. KRESS: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?  
MR. MACEY: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?  
DR. MARTONI: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?  
MS. MEANS: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?  
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?  
MS. REA: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?  
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 14. Nos, 0. Bill passes.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 8731-15.

MR. CATANESE: An Ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, authorizing an extension of an agreement with the GATEWAY RADIO CONTROL SOCIETY for the operation and management of the Model Aircraft Field located in Boyce Park. Sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Councilman Futules?

MR. FUTULES: The Parks Committee approved this with an affirmative recommendation. I make a move for approval.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

MR. FUTULES: Or a motion.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, we'll take the roll.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms Danko?

(No response).

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?  
MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?  
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?  
MR. KRESS: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?  
MR. MACEY: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?  
DR. MARTONI: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?  
MS. MEANS: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?  
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?  
MS. REA: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?  
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 13 (sic). Nos, 0. Bill

passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 8739-15.

MR. CATANESE: A Resolution of the County of --- the Council of Allegheny County, Pennsylvania, made pursuant to the Local Economic Revitalization Tax Assistance Act, LERTA, PA Statute, Title 72-§4722 et seq. (1995), as amended, providing for: a program of temporary exemption from increases in Allegheny County Real Property Taxes, for specified timer periods, resulting from improvements made by an owner of property located within a specific geographical area within the City of Pittsburgh, County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, previously determined to be a deteriorated area; establishing a schedule for exempting increases in Allegheny County property taxes resulting from such improvements; and prescribing the requirements and procedures by which an owner of the property located within the deteriorated area can secure the temporary exemption resulting from such improvements. Sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Councilmember Hawkins.

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Thank you, Mr. President.

Move for approval.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Go ahead, Sue.

MS. MEANS: Yes. I was wondering if someone had --- I did attend the meeting and I did have a question. I was wondering if maybe someone from the administration could answer the question. And my question is bakery this --- Walnut Capital has already built an apartment complex on this land, and that's Bakery Living One and now this is the proposal to build a second high rise. And I was wondering if anyone knows if there was a LERTA awarded to Walnut Capital for their first high rise on the property and if anyone could answer that question?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Is there anyone here from the administration that could answer that?

MR. KRESS: Maurice could.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

MR. STRUL: Good evening. This is for Bakery Square One, actually. It's not for the second one. The second one is proposed.

MS. MEANS: I thought the other one was built. It was already built.

MR. STRUL: It has been built. It is now leasing.

MS. MEAN: I'm sorry?

MR. STRUL: It is now --- it's under --- it's been built. It is now leasing.

MS. MEANS: It's built. It's been leasing. But do we not --- did we or did we not grant a LERTA for this property?

MR. STRUL: This is the one --- the one that is currently built and leasing is the one that is asking for the abatement.

MS. MEANS: I understand that. But I was wondering since it's --- the same property owner that built the first one is building the second one. I was wondering if we, County Council, granted a LERTA for that property. That's what I wanted to know.

MR. STRUL: Okay. I'm trying ---.

MS. MEANS: Do they own all the land --- they bought all the land from the school district. And when they bought the land from the school district, they agreed to not to ask the school district for a LERTA.

MR. STRUL: Right.

MS. MEANS: So and then --- so they built --- they already constructed their first apartment complex.

They are already renting it. Did the County give them a LERTA for that property and now they're asking us for a LERTA to build a second complex?

MR. STRUL: They're actually asking for the LERTA for the first complex.

MS. MEANS: Oh, it's for the first one?

MR. STRUL: Yes.

MS. MEANS: It's not for the second?

MR. STRUL: Correct.

MS. MEANS: Okay. All right. Thank you for clarifying that for me.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any other comments? Seeing none, we'll have a roll call vote.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms Danko?

(No response).

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?

MS. REA: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 12, Nos, 2. The bill passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 8740-15.

MR. CATANESE: A Resolution of the Council of Allegheny County, Pennsylvania, made pursuant to the Local Economic Revitalization Tax Assistance Act, LERTA, PA Statute title 72, Section §4722 et seq (1995), as amended, providing for: a program of temporary exemption from increases in Allegheny County Real Property Taxes, for specified time periods, resulting from improvements made by an owner of property located within a specific geographic area within Findlay Township, County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, previously determined to be a deteriorated area; establishing a schedule for exempting increases in Allegheny County property taxes resulting from such improvement; and prescribing the requirements and procedures by which an owner of property located within the deteriorated area can secure the temporary exemption resulting from such improvements. Sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Council Member Hawkins.

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Thank you, Mr. President. I move for approval.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

MR. ROBINSON: Get me my wallet and my ---

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks. Heather?

MR. ROBINSON: --- keys and ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: What --- what ---?

MR. FINNERTY: You're going to have to turn him off.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Who is that?

MR. CATANESE: Councilmember Robinson?

MR. FINNERTY: We're conducting business here.

MR. ROBINSON: No problem.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Council member Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes, I have some questions for Mr. Stral. Can you tell me which Walgreens ---?

MR. ROBINSON: That's a ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. He got to cut ---.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: It's my fault. I apologize. I didn't have my microphone on.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson, are you ---?

MR. ROBINSON: Hi.

MR. CATANESE: No. Mr. Robinson, there's a lot of background noise and it's coming through. We can't hear ---.

MR. ROBINSON: Did you hear my last vote?

MR. CATANESE: Yes, we did. But there's a lot of background noise. We didn't take a vote. There's a lot of background noise. We need not to have that so we can hear what's going on.

MR. ROBINSON: What do you need me to do?

MR. CATANESE: Nothing. They want you to just listen at this time.

MR. ROBINSON: Got you.

MR. FINNERTY: I don't even believe this.

MR. STRAL: Sorry. Could you repeat the question?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Sure. Can you tell me where Walgreens is headquartered?

MR. STRAL: Locally, you mean?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No, their principal place of business.

MR. STRAL: I don't know the answer to that.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Illinois.

MR. STRAL: Okay.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: And can you tell me how many employees they have in Illinois?

MR. STRAL: I cannot.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: And can you tell me their ranking in terms of their place in their industry?

MR. STRAL: No, I cannot.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Do you know that they're the number one pharmacy in America?

MR. STRAL: I'm sure that you have your facts straight.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH:: And are there Pennsylvania companies who they compete with?

MR. STRAL: I don't know that.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: So have you investigated whether there are Pennsylvania companies that they compete with? Did you bring them to the table when you were discussing this tax abatement with Walgreens, this out-of-state company?

MR. STRAL: We did not.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Okay. And can you tell me the total amount of taxes that you are waiving if this passes?

MR. STRAL: The abatement schedule is attached to the legislation. I can't quantify the exact number because I don't really know what the exact assessed value is going to be.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Give me a guess.

MR. STRAL: I really don't have a guess.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: So do I understand, sir, that you're coming to this Council and you're asking us to approve a tax abatement for the largest pharmacy in America, headquartered in Illinois and you can't tell the citizens of Allegheny County how much the tax abatement is going to be?

MR. STRAL: What I'm trying to tell you is that we did not evaluate this based upon the cost of the abatement. We evaluated it on the opportunity to keep employment in the County and to increase employment in the County.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Well, this isn't keeping employment.

MR. STRAL: Well, we were ---.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: They're coming in new.

MR. STRAL: No. They've already got a location in this County.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: So why we giving them a tax abatement if they're already here?

MR. STRAL: Because they want to relocate and they said that they would relocate outside of the County if we didn't assist them with this project.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Isn't that what all the people say to you so that you give them a tax abatement?

MR. STRAL: Not always, no.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: So to date, I asked them to run the numbers. Last year we gave up \$5 million in taxes for at least ten years which would be, if I do some math, would be \$50 million in taxes. Why is it that you don't provide us with what the raw numbers of the tax abatement are? Why do we have to vote on these things when we don't know what it is that we're giving up?

MR. STRAL: We don't have a way to calculate with any certainty what the assessed value of a project is going to be. And it's over building ---.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: You could estimate.

MR. STRAL: Yes, we could. And quite frankly, we just could certainly provide you in the future an estimate of what we think the cost would be of that abatement.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Okay. And you realize when you come here and you ask us to give one of the largest corporations in America who's headquartered out of state a

tax abatement, you realize that when they use the services of Allegheny County, we're going to have to ask ordinary citizens of Allegheny County to pay for that.

MR. STRAL: It's not like they're not going to be paying taxes, ma'am.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No, but we are giving them a tax abatement. That's why you're here.

MR. STRAL: Yes.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I have no further questions.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any other questions? Seeing none, I ---.

MR. STRAL: I just have one.

MR. FINNERTY: Was this tax abatement, this LERTA, okayed by the school district?

MR. STRAL: They --- both the local taxing bodies approved it in advance.

MR. FINNERTY: Did the Township?

MR. STRAL: Yes, sir.

MR. FINNERTY: Okay. Thank you.

MS. MEANS: Do I have time?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead, Sue.

MS. MEANS: Currently, Walgreens is located in Carnegie and then they want to move to Cranberry Township. And when they move and they build a bigger --- they will be employing another 100 people so they will --- because they're in a bigger favorite facility, they will be able to employ more people. So just that information. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any other comments? Seeing none, we'll take the roll.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms Danko?

(No response)

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?  
MR. MACEY: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?  
DR. MARTONI: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?  
MS. MEANS: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?  
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?  
MS. REA: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?  
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 13. Nos, 1. Bill passes.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 8733-15.

MR. CATANESE: An Ordinance authorizing the County of Allegheny to acquire by condemnation certain temporary construction easement areas from three parcels required to construct lateral support facilities for Homestead-Duquesne Road at Franklin Street in Munhall Borough, 5147 through 0207, and to take such further actions as may be necessary under applicable law, including Eminent Domain Code sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Council member Macey.

MR. MACEY: Thank you, Mr. President, and members of Council. This particular ordinance was vetted on 1/22/15 of last month, and it was sent to the full Council with affirmative recommendation. I move for approval.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, let's take the roll.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?  
MR. BAKER: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms Danko?  
(No response).  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?  
MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?  
MR. FINNERTY: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?  
MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?  
MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?  
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?  
MR. KRESS: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?  
MR. MACEY: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?  
DR. MARTONI: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?  
MS. MEANS: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?  
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?  
MS. REA: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?  
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 14. Nos, 0. Bill passes.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 8734-15.

MR. CATANESE: An Ordinance authorizing the County of Allegheny to acquire by condemnation a certain drainage easement area from a parcel of land of Ernest M. Pido and Catherine Beauchamp required to construct a replacement storm sewer along West Run-Homestead and Duquesne Connecting Roads, also known as East 22nd Avenue Extension, in Munhall Borough, 5331-0002, and to take such further action as may be necessary under applicable law, including the Eminent Domain Code sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Councilman Macey.

MR. MACEY: Thank you, Mr. President. The Public Works Committee met on January 22nd, 2015 and this particular ordinance was sent to the full Council with affirmative recommendation. I ---

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

MR. MACEY: --- move for approval.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, we'll take the roll.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms Danko?

(No response).

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?  
MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?  
MR. FINNERTY: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?  
MR. FUTULES: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?  
MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?  
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Sorry. You kind of butchered

that.

MR. CATANESE: Sorry?  
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I'm just teasing. Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?  
MR. KRESS: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?  
MR. MACEY: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?  
DR. MARTONI: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?  
MS. MEANS: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?  
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?  
MS. REA: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson? Mr. Robinson?  
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 14. Nos, 0. The bill

passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 8735-15.

MR. CATANESE: An Ordinance authorizing the County of Allegheny to acquire by condemnation temporary construction easement area from parcels of land of Walter J. Davic required to construct lateral support facilities for Painters Run Road east of McMillan Road, Site 1, and of William Raymond Siedle, half interest, and Daniel F. Vanzin and Catherine Vanzin, half interest, required to construct lateral support facilities for Painters Run Road at Essen Hill Road, Site 2, both sites being in Upper St. Clair Township, 6242-0206, and to take such further action as may be necessary under applicable law, including the Eminent Domain Code sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Council Member Macey.

MR. MACEY: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I just want to say that all three of these ordinances at the quality of life, safety and infrastructure as well as the enhancement of the community. On January 22nd, 2015 we met on Ordinance 8735-15, and it was sent to the full Council with affirmative recommendation.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

MR. MACEY: And I'd move for approval.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Go ahead, Mr. Ellenbogen.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Yeah, I'm very familiar with this lateral support. When I was Chief of Operations of Special Services, we had problems back in the 90s. We had trucks down there trying to keep that patched and keep the roads from falling in, so I think this is a good thing. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any other remarks? Seeing none, take the roll.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms Danko?

(No response).

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?

MS. REA: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?  
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 14. Nos, 0. The bill

passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Liaison Reports.  
MR. FINNERTY: I definitely have ---.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead, Council member

Finnerty.

MR. FINNERTY: I actually have two. These concern Soldiers and Sailors. On February the 7th, which is a Saturday, at 1:00 p.m., the Black Veterans With Success is having their history, health and commitment to excellence out there and so if --- it's free, so if you have a chance, stop at Soldiers and Sailors at one o'clock on February the 7th, Saturday.

Also at Soldiers and Sailors, there is a play that's going on. It's called Tell It To The Marines. It's a play for the time at hand. It's on February the 6th, 7th and 8th, and also the 13th, 14th and 15th. Show time is 7:00 p.m. It's at Soldiers and Sailors Auditorium also, and it's written by Samuel Hazo. You might know Samuel. He is a poet from this area. He also was a professor of English at Duquesne University. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any other reports? Go ahead,, Sue.

MS. MEANS: Last Monday, January 26th, Bethel Park laid to rest their youngest policeman. Little eight-year-old Joey Fabus passed away due to his brain tumor. But I want tell everyone how really proud I am of Bethel Park and the community, especially all the police departments in the area. Forty (40) different police departments participated in his funeral. 166 vehicles were in his procession. There were fire trucks and paramedics and policemen. And there was just an amazing support, that the Fabus family has this amazing support of the community. And I just want to tell Bethel Park how really proud I am. And I would be remiss not to thank the Mount Lebanon community as well because the Bethel Park firemen, they brought their ladder truck, and the Mount Lebanon firemen brought their ladder truck. And over the Gateway Cemetery they put up their ladder trucks together and hung a huge flag.

Also, police departments from all over the United States sent Joey little patches. He also had an NYPD cap and jacket. And it just was amazing to see. Everyone --- especially I wanted to thank Officer Rigetti for spearheading the effort to give Joey --- help him make his wish to be a police officer for a day, which he got to do. He also got to throw a ball out to the Pirates. I think it was a County baseball evening. And I just want to thank everybody, again, for the support and give the family our greatest condolences at the passing of their dear little boy. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Any other reports? Go ahead, Jim.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: No. I just wanted to say that I'm glad that Councilwoman Means brought that up because I don't think we'll ever see such courage from a young man of his age, you know, who really, I think, captured the hearts of the people of this County. And I would ask this Council that I think that we should honor him in a resolution so that this young man's name be entered into the record for this County's history. I think it's appropriate. Thank you.

MR. FINNERTY: I second.

MR. MACEY: I'll second that.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah, that's good. Second. Under remarks? All those in favor, signify by saying aye. (Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.

MR. FUTULES: It's a resolution.

MR. FINNERTY: You can't do that.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: What? Oh, it's a resolution.

MR. FINNERTY: It's a resolution. You can't ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Oh, well, I ---.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I'm just saying we should do it. If Councilwoman Means would ---

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Well, I ---.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: --- do it, I think that that would be appropriate.

MR. FINNERTY: You should ask ---.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Yeah, I'm asking ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I thought he made a motion.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: No, no. I'm sorry.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: If you want to put a resolution ---.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I probably would if I thought I could. So I mean, I'm just trying to do it the best respectful way that, you know, ---

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. You will ---.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: --- in light of the loss of a child.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MS. MEANS: I'll look into it. I did make a proclamation honoring him this summer. And you know, I already did for being a brave policeman.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: You did.

MS. MEANS: Yeah, I did. So I don't know if I can do another one or not. But I will certainly look into it. I am --- yeah. Thank you.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: May I respond?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Yeah, I just wanted to say that I think --- would appropriate, maybe, we could, you know, have this young man added as an honorary County police officer, you know, in his memory. So thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Any other --- go ahead.

MR. MACEY: Yeah. Thank you, Mr. President, and members of Council. You know, I'm pretty partial to volunteer fire companies and all of our first responders. So I'd just like to mention that the Lincoln Volunteer Fire Company will have a Night at the Races on Saturday, February 7th beginning at six o'clock.

I'd also like to mention that the NAACP McKeesport Unit will be having a pancake breakfast on Saturday, February 14th, and that'll be at the Common Ground in McKeesport on Ninth Street. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Anyone else? Go ahead, Councilman Palmiere.

MR. PALMIERE: Thank you, Mr. President. Just a couple of things on a lighter note. This past Saturday night I wanted to congratulate the Pittsburgh Playhouse and their wonderful production of My Fair Lady. It was an absolute delight to be there on Saturday night at the O'Reilly Theater. You know, its really a tribute to the area down there now for the arts, and they're right across the street from Heinz Hall. It was just a wonderful evening and I just wanted to go on the record that the

Pittsburgh Playhouse did an absolutely magnificent job of their production.

And also, I'd like to announce also that Baldwin Borough is having a Night at the Races at St. Albert the Great on Friday night. And this is their 100th year and they're trying to raise some money for their Centennial celebration. So I just wanted to make that as a matter of record. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Council Member Kress.

MR. KRESS: Thanks. I just want to say real quick on January 29th, I was at the Shaler Area High School and they had a STEAM Expo. STEAM stands for Science, Technology, Engineering, Arts, Mathematics. And again, this is an opportunity for our students for the future. And again, I know we just were talking about natural gas, but again, we're looking for jobs for our students, preparing them for the future, and we're talking about getting them jobs in the natural gas industry. They also had a robotics classroom there. And that's something that's really, I think, fundamental. When I was a student at Shaler Area, we didn't have robotics classroom. And I think what we're training our students today, I think that the assets that they have, the resources they have, it's great. And whatever I can do to help them out, I will. But kudos to the Shaler Area High School for what they're doing for their students. Thank you very much.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Seeing no more, let's go on to New Business, Ordinances, Resolutions. 8771-15.

MR. CATANESE: An Ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, to amend and supplement Article 1013 of Division 1 of the Code of Allegheny County entitled Administrative Code, Section 1013.09.N, entitled, Misuse of County Resources, in order to clearly establish rules prohibiting the use of County owned vehicles to travel to and from partisan political events. Sponsored by Council Member Heidelbaugh.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into Government Reform.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: May I speak to that, please?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Real --- yeah, say a sentence or --- we're not going to discuss the issue.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Okay. Well, I appreciate that, Mr. President. I have introduced this ordinance to address what should have been clear in the law, but obviously was being violated as a result of what we

recently read in the news. So this is a pretty straightforward bill to make sure that everyone understands that you cannot use County property when you are attending political events, either for yourself or for others.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. 8772-15.

MR. CATANESE: An Ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, amending the Administrative Code of Allegheny County, Article 203, entitled, County Authorities, Section §5-203.02, entitled, Appointments to County Authorities, in order to limit the appointments of County employees and County Council members to the governing boards of authorities. Sponsored by Council Member Heidelbaugh.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go to Government and Reform.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: May I speak to that, please?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes. Quickly again.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Thank you. Well, usually, this is my only opportunity to say anything because it never comes out of committee, so I appreciate that.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No, wait a minute. Let's take one time. You were the first one called. You never even showed up. So don't be saying things that aren't true.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I was the first one called out of ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Out of one bill out of three years, ---

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: You were ---.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: --- I wasn't there.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: You were the first one called and didn't even show up.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: My bill has been sitting ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: You didn't even call in, so don't be putting on like no one listens to you. Go ahead.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: My bill has been sitting in your committee ---

MR. FINNERTY: Point of order.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: --- for a year and a half.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go on with that. Okay?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: So this bill is to address the current situation in which the county executive is nominating for appointment County employees. There's been

a huge increase of that since he stopped using the resignation letters. And the independent boards and authorities should have people who are independent and who are free thinkers and who cannot be pressured by the fact that they have a job with the County.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 8773-15.

MR. CATANESE: Ordinance of the County of Allegheny authorizing the transfer of custody of certain County records to the Historical Society of Western Pennsylvania to allow for their maintenance and preservation at no cost to the County under preservation guidelines established by the Society of American Archivists and for public access to those records at the Senator John Heinz History Center. Sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into the Education Committee. 8774-15.

MR. CATANESE: A Resolution of the County of Allegheny amending the Grants and Special Accounts Budget for 2015, Submission 02-15. Sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go to Budget and Finance. 8775-15.

MR. CATANESE: A Resolution of the Council of Allegheny County, Pennsylvania, made pursuant to the Local Economic Revitalization Tax Assistance Act, LERTA, Pa. Statute Title 72, §4722 et seq., 1995, as amended providing for: a program of temporary exemption for increases in Allegheny County Real Property Taxes, for specified time periods, resulting from improvements made by an owner of property located within a specific geographical area within the City of Pittsburgh, County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, previously determined to be a deteriorated area; establishing a schedule for exempting increases in Allegheny County property taxes resulting from such improvements; and prescribing the requirements and procedures by which an owner of property located within the deteriorated area can secure the temporary exemption resulting from such improvements. Sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go to Economic Development. Okay. New Business, Motions. 8776-15.

MR. CATANESE: Authorizing the Council's Executive Committee to select from responsible bidders and select a proposal to provide in-house information

technology, I.T., services to the office of Allegheny County Council. Sponsored by Council members Futules and Danko.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Futules. Council member Futules.

MR. FUTULES: That would be me. Thank you. The Executive Committee has met on several occasions regarding this IT issue, and we've come to the consensus that we would like this entire Council to review the issue and take a vote whether to forward or not. I'd like to ask for an Exec Session because the information I have is still private and confidential and should not be public. And we --- so we can discuss it in the back for a minute.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. We'll take a few minutes to go back to Executive Session.

(Executive Session held.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. We're back from Executive Session. We were on 8776-15. I think Chairman Futules had the floor.

MR. FUTULES: Yes, thank you, Mr. President. At this time, we're going to make a --- take a vote whether we should move forward or not ---

MR. FINNERTY: Make a motion.

MR. FUTULES: --- for the Executive Committee with I.T. solutions. Now, moving forward, if it goes back to the Executive Committee, we had agreed to allow any member of Council that shows up at the Executive Committee a right to vote the way they ---. I wanted that on the record. So at this time I would make a motion to vote.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I think I have to raise a matter of procedure.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: She has a point of order. Go ahead.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: So what I'd like to do is I'd like to ask Mr. Futules if he would accept a friendly amendment, which is what you just said, because you can't do it. Somebody else has to do it.

MR. FUTULES: Okay.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: All right.

MR. FUTULES: I accept an amendment, yeah.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: So that what we would be doing is authorizing ---.

MR. FUTULES: Is it in writing?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I don't have to do a friendly amendment in writing, I don't think, do I.

MR. CANTANESE: I'd say you do.  
MR. FINNERTY: You can do it in committee.  
MR. CANTANESE: You can do it in the committee,  
though.  
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: You can't change this. We  
didn't agree to this.  
MR. FUTULES: What do you mean, we didn't agree  
to it?  
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Authorizing this ---.  
MR. FUTULES: She lost me. I didn't hear her.  
MR. MACEY: Straightforward yes or no.  
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No, but ---  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: What are ---?  
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: --- I'm trying to do this  
procedurally correct ---  
MR. FINNERTY: You are right.  
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: --- because ---.  
MR. FINNERTY: She'd right.  
MR. FUTULES: Okay. But I don't know what she's  
saying. I didn't hear her.  
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I'll try to explain it again.  
So what is pending is not what we've all just agreed to.  
MR. FINNERTY: Right.  
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: So it has to be amended.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah, but you can't do it  
that way, either.  
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Well, you just explained ---.  
MR. FINNERTY: John, can I speak?  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Do you want a point of  
order?  
MR. FINNERTY: Yes, point of order. I don't  
think we can vote on it at all, and I agree 100 percent  
with you, what you're saying. I think this has to back to  
committee ---  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.  
MR. FINNERTY: --- and has to be taken care of.  
I mean, you have three different ---.  
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yeah.  
MR. FINNERTY: It'll get crazy up here.  
MR. FUTULES: Maybe that might be the --- just  
send it back to committee and not vote at all.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah, send it back to  
committee and not do it at all.  
MR. FINNERTY: Yeah, you have to.  
MR. FUTULES: Okay.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yeah.  
MR. FUTULES: Send it back to committee.  
MR. FINNERTY: It's wrong.  
MR. FUTULES: We don't have to vote. How's

that?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.  
MR. CATANESE: You have to withdraw your motion

then.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: He withdraws ---.  
MR. FUTULES: I'll withdraw my motion then.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah. All right.  
MR. FUTULES: Okay.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 8777-15.

MR. CATANESE: Pulling Bill Number 8228-14, a Resolution of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, urging the Pennsylvania General Assembly to enact with all deliberate speed an act authorizing the governing bodies of the counties of the second class to provide by ordinance for the implementation of tax provisions to allow for a property tax freeze for qualifying senior citizens, from committee for an immediate and final vote. Sponsored by Council member Heidelbaugh.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: And I believe I have a second.

MS. MEANS: I second.

MR. BAKER: Second.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: So I just want to speak to this briefly, Mr. President.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Well, you can --- yeah, it's a motion ---.

MR. FINNERTY: It's timeliness --- you can't speak to this. It's not on the floor.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No, it's in committee.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I just want to speak to the pulling.

MR. FINNERTY: Well, it's timeliness is all you can ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah. It's in Committee.

MR. FINNERTY: You can't speak to the bill.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I want to pull it.

MR. FINNERTY: Right.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Oh, you want to pull ---.

MR. FINNERTY: That's good.

MR. FUTULES: I understand that.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yeah. So I want to pull it ---

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: --- because it hasn't been voted on, and I want to vote on it tonight.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

MR. FINNERTY: Okay.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: You made a motion that was properly seconded.

MR. FINNERTY: Right.

MS. MEANS: I seconded it.

MR. BAKER: I seconded it as well.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: And I'd like to speak to it, but you won't let me.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No, you can't.

MR. FINNERTY: You can't.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: It's a rule.

MR. FINNERTY: It's impossible. It's not on the floor.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: It's a rule. All right. Let's take a --- let's have a roll call vote because we have some controversy here.

MR. CATANESE: This is to pull the bill. Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms Danko?

(No response.)

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

(No response.)

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Yes?

MR. KRESS: Yeah.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: No. And I'm not sure what the hell we're voting ---.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?  
MR. PALMIERE: No.  
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?  
MS. REA: Yes.  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?  
(No response).  
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No.  
MR. CATANESE: Yes, 6. No, 6. It's a tie. It

fails.

MR. FINNERTY: It fails.  
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Pretty close.  
MR. FINNERTY: Close.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: You're getting better.  
MR. FINNERTY: You're getting better.  
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. 8778-15.

MR. CATANESE: A Motion urging the Pennsylvania General Assembly to oppose Senate Bill 4, House Bill 173 when either comes before them. Sponsored by Council members Finnerty and Martoni.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Councilman Finnerty.

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you. Senate Bill Number 4 is a bill that has gone through both the House and the Senate one time. It's going through again because it is a Constitutional Amendment, this Senate Bill. And a Constitutional Amendment has to do with giving the General Assembly rights to fashion uniform standards and qualifications for purely public charities. Right now, we already have that. We don't know exactly what they're going to do when they do this. But the idea is to make it easier, and to make Harrisburg the place that decides the easiness of getting a purely, public charity so they can get a tax exemption. Now right now, it's in our court. We have challenged the public --- the purely public charities in our entire Allegheny County. And some other counties also have done this. Now, I believe that they're going to attempt to make it easier for these charities to get this tax exemption.

And let's take a look at some history that's happened here in regard to pure public charities. This is a law that was passed in 1957, if I'm not mistaken. I might be off by a year or two. But in 1957, UPMC didn't qualify as a tax exempt body. And many other things didn't qualify, either. But in 1997, they amended this in

the General Assembly somehow, and I don't know how. I wasn't that much into this type of thing at that time. And after 1997, UPMC qualified as a tax exempt status. So what we're looking at here is something that right now we know that we have a HUP --- we have five HUP principles that have to be met for purely public charities. We know that. We know that they've been asserted by the Courts and that --- if I can find the right case here that happened in Pikes (sic) County which was Mesivtah versus Pikes County Board of Assessment Appeals. This group was denied their purely public charity because of what the Court said.

Now, --- I got my papers messed up --- if we look at what the HUP is saying to us in regard to this, it's saying that, number one, these institutions have to meet these requirements. There has to be a charitable purpose. Number two, it has to be free from private profit motives. The third thing, it has to have communities service. The fourth thing is that it has to be a charity of the people or person, meaning if a person can't pay for it, they will take care of them anyhow. And the last thing, the fifth thing, is government service. They have to somehow make it so that what they're doing is going to relieve us of a service that we do.

So that's what it is at this moment. I really think that we should vote on this. And I did send you all --- Jared did, by e-mail, the three documents in regard to this, that I hope you had a chance to look at. It's already been passed by the City Council in regard to this, that they don't want this to happen. And there has been no hearings in regard to this, none whatsoever. And that's really --- that is very, very, to me, disingenuous, that they would enter into this without having public hearings throughout the state.

So I'm asking for a vote on this and I'll try to answer any questions that you have.

MR. MACEY: Mr. President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MR. MACEY: I also e-mailed in to co-sponsor that, so if the clerk would put me on, I'd appreciate that. Thank you.

MR. KRESS: Joe, can you add me as a co-sponsor? Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Joe (raises hand.)

MS. MEANS: (Raises hand.)

MS. MEANS: I'm not a co-sponsor. I'm raising my hand because of a question. Don't put me down as a co-sponsor.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. All right.

MS. MEANS: I have a question.

MR. FINNERTY: Sure.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Properly seconded.

MR. FINNERTY: I'll try to answer it.

MS. MEANS: And so are we --- are we proposing that we vote on this motion this evening, ---

MR. FINNERTY: Yes, I am.

MS. MEANS: --- that this is not getting sent to Committee? Do we have to have a vote to vote on it tonight?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MS. MEANS: Do we have to have a vote to vote on it?

MR. FINNERTY: No, you don't. It's a motion.

MS. MEANS: It's a motion. Okay.

MR. FINNERTY: It's my prerogative and that's my prerogative at the moment.

MS. MEANS: Okay.

MR. FINNERTY: There was --- was there a second on the motion?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: There was a second?

MR. FINNERTY: I'm asking.

MR. MACEY: Second.

MR. FINNERTY: I made a motion.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I thought he did.

MR. FINNERTY: Good enough.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Now, it's for sure.

MR. FINNERTY: Good enough.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks again? Heather, you want to ---?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yeah.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Wait until we get Heather, then I'll come back.

MS. MEANS: I just want to say I need more information. And I thank Mr. Finnerty for the information that's he provided, but I would rather we waited.

MR. FINNERTY: Uh-huh (yes).

MS. MEANS: I did read it. I did some research. I did contact my State Representative, and I --- so I would rather not vote this evening. So if we have to vote, I'll probably abstain. Thank you.

MR. FINNERTY: Okay. That's fine. I think your State Representative is on this bill.

MS. MEANS: No, he isn't.

MR. FINNERTY: Isn't he? I think so.

MS. MEANS: No.

MR. FINNERTY: Okay. Go ahead.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Next was Heather, then Mr. ---.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: So I was provided with a copy of this this evening by Mr. Finnerty. And as I understand it, the State House and the Senate have both passed the necessary measures to introduce a Constitutional Amendment which would have to be put before the people on a couple of occasions.

MR. FINNERTY: No, Heather, they have to go twice. It's been through once. It has to go through twice.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Do I ---?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Well, wait a minute. Hold it. You still have the floor. Go ahead.

MR. FINNERTY: Go ahead.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: So the gist of the action is whether the Courts are going to decide what is a public charity or the legislature is going to decide what is a public charity. So what happened was in 1997 the legislature got together and they said we're going to put together a statute that says if you do these sorts of things this is what --- if you do these sorts of things and comply with these parameters, you will be a public charity.

Recently, the Court has decided again to weigh into this and say despite what the legislature says, we're going to take this under our own hands and we're going to decide. So for me, philosophically, this is a question about whether the legislature is the proper branch of government to decide this issue. Or whether we're going to have the Courts come in on an ad hoc basis on particular charities and then you can sue for --- on these cases, and the Court is going to say, legislature, we really don't care what it is that you've said. We're going to decide this on our own.

So for me, what the House and the Senate are trying to do is say we're responsible for these decisions. Courts, you are to apply the law as we see it. So I would

never be in support of what you're saying, Mr. Finnerty, because what you're saying is that the Courts should decide these issues. We elect the legislature, the legislature puts out the legislation and the test, and the Courts are to take that and to interpret it. And they are not to act as a super legislature. And oddly enough, our solicitor wants to disagree with me, but here's the great thing about that, is that you can disagree with me in the hall, but I get to say what I want to say up here because I actually went through an election. Okay?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. All right.

MR. FINNERTY: Can I answer that?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MR. FINNERTY: Oh, go ahead. There's somebody ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah. Go ahead.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I just have a question. I know your intent is to send this to the legislature. I would assume that the Governor would have the opportunity to sign or not sign. Are you going to be sending this to the Governor also?

MR. FINNERTY: I don't really know if the Governor comes into this at all. I don't think he does. This is a Constitutional Amendment, so if it passes the second time, it goes to the people, I believe, okay, on a ballot.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Oh, okay.

MR. FINNERTY: You know, that's the way I understand it. I don't --- I could be wrong. Mr. Solicitor?

MR. CAMBEST: That's correct.

MR. FINNERTY: Okay. I just want to clarify one thing. I don't want the Courts to decide this. I want it to remain the way it is which gives every county in Pennsylvania a right --- a right to say you meet these five things, and if you don't meet them, then maybe we'll have to go to court. So that you have to prove that you meet them. But if we --- if it goes back, I don't think it's coming back that way. It's coming back some way that's going to make it ironclad that you will not be able to contest it. And I think that's important. I mean, if you look at one thing, you know, it's not supposed to be for profit motives, then I don't know how in the world UPMC makes it.

DR. MARTONI: Yeah, I feel sorry for them.

MR. FINNERTY: You know, I don't understand. You know, and they don't have property taxes --- you remember that Highmark does pay property tax, by the way. So you know, this is what I'm looking at. I want it to stay the way it is so that you can challenge these purely public charities.

DR. MARTONI: I'm in total agreement with you. It's almost inconceivable ---

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

DR. MARTONI: --- that we have public charities that make over a billion dollars in profit a year. That doesn't --- in my mind, that doesn't make any sense. Okay?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Sue, do you still have a question?

MS. MEANS: I just wanted to clarify. I was just studying the amendments to the state constitution and it has to pass the House and Senate in two consecutive sessions.

MR. FINNERTY: Right.

MS. MEANS: And then it goes to a vote of the people. I don't believe the Governor can weigh in on it. But I was wondering, Mr. Finnerty, can you tell me when it passed? Did it pass in 2014 or did it pass in --- it didn't pass already. It's too soon. Do you know when this passed?

MR. FINNERTY: I don't know the date on the pass.

MS. MEANS: Okay. But ---.

MR. FINNERTY: I know that this is the --- it is ---.

MS. MEANS: Up for a second?

MR. FINNERTY: It didn't go as yet. If it goes this time, it's going to a ballot.

MS. MEANS: Okay. Thank you. I was not given the impression that it had passed once, but I will check my ---.

MR. FINNERTY: It has.

MS. MEANS: Thank you.

DR. MARTONI: Maybe we need a definition of charity.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Oh, they have a ton of that. It's spelled out like he said. There's a lot behind it. Even though certain people don't abide by it, it's there.

Yeah. Okay. There's a motion. Okay. You have a question?

MR. KRESS: No, I just wanted to ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: You don't have a question, then turn that off then.

MR. KRESS: No. In regards to this whole thing with the non-profits, the big concern I have is, you know, centralization of power. I prefer that the power remains with the local people. And that's thing about decentralization. At least we have a choice to try and make a determination --- when we have a larger company we could certainly be a non-profit. But how their actions affect the local populous --- and of course, as we have had our UPMC hearings and Highmark hearings when they were both in this room that --- you know, the question about how their actions affect the local population and how they are --- can we actually challenge these --- you know, their actions themselves? And my concern is that if we take the power away from the local government and centralize it in Harrisburg, are we still able to challenge decisions made here locally? And that was the problem with UPMC/Highmark, is that the people throughout the state are not being affected by this. But the people here in western PA are being affected by the UPMC/Highmark dispute. And I don't know if we can do anything about it or not. But again, we were talking about looking at non-profits, so if we allow Harrisburg to dictate to us what's going on locally, I'm opposed to it. And that's the reason why I'm opposed to this amendment to the Constitution. If we look at the HUP test, we're talking about being free from private profit motive. Now, that doesn't mean that --- again, that non-profits can't have revenues that exceed expenses.

And again, I think that the problem --- we talk about non-profits. I think it's a misnomer. That they're allowed to technically make money. Their profits are allowed to --- I mean, their revenues are allowed to exceed their expenses. I think a better thing would be maybe more --- like a charitable corporation was a better name for it because, again, if they weren't --- if their revenues didn't exceed their expenses, they would be bankrupt. So again, that's not the question here. When we look at non-profits, per se, I'm looking at about --- you know, again, we had the hearing with the physical therapists, you know. They're talking about

self-referring their patients within network, not allowing competition, not allowing independent physical therapists to be within the UPMC network. Something like that is something is something I have a concern about. And that's the reason why --- again, if you're consolidating all the power in Harrisburg, are we losing our right to examine how local non-profits are operating? That's the reason why I'm for the Finnerty motion and opposed to what they're trying to do in Harrisburg. So thank you very much.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Seeing no more, it's only a motion, but we'll take a roll call anyway because there might be a little controversy.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: I'll abstain. And I think we have to say why we abstain. I work in the sector and I don't always feel this is our role to weigh in.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Yes on the Finnerty amendment.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

(No response).

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: I serve on some non-profits where they're truly non-profits. I vote yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Abstain.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?

MS. REA: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

(No response).

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 9, nos 1, 2 abstentions.  
It passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

MR. BAKER: Could I have a point of clarification? If you abstain, do you have to say why?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No.

MR. FINNERTY: We never do.

MR. BAKER: Okay.

MR. FINNERTY: I didn't have to ---.

MR. BAKER: Do we have it in writing? Okay.

Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. 8779-15.

MR. CATANESE: 8779-15. Amending Article IV, Rule D of the Rules of Council for Allegheny County Council, entitled Tax Increment Financing, TIF, and establishing a new Rule E within Article IV entitled Local Economic Revitalization Tax Assistance, LERTA, in order to provide clear guidance for the factors to be considered by the Council prior to approving TIF and/or LERTA proposals. Sponsored by Council member Heidelbaugh.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. That's going to Government Reform. Okay. Public comment on general items. We have one speaker, who's that --- Sherlivia Murchison, come on up. Ms. Murchison, thank you for waiting.

MS. MURCHISON: I appreciate it. Thank you. I had a prepared statement and ---.

MR. FINNERTY: Use the mic.

MS. MURCHISON: I'm sorry. My name is Sherlivia Murchison and I live at 115 East 11th Avenue, and that's in Homestead, PA. I have a prepared statement here that is probably going to go over my time, but I'm just going to read off the first paragraph. My name is Sherlivia Murchison. I reside at 115 East 11th Avenue in Homestead, PA. I write to you today as a concerned resident that truly loves our town and have loved since I was a young child. The concern is in regard to the current construction that's being done in our town, and specifically the units that are being built on my street. I'm going to skip through this because I don't want to go over my three minutes, and just talk to you all for just a minute. And I'll give you all a copy of this.

This is like the fifth time I've read this at different Councils, and I made my way up to you all, because I went to City Council. I started with my local

government. We didn't get the answers we wanted to, to find out about the construction that's going on in our neighborhood. It's called One Homestead. And it started off to be --- to look like nice, single family homes they were building to beautify the area. The more they built, the more they started to turn into like public housing. And I live on the street where I went in my house one day, came back out and there were five more on my street. Now, they only knocked down two existing homes that were there, and one on the other side, and want to put ten units all the way around there, another four on this side, and another four down the block. In the middle of all this is a big gigantic church. I think my major concern with this construction was we, as the residents, did not know that they were going to be building this complex until the bulldozers came in.

Now, they had public hearings so we found out. They had public hearings and things of that nature. But they were all advertised in the McKeesport paper. We are the Valley. We have a paper, the Valley Mirror. Okay? This is where I come and I look --- looking for what's concerning me, I'm thinking I'm the Valley, let me go the Valley. Our borough has decided not to advertise public anything in this paper here. So when we found out about that, I went to the Council and I read this statement, which I'll make some copies and give them to you all. And he just really just, you know, shooing me away. So we the taxpayer then she asked, well, I just want to have my own question. Are my taxes going to go up? And he was very evasive with her. So we started from that point on screaming, like, hey, if you're not going to listen to us, we're going downtown. So my major issue is once I told them I thought those units were safe --- no, unsafe, there was this glowing review that was in the paper, okay, that these units were being built for the people that work down at the waterfront that make between \$22,000 and \$27,000 a year. That's what they said they were being built for. When I went down myself to go get a application for it --- these are the applications for it. They look like public assistance applications. They're asking you do you make --- what's in your bank account, what's in your checking account, what's in your savings account? Have you sold any property over \$1,000 in the last two years? These are questions that someone that makes that amount of money does not want to answer and so we're trying to mix

(phonetic) them to be transparent. That's what we want. We want ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Could you try to wrap it up pretty quick?

MS. MURCHISON: Yes, sir, I will. We're trying to get transparency. What's going on in our neighborhood and why do we not have a say so? So I really came to speak to Ms. Barbara because she's the --- in charge of that, and because she's not here, we're going to work together to put some paperwork together to come back and speak again. And I pray to God that she's here so that she can hear us. But ya'll can get some of the message, that that young lady sat here waiting on you, just to be able to put front (phonetic) to you, we're coming back and I just want some answers. Did this private owner get and government money and what did he ---

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

MS. MURCHISON: --- promise he was going to do? And is he doing that?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I represent you as well, so come talk to me.

MS. MURCHISON: Yes, ma'am. Thank you.

MR. FINNERTY: U-R-A?

MS. MURCHISON: Excuse me?

MR. FINNERTY: That's URA.

MS. MURCHISON: No, it's a private ---.

MR. FINNERTY: Rodriguez?

MS. MURCHISON: Yes. And he's put in here that he --- it's touted Homestead to be the new Bakery Square, the new Lawrenceville. And we're Homestead. We do not want to be East Liberty. And we don't want that. We have town churches. We don't want that. And they didn't ask us, so he has this big thing he wants to do for us without asking us. Now, we have an issue, one thing, if I could say please real quick.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: You're way over.

MS. MURCHISON: We have a giant church in the middle of all this construction. We're asking that we can use that as a recreation center because I can't stop the bulldozers. But can we balance the prescription for crime with a recreation center for the youth that are already there and that'll be coming. I don't think that's unfair, you know. I don't think that's a lot to ask for. Thank ya'll. And we'll be back. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Does someone want to make a motion to adjourn?

MR. MACEY: So moved.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Do I hear a second?

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:21 p.m.

CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify, as the stenographic reporter, that the foregoing proceedings were taken stenographically by me, and thereafter reduced to typewriting by me or under my direction; and that this transcript is a true and accurate record to the best of my ability.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Court Reporter