

ALLEGHENY COUNTY COUNCIL

REGULAR MEETING

- - -

BEFORE:

John P. DeFazio	-	President
Nicholas Futules	-	Vice President, District 7
Heather S. Heidelbaugh	-	Council-At-Large
Tom Baker	-	District 1
Jan Rea	-	District 2
Edward Kress	-	District 3
Michael J. Finnerty	-	District 4
Sue Means	-	District 5
John F. Palmiere	-	District 6
Dr. Charles J. Martoni	-	District 8
Robert J. Macey	-	District 9
William Russell Robinson	-	District 10
Barbara Daly Danko	-	District 11
James Ellenbogen	-	District 12
Amanda Green Hawkins	-	District 13

Allegheny County Courthouse
Fourth Floor, Gold Room
436 Grant Street
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219

Tuesday, February 4, 2014 - 5:00 p.m.

SARGENT'S COURT REPORTING SERVICE, INC.
429 Forbes Avenue, Suite 1300
Pittsburgh, PA 15219
(412) 232-3882 FAX (412) 471-8733

IN ATTENDANCE:

William McKain - County Manager
Joseph Catanese - Director, Constituent Services
Jared Barker - Director, Legislative Services
Walter Szymanski - Budget Director
Michael Wojcik - County Solicitor
Jack Cambest - County Solicitor

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. The meeting will come to order. Will you all please rise for the Pledge of Allegiance to the flag and remain standing for silent prayer or reflection. After me.

(Pledge of Allegiance to the flag.)

(Silent prayer or reflection.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. We'll have the roll call.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Danko?

MS. DANKO: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I think I'm here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Present.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

(No response.)

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?

MS. REA: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Present.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Fourteen (14) members currently present.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Proclamations and Certificates. 7993-14.

MR. CATANESE: Proclamation naming the month of February as American Heart Association Month in Allegheny County. Sponsored by Council members Robinson, Baker,

Danko, DeFazio, Ellenbogen, Finnerty, Futules, Green Hawkins, Heidelbaugh, Kress, Macey, Martoni, Means, Palmiere and Rea.

MR. ROBINSON: Mr. President and members of Council, thank you for allowing me this distinct honor and presence. Each year over the last few years, we've taken some time out to recognize the seriousness of heart disease and its impact on too many women in our county and in the United States of America. This is one of our rare opportunities to work together on an issue important to all of us. February is also a month in which we emphasize our love and affection for the people in our lives, many of whom are women. And while in a week or so we'll have some fun with that and some seriousness, this opportunity gives us, as Allegheny County Council, the first official act of saying thank you to the men and women who we love and, at the same time, recognizing the seriousness of heart disease and its devastating impact upon women.

I have with me today Ms. Sherri A. Stitt, vice president of the American Heart Association, and Ms. Shannon Lesnock, Go Red for Women director. As you know, Friday, the 7th of February, is the day we're all supposed to wear red. For some women, that's not difficult; for some of us, we wear red periodically. But on Friday, the 7th of February, it's the official day to wear red. And we hope that each and every one of you, after you hear from these two fine ladies --- that you will do just that. And while we're going to have some fun, you will take serious, heart disease and, like I said, its devastating impact on women, regardless of who they are or where they are in our county or in our country. I'm going to read this proclamation on behalf of all members of Council and then ask these ladies to come in their own special way and say a few things to us, get some pictures, and encourage us to do what it is they feel we need to do, not just on next Friday --- or this Friday coming, but what we need to do in the weeks to come.

WHEREAS, the American Heart Association is celebrating the month of February 2014, as American Heart Month and promoting education and awareness by encouraging citizens to learn the warning signs of heart attack and stroke; and

WHEREAS, the American Heart Association's Go Red for Women movement has been impacting the health of women

for 11 years. More than 627,000 women's lives have been saved and 330 fewer women are dying every day; and

WHEREAS, in celebration of the 11th anniversary of national Wear Red Day on February 7th, 2014, Go Red for Women is asking all women across America to go red by wearing the color red to signify the fight against the number one health threat to women, heart disease;

WHEREAS, making the right choices relating to proper nutrition, physical activity and other healthy lifestyle choices is essential to living a heart-healthy life.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that in recognition of the importance of the ongoing fight against heart disease and stroke, Allegheny County Council does hereby proclaim the month of February as American Heart Month in Allegheny County. And we designate February --- Friday, February 7th, 2014, as Wear Red Day in Allegheny County. Furthermore, we urge all Allegheny County citizens show their support for women and the fight against heart disease by commemorating this day by wearing the color red, by increasing awareness, speaking up about heart disease, and empowering women to reduce their risks for cardiovascular disease. We can save thousands of lives each year. Sponsored by all members of Allegheny County Council. I'm going to ask Ms. Stitt and Ms. Lesnock to please come forward. Share with us who they are, again, and what it is they would have us do. Ladies?

(Applause.)

MS. STITT: Thank you. I'm Sherri Stitt, the Vice President of the Heart Association, Greater Pittsburgh Metro. Shannon Lesnock is our Go Red for Women director.

MR. CATANESE: Actually, why don't you move that mic very close? There you go.

MS. STITT: Yes. Thank you. I'd like to thank all members of the Council for the proclamation. As they mentioned, this is our 11th year for Go Red for Women. When we started this campaign back in 2003, there was only a 13 percent awareness that heart disease was the number one killer of women. Now we're up to about 62 percent, so we've made a lot of progress, but there's a lot of work to be done. So we do ask everyone to wear red on Friday. Guys, men wear red, too. You can wear a red tie, and help us raise the awareness. It's so important because --- I came to the Heart Association because I lost my mother to

heart disease in 2005. And back then --- well, I didn't work for heart --- I didn't know the risk factors and the symptoms. My mother had trouble breathing, and even the doctors back then didn't always look at the heart as the number one killer of women. So they looked in her lungs, and two years later they realized that it was her heart, but there were complications by then. So women, your symptoms are different. It could be your shortness of breath, like my mother. It might be that you have a pain in your neck. It might be a pain in your jaw. You might have a really sore throat.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I'm sorry. When you said pain in the neck, I was thinking about --- most of you women have husbands who are pains in their neck.

MS. STITT: Yes. It might be that you're just exhausted, and women are always exhausted; you know, you're working. You're taking care of children, you're taking care of grandchildren. You might be caring for elderly parents, so you're tired anyway. So you might dismiss these symptoms as just I'm tired. Or, you know, for many of us over 50, we might carry a couple extra pounds that we might normally not. Your symptoms are different. Pay attention to them. We know our bodies. Go see your doctor. If something just isn't right, ask them to take a look at your heart. So again, thank you, members of Council. We appreciate it. Please wear red on Friday.

(Applause.)

(Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: These next proclamations will all be read into the record, starting with 7994-14. Oh, you want to ---? Okay. We could --- okay. Jimmy Ellenbogen has one here. Go ahead. You can go up.

MR. CATANESE: We don't have a number for that one, but it's a proclamation recognizing and honoring in memoriam the service and sacrifice of Pittsburgh Bureau of Police K-9 Officer Rocco. Sponsored by Council member Ellenbogen, Baker, Danko, Finnerty, Futules, Green Hawkins, Heidelbaugh, Kress, Macey, Martoni, Means, Palmiere, Rea, Robinson and DeFazio.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I would, at this time, like to ask Lieutenant Kearney, who's head of the County Fugitive squad, Sheriff's Office, to come up, please. You know, most times we take the podium, it's for good causes or for happy things. Sometimes it's for something sad. And I

take personal sadness in having to read this, but it's very important. And before I read it, I'd like to thank Ms. Stephanie Buka for writing and putting in the proclamation of something that's very appropriate in light of K-9 Rocco's memory, the city, but I say police officer who was brutally murdered last week. And this is a poem that was --- it's called Guardians of the Night and the author is unknown. And it says, trust in me, my friend, for I am your comrade. I will protect you with my last breath. When all others have left you and the loneliness of the night closes in, I will be at your side. Together we will conquer all obstacles and search out those who might wish to harm others. All I ask of you is compassion, the caring touch of your hands. It is for you that I will unselfishly give my life and spend my nights unrested. Although our days together may be marked by the passing of the seasons, know that each day at your side is my reward. My days are measured by the coming of your footsteps. I anticipate them at the opening of the door. You are the voice when I am ill, the voice of authority over me when I have done wrong. Do not chastise me unduly, for I am your right arm, the sword at your side.

I attempt to do only what you bid of me. I seek only to please you and remain in your favor. Together you and I experience a bond only those like you will understand. When others see you and us together, their envy will be measured by their disdain. I will quietly listen to you and pass no judgment, nor will your word --- excuse me --- nor will your spoken words be repeated. I will remain ever silent, ever vigilant, ever loyal. And when our time together is done and you move on in the world, remember me with kind thoughts and tales. For a time we were unbeatable. Nothing passed among us undetected. If we should ever meet again on another field, I will gladly take up your fight. I am a Police Working Dog, and together we are guardians of the night.

Thus is the legacy of a K-9 officer. I'm going to read the proclamation in memory of a K-9 officer. And I take personal being the son of a former police officer of the City of Pittsburgh and being an enforcement chief of the Pennsylvania DOR, I have to call on other agencies many times to work together. And any man or woman who carries a badge feels the same pain. As I said to a police commander this morning, Rocco now belongs to the public and to the world. So with that, I'd like to say,

in loving memory of Pittsburgh Police K-9 Rocco, from my colleagues and myself.

WHEREAS, the Pittsburgh Bureau of Police K-9 Officer Rocco, an eight-year-old German Shepherd, died on January 30th, 2014, at the Pittsburgh Veterinary Specialty Emergency Center, PVSEC, two days after being stabbed in the line of duty; and

WHEREAS, on January 28th, 2014, an Allegheny County Sheriff's deputy attempted to arrest a fugitive. When the subject struggled with the deputy and fled to the basement of a building through the 3700 block of Butler Street in Lawrenceville. Pittsburgh Police Officer Phil Lerza and Officer Rocco responded to a call for assistance. When they entered the darkened room, a man began swinging a knife at them, wounding both officers. K-9 Rocco attacked the subject, but suffered a deep stab wound to the back, which punctured his kidney and spine. Two other Pittsburgh police officers were wounded as they struggled with the subject.

The subject was taken into custody and faces multiple charges; and

WHEREAS, on January 30th, 2014, at 6:17 p.m., K-9 Rocco passed from this life at the PVSEC, where he received the utmost in professional medical treatment; and

WHEREAS, K-9 Rocco was Officer Lerza's partner, his friend, his protector, and he was a member of the Pittsburgh Bureau of Police for five years, having served with honor, dignity and valor. K-9 Rocco was loyal, loving, devoted, and he made the ultimate sacrifice while protecting our communities and safeguarding the citizens of Pittsburgh.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Allegheny County Council, on behalf of the citizens of Allegheny County, does hereby recognize and honor in memoriam, the service and sacrifice of Pittsburgh Police K-9 Officer Rocco. And our condolences go out to the Officer Lerza family and the Pittsburgh Bureau of Police. Sponsored by myself and all members of Council. Presented this 4th day of February, 2014. And may I say that Officer Rocco will be buried the hero that he was, and he belongs to the ages and with respect and love from the people of Allegheny County. Thank you. And with that, I'd like to introduce and have Lieutenant Kearney, who is in charge of that fugitive squad ---. It's very understandable that Officer Lerza could not be here

tonight. But I would ask the lieutenant, if he's up to it, to --- he was there that night --- if he would want to say a few words. Thank you.

LIEUTENANT KEARNEY: All I would just want to say is, the tragedies that unfolded that night are very sad and very upsetting to all involved. And I just want to say God Bless Officer Lerza, his family and K-9 Officer Rocco.

(Applause.)

MR. ELLENBOGEN: And with that, I'd like to present this proclamation.

LIEUTENANT KEARNEY: Thank you.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Thank you, ladies and gentlemen.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Again, 7994-14 and the rest of them will all be read into the record.

MR. CATANESE: Certificate of Achievement awarded to the Avonworth High School boys' cross-country team, for winning the 2013 WPIAL Class A boys' cross-country championship. Sponsored by Council member Baker.

7995-14. Certificate of Achievement awarded to West Allegheny High School boys' soccer team, for winning the 2013 Class AA boys' soccer championship. Sponsored by Council members Baker and Finnerty.

7996-14. Certificate of Achievement awarded to Bishop Canevin High School girls' volleyball team, for winning the 2013 WPIAL Class A girls' volleyball championship. Sponsored by Councilman Ellenbogen.

7997-14. Certificate of Achievement awarded to South Fayette High School boys' cross-country team, for winning the 2013 WPIAL Class AA boys' cross-country championship. Sponsored by Councilman Finnerty.

7998-14. Certificate of Achievement awarded to Shady Side Academy girls' field hockey team, for winning the 2013 WPIAL Class AA girls' field hockey championship. Sponsored by Council member Kress.

7999-14. Certificate of Achievement awarded to the Shady Side Academy girls' soccer team, for winning the 2013 WPIAL Class A girls' soccer championship. Sponsored by Councilman Kress.

Proclamation 8000-14. Certificate of Achievement awarded to Mt. Lebanon High School girls' cross-country team, for winning the 2013 WPIAL Class AAA

girls' cross-country team championship. Sponsored by Council member Means.

8001-14. Certificate of Achievement awarded to the Upper St. Clair High School boys' golf team, for winning the 2013 PIAA and WPIAL Class AAA boys' team golf championships. Sponsored by Council member Means.

8002-14. Certificate of Achievement awarded to Upper St. Clair High School boys' soccer team, for winning the 2013 PIAA Class AAA boys' soccer championship. Sponsored by Council member Means.

8003-14. Certificate of Achievement awarded to the North Allegheny High School girls' tennis team, for winning the 2013 PIAA and WPIAL Class AAA girls' team tennis championship. Sponsored by Council member Rea.

8004-14. Certificate of Achievement awarded to the North Allegheny High School girls' field hockey team, for winning the 2013 WPIAL Class AAA girls' field hockey championship. Sponsored by Council member Rea.

8005-14. Certificate of Achievement awarded to the North Allegheny High School girls' volleyball team, for winning the 2013 WPIAL Class AAA girls' volleyball championship. Sponsored by Council member Rea.

8006-14. Certificate of Achievement awarded to the North Allegheny High School boys' cross-country team, for winning the 2013 WPIAL Class AAA boys' cross-country championship. Sponsored by Council member Rea.

8007-14. Certificate of Achievement awarded to Sewickley Academy boys' soccer team, for winning the 2013 PIAA and WPIAL Class A boys' soccer championship. Sponsored by Council member Rea.

8008-14. Certificate of Achievement awarded to Sewickley Academy boys' golf team, for winning the 2013 WPIAL Class AA boys' team golf championship. Sponsored by Council member Rea.

8009-14. Proclamation naming January 27, 2014, as Holocaust Remembrance Day in Allegheny County. Sponsored by Council member Baker.

8010-14. Proclamation welcoming Shen Yun Performing Arts to Allegheny County on February 19th through the 20th, 2014. Sponsored by Council member DeFazio.

8011-14. Proclamation congratulating the Bower Hill Volunteer Fire Department, upon the occasion of its 90th anniversary. Sponsored by Council member Finnerty.

8012-14. Certificate of Recognition honoring Ms. Neva Lampman, upon the momentous occasion of her 100th birthday. Sponsored by Council member Finnerty.

8013-14. Proclamation congratulating Pittsburgh Sunnyside School for earning a 2013-2014 Students and Teachers Achieving Results (STAR) award. Sponsored by Council member Green Hawkins.

8014-14. Certificate of Achievement awarded to Ryan J. Breen, of Boy Scout Troop 380, upon earning the rank of Eagle Scout. Sponsored by Council member Kress.

8015-14. Certificate of Achievement awarded to Adam K. Webb, of Boy Scout Troop 99, upon earning the rank of Eagle Scout. Sponsored by Councilman Macey.

8016-14. Proclamation commending the Fire Department of North Versailles (F.D.N.V.), for their dedicated service. Sponsored by Council member Macey.

8017-14. Certificate of Recognition awarded to Mr. and Mrs. Herbert and Dorothy Howell, upon the occasion of their 65th wedding anniversary. Sponsored by Councilman Macey.

8018-14. Certificate of Recognition awarded to Mr. and Mrs. Louis and Elva Boissin, upon the occasion of their 55th wedding anniversary. Sponsored by Councilman Macey.

8019-14. Certificate of Recognition awarded to Mr. and Mrs. Richard and Grayce Howard, upon the occasion of their 50th wedding anniversary. Sponsored by Councilman Macey.

8020-14. Certificate of Recognition thanking Ms. Carol Haines, for her 24 years of service as the treasurer for South Versailles Township. Sponsored by Councilman Macey.

8021-14. Proclamation recognizing the Community College of Allegheny County, Big Red --- Big Read Project, and declaring March 3rd, 2014, as Big Read Day in Allegheny County. Sponsored by Council member Martoni.

8022-14. Proclamation honoring The Honorable Donald L. Dolde, for his years of service as Mayor of Bridgeville. Sponsored by Council members Means and Finnerty.

8023-14. Proclamation thanking The Honorable Dick Rose, for his years of service as a Bethel Park school director --- School District board member. Sponsored by Council member Means.

8024-14. Proclamation congratulating the Clairton Volunteer Fire Department, upon the occasion of its 26th anniversary. Sponsored by Council member Palmiere.

8025-14. Proclamation naming the month of February, Black History Month in Allegheny County. Sponsored by Council members Robinson, Green Hawkins, Baker, Danko, DeFazio, Ellenbogen, Finnerty, Futules, Heidelbaugh, Kress, Macey, Martoni, Means, Palmiere and Rea.

8026-14. Proclamation congratulating the Bon-Ami Temple Number 49 of the Daughters of the Elks, 2014 award winners. Sponsored by Council member Robinson.

8027-14. Certificate of Recognition awarded to The Honorable Jean Fink, for her 33 years of service to the Pittsburgh Board of Public Education. Sponsored by Councilman Robinson.

8028-14. Proclamation thanking The Honorable Sophie Masloff, for her many contributions to the City of Pittsburgh. Sponsored by Councilman Robinson.

8029-14. Certificate of Recognition honoring Ms. Elaine Effort, a Pittsburgh KQV radio news reporter, for her excellence in journalism. Sponsored by Councilman Robinson.

8030-14. Proclamation honoring in memoriam, Elizabeth (Bessie) Coleman, the first female pilot of African-American descent, and the first person of African-American descent to hold an international pilot license. Sponsored by Councilman Robinson.

8031-14. Proclamation honoring in memoriam, Paul Leroy Robeson, an African-American singer, actor, social activist, lawyer and athlete. Sponsored by Councilman Robinson.

8032-14. Proclamation honoring in memoriam, Lott Cary, an African-American Baptist minister and lay physician, who was instrumental in the founding of the Colony of Liberia, in the 1820s in Africa. Sponsored by Councilman Robinson.

8033-14. Proclamation honoring in memoriam, Martin Robison Delany, an African-American abolitionist, journalist, physician and writer. Sponsored by Councilman Robinson.

8034-14. Proclamation honoring in memoriam, Mahalia Jackson, an influential gospel singer, also known as The Queen of Gospel. Sponsored by Councilman Robinson.

(Applause.)

MR. CATANESE: Let the record show that Councilman Kress is present. Sorry, Councilman. You've been here for 20 minutes already.

MR. KRESS: He was on a roll.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We have Public Comment on Agenda Items. We have a Jeff Martin.

MR. MARTIN: Good evening. My name is Jeff Martin. I live in West Deer Township. I'm here to speak tonight concerning one of your agenda items concerning alterations to Act 202. Act 202 is very crucial to the building industry in Allegheny County. I'm here representing the 800-plus members of the Builders Association of Metropolitan Pittsburgh, as well as the North Suburban Builders Association, as well as my own company, Richland Holdings. We are the developer, primarily, in the West Deer-Richland Township area. I don't have to tell many of you, that is adjacent to Butler County.

It's a big problem that we have when we meet with clients, that they say we can go two miles up the road and have lower taxes. Act 202, the way it currently reads, gives a two-year tax abatement --- county tax abatement for new construction properties. The only tax due from the county is based on the current lot value at the time of the construction. It is my understanding that there's going to be a vote this evening that will cut that 100 percent abatement for the first two years down to 50 percent. I would urge you to reconsider that and not to change the Act as it is currently and reinstate it.

In years past, it has been June or July before this was ever approved, so I'm not so sure why it has to be done this evening without much consideration. I've developed over 400 lots in the last 10 years. Every one of my customers, which amounted to over 50 percent of those lots, was encouraged by this tax break. It means a considerable amount when you're talking in the lower price range home that I construct. You know, to save county tax for two years is that much more they can either put into the house or buy furniture. So again, on behalf of the associations I represent, my company, my wife and I, since we have utilized this tax abatement three times since it's been enacted. We just moved again within West Deer Township.

We would encourage you to reconsider this. We would really like to have the Act remain as it is with the full two-year abatement. Thank you very much for your time and consideration.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Next we have Dion McMullen.

MR. MCMULLEN: I'm here to speak to the same. So I don't need to reiterate anything that Jeff said. I fully back up everything he said. I'll point out a few others. I don't --- he's up in the North. I build in the South and the West, so I'm on the edges of all the counties. All seven of my houses under construction are under Allegheny County, and every piece of real estate I have is under Allegheny County and 90 percent of my building is in Allegheny County. We have used this abatement since it's been instituted to, at least, fight off the first two years to put us on a level playing field for two years with Washington and Butler, which are the two biggies. And the numbers have changed over the years. Before Allegheny County, it used to be --- far outweigh all new residential construction over all the other counties. But it's to the point now that the other counties come in at 3184 with new construction every year. And we come in with 2817 now.

And I think that turned over about five years ago, so it's a constant fight that we have with the surrounding counties and with the new assessments this year and assessments going up and new construction usually getting hit at the higher amount. We really need this abatement for two years to help attract people to Allegheny County. It brings jobs. The other thing is, it's not that much of a hit to Allegheny County, because when we do get new homes, these lots are still fully taxed, so land in most cases was land that was assessed at maybe \$7,000 or \$8,000 per lot in the division of the farm or whatever we just developed --- is coming in to Allegheny County at a base price of about \$125,000 a lot.

So even during the abatement period, it's only the house that's abated. It's not the lot that's abated. So if you take the average cost of the new lots and the new developments, because of all the new environmental rules and such, we're still bringing in, for every new home we bring, about three times the average of the average house in Allegheny County, just in our lot income during the abatement period. And then we're bringing in

the total value of that product forever. So we think it's good for the county, we think it's good for the building business and we think it's good for jobs. So please reconsider keeping the full 100 percent. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. We have Approval of Minutes. 8035-14.

MR. CATANESE: Motion to approve the minutes of the regular meeting of Allegheny County Council, held on January 14th, 2014.

MR. MACEY: So moved.

DR. MARTONI: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it. Presentation of Appointments. 7990-14.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the reappointment of Susan Davis, to serve as a member of the Allegheny County Mental Health/Intellectual Disability Advisory Board, for a term to expire on December 31st, 2015. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That will go to the Appointment Review Committee. 7991-14.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the reappointment of Michael Enright, to serve as a member of the Allegheny County Mental Health/Intellectual Disability Advisory Board, for a term to expire on December 31st, 2016. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That will go to the Appointment Review Committee. 7992-14.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the appointment of Denise Macarelli, to serve as a member of the Allegheny County Mental Health/Intellectual Disability Advisory Board, for a term to expire on December 31st, 2016. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That will go to the Appointment Review Committee. Committee on Appointment Review, Second Reading. 7949-14.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the reappointment of Victor Diaz, to serve as a member of the Allegheny County Industrial Development Authority, the Allegheny County Hospital Development Authority, the Allegheny County Higher Education Building Authority and the Residential Finance Authority, administered collectively through the

Finance and Development Commission, for a term to expire on December 31st, 2018. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Jan?

MS. REA: Thank you, Mr. President. The Committee on Appointment Review met and interviewed Mr. Diaz to reappoint him as a member of the Allegheny County Industrial Development Authority, the Allegheny County Hospital Development Authority, the Allegheny County Higher Education Building Authority and the Residential Finance Authority, administered collectively through the Finance and Development Commission. And I'd like to make a motion to reappoint Mr. Diaz.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.
7950-14.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the reappointment of State Senator Wayne Fontana, to serve as a member of the Sports and Exhibition Authority of Pittsburgh and Allegheny County, for a term to expire on December 31st, 2018. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Jan?

MS. REA: Yes. The Appointment Review Committee met and interviewed State Senator Wayne Fontana, to serve as a member as a reappointment to the Sports and Exhibition Authority. And I'd like to make a motion to reappoint Mr. --- State Senator Fontana.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.
7951-14.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the reappointment of Dr. Ellen Stewart, to serve as a member of the Allegheny County Board of Health, for a term to expire on January 12, 2017. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Jan?

MS. REA: The Appointment Review Committee met and interviewed Dr. Stewart for reappointment to serve on the Allegheny County Health --- Board of Health. And I'd like to make a motion to reappointment Dr. Stewart.

MR. PALMIERE: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.
7952-14.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the reappointment of Mr. Anthony Ferraro, to serve as a member of the Allegheny County Board of Health, for a term to expire on January 12, 2017. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Jan?

MS. REA: Yes. The Appointment Review Committee met and interviewed Mr. Ferraro for reappointment to the Allegheny County Board of Health. And I'd like to make a motion to reappoint Mr. Ferraro.

MR. PALMIERE: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.
7955-14.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the appointment of Dr. Elayne Arrington, to serve as a member of the Community College of Allegheny County Board of Trustees, for a term to expire on December 31st, 2016. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Jan?

MS. REA: Yes. The Appointment Review Committee met and interviewed Dr. Arrington for an appointment to the Community College of Allegheny County Board. And I'd like to make a motion to appoint Dr. Arrington to the Community College Board.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.
7956-14.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the reappointment of Jack Shea, to serve as a member of the Allegheny County Sanitary Authority, for a term to expire on December 31st, 2018. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Jan?

MS. REA: Yes. The Appointment Review Committee met and interviewed Mr. Shea for a reappointment to the

Allegheny County Sanitary Authority. And I'd like to make a motion to appoint Mr. Shea.

(Chorus of seconds.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks?

MS. MEANS: I'd like to make a remark.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MS. MEANS: I was present when we interviewed Jack Shea. He seems like a really nice person. He does a good job, but his title is President of the Allegheny County Labor Union, and that's intimidating. I just think that that title alone makes it hard for him not to have a conflict of interest, seeing as --- that there are union employees working at ALCOSAN. So for that reason, I'm going to vote no.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Seeing no other remarks --- I guess you can take a ---.

MR. CATANESE: A roll call.?

MS. REA: Roll call.

MR. CATANESE: This is on 7956-14. Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: I'll abstain.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Danko?

MS. DANKO: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?

MS. REA: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 12, noes, 2, with 1
abstention. Mr. Shea is confirmed.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 7957-14.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the reappointment of
David Minnotte, to serve as a member of the Allegheny
County Airport Authority, for a term to expire on December
31st, 2018. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Jan?

MS. REA: Yes. The Appointment Review Committee
met and interviewed Mr. Minnotte to serve as a member ---
a reappointment to the Allegheny County Airport Authority.
And I'd like to make a motion to nominate Mr. Minnotte.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none,
all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.
Okay. Committee on Budget and Finance, Second Reading.
7958-14.

MR. CATANESE: A resolution amending the New
Home Construction/Improvement Program Resolution, enacted
May 23rd, 1996, by the Board of Commissioners of Allegheny
County at Agenda Number 700-96, subsequently amended by
Resolutions Number 22-00, 6-01, 61-02, 04-04-RE, 49-05-RE,
07-08-RE and 25-09-RE, by providing for the continuation
of the Allegheny County New Home Construction/Improvement
Exemption Program. Sponsored by Council members Martoni,
Kress and Macey.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Mike, do you want to ---?

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you, Mr. President. This
was released by the committee. Five members were there
out of the nine, and it was amended. And I'd move for
approval.

MS. MEANS: I would like to amend the bill.

MR. FINNERTY: Wait. We have to have a second,
I believe.

MS. REA: I'll second that.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That's okay.

MR. FINNERTY: I'd like to speak to the bill.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MR. FINNERTY: Thanks. What the bill does is it
takes the tax abatement, which was --- say we're talking

about a \$300,000 house, and that tax abatement for the first year would be \$1,419. It takes that tax abatement and cuts it in half, so the tax abatement for the first year would be \$710, roughly, and for the second year it would be \$710. So there would be a two-year abatement still but half of the amount. If it was a \$100,000 house, the county taxes on a \$100,000 house --- and I'm talking about just the house --- you could have --- they could have paid \$180,000 for it or \$170,000, counting the lot, but we're just talking about a house --- is \$473. That's the abatement from the county right now per year. It would take that and slice that in half, also, so it would be \$237 for the first year, roughly, and \$237 for the second year. So that's what the amendment does. It takes the abatement and slices the amount of the abatement in half for two years. I think if we look at this, that that's still a generous amount of money that's being abated, considering that no one else in Allegheny County has an abatement program, all the municipalities, except Pittsburgh. So that's what we're looking at. It's still a 50 percent abatement, which I believe is a generous amount. And like I said, I'd move for approval.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Sue?

MS. MEANS: Can I have my amendment introduced and passed out to people?

MR. FINNERTY: Sure, you can.

MS. MEANS: May I speak to my amendment, please?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.

MS. MEANS: Is my microphone on? No. Okay.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We need a ---.

MS. MEANS: I just wanted to speak ---

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Get her amendment.

MS. MEANS: --- to my amendment, which is to restore --- thank you, which is to restore the abatement to 100 percent for two years. I think that we --- that we're being --- we need to be farsighted. We need to think this through carefully. I do regret that this is on a fast track, that we did not consider this in the fall, that it's expired. And it's sad that the Home Building Association people, most of them are at their national convention, so they're not here to speak on this issue. But to look at the big issue, is we want people to build homes in Allegheny County. If we have people build homes in Allegheny County, we increase our --- what --- the money, the revenues that we bring in.

And I think that this looks like a quick fix. We're going to save \$1 million if we cut the abatement in half. Last year, 1,700 people applied for this abatement. It's a quick fix, whereas we're exchanging it for, in the long run, that people will come and live here for 40, 50 --- forever, and increase our tax revenues. We all know business owners, new home owners and contractors. And the issue here is the big picture. In the end, we will lose more than we gained by removing the tax incentive. The county and each individual municipality gains when new homes are built. A two-year full tax abatement encourages builders --- home owners to build here, here in Allegheny County, versus Butler or Washington County, an increase in the tax base for 40 years and beyond. And if a builder --- if a person builds in Jefferson Hills, that helps Pleasant Hills because those people are in the same school district. So that increases --- like if a hundred homes are built in Jefferson, then that helps defer raising school taxes in the future for that school district. Taxes are high in Allegheny County. Fitzgerald even campaigned on this, that they are too high.

And this, as one of the gentleman mentioned, puts us on an even field. The tax --- the home building industry and the remodeling industry drives our economy. If you notice --- I read that a new home owner puts \$25,000 in their new home. They put furnishings, carpeting, and they put drapes. The second year they put an average of \$15,000 into their new home. So they're investing in our community. They're helping the man that sells the carpeting, the man that puts trees in his yard; I mean ---. And then I did the math. \$25,000 times 1,700 people is \$42 million. \$15,000 times --- I'm sorry, 1,700 people is \$25 and a half million.

Tax --- and this has been a tax incentive since 1996. I don't know how many letters you all received. I received phone calls, and I received six letters. Out of my three --- six letters, I received three from contractors who said yes, that they include this as part of the package when they're selling a house. I also received from a new home owner in Collier Township --- to say when he went to secure his loan and how much this new property was going to cost him, he was told how much it's going to cost him. But now he's not going to get this tax abatement, so it's going to cost him more, that --- he

wasn't counting on that. I just feel bad for the people. Nobody saw this coming. One of the builders who used this as an incentive to sell two houses and bought the house himself, made a phone call downtown to find out about the tax abatement and to find the details out.

And no one told him that it was going to expire. And of course, they wouldn't, because it's been around since 1996. Nobody saw this coming. One last point is, nobody can predict the future. I believe the county will benefit by giving this tax --- this tax abatement as an incentive. It will increase our tax base, and we will reap the benefit of the ripple effect. I thank you for your consideration.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Bill?

MR. ROBINSON: Thank you, Mr. President, and members of Council. I'm going to support the gentle lady in her efforts to maintain the status quo, so that we might have an intelligent and informed discussion around our abatement program. Contrary to what the lady has said, I saw this coming. I saw this coming five years ago, and I shared with my colleagues --- some of you were not here --- my concern that our abatement programs were costing us close to \$70 million a year during a time when the revenue, additional revenue, was an important issue for this Council. I think the gentle lady's concerns about the loss of revenue under the proposal before us is a valid one, and that it is time for us to consider all those programs in light of the continuing need for this county to develop new revenue sources, not find ways to reduce our revenue.

Any adjustment in the program, as proposed, is going to reduce the possibility of us maximizing revenues through real estate. While I think the gentle lady did not have the benefit of the work of the Budget and Finance Committee on this issue over the last five years, I appreciate her diligence and her concern that perhaps this is not the way to proceed today, because we need a more reasonable and substantive discussion on what the impact is going to be if this Council approves a reduction in the abatement. While on the one hand it's very good politics, it's bad government on the other hand; in the face of a recurring fiscal challenge to reduce our potential to raise additional revenue, I don't believe is the right approach.

When our previous budget director and I worked on this issue, she was patient enough and diligent enough to help me develop some scenarios, which included budget scenarios, an elimination of all of our abatement programs and reductions. In the face of that, we had to consider, how does the county pay its bills? I have said over the last couple years, I believe we need an additional \$50 million to make ourselves whole. I still believe that. I have not been able to convince enough of my colleagues that I am correct; so be it. But I think Ms. Means is on to something, and I'm willing to support her, so that we might slow ourselves down a little bit and look at the program as it's presently constituted. The fact that it was allowed to expire is nobody's fault, but I think the administration has indicated over the last two budget cycles, that this is not necessarily a priority for them, and they have conveniently left it to this Council to struggle with this issue. I find that interesting. All other fiscal issues in this county have been addressed by the administration, even in the face of several members of this Council, mainly myself, telling them to mind their own business. Now they're telling us it's our business what we would like to do with this legislation. I find that interesting. The chief of operations, as I will call her, for the Fitzgerald administration, is our former budget director, the person who helped me develop the budget scenarios which I've shared with every member of this Council, yet this administration has not weighed in on this. It's like dumping it on us.

I think Ms. Means is absolutely correct. Just leave it where it is, and let's spend a little bit of time trying to figure out how these abatement programs fit into the overall budgeting for the County of Allegheny. Thank you, Mr. President, and members of Council.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Heather?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Thank you, Mr. President. So as I understand it now as a recap, especially for those viewers, this bill --- this law has completely lapsed. And so because it doesn't exist, it is projected that the county will obtain approximately \$2 million of additional revenue. So then what's happened is there's been this measure introduced, what we're debating today, to reinstitute the measure, but at 50 percent, so that we would only be losing about a million. So my question is --- we really have two choices here. We could

introduce --- introduce a measure, as Ms. Means is suggesting, that would put us back to where we were before, so we would be losing about \$2 million; or we can introduce --- we could pass what Mr. Finnerty is suggesting, and we would lose about a million dollars of revenue.

So the question I have is for Mr. McKain. Mr. McKain, do I understand correctly that we're expected to have a shortfall? I heard about \$8 million that we're off on the budget; is that correct?

MR. MCKAIN: We have an adopted budget for this year. But the \$8 million, I'm not sure what you're referring to. We have an adopted balanced budget for this year.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Right. Do you have any information that we're going to have a shortfall?

MR. MCKAIN: Oh, no. For 2014, no.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: So there would be no reason then, from the administration's viewpoint, to not re-up this completely?

MR. MCKAIN: We have not weighed in on this. This is a County Council initiative. The budget did not take into effect any of the actions that are presented in front of you today, either to completely do it or in half.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: So if we --- if we go with Ms. Means, we go back to where we were, and we'd have about \$2 million less in county tax revenue. That is not going to impact this coming budget?

MR. MCKAIN: No. We have a balanced budget did not --- that did not contemplate this legislation.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: So again, what I said, if we pass Ms. Means' proposal, it's not going to affect this budget at all; is that right?

MR. MCKAIN: Uh-huh (yes). Right.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Okay. And last question.

MR. MCKAIN: Okay.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Is there ---? To your knowledge, will you be coming to us, what you know now, and asking us to reduce expenditures, to increase revenues? Is there anything that you know now that we should know when we're taking into --- the policy question into consideration?

MR. MCKAIN: No, we ---. The answer would be no, not at this time. I always say, though, we put a

balanced budget together that was approved by Council. During the course of any year, things happen ---

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Of course.

MR. MCKAIN: --- revenues up or down or expenditures. But no, we're just in the second month of our fiscal year. So to answer your question, I have no additional information except we have a solid balanced budget.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Thank you, Mr. McKain.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Amanda?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Thank you, Mr. President.

And I thank my Council colleague, Councilwoman Means, for bringing her proposed amendment to our attention. I found her to be very --- very thoughtful and very thorough in that presentation, and I thank you for that. And while I do understand reasons for the bill in its present form before the --- before being amended, I'm also concerned about the impact that this may have on workers, workers who help to build a lot of the homes that the speakers, Jeff Martin and Dion McMullen, were speaking about. In my district, I have many members --- many members of my district who are electricians, who work on excavation, who work on various forms of construction work and building all kinds of homes within the county.

And I would --- I am concerned about the impact that this may have on jobs within our county as a whole, but particularly members of my district who I see and say hello to every day, who go off to work on various projects in the county at 6:00 in the morning, 7:00 in the morning, whatever. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Jimmy?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Yeah. I have a totally different take on this. You know, we struggle up here to keep our property taxes down. This is the second oldest population in the United States. I'm concerned about the thousands of senior citizens who come to me with their taxes, that they can barely afford to live in their homes, let alone build a new home. I'm more concerned about --- because, you know, maybe the County Executive's Office was able to pass the budget, but we had to raise the family park fees for somebody to be able to take their kids to go to the pools. To me, \$2 million is a lot of money, whether it's spent now or not.

That being said, I'm --- anybody that knows what's going on out there, it makes good sense to me to

roll the dice. And this is why I say that. I had a friend of mine who came up here from Arizona last week and had to rent a hotel room in Ohio because there's nowhere to rent anything in this county. This county is filled with drillers; it's filled with development people. You can't even rent anything. And I'll guarantee you, if you --- that those people will still build those homes because the jobs are going to be here. And they'll still build them homes because --- you know, Washington County just raised their taxes. Butler County just raised their taxes. Everybody's going to catch up. And more importantly, if anybody is not looking at the new Transportation Act and what it's going to do to the gasoline tax, I'll guarantee you, if you don't want to pay another couple hundred dollars to build a half a million dollar home, then spend another \$5,000 to drive from the airport on the parkway, from out on the county line to downtown Pittsburgh at \$5.50 a gallon. So although I appreciate everybody's diligence, and I know everybody has everybody's good interests at heart, I have to agree that this is a good measure, just for the simple fact that --- you know, getting any money in the county coffers. Now there's this little --- and you know what? Anybody that knows the way I am, I'm not going to play this little game of whose fault it is.

You know, the Chief Executive's Office don't want to weigh in, and we don't want to weigh in. I don't care whose fault it is. My district is built up. The people in my district need the jobs. You know, if you want a home, come into the city, come into Green Tree, come into Dormont and rebuild a house at half the price. And you'll be able to save \$3 a gallon. So I agree with this. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Mike?

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you, Mr. President. I'd just like to go back and look at a couple things that have been said here. Number one, a \$50 million shortfall, that's baloney. That's not true. It's somebody's opinion is all it is, and we haven't had that problem. I'd like to have an extra \$100 million. That would be great. But let's be reasonable and let's forget opinions and let's talk about facts. Number one, we're talking about --- this \$2 million is 2013. It's actually \$2,091,450 is what it is. That was an abatement that was given to 1,699 homes. If we're talking about half of that, we're talking

about \$1,045,000, roughly, that the county will have, that they don't have. And the abatement will be lost for the homeowner, that amount.

That's what we're talking about. That was 2013; 2014 --- and you have these numbers right in front of you. I don't know why people can't talk about the facts when they're in front of you. It talks about 2014, and 2014 is a partial, is all it is. So if you look at it, you'll see that it's saying it's probably going to be about 1,144 homes, partial, and it's going to be \$1,402,736. That's partial, all right, in 2014. That's what we're talking about. And Councilwoman Means did a tremendous job, but we're saying that people want to build in Allegheny County. They want to be here. I represent Collier Township. I represent South Fayette. I did represent Findlay and North Fayette, but reapportionment took care of that. Now we're talking about a tremendous build area. We're building out there. It's like --- like mushrooms coming up after a rain out there. You go down the road and all of a sudden, where did all these houses come from? People are going to still build, and I don't want to be sitting up here saying to myself that --- well, you know, they're not going to build because we took --- this guy that's going to build a \$300,000 house, we took \$726 off of. I don't think so. That isn't going to happen.

He's still going to build that house. People build a half a million dollar house. They're still going to build this house, even if we take \$800 off of them. These are just sensible things that happen. Now we can go on and on and on about --- maybe there wasn't enough time in committee. We had five committee people there. We talked about it. It was released unanimously.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No, it was not.

MR. FINNERTY: Who didn't; you? What was it? Okay. One person voted against it.

MS. MEANS: I voted against it.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All right. Okay. Mike has the floor. Let's go.

MR. FINNERTY: Okay. Another thing, this is my compromise. It's my compromise. People approached me --- and people in built-up areas --- and said, you know, we don't want to give this abatement anymore. We want to take it away. I said, I don't want to take it away. I'll compromise and go halfway with you and see what we can do. And that's where I am. I'm getting a compromise here, so

that we don't have to take it all the way, because there's a number of people up here that do want to do that. We're talking about people that have built-up areas. And part of my district is built up. Scott Township --- you're not going to find too many lots in Scott Township. Thornburg, you're not going to find a whole lot of lots there, either.

All right? So you could go and look at this and say, hey, you know, how about these people? How about these people that are paying somebody else's way because you're giving them an abatement. Let's take a look at it that way and say like Jimmy said, Councilman Ellenbogen. Look at it that way. What are you doing? You live in the city. There's not a whole lot of lots there in the city to build on, but we're giving --- we're giving up tax money for that. It's not a whole lot of money; it's not a whole lot. According to 2013, if we look at it, I said it's a million --- about \$1,045,000, that the county --- excuse me, will gain, all right, and the homeowner will lose. We're talking, again, about an area ---. If we take a look at Allegheny County --- excuse me, and say to ourselves, you know, Allegheny County, you know, all around us --- Beaver, because Beaver is on my radar because it's right there, Raccoon State Park, et cetera, out that way. They raised their taxes 22 percent.

Butler raised their taxes. They raised them a lot, and they're going to have to do it more often, just like Peters Township, down that way, in Washington, because they're going to have to put the infrastructure in. And they're going to have to build schools, because more people are going there. But at the same time, this is, like, the first time, I believe, that we saw an increase in the population in Allegheny County for a long time. We have an increase in population. It's a good place to live. It's a good place to raise your family. So that's what I'm looking at. I'm looking at that and saying, you know, let's think about this before we jump to opinions about things.

You know, let's look at it another way --- and this is one of the things that troubles me about this --- that if we pass this --- and I'm giving you both sides of the story. If we pass this, this is going to affect a change for some people that already have an abatement that's carried over into 2014, because their abatement is not going to be full anymore. It's going to be half. And

I think that's important to know, and I'll tell you how many people it's going to affect, 978 homes. I mean, this is what you have to look at, too. This is not an easy thing at all. In 2014, it might affect 303, but these are people that have got the abatement. So that's what we're talking about. Now that's a big decision that you have to make. And I think it's important that you sit there and think about it, and I could give you blarney forever.

But the thing of it is, that I just want to talk facts and say, like, this is what we're looking at. It's only another \$1,045,000, is what it is. If the vote says no, that's fine. If the vote says yes, that's fine, also, because I think, either way. But you have to start thinking, and it's important to think. As Councilman Robinson mentioned, he said we need more revenue, but he wasn't wanting to do this. You know, this is something that you have to take a look at. You have to take a look at all abatement programs, all abatement programs. The Homestead, that's \$27 million to \$30 million a year in the Homestead. So you know, if we're going to look at them all, let's look at them all. Don't single anything out, because we have a number of abatement programs; about seven, I believe. And I could name them for you, but I'm not going to. I think I've said enough, and I think you know how I feel about it. And I just think it's important that we all consider all angles here, and we work with facts, not some kind of fiction. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Heather's next, then Jimmy.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I represent the entire county, so therefore I represent the perimeter. When we were in the Budget and Finance Committee, I talked about tax policy. There's two reasons to tax; one, to gain revenue, two, to influence human behavior. So I was on the fence about this, because I didn't know whether the exemption would influence human behavior. But one of the reasons why agenda topics and the public speaking are important is because Mr. McMullen convinced me that this was a convincer of human behavior. And here was the fact that he laid out. He said that at the perimeter, if you're going to buy a house in Allegheny County versus Butler County, Beaver County, Washington County, you may well move over the border into Allegheny County because of the abatement. So I'm going to be a yes for Ms. Means.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Jan?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Hey, John, you forgot me.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No. Okay. Okay.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: But I'll defer to Jan.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I'm sorry. Jan?

MS. REA: Thank you, Mr. President. I was in that committee, and Mr. Finnerty did an excellent job presenting to us the changing the abatement and cutting it in half. And today I met with him again, and he explained a lot of facts to me. But in the interim, I live in the North Hills and we border, you know, Butler County. And I did have a lot of contractors contact me that are very concerned about it. And I do look at it as --- it's a business, and I think it inevitably does hurt their business. And in hurting their business, it's not only one person or one contractor, it trickles down to the effect that --- Ms. Means has said about purchasing things in Allegheny County, which Ms. Green has said about going to work and using people who do work in Allegheny County. And the contractors that contacted me, you know, I think they had their facts in order, too. So because of that, in committee I did support this, but tonight I am going to support the amendment. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Next, we have Jim, and then Sue and then ---.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Again, you know, to my colleagues, I appreciate your argument. I think you guys did a --- I mean, you did a very solid job in your argument and in your research. However, I have to tell you, I've looked at a lot of these new houses out in the county. Really? What's the guy in the commercial say, really? I'm going to build a house like this, and for a few hundred bucks, I'm just going to build it? I'm sorry. I don't buy that. As far as the worker argument --- you know, I'm a strong union guy. I have no bones about that. I'm not --- if I really believed that this was going to affect the union working force, I would have heard from the laborers' union. I would have heard from the construction union. I would have heard from the carpenters' union. I've not heard from one building trades union about reducing this, so that tells me, you know, does this really affect a lot of union jobs, period?

So there's that. Councilman Finnerty said something that probably sticks in my mind more than anything, because I'm not going to lie to you. If I had my druthers, I would eliminate it, period. But in the

interest of compromise, I'm willing to go halfway and vote for 50 percent. But what Councilman Finnerty said is the most important thing. Is it fair for some senior citizen who's cutting her medicine in half, that pays her county taxes, or some poor guy that can't afford to take his car to the mechanic, that's laying out in the street with a jack up, who's trying to change the muffler because he don't have the money, to pay for somebody else to build a home? And that's the biggest crux that I can't get over, is the fact that poor working middle-class people in this city and in this county who are struggling, have to pay for somebody that has the luxury of being able to build a home. And I'm sorry. That, in itself, makes me have to vote for this bill. So thank you for your diligence and for your hearing my big mouth.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Nick Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Oh, do I get a turn?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah, you do now.

MR. FUTULES: All right. Thanks. I get a turn.

MR. FINNERTY: That was a mistake.

MR. FUTULES: Yeah, it was a mistake. Thanks a lot. Well, listening to everybody --- you know, everybody does have a great voice. And the part that I --- in my own opinion, I look at, I think it was a crime that when we enacted this back in or around 2005, other municipalities or school districts didn't jump on board and come up with an abatement to go along with ours. We seem to be the only one that did it, except for some exception of Pittsburgh or ---.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Except for Pittsburgh.

MR. FUTULES: Except for Pittsburgh. But when Mr. Robinson brought up a point that, you know, we should be looking into it. And this would be a good year for us to look into that, to see if by taking it to a half dozen pack without eliminating it --- that's a good point. And while we're talking about taking away, the fact is, we're still giving. We're just not giving as much as we did. You know, if you ever gave to an organization like the American Cancer Society, if you give them \$1,000 every year but this year you can only give \$500, the fact is, you still gave. The fact is, you just didn't give as much as you could. So this may be a year for us to help increase our fund balance, because that's exactly what it will do. And it will give us an opportunity to take a look at all those scenarios of money being spent in the

county, so that we'll have another year --- possibility of next year we can reenact it or raise it again.

So this is an opportunity for us to let this be an eye opener and say, let's see what happens if we would go to half. So just for that respect, I think it will be a good conversation for this year coming, for us to keep an eye on that, so ---. But I do support dropping it to half, and thank you for your time.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Sue, did you have something to say?

MS. MEANS: Yes. I wanted to answer some of the comments and point out some things. The average home cost, a new home, is \$240,000; is that right?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: \$204,000.

MS. MEANS: Sorry?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: \$204,000.

MS. MEANS: \$204,000; so we're not talking about half a million. It does really help the senior citizens. It does help the senior citizens when more people buy property in the county, because we increase our tax base. And as Mr. McMullen --- I believe he said, whenever they take the farm and take a lot that's only worth \$7,000 and now they're going to build a house on it, the lot now went to --- what did you say, sir, \$120,000; is that what you said?

MR. MCMULLEN: The average lot I build on, yes.

MS. MEANS: Yes. So now they are giving, because now --- the lot was worth \$7,000. Now they're paying taxes on \$120,000. And the bottom line, nobody really knows why somebody buys a house where they buy it. I mean, there are so many factors to factor in. But the bottom line is the cost of the house. And if a house is going to --- you know, if the mortgage is going to be \$120 more dollars a year, and if I move because I have to pay the full taxes --- maybe I'm going to move two miles down the road to Washington County because I'm going to get a bigger house. I mean, I live in Bethel Park. I live on the edge of Washington County.

My cousins, my father, they all moved to Washington County, and I never hear anybody say, I'm going to build in Allegheny County. I always hear people say, I'm escaping. I'm going to go where taxes are lower. And that is what's happening. Our taxes are too high, and this levels the playing field. So I thank you again for your time and allowing me to speak.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Wait. Let me get ---.

MR. FINNERTY: Oh, go ahead. Jimmy ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: She hasn't spoken. Go ahead.

MS. DANKO: Yes. I'm having a hard time with this because I have an economics background and I --- you know, I'm hearing both sides. But I think one of the things we haven't looked at specifically --- and it sort of goes to what Sue just said --- is you know, in the short run, yeah, we're getting that extra revenue; and if we get it from the people that are building the houses, then we don't have to get it from people of low moderate income. But if we don't build, or if the \$300,000 homes don't get built --- I'm trying to think of the clean way to say this but whatever --- we're screwing ourselves in the long run, and that --- because in a couple of years, that extra money will be coming in that would not come in if those houses were not built. I think that my inclination is to support the Means amendment, but I do think we need to look across the board at all the abatements that we're giving. And maybe we do that in the course of the next budget season. Thank you.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Amanda?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Thank you, Mr. President. I just want to be clear --- maybe clarify something for my own purposes. And when I mentioned workers, I'm not necessarily talking just about labor --- organized labor, I'm talking about all workers. And while someone may not have heard from organized labor, there are plenty of workers who aren't in organized labor, who we also need to be concerned about. And my thing is, like, let them keep working but also join the union. That would be great, from my perspective. And I do know plenty of people who live outside Allegheny County, and it does have to do with a couple of hundred dollars in taxes. I will say that personally, I know people who have told me, personally, that they have moved --- decided to move outside of Allegheny County, decided to build outside of Allegheny County, to look outside of Allegheny County, because of a couple hundred dollars for taxes. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Wait a minute. Wait, Mike. I think it was Bob Macey.

MR. MACEY: Okay. Yeah, whatever. Thank you, Mr. President, and members of Council. As we saw in the

newspapers today, the assessments seem to be a little out of whack. And it seemed that the affluent were getting the distinct advantage in their assessments, while the less affluent was not getting that advantage. In fact, their homes were being assessed higher than what they're being sold for. In addition to that, we hear about taxes, taxes in Allegheny County. Well, ladies and gentlemen, take a look at your taxes. Take a look at your township taxes. Take a look at your borough taxes. Take a look at your school taxes and your county taxes. Your lowest taxes is your county tax. Now it doesn't seem to me that we're --- people are shying away from building in Allegheny County. You know, a shining example is, you know, Summerset at Frick. I mean, that's a huge complex and nobody's afraid to be building there. In fact, I understand they're having quite a time filling in those houses and those condos. If you want to find some vacant lots, or you're interested in building, come on down to the Mon Valley. We have a lot of vacant lots down there. But it seems to me, nobody has wrote me a letter. I have two letters, as a matter of fact, I must say, two letters that said we should not support this.

But I didn't have anybody call me or tell me that I shouldn't support this. People in my neck of the woods would like to have a fair playing field. And I think a fair playing field is by treating people equal. And if the affluent and the people with the \$200,000, \$300,000 homes are getting the benefits, where's the benefits for those people in other communities, the less affluent communities? You know, I'd like to --- and these people, they're paying their taxes on a regular basis, but they're not getting any incentives to add on to their homes, to rebuild their homes, to refurbish their homes.

So I support this. I think it's fair. We're still encouraging people to build in Allegheny County by virtue of giving them a tax abatement for two years. So please stop down to the Mon Valley or in our area. We have plenty of vacant lots. We'd love to see you build down there. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Amanda?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Call the question.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No, wait. Whoa, whoa.

We're going to vote but let him ---.

MR. KRESS: Thank you, Mr. President. I just want to say about this bill, I support the Means

amendment. Of course, I would also support the Finnerty amendment, too. However, we're looking at --- we're talking about --- we're going to lose revenue, but we're actually not even looking at the real reason that this --- first of all, this is --- we're giving the homeowner a break. Okay? But how much do we give in TIFs to large corporations? This is for the individual in support of a small business. So I don't see why we can't do this. I mean, we do everything for the big corporations, and I'm just saying this is something for the individual. And that's the reason why I'm supporting it. And of course, you're looking at new tax revenues. Maybe you should start looking at some of the non-profits. But again, I'm very supportive of this. Again, it's for the individual homeowner. Anything that we can do to help individual homeowners purchase homes and also support small business, I'm for it. So thank you very much.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Mike?

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you, Mr. President. I'd just like to clarify one thing. People talked about people moving out of the county because of the high taxes. They're moving out of the county because of high school taxes. Mt. Lebanon, Upper St. Clair, Bethel Park, real high school taxes; Chartiers Valley, one of the low areas for school tax; that's Scott Township, Collier, Heidelberg. So that's what you're looking at. When it comes down to it, you're looking at --- the big tax is in schools. You look, see what's going on. See the beautiful school that Upper St. Clair has, the beautiful school that Mt. Lebanon --- they just remodeled the whole thing. These --- there was a tremendous fight there, because they raised the taxes pretty high.

And that is what we're talking about when we talk about high taxes. It's not the county, and it's not the municipality --- and I taught school for 30 years --- it's the school district. And that is one of the reasons people are leaving, and it's going to catch up to them anyhow, because they're going to Peters Township, Washington County. Peters Township has got to build another school because a lot of people moved there. It's going --- their school tax is going to go up. When these people move, they bring their children with them, and that increases the population, the same way going up to Butler, Seneca all those places up there. There's tremendous

school districts up there. The population is real high, and the school district tax is going up.

So I just wanted to make sure you think of that, also, because that's something that comes into play for a lot of people, especially; especially people once their children get through the school system. In Allegheny County, we have great school systems. They cost a lot of money; Mt. Lebanon, Upper St. Clair and Chartiers Valley, Bethel Park, great school systems. But they cost money. And once their children get through the school, a lot of people move. They move to find lower taxes, and it's not because of the county tax. And that's what you hear all the time. I don't have any kids in school. Why am I paying school tax? Because it keeps your property up, is what it does. But that's something to think about, also. Thank you.

DR. MARTONI: John, I'd like to call the question and vote.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Well, okay. We have to go with the amendment. Was there a second to the amendment?

MR. ROBINSON: Second.

MS. REA: Yes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All right. Let's vote on the amendment.

MR. CATANESE: We're voting on the bill, as amended.

(Discussion among Council members.)

MR. CATANESE: This is a vote on the amendment.

MR. FINNERTY: We're going to vote on Ms. Means' amendment.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah. Explain that to everybody.

MR. CATANESE: This is a vote on Ms. Means' amendment.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Explain what that is, could you?

MR. CATANESE: And if that passes, then we'll vote and we will amend the bill.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: She wants to keep it at 100 percent.

MR. FINNERTY: Right.

MR. CATANESE: She wants to keep the bill at 100 percent. That's what we're voting for, keeping the bill at 100 percent.

MR. FINNERTY: Okay. Sounds good.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All right. Go ahead.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?
MR. BAKER: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Danko?
MS. DANKO: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?
MR. ELLENBOGEN: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?
MR. FINNERTY: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?
MR. FUTULES: No.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?
MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?
MR. KRESS: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?
DR. MARTONI: No.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?
MS. MEANS: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE: No.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?
MS. REA: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 8, noes, 7 (sic). The bill
passes.

MR. BAKER: As amended. The amendment passes.

MR. CATANESE: I'm sorry. The amendment passes.

Excuse me.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: What was it, Joe?

MR. CATANESE: 8-7.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: You voted yes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I voted no.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: You voted yes.

MR. CATANESE: He voted no.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: He voted yes.

(Discussion among Council members.)

MR. CATANESE: 8-7; it passed. The amendment passed, 8-7.

MR. BAKER: But Mr. DeFazio said yes; right?

MR. CATANESE: No. He said no.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I said no.

(Discussion among Council members.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: It doesn't matter. The amendment passed, 8 to 7. That's 15.

MR. FINNERTY: Now we need a motion to vote on the bill as amended.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Right.

MR. FINNERTY: Anybody want to make that motion?

MS. DANKO: I'll make the motion.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Second.

MR. FINNERTY: Can we have a vote?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

MR. FINNERTY: We didn't discuss it.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Do you have any questions?

MR. FINNERTY: No, I don't. Let's vote.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any questions?

MR. CATANESE: We're voting on the bill as amended. Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Danko?

MS. DANKO: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?
MS. REA: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No; 8-7.

MR. CATANESE: Yeses are 8, noes are 7. The bill passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. We just went through, is it 7980-58?

MR. CATANESE: We're on 7959-14.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

MR. CATANESE: A resolution amending the New Home Construction/Improvement Program Resolution, enacted May 23rd, 1996, by the Board of Commissioners of Allegheny County, at Agenda Number 700-96, subsequently amended by Resolution Numbers 22-00, 6-01, 61-02, 04-04-RE, 49-05-RE, 07-08-RE, 25-09-RE and 30-11-RE. Sponsored by Council members Kress and Macey.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Mike, do you want to speak on this?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes. This bill was amended in committee, and the amendment has increased the --- excuse me for one second --- has increased the abatement from 36,000 to 66,000, so that we're looking at --- this is Act 42. And Act 42 talks about --- for those people that don't know, I'll just say it talks about remodeling or putting an addition on your house. If you look at the statistics that were given out by Walt, if you look at --- in relation to 202, and also, if we're looking at 2013, you'll see that for Act 42, home improvement, county, that there was only 11 people that applied for this, and all 11 got it. And then only --- this abatement only cost the county \$1,011.

Now one of the things, at least with --- and I'll tell you what my purpose is, straight up. One of the things I'd like to do is increase this so that more people will take advantage of it and talk about places that have --- that have been built up, that don't have new construction; that if we increase it to \$66,000, the abatement still would only be \$312.18 for that amount of money. So that's what we're looking at. Probably the reason why we only have 11 houses that applied for it is because a lot of people that do home improvements don't

get the building permit, and you have to get the building permit.

And we usually don't catch them. It ends up that their neighbor gets aggravated because they look at their assessment, and this guy put an addition on and his is the same, and they call and say, hey, they have an addition on their house. How come it's \$150,000 and mine is \$150,000? His should be more. That's how they end up getting caught --- or a reassessment, one or the other. So that's the reason it's only 11, probably, and I say probably because I don't know for sure. But I've seen it happen in my own neighborhood. So this is my thinking about this bill. Thank you. And I make a motion to approve.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, we'll take the vote.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Danko?

MS. DANKO: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?

MS. REA: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 15, noes, 0. The bill passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 7961-14.

MR. CATANESE: A resolution of the County of Allegheny, amending the Grants and Special Accounts Budget for 2014 (Submission 1-14). Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Mike?

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you, Mr. President. I'd like to make a motion to approve.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, we'll take the vote.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Danko?

MS. DANKO: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?

MS. REA: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 15, noes, 0. The bill passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Committee on Public Works, Second Reading. 7977-14.

MR. CATANESE: An ordinance amending Ordinance Number 41-OR --- 41-09-OR, enacted November 17, 2009, approving the sale of certain real property owned by the County of Allegheny, Pennsylvania, known as 3333 Forbes Avenue, and identified as Block and Lot 28-J-97, to an ownership/development group, for the sale price of \$4,900,000, for the purpose of restating the composition of the ownership group and the scope of the proposed development on the property. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Bob?

MR. MACEY: Yeah. Thank you, Mr. President, and members of Council. The Public Works Committee met on January 23rd and discussed the situation at great length, and they decided that, affirmatively, they would recommend this to the full Council. Therefore, I make a motion to accept 7977-14.

DR. MARTONI: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, --- oh.

MS. MEANS: I'd like to --- I'm sorry. May I ask a couple questions? Is this the time?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.

MS. MEANS: Is there anyone here that represents the buyers, the builders?

MR. WILSON: Yes.

MS. MEANS: Could they come and --- hi, how are you?

MR. WILSON: Good. How're you doing?

MS. MEANS: Good, good. Could you come to the microphone so we can ask you some questions? Is that okay?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: If she has a question ---.

MS. MEANS: I'm not allowed to do that?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I don't know.

MS. MEANS: I'm sorry.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: You'll have to ask the president.

MS. MEANS: I'm sorry, Mr. President.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No, that's okay. You can come up. You're supposed to ask me, and I'll say yeah.

MS. MEANS: I'm sorry, Mr. President.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I'm sorry, Sue. I've been sitting here too long next ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We let the first one go by, we'll cut you on the second one.

MS. MEANS: Okay.

MR. WILSON: Hi. I'm Gary Wilson with Langholz, Wilson, Ellis.

MS. MEANS: Hi. I just wanted to ask, can you address the fact that the property was worth approximately the same amount of money, like, \$4.9 million, five years ago, and that we're selling it for the same price now?

MR. WILSON: Yes. There was a slight recession in those five years, and it just got back up to a value. You folks had it re-appraised, and it came back the same number. I didn't value that, your appraiser did.

MS. MEANS: Okay. I don't know if you can ask this question, but --- answer this question or not, but is it unusual for us to make an agreement to sell a property to one set of owners, and that they change horses in the middle of the stream ---

MR. WILSON: No.

MS. MEANS: --- and then also leave it kind of open? You know, I see the agreement says that you can have others join in as partners later on, so at this stage, we don't know who all the buyers are. Is that unusual?

MR. WILSON: No, it's not unusual at all on a development of this size.

MS. MEANS: Okay.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We're going to --- Mr. Davin is going to ---.

MR. WILSON: And the original partner are --- just one dropped out.

MS. MEANS: Oh, just one dropped out?

MR. WILSON: Yeah.

MS. MEANS: Who was it?

MR. WILSON: The same partners have been in since '9.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Mr. Davin, do you want to come up?

MR. DAVIN: No.

MR. DEFAZIO: No? At least he's honest.

MR. DAVIN: No, I think Jerry answered. I wanted to make sure that the question was answered. The

partners --- only one of the partners dropped out. So we're restating --- we're asking for a restating of the partnership name.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay?

MS. MEANS: Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFRAZIO: Another question for Davin?

MR. KRESS: No, I just have a question as to appraisal, because the developer just said there was another appraisal done. I have an appraisal from 2008, and I think it was, like, what, \$4.2 million, and there was another appraisal?

MR. DAVIN: No, actually the appraisal for 2008 was, I think, \$2.5 million. It's vacant property, and if the building would have been recapitalized, whatever, I think it's about \$1.8 or \$2,000,000, or something like that.

MR. KRESS: Okay.

MR. DAVIN: Another appraisal was done, actually, in September of 2013, and it was done for the parcel right next to this, which is called --- we call it the notch parcel. You may remember that from --- well, Councilman, I'm not sure that you were here in December when we spoke about that. That parcel was appraised for \$76 per square foot. If you take the \$76 per square foot --- square footage of this parcel right here, it comes out to about \$4.7 million. So it's less, actually, than the value of the property that we're getting right now, \$4.9 million.

MR. KRESS: Okay. So in your opinion, we're getting fair market value for this property?

MR. DAVIN: We're getting --- I hate the fact that he's standing back there, but we think we're getting better than fair market value for that.

MR. KRESS: All right. That's fine. Thank you very much for your comments.

MR. DAVIN: Sure.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Bob Macey --- wait a minute. Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Mr. Davin, while we have the advantage of you standing at the podium, and for all those people that think individuals are running out of Allegheny County because of taxes, is there not a component for housing in this development?

MR. DAVIN: Yes. Yes, there is.

MR. MACEY: Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That's it?
MR. MACEY: Yes, sir.
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Mr. Futules?
MR. FUTULES: Can you state for the record who
dropped out?
MR. DAVIN: Kratsa Development Corporation.
MR. FUTULES: Thank you.
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Seeing no more questions,
we'll take the vote.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?
MR. BAKER: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Danko?
MS. DANKO: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?
MR. ELLENBOGEN: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?
MR. FINNERTY: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?
MR. FUTULES: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?
MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?
MR. KRESS: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?
DR. MARTONI: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?
MS. MEANS: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?
MS. REA: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 14, noes, 1. The bill
passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Liaison Reports? Mr. Macey
first. I seen the hand.

MR. MACEY: Thank you, Mr. President, and
members of Council. I'd just like to remind some

homeowners or those individuals that are --- that have property that are not going to be inhabited by family members or even some of the financial institutions that are foreclosing on homes in some of the less affluent areas, or even anywhere in Allegheny County, that Habitat Humanities --- for Humanity will take these buildings and, with the help of soon-to-be homeowners, will help remodel and rebuild these homes back to livable status. And I've got to commend Habitat for Humanity for taking another approach at making affordable housing for people of modest means. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Jan?

MS. DANKO: Yes. I just wanted to recognize the civil rights attorney and Tuskegee airman, Wendell Freeland, who died on January 24th at the age of 88. Wendell lived in Shadyside, and I knew him. He shared law office space with a couple of good friends of mine, and I've known him a very long time. And he was always the nicest man, most unpretentious, brilliant. And besides having served as a Tuskegee airman, he had a huge civil rights background and influence on this city and this county. My own father served in World War II and was an officer. And after the war was over, he went to the South and he would frequently travel with African-American officers. And because of that, long before I came to Pittsburgh, he used to tell me stories about the discrimination that the colored officers would receive when they would try to go to a hotel or restaurant together. He was frequently told that he could come in but they had to sit in the car. I'd like to say a lot of those officers were people like Wendell Freeland who went on to live a wonderful life and to see things change in our country, change because of people like him. I know that Mr. Robinson is going to do a proclamation in a few weeks in memoriam. But he was a great man and it was a great loss to the City of Pittsburgh and Allegheny County.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Amanda?

MS. GREEN-HAWKINS: Thank you, Mr. President. It looks like great minds think alike because I was also going to mention, you know, it is Black History Month and we did suffer great loss with the loss of our hero here, Wendell Freeland. And I would just want us to not put him in a box of black history, but in American history as a whole because he was truly a great American and made great contributions to our society as a whole. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Yeah. Before I tell you my thing I just want to say in terms of Mr. Freeland, he used to do our inheritance tax hearings for the Department of Revenue. And he was a wonderful gentleman and a great loss to everyone.

The point I want to bring up, and I'm going to ask Chairman Macey to pay close attention to this because we talked about this. We've had city snow agreements. With this storm coming, this is something that's going to be very real. There are a lot of county roads that run through the city and these city snow agreements, the City of Pittsburgh is supposed to do our roads and in return we do the neighborhoods that are near our warehouses. Well, our people do the neighborhoods.

You know, I work for the City and the County and I've had this argument 20 years ago, that the city treats our main roads in the City of Pittsburgh as though they're the side streets in my neighborhood. Now, I'd like to personally thank the Mount Lebanon and Greentree Public Works Departments because I thought that I was in ten feet of snow and I've showed my colleagues down here, McMonagle Road, which has thousands of cars every day, this is the third time. I want to show everybody this picture. Once I cross this ice zone, I got into Mount Lebanon and I didn't know what to expect because I had to go somewhere. Totally clean, the roads. They don't even have a tenth of the equipment that we have. But the boroughs and townships, wonderful.

Now, the reality of the situation is do I have confidence in what's going on in the City Public Works Department right now? Absolutely not. They've whacked all the leaders who were the snow fighters in the last couple weeks. Is that appropriate to say? Probably not, but it is what it is. So what I'm asking is --- last Saturday, I reached out in text messages to the administration that I understand them not getting back to me that night, but I've waited all week to see if anybody would respond to me. Nothing. Nothing, just --- you know what, the high hat, as we say. I would like for us to review the fact that our own people do our own roads. These are not side streets, McMonagle, Becks Run, McNeely, the roads that --- Steuben Street, Potomac. Numerous people come through to go through these from all of our

districts. And they are a nightmare while the boroughs and township roads are clear.

This has been going on for the 20 years that I know about. I don't see any resolution before. And the only resolution to me is to end them. So I would ask you, Mr. Chairman of Public Works --- which I sit on the committee --- to review this and let's put an end to this. Because if they're not going to do our roads, we're doing theirs. And I'm so sick and tired of the dangerous situations, the school buses. Every single snowstorm I have to call the chief of operations of the County Public Works to ask him to go down and check these roads because the city is not living up to their end of it. So with that, I'll ask you to think about it. Let me show you this --- I'm going to walk down and I'm going to show you folks this picture with --- be mindful that the side streets in Mount Lebanon, Dormont and Greentree were all, what we call in snow fighting, wet and running. So you be the judge. Thank you, Mr. President.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Mike?

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you, Mr. President. I'd just like to remind people that Jeremiah Place is a Pittsburgh relief nursery which is out by Kingsley Place, if you know where that is, in East Liberty. Kingsley Place had some extra room so they let Jeremiah's Place use it. This relief nursery is for people that have a problem with their children from one to six. It's actually before one, actually, but the top age is six. And they're going to be able to take in children 24 hours a day that have no place to go so that they don't have to go to our CYS. And for 72 hours they can do that. I think it's a very important place for our people, and I'll give you the address of it if you want to donate some money. It is a nonprofit. It's P.O. Box 11100, Pittsburgh, PA, 15237. The phone number there is (412)444-5863. My eyes were failing me there for a second. That's because I should have taken my glasses off. I can't see with them --- I can't read with them on. But they have a mission statement, they seek to provide a refuge of rest, safety and renewal for children and families, and love them. It's important. It's important for us all. It's important because one of the things that Allegheny County, that we have, we sort of have a high infant mortality rate. And that is something else that we should be looking at, as our County Health Department, and see what

the story is there. Because there's something there. And it's been going on for a number of years. I thank you, Mr. President.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: New Business, Ordinances and Resolutions. 8036-14.

MR. CATANESE: An ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, amending and supplementing the Administrative Code of Allegheny County, Article 307 encompassing the operation of Allegheny County Council through the creation of a new Section 5-307.10 entitled Board Membership on Authorities and Agencies and providing for the requisite membership of Councilmembers on such boards. Sponsored by Councilman Robinson.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That's going to go into Government Reform Committee. Bill, you got anything?

MR. ROBINSON: Thank you, Mr. President, members of Council. No comment at this time.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. 8037-14.

MR. CATANESE: A resolution of the County of Allegheny amending the 2008 Capital Budget for Allegheny County. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That would go to Budget and Finance Committee. 8038-14.

MR. CATANESE: A resolution of the County of Allegheny amending the 2011 Capital Budget for Allegheny County. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That would go to Budget and Finance Committee. 8039-14.

MR. CATANESE: A resolution of the County of Allegheny amending the 2014 Capital Budget for Allegheny County. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That would go in the Budget and Finance Committee. 8040-14.

MR. CATANESE: A resolution of the County of Allegheny amending the Grants and Special Accounts Budget for 2014, Submission 02-14. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. New Business, Motions.

MR. MCKAIN: Do you want to put that in committee?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: What's that?

MR. MCKAIN: Do you want to put that in committee?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Oh, yeah. Sorry. Budget and Finance Committee. New Business, Motions, 8041-14.

MR. CATANESE: A motion endorsing the efforts of the Pittsburgh area non-tenured track faculty, including those classified as part time and those classified as full time to form unions to promote and protect their economic and social interests and enjoins all institutions of higher education in the Pittsburgh area to remove all impediments, legal and otherwise, to forming a productive collective bargaining relationship with any union selected by the majority of the non-tenured track faculty in a bargaining unit and to bargain with the said union in good faith. Sponsored by Councilwoman Green-Hawkins.

MR. ROBINSON: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We're going to put that in the committee, Education Committee. And Amanda, do you want to say anything?

MS. GREEN-HAWKINS: Thank you, Mr. President. I was going to ask that it be sent to committee for a full discussion.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MS. GREEN-HAWKINS: Thank you and thank you also, Mr. Robinson.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 8042-14.

MR. CATANESE: A motion to amend Article IV of the Rules of Council for Allegheny County Council through the creation of a new subsection (b) of Section A.7, Appointments, in order to restrict membership to more than two boards of the authorities or agencies as enumerated within the Code so as to prevent conflicts and ensure the adequate attention to the boards for which members are appointed. Sponsored by Councilman Robinson.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That would go to Government Reform. Bill, do you want to say anything?

MR. ROBINSON: Thank you, Mr. President, members of Council. No comment at this time.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 8043-14.

MR. CATANESE: A motion expressing the Sense of Council of Allegheny County calling for the General Assembly to support Senate Bill 528 or the Regulate Marijuana Act and to enact this proposed legislation or similar legislation which would provide for the personal use of marijuana for lawful operation of marijuana-related facilities and for the regulation of marijuana for

employees, minors and making related appeals. Sponsored by Councilman Robinson.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That would go into the Health and Human Services. Bill, did you want to say anything?

MR. ROBINSON: Thank you, Mr. President, members of Council. I only want to say that I spoke to several members of this Council about this issue. And I sense that they are not ready to opine much less vote. I think it is appropriate to send it to committee so that we can thoroughly review the proposed legislation, taking into consideration if this legislation moves to the General Assembly it will take many forms, some of which we won't recognize when they're finished with it. But I think it would behoove us to have a very spirited and in-depth conversation on this issue. Thank you, Mr. President and members of Council.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. 8044-14, Motion to reapprove the Rules of Council. That would go to Government Reform. Bill, did you want to say anything on this?

MR. ROBINSON: Thank you, Mr. President, members of Council. In the past I can't remember since I've been a member of this Council that we ever approved rules once we reorganized. And while I believe that the rules continue until changed, I think approval of the rules will give us clarification as to which set of rules we're operating with and whether or not we want those rules. I have made some proposals to change the rules in a fashion that I think will help us operate more efficiently. But in the meantime I think we need to be clear which rules are in effect and to whom they apply. Thank you, Mr. President, and members of Council.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: At this time we're going to have Public Comment.

MR. FUTULES: Mr. President, if I could, I have to leave. I have a meeting at seven o'clock in Carnegie.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. All right. The first speaker is Lester Ludwig.

MR. LUDWIG: My name is Les Ludwig. I live at 6589 Rosemoor Street in Squirrel Hill. I was surprised, very pleasantly --- my wife insisted that I should do something different. Don't think about cancel, don't think about all the different things that I've been involved in. Sit down and read the Old Testament. Huh?

And there in the first paragraph it says that the good Lord separated the water from the land and saw that it was good. And there was one water, one water. Jeez, it's even in the Bible and I've been standing here and waving my hand and saying one water. But there's a greater issue that was in display here this evening. And I think that I have no choice but to call it to question. I came here originally, and I met with Mr. Szymanski and I met with Mr. Robinson, and I've had endless conversations with Doctor Martoni about what? New revenue. We are --- whether we realize it or not, we're sitting in a doorway of time, a time when if we apply ourselves to finding the revenues that are literally sitting in front of us that are going unrecognized, that these arguments that have occurred here tonight --- what is it, a million dollars? The City of Pittsburgh, on nine ideas alone, is raising a million dollars. Nine ideas. Naming rights, different things like that. Why are we still waiting almost a year --- Mr. Szymanski, is it a year later?

MR. SZYMANSKI: Uh-huh (yes).

MR. LUDWIG: It's easily a year later asking for the joint venture proposal to be voted on and approved so that we can take all the vending machines of Allegheny County and all the vending machines of Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, and go out for one contract. Let's say why? Because Huntington Beach, California --- and I've got the CD, the plastic disc that shows the Mayor of Huntington Beach. And he says we couldn't pick up the rubbish or sweep the streets but we made a deal. We have offered all the vending machines under contract for 20 years for \$655,000 a year. Hey, that's not chicken feed. Now, if we get all of the County and all of the City's machines together, maybe the million dollars that we've argued about here this evening will look like chicken feed. Maybe we can get two, three million out of it. When are you going to move and vote on it? Thank you for your attention.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Next we have Muse Linnell (phonetic)? Douglas Shields? Doug Shields? Mike Sully (phonetic)? Okay. Aaron Bowes (phonetic)?

MR. BOWES: In the interest of saving Councilmembers' time, I'm going to defer tonight.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. All right. What's that, Jerry Pantone?

MR. PANTONE: Good evening, Jerry Pantone, 163 Sunny Drive, 15236. I apologize for not being here for some of the previous meetings. I live in Whitehall School District. I'm sure you've seen us on the news so --- yeah. We can talk after the meeting. I have a couple of comments on a few articles and a few comments of my own. The first one says property owner takes Sunoco's Mariner East pipeline to court in Washington, PA. Sunoco claims that are a public utility. Now, I think you said really. Really? Sunoco is a public utility? I'm sorry. It's all going to tie together at the end, I promise. Wednesday, January 22nd, there was a DEP hearing. One of the ladies that spoke whose name was Raina Rippel, Director of the Peters Township based Southwest Pennsylvania Environmental Health Project --- she was the first speaker and not the last to focus on water. There is a significant concern about water the potential of chemicals leaking into the ground, she said, referring to underground storage tanks.

She also studied reported cases of respiratory dermatological and intestinal concerns. One a little closer to home, Findlay neighbors want drilling inside the airport moved. A group of Findlay residents wants Consol Energy to move the location of one of its proposed drilling sites at Pittsburgh International Airport saying it's too close to their homes and could send air toxins into their neighborhood. I won't read all the rest of this, but they're asking for an air monitoring device. The closest one to them currently is in South Fayette. That's roughly 13 miles away so if it comes up --- I don't know if it involves you guys or who it is, you might want to give them an air quality monitoring device.

My comments, I would have made these at the hearings you had for the airports but again, I've been busy. I am not against drilling in any form. I'm not against it. I am against it when it's not done safely. All right. I am a member of SHAADD. I'm sure you've heard some of our other members speak here. It's South Hills Area Against Dangerous Drilling. What they're doing now with the drilling that I can see, from what I've read, from my research, they're going incredibly fast --- I don't know what they're doing. So my comments, it is about balance. How much profit is equal to the harm that is done? How many tumors or lesions or nosebleeds are equal to the money we're going to make --- because there's definitely money in drilling. Everybody here knows it.

Who am I to argue that? But how much harm --- what is the cost of the harm that is done? Do I know all the harm that's caused by drilling? No, I'm not an expert. But what all of you have to do, you guys are going to make a vote at some point about drilling under the parks. These are places where we all participate, we all play, our kids play, our grandkids play. What is the balance to the harm that would be done?

I'll finish with one quick thing. I would ask you to vote no, obviously, on the parks drilling. It's emotional to me because it is something that we treasure. These are things that are, I think, protected in the Constitution, in the State of Pennsylvania. I ask that you please vote no on the parks. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. John Detwiler.

MR. DETWILER: Thank you, Mr. President. I'm John Detwiler, 5723 Solway Street in the City of Pittsburgh. I've been asked to speak on behalf of the Protect Our Parks Coalition to respond to a concern that we've seen in some members of this Council. I'll try to do that within the three-minute limit, but I apologize in advance if I run over. And we're providing staff with printed copies for you. First, some background. Protect Our Parks came together last August as a coalition of grassroots and nonprofit organizations and individuals to oppose fracking on or under Allegheny County parks. Over the last six months, this opposition has been growing broader and deeper, not just near Deer Lakes Park, but across the entire county in all of your districts. In every Council meeting, you've heard public comment from citizens who are alarmed at the prospects of our parks being turned over to drilling. But now, for a variety of reasons, it looks as if it may be a while before a proposed drilling lease comes before this body. You have other work to do and you know where we stand on fracking.

So we initiated conversations with several members of Council and met with President DeFazio and have decided to be more conservative with our use of this public comment period. As I said, opposition to fracking the parks is deep and broad. Protect Our Parks doesn't represent all of it by any means. We can't, even if we wanted to, tell citizens not to speak at Council meetings, but we will make an effort to check with your staff to see how many people have signed up to speak on this issue, and to encourage our members to pass, as Aaron did tonight, on

use of their time if our position is over-represented. For now, the initiative on fracking is in the County Executive's hands. He will decide when he wants to place the issue on your agenda, and when he does, you'll be pressured to act quickly. So we're not going away. We'll continue to come to Council meetings and to committee meetings and to meet with individual members. You will still hear from us. And if this Council would decide to take back the initiative to use this time to prepare for making a wise decision, then Protect Our Parks will be eager to support you. I'm repeating the offers that we have made in this chamber and in individual meetings with many of you. We will help to plan public hearings and to offer you expert testimony for your due diligence.

And finally on the topic of due diligence, let me point to the State Supreme Court's recent ruling striking down the pro-drilling provisions of Act 13. The Court based its ruling on this public trust created in our Constitution. Government at all levels holds Pennsylvania's environment in trust for the citizens, including generations yet to come. That concept has three important consequences. All levels of government are required to demonstrate due diligence before taking any action that affects the environment. Citizens, as beneficiaries of that trust, are entitled to an accounting from the trustee, the government, as to how its due diligence was carried out. And finally, citizens have standing in court to enforce their rights to protection of the environment. We are offering to help you meet those legal obligations. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Terri Supowitz?

MS. SUPOWITZ: Hi. I'm Terri Supowitz. I live and bake at 310 Hay Street, Wilkinsburg. And I was much relieved --- it was either baking or preparing a speech, and you've heard enough. So I have cookies for you. They're Valentine cookies. They're homemade. They're made with butter, from my oven to you and they're hearts. And it's my heart to your heart about the parks. I wanted to give each one of you nine cookies --- that's a lot of cookies when you're cutting them out --- so you got five. And each one represents two parks. So please, as you're eating them and sharing them --- there's enough for everybody, for all of you. They're in bags here, I will give them to Joe. Think about the parks. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Mel Packer.

MR. PACKER: In the interest of City Councilmembers' time I'd like to abstain from speaking if you will instruct the clerk or Joe to distribute an article I was going to read about birth defects around fracking sites; is that okay?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah. And next, we have Althea Collucci (phonetic).

MS. GALLUCCI: As a vocal objector to drilling in and under our County parks and in the interest of saving time for County Council, I defer my time.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Give her a cookie. Okay. Lucas Lyons (phonetic)?

MR. LYONS: I'll defer as well.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Ray Peter?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: He left. He told me he wanted to give you his cookie.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thaddeus Popovich?

MR. POPOVICH: He passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: He passes. Timothy Ludwig?

MR. LUDWIG: I have deferred my time as well.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Oh, there you go. George, what's that, Kappakas (phonetic)? He's passing? Okay. Is that the last one? Oh, okay. We have one here we had a little mix-up on. Was it Keeran (phonetic) Young?

MR. YOUNG: I'm not speaking about fracking. I'll be brief, though I didn't bring sweets. Sorry about that. I didn't know that was a prerequisite. My name is Keeran Young. I live at 5047 Somerville Street, City of Pittsburgh. I would like to say good evening to you all. Ms. Hawkins, it's nice meeting you finally. I'd like to say that I am running for the State Democratic Committee. I hope to see you all doing a little bit more to help those who are impoverished in our communities, maybe bringing up a raise of the minimum wage. I think maybe the conversation should start about \$15 to \$20. I don't expect to get \$20 for people but it's a good place to start the conversation. It's really important to me that my elected officials work harder for those who have the least. Those who have the least give in to our system and get very little out of it in a lot of cases. And it's very, very important to me that those people are represented by their elected officials to the fullest. Because the people who have more can do with what they have to get what they need from their elected officials. So it's important that our elected officials represent

those who have the marginalized voice in our community. Thank you for your time and I appreciate all the support from every single one of you, very talkative and very welcoming. I appreciate this Council and I thank you for your time today.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Normally, we don't have any political speeches but we left that go for now. Okay. We're going to adjourn the meeting.

(Chorus of seconds)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All those in favor say aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.

MEETING CONCLUDED AT 8:00 P.M.

CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify, as the stenographic reporter, that the foregoing proceedings were taken stenographically by me, and thereafter reduced to typewriting by me or under my direction; and that this transcript is a true and accurate record to the best of my ability.

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Danielle Olin", is written over a horizontal line.

Court Reporter