

ALLEGHENY COUNTY COUNCIL

REGULAR MEETING

- - -

BEFORE:

Dr. Charles J. Martoni	-	President, District 8
Nicholas Futules	-	Vice President, District 7
John P. DeFazio	-	Council-At-Large
Heather S. Heidelbaugh (via telephone)	-	Council-At-Large
Matt Drozd	-	District 1
Jan Rea	-	District 2
James R. Burn, Jr.	-	District 3
Michael J. Finnerty	-	District 4
Krista Harris	-	District 5
John F. Palmiere	-	District 6
Robert J. Macey	-	District 9
William Russell Robinson	-	District 10
Barbara Daly Danko	-	District 11
James Ellenbogen (via telephone)	-	District 12
Amanda Green Hawkins	-	District 13

Allegheny County Courthouse
Fourth Floor, Gold Room
436 Grant Street
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219

Tuesday, November 19, 2013 - 5:00 p.m.

SARGENT'S COURT REPORTING SERVICE, INC.
429 Forbes Avenue, Suite 1300
Pittsburgh, PA 15219
(412) 232-3882 FAX (412) 471-8733

IN ATTENDANCE:

Jack Cambest - County Solicitor
Joseph Catanese - Director, Constituent Services
Jared Barker - Director, Legislative Services
Walter Szymanski - Budget Director

PRESIDENT MARTONI: The regular Allegheny Council meeting will now come to order. Please rise for the Pledge to the Flag, and please remain standing for a few moments following the pledge.

(Pledge to the Flag.)

(Moment of silence.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Please remain standing for a moment of silence. At this moment of silence, I would ask you to remember in your thoughts and prayers the passing of Joe Natoli. Joe Natoli was an Allegheny County councilman, one of the original who served in District 13. He was appointed to fill the vacancy in District 13 of the Inaugural County Council. Joe was a coach, a mentor, and a friend to countless people and always responsive to the needs of Council District 13. Joe's career spanned 40 years in Pittsburgh Parks and Recreation Department, served as the Director of Parks and Recreation for Allegheny County. Joe also served as the Director of Veterans Affairs for the County of Allegheny before his retirement.

Joe had many accomplishments, but probably his greatest was the Founder and Head Coach of the Morningside Bulldogs youth football program for boys ages 13 to 15, and a record --- and a record of 271 to 19, during its existence from 1950 to 1979. He was also President of the Pittsburgh Chapter of the National Italian American Sports Hall of Fame, instrumental in the founding of the Pittsburgh Columbus Day Parade, to mention just a very few things. Joe touched the lives of many children and their families and will be long remembered for his contributions. And Allegheny Council sends its condolences to the Natoli family. Thank you. Please be seated. Roll call.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Burn?

(No response.)

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Danko?

MS. DANKO: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio?

MR. DEFAZIO: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Drozd?

MR. DROZD: Present.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Present (via telephone).

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?
MR. FUTULES: Here.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?
(No response.)
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Harris?
MS. HARRIS: Here.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Here (via telephone).
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY: Here.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE: Here.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?
MS. REA: Here.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?
MR. ROBINSON: Present.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni, President?
PRESIDENT MARTONI: Here.
MR. CATANESE: Thirteen (13) members currently
present.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Proclamations/
Certificates. 7837-13.

MR. CATANESE: Proclamation honoring in
memoriam, The Honorable William Joseph Coyne, member of
the United States House of Representatives, from
Pennsylvania's 14th District, for more than 20 years.
Sponsored by Council members Robinson, Burn, Danko,
DeFazio, Ellenbogen, Finnerty, Futules, Green Hawkins,
Macey, Martoni, Palmiere and Rea.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Thank you, Mr. President, and
members of Council. It is a distinct honor and privilege
that I have this evening to pay tribute --- and I thank
those of you who have joined me --- to a distinguished
public servant who has gone home to his final reward. In
many respects, some of what you see in me is attributable
to The Honorable William J. Coyne, known to many of us as
Billy Coyne. I had the privilege of running for public
office in 1977 with then former State Representative
William Coyne; probably, the last time four Democrats ran
together for City Council, raised money together, went to
events together, and actually campaigned together.

It has not happened since; Bill Coyne, Bill
Robinson, Sophie Masloff and Bob Stone. That was the
group. No one has done that since. I take great pride in

that now, more so than when it was happening; didn't understand the historical significance. But much of what you see and understand to be Bill Robinson, is attributable to Bill Coyne, particularly some of my patience, certainly not my long windedness. Bill Coyne was a man of few words. I sat beside him for two years at Pittsburgh City Council. And every time I entered those Council Chambers, the first two seats with the backs to the door, Coyne on the right, Robinson on the left. Bill Coyne used to kick me under the table, because I used to raise hell a lot more than I do now. And he'd just sit there. He was looking straight ahead and he's kicking me under the table.

I asked him once; I said, "Why are you kicking me under the table, man?" He said, "Calm down. Slow down, slow down, slow down, slow down." We could count on each other for quiet conversation, for political education sessions where I was learning and he was teaching. He was always calm and patient, and he had a way to convince our colleagues to do what he needed them to do. He worked tirelessly to have the land tax instituted in the City of Pittsburgh, the remnants of which exist today, because he believed it was the best thing to do, higher tax on land than on buildings.

Politically, I always remember something he taught me when we were out campaigning once. He said, "Watch this." When people came up to him, they had raffle tickets. He went in his left pocket and pulled out a wad of money. He said, "How much are those?" And the person said, "They cost a dollar apiece." That was a long time ago, a dollar apiece. He said, "Give me ten." And he rolled off a \$10 bill and handed it to the person. He takes the tickets. He says, "Wait a minute, wait a minute, wait a minute, wait a minute. Here, sell these to somebody else." It was one of those charity events. I'm watching. And he said, "Whenever you're out campaigning, always have some money in your left pocket. That's the money to buy the tickets and the dinners and all that. Never refuse a person, because they will remember that. Don't ever tell them no. Buy the tickets, buy the dinner. Whatever it is, keep moving. They're going to remember that." I never forgot it, and I always share that with people who are out there campaigning. I always say, "Bill Coyne told me a winning strategy; keep some money in that left pocket. When people are approaching you with those

raffle tickets, buy them and keep going. Give those tickets back. Give the television back. Whatever it is, give it back. Let them raffle it off. As long as they mention your name. He said, give it back, give it back.

You did that once? Okay. I saw someone do that with a big screen TV. That took a lot of nerve. But it paid off for him. I had the occasion to pay my respects to the Coyne family and friends when the Congressman passed. I watched his career grow. I remember once when he served on a committee, an inaugural committee for a person of another party, and there were those who scolded him. They said, why would you do that? He said, because I'm a congressman, and that person represents everybody. There's no sound reason not to serve on their committee. It helps; it doesn't hurt. It shows class. It shows I'm concerned about my people. Why would I not serve for some partisan reason?

That's the kind of person that I'm remembering this evening, a dear friend. I used to see him at the health club. We'd have quiet conversations. This was after he had retired, long retired. Most people don't remember Bill Coyne, because he was so quiet and so thoughtful, one of the best public servants this country has ever known, and certainly this city and county. We do ourselves justice by remembering him and honoring him and looking to his example for all that we can be. There's some people here this evening who I'd like to have join me and then have a few words, people who were close to Bill Coyne.

The first, Kathy Kozdemba --- and if I mispronounce your name, please forgive me --- long-time friend and special companion of Bill Coyne, if she'll come forward, please. Phil Coyne, his brother, Mary Margaret, his sister-in-law, and a young man who I used to talk to almost as much as Bill Coyne, Jamie Rooney, a long-time friend and his executive assistant. Jamie used to play rugby. When we were both younger, I could seriously talk to him about playing rugby. I asked him the other day --- I said, are you still playing rugby? He said, refereeing. That was the end of that conversation. Okay. I understood what he was saying. All right. That's good. I'm glad he's still in the game.

These are individuals who will speak to us tonight about The Honorable William J. Coyne. He was honorable. He carried that title well. And if you ever

met Bill Coyne, unpretentious and helpful, the kind of guy I really learned to respect and in many respects, like I said, modeled much of what I do and much I did in my political career after the example that he set. Of course, I don't kick anybody under the table, anything like that, but it was a kick out of love and kindness. And he never scolded me. He just kicked me in the ankles. And I'd like to read now this proclamation and then if folks will come in the order that I called you and say some nice and kind words. Too bad the congressman is not here to hear these.

WHEREAS, William (Bill) Joseph Coyne was born in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, on August 24th, 1936, a lifelong resident of the Oakland section of Pittsburgh. He graduated from Central Catholic High School in 1954. He served with the U.S. Army in Korea from 1955 through 1957 and earned a Bachelor's Degree in Accounting from Robert Morris College in 1965; and

WHEREAS, Mr. Coyne served in the Pennsylvania House of Representatives from 1971 to 1973 and was a member of Pittsburgh City Council from 1974 to 1980. He was elected to the United States House of Representatives in 1980, where he represented the 14th Congressional District of Pennsylvania, which includes the City of Pittsburgh and parts of surrounding suburbs, for 22 years until his retirement in January of 2003; and

WHEREAS, as a member of Congress, Representative Coyne served on the influential House Ways and Means Committee and represented that committee for five years on the House Budget Committee. He also served on the House Banking Committee, the Committee on House Administration and the House Ethics Committee and where Representative Coyne was a stalwart champion for the poor. He worked tirelessly to provide federal assistance for those who needed it. He worked to expand the income --- earned income tax credit, bringing relief to millions of low and middle income Americans; and

WHEREAS, during his 22-year tenure, Representative Coyne secured financial appropriations for Pittsburgh area projects, such as upgraded transportation infrastructure, redevelopment of the Hays Munitions Plant, funding for the construction of the Children's Hospital, technology research and development associated with Carnegie Mellon University and improvements to wastewater

and sewage infrastructure to combat regional flooding problems.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that Allegheny County Council does hereby honor in memoriam The Honorable William J. Coyne, and we extend our deepest condolences to his beloved long-time companion, Kathy Kozdemba and his family and friends. He will forever be remembered as a legislator truly dedicated to improving the lives of his constituents, and his spirit will live on in our hearts and serve as an inspiration to us all.

It was always a pleasure to represent the congressman and the retired congressman whenever I was in office, because the Oakland section of Pittsburgh, where he was born and raised, was always in my district. And his passing touched all of us in the 10th County Council District because Oakland is in the 10th County Council District. Without further ado, I give you those who have come to speak on behalf of William J. Coyne. I heard someone say he's here with us, and you're probably right.

MR. ROONEY: I'm the designated hitter here, so Bill, thank you very much, and it's great to be here with Bill's old friends. John Defazio, Chuck Martoni, I know we spent many a time together working on issues that affected the county and the city and the state. And it's a great pleasure to be here representing him with Kathy and his sister-in-law, Mary Margaret, and of course, Philly. And I used to walk in the St. Patrick's Day Parade and we'd go down Fifth Avenue, and people would say, there's Philly Coyne. And they'd say, well, who's that with him? They would say, that's his little brother, the congressman. So everybody knew him. But Bill, it was very thoughtful of you to have this done, and the family appreciates it very much. Thank you.

(Applause.)

MR. DROZD: Add me to it. I knew Bill Coyne, too. He was a great guy, a really great guy.

MR. ROBINSON: We're going to prepare ourselves to take a picture. For those of my colleagues who did not have an opportunity to sign onto this proclamation, we'll give you another chance. We're going to let the family take this one, but anyone who didn't sign on who wants to, we'll do another one; then they'll have two. That's how much we loved Bill Coyne. So everybody will get a chance to sign on who would like to. Councilman DeFazio, who knew Councilman Coyne, as well as anybody in this room,

from a political and personal perspective, has something he'd like to say.

MR. DEFAZIO: Yeah. I'd like to say is --- give you a little story on Congressman Coyne. I was working in the mill, and he was running for State legislator in the area. The person he was running against was the State legislator and president of the union at J&L. So he called me up and he said, can you help me get some votes? I'm running against so-and-so. And I said, yeah, you can help me out, because I'm running against him also. So what happened --- what happened, he lost both jobs all in one month. He lost to Billy Coyne, the State representative, and he lost to me as the President. So he took a hit. Thank you.

MR. DROZD: One great point, too. A lot of people don't realize, I knew Billy, too. And I remember those days when he would win and lose, but he was the kind --- he was the kind of guy who just got up and ran again. And he was very quiet, but he also --- I think he was in the seminary, wasn't he? Was he? But he was very religious, because I used to go to churches and there would be Billy Coyne in half of these churches. He used to go to a lot of church. And in fact, you and I would see each other at the Strip. I would sit behind you, right here in the Strip District.

And Bill not only reached in his pocket because of politics, he used to always reach in his pocket and always pull out a big bill and put it in there. So he was really that kind of guy. He lived austerely and was an honest, nice person.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Mr. President, can I say something?

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen would like to comment.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Sure, sure.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Yeah. I just want to say to his family --- I mean, you know, I remember 30-some years ago when they were redistricting Mr. Coyne. And I was a young kid that was interested in politics and, you know, those who had been around for a long time will tell you, in those days if you were a young guy, the old-timers used to tell you to go away. They wouldn't even talk to you, so you couldn't learn anything. They were rather rude. And the thing I always remember about him, when I was a young kid, you know, Mr. Coyne always took time to

like talk to the young people and encourage them. I always remember that. And I remember when I was in my 20s, which was a long time ago, when my wife and I spent an entire weekend getting signatures for him in, like, 20 degree weather because we knew that the mighty 10th Ward were --- actually, Joe Natoli was the treasurer at that time --- would be part of Mr. Coyne's district, and we wanted to participate. And that's how much that I always thought of him and respected him. And he left his legacy on a lot of us, so --- and I'm one of them. Like I said, I was one of the young people that he encouraged, and I appreciate him for who he was. And I just feel bad that I couldn't be there tonight. Thank you, everyone.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you.

(Pictures taken.)

MR. CATANESE: Let the record show that Councilwoman Green Hawkins is present and Councilman Jim Burn is present.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: 7838-13.

MR. CATANESE: Proclamation recognizing the students in The Future In Mine (TFIM) Club, from Steel Valley High School, for creating the documentary entitled, A Place Worth Investing In. Sponsored by Councilwoman Danko.

MS. DANKO: I'd like to invite the students and their teacher to come up. And you saw how the other people lined up, so you can do this. I've also invited Council member Matt Drozd up, who is one of Munhall's originals, so --- or originally from Munhall. I decided to bring these students in and their teacher for this proclamation. I'm often looking for people that are doing things a little bit out of the box, and I met these students --- I was at the Steel Valley Enterprise Zone breakfast just a few weeks ago, and they gave a little presentation about the film that they had done. They're clearly very passionate about the Steel Valley. They want to, you know, get the Steel Valley going.

And the film is called, A Place Worth Investing In, so they're telling why they love Steel Valley and why people should come and invest in the Steel Valley, because that's their future, you know. We've heard about Congressman Coyne and all the great work he did. Well, these people are kind of at the other end of their career and just starting out. And this group of people, I think, are destined to do great things, and I hope you think so,

too. Before I read the proclamation, Matt, did you want to say anything?

MR. DROZD: The Steel Valley encompasses a lot of those communities in through the Steel Valley, where I was born and raised, not far from where the Steel Valley is. And half of my family went to Steel Valley High School and the schools including me. And you guys probably went to the Park School, which is still in existence, so you know how old that is if I was there. All right? But I'll tell you, what really built the Steel Valley was the ethnicity of that Steel Valley, including the steelworkers, you know, that really were there and really helped build it. And what keeps it going and what you build on and I'm sure what you found when you did that, it's still there, the fiber of the families.

The families are very strong. That's why the communities still thrive today. They're very well maintained, and you're the product of it. And we look forward to some day you replace many of us or any of these elected officials and make this world a better place, won't you? And I know you will, because you're that type of cut.

MS. DANKO: I have a little card that has the link to the video, and I'll make sure that all my colleagues get the link. It's about nine or ten minutes. I'll let you decide. So I will read the proclamation, and then we have a designated speaker, and that person will introduce everybody and talk a little bit about the project.

WHEREAS, the Steel Valley School District serves the Boroughs of Homestead, Munhall and West Homestead, former mill towns, and is the home of several notable landmarks, including the site of the Homestead Strike, the Carnegie Library of Homestead, the Waterfront Shopping Complex, Sandcastle Water Park and the headquarters of the Allegheny Intermediate Unit; and

WHEREAS, students in The Future is Mine, Hear Me 101 Program at Steel Valley Senior High School, produced a documentary film entitled, A Place Worth Investing In, promoting the Steel Valley as a great place to live and work; and

WHEREAS, the film, which debuted on May 21st, 2013, at Pittsburgh Filmmakers Melwood Theater, focuses on the positive aspects of the community and asks viewers to consider the Steel Valley as a place to invest in because

of the area's diversity, history, attractions and positive people; and

WHEREAS, the students convincingly make their case by illustrating the historical paths and rich tradition of the Steel Valley, the economic development and revitalization activities taking place in the area, the family-friendly sense of community and the tremendous pride that the Steel Valley School District shows in educating the children of the Homestead, Munhall and West Homestead communities.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that Allegheny County Council does hereby honor the Steel Valley Senior High School TFIM Hear Me 101 students for creating the documentary, A Place Worth Investing In. And we thank you for the inspiring individuals, family and businesses to invest in the Steel Valley. Sponsored by myself and Matt Drozd. Thank you.

(Applause.)

MS. DANKO: Do you want to say anything first?

MS. OLSEN: Thank you so much for having us tonight. This young man is going to do the speaking, because the whole purpose of the Hear Me 101 project is to allow students to have a voice. Therefore, I'm an adult, I'm a sponsor and I'm going to go back to my place so their voice can be heard.

MS. DANKO: That was Sue Olsen. And now I'm going to call up Shane McGuire.

MR. MCGUIRE: Hello. I'm Shane McGuire, a Steel Valley Senior student. I'm also president of The Future Is Mine, under the sponsorship of Miss Sue Olsen, Vice President, Hannah Fallon, Secretary, Chelsea Pearson, Treasurer, Chelsea Greenhow, Brandon Tomasic and also Sam Ligeros. I want to say thank you to Councilwoman Danko and Councilman Drozd and all the other Council men and women, for having us here tonight and honoring us for the work we put forth to the video of why --- worth investing in the Steel Valley.

I want to thank everyone here and ---.

MS. DANKO: Tell them how you decided to do this topic and the dinner.

MR. MCGUIRE: Well, we were at a Steel Valley Hall of Fame dinner. We were sponsoring it. And there was a lot of people there. Porky Chedwick --- I don't know if you guys know who he is, ---

MS. DANKO: They know.

MR. MCGUIRE: --- Charlie Batch and many others who we honored, who are now in the Steel Valley Hall of Fame. And from there, we realized that we have a strong pride in the Steel Valley community of Homestead, Munhall and West Homestead. So from there, we put forth a video of effort, meeting borough managers, you know, politicians, a historian --- well, he's the Director of the Steel Valley Heritage Museum. And then we spoke with all them, interviewed them, and we collaborated --- I believe it was eight minutes of footage to get out the point that Steel Valley is a growing community, it is a great community and that is a place worthwhile to invest in, to live and to congregate there for whatever it may be.

And not only does it have the potential now to start up, but it will be thriving for a long time. And from that dinner --- that was where we got our inspiration, and at the Steel Valley Business Breakfast --- the enterprise breakfast. We went and spoke there to other Steel Valley businessmen and women and they really fell in love with the idea from our video; so thank you.

(Applause.)

MS. DANKO: I just have a soft spot for students, I think. All right. You guys have to get your picture taken.

(Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: 7839-13.

MR. CATANESE: Proclamation congratulating Ms. Jayme Graham, of the Allegheny County Health Department's Air Quality Program, for being elected to the Board of Directors of the Air and Waste Management Association. Sponsored by Council members Palmiere and Danko.

MR. PALMIERE: Mr. President, members of Council. It's a pleasure to --- this evening to be able to honor one of our own local working for Allegheny County, bless her heart. It's Jayme Graham. Jayme was just elected to the Air and Waste Management Association Board of Directors for the years 2014 and '16, and that recognized as an exceptional achievement. I'm reading right off of here, so I'm going to read the proclamation. Jayme, congratulations. I wanted to make sure I got that right. The proclamation reads as such:

WHEREAS, Ms. Jayme Graham is the Manager of Air Quality Planning Section of the Allegheny County Health Department, where she and her staff are responsible for

air quality planning, regulation, development, dispersion, modeling, ambient data management, pollution, prevention and public outreach --- try to say that all in one time;

WHEREAS, Ms. Graham's term has been responsible for bringing the area into attainment of the --- particular standards and the first round of fine particulate standards and for investing over \$3.5 million in grant funds to eliminating local diesel toxic emissions; and

WHEREAS, Ms. Graham is a resident of Baldwin Borough and has worked with the Health Department for over 32 years. She has a B.S. in Chemical Engineering from the University of Pittsburg; and

WHEREAS, headquartered in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, the Air and Quality Waste Management Association is an organization for environmental professionals, with 5,500 members in 57 countries. Ms. Graham has been a member of AWMA for 30 years and was honored as a fellow member in 2000.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that Allegheny County Council does hereby congratulate Ms. Jayme Graham for being elected to the Air and Waste Management Association Board of Directors for those years, 2014 through 2016. We recognize this exceptional achievement, and on behalf of the residents of Allegheny County, we thank Ms. Graham for her outstanding service. Sponsored by myself and Barbara Daly Danko.

(Applause.)

MS. GRAHAM: Innovations and progress in air quality has been the legacy of Pittsburgh and Allegheny County due to the major portions to the joint efforts of dedicated professionals from the public, from industry and from government. The Air and Waste Management Association is an international organization of environmental professionals dedicated to the training, networking and knowledge exchange within a neutral forum. Much of my personal learning has come through the Air and Waste Management training events, and many of our local results have come from professional connections made from this field.

I'm honored and pleased to be able to return some of what has been given, to continue to improve the knowledge base for our hard work still ahead. Thank you, Councilman Palmiere and Councilwoman Danko, for this honor.

(Applause.)

(Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: The remaining proclamations will be read into the record.

MR. CATANESE: 7840-13. Certificate of Achievement awarded to Mr. Stephen Tyler Barnhart, of Boy Scout Troop 4, upon earning the rank of Eagle Scout. Sponsored by Councilwoman Harris.

7841-13. Certificate of Recognition awarded to Mr. and Mrs. Rudy and Dorothy Richardson, upon the occasion of their 50th wedding anniversary. Sponsored by Councilman Macey.

7842-13. Certificate of Recognition congratulating Mr. William Zachery, Sr., upon the occasion of his 80th birthday. Sponsored by Councilman Martoni.

7843-13. Proclamation congratulating Reverend Dr. Loran E. Mann, of Pentecostal Temple Church, upon the occasion of his 41st --- 44th pastorial (sic) anniversary. Sponsored by Councilman Robinson.

7844-13. Proclamation honoring in memoriam, Lieutenant Colonel George N. Charlton, Jr., for his service to the community and Country. Sponsored by Councilman Robinson.

7845-13. Proclamation honoring in memoriam, Dr. George J. Magovern, pioneering heart surgeon and inventor of life-saving procedures. Sponsored by Councilman Robinson.

7846-13. Proclamation honoring in memoriam, The Honorable Joseph Rhodes, Jr., member of the Pennsylvania House of Representatives, serving the 24th District of Allegheny County from 1973 to 1980. Sponsored by Councilman Robinson.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. Public Comment on Agenda Items.

MR. CATANESE: We have none.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Approval of Minutes.

7848-13.

MR. CATANESE: Motion to approve the minutes of the regular meeting of the Allegheny County Council, held on October 22nd, 2013.

MR. MACEY: So moved.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Moved and second. Question? All in favor?

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Opposed? So ordered.
Presentation of Appointments. 7835-13.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the appointment of Sharon Adams to serve as a member of the Council of Friends organization (South Park), for a term to expire on November 19, 2015. Sponsored by Councilman Palmiere.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Thank you, Mr. President. It's with pleasure that I recommend these two people. They both work very hard with the Friends of South Park --- and I've got a mint in my mouth, sorry about that --- and it's an honor to be able to do that, and I move for approval.

(Chorus of seconds.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Moved and second. Question?
All in favor?

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Opposed? So ordered.
7836-13.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the appointment of James W. Converse to serve as a member of the Council of Friends organization (South Park), for a term to expire on November 19, 2015. Sponsored by Councilman Palmiere.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Move for approval, Mr. President.

(Chorus of seconds.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Moved and second. Question?
All in favor?

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Opposed? So ordered.
Unfinished Business. Committee on Budget and Finance,
Second Reading.

MR. CATANESE: 7781-13. An ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, establishing the tax levy upon all real property subject to taxation within the limits of Allegheny County. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Thank you, Mr. President, and members of Council. Amidst all of our discussions relative to the budget and revenues for this county, this Council has come to an agreement on what the millage should be in Allegheny County next year. In doing so, we have accepted the recommendation and legislation that come from our Chief Executive. This bill has gone through a process that I've never seen here before. I can't

remember one comment on this proposal, and the only person that spoke in committee on this bill was myself, the Chairman of the committee. There seemed to be general agreement that the millage rate should remain the same in Allegheny County as it is now, 4.73, for the year 2014.

That is, I think, a tribute to my colleagues and the Chief Executive. Find a way to work together on something that's very important to the citizens of this county, and that is establishing an agreed-upon millage rate; and as I said, without any controversy or the blowing of hot wind, myself included. And I thank my colleagues and the Chief Executive for sparing us all that lengthy discussion, which we've had in the past, and I respect everybody's perspective. And I talked to just about everybody on this Council, and I didn't find not one person that disagreed with the millage rate for next year, 2014, should be the same millage rate that we have in 2013. So I thank everybody involved in this process and, particularly, Mr. Szymanski, our Budget Director, and his staff, who helped guide the committee through this process. Having said all that, move for approval.

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Second.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Moved and second. Question?

Roll call.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Burn?

MR. BURN: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Danko?

MS. DANKO: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio?

MR. DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Drozd?

MR. DROZD: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Harris?

MS. HARRIS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?
MS. REA: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni, President?
PRESIDENT MARTONI: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 15, noes, 0. Bill passes.
PRESIDENT MARTONI: Liaison Reports. Mr.

Finnerty, why don't you go ahead?

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you. I'd just like to mention that --- that the Oakdale Boy Scouts are having their Pancake Breakfast coming up this Saturday, so if you're in the --- around Oakdale, go to --- stop at the Community Center, get some good pancakes and some sausage and bacon. They'll be looking for you. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Mr. President, I have two Points of Personal Privilege; if you'd like me to wait until after the liaison reports ---

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Why don't you just do it right now?

MR. ROBINSON: Thank you. On a very light note, and hopefully, everyone can digest this this evening, I want to thank again and put on the record --- I want to thank Mrs. Walter Szymanski --- Heather Szymanski --- for providing this Council with an example --- two examples of her culinary skills. She's turning into a very good baker. As some of you know from our budget hearings, I volunteered to be a tester for her if she ventured into the area of making carrot cake, which is not easy. She ventured into that area and Mr. Szymanski brought into Council today some carrot cake muffins, I'm calling them. And I want Heather Szymanski to know that I had two and that Ms. Stevens --- Ms. Celeste Stevens had to put the rest in the icebox, because as long as they sat there on that front desk, I would probably have three or four. But I recommend those carrot cake muffins to any of my colleagues who like desserts and who like carrot cake. Heather is on her way to, I guess, opening up Heather's Bakery or something. But I thank her on behalf of the council for being so kind and generous with us.

My second point relates to one of our colleagues, The Honorable Barbara Daly Danko, who is going to be honored in the near future by the Pennsylvania Federation of Democratic Women, for her tireless service on behalf of people in this state. She's been a member of the State Democratic Committee for many years. She served as a Democratic Chair of her ward, the 14th Ward. She's just an all-around good person, and she's done many other things in the community and is just tireless on behalf of others, regardless of political affiliation. But we thank the federation for recognizing her on a statewide basis, and I'm sure all of us are glad that she is here with us and will continue her --- her service. So Barbara, thank you very much, and enjoy your --- your award.

One thing; when you get the award, that night you are authorized to sleep with the award, that night. And beginning in the morning, put it on a shelf and go back to being the great person that you --- you are.

MR. DROZD: I'll second that, Mr. Councilman Robinson.

MS. DANKO: The only reason I agreed to do this was that Kathleen Kane is also being honored, and it would be a good excuse to see Kathleen Kane.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Congratulations. Is that it, Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Yes, sir. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: I'd like a recount on those two. I heard it was more than that.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I have something ---.

MR. ROBINSON: The night is still young.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: The night is still young. I'm going to go right around this way, because it's hard to ---. I don't know who --- we'll go to ---

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Joe?

MS. HARRIS: Thank you. I just have a brief Point of Personal Privilege, if you will indulge me.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: You always have it.

MS. HARRIS: Thank you. Since tonight is the last Council meeting of my appointment, I just wanted to thank all of you for the privilege and honor of serving with you. I've enjoyed our very spirited conversations. It's been an education, and I certainly appreciated your kind mentorship. And I want to thank the staff for the exceptional service that you provided to our

constituents, and I know I leave the constituents of the 5th District in very capable hands.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: We want to thank you. You'll be back at our next meeting. Okay --- you will be back, okay?

MR. FUTULES: No?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Well, we have something planned.

MR. FUTULES: Oh. That's in December, I guess.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I had something I like to say if I get a chance.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: In December. I'm sorry; in December.

MR. FUTULES: December 17th.

MR. CATANESE: It's in December.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Okay. Come on; Bob? John?

MR. MACEY: No, I don't have anything.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: That's very unusual.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. President, Councilman Ellenbogen would like to make a comment.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Please, Mr. Ellenbogen, make a comment.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Thank you. First, I'd like to thank Councilwoman Harris for her service. She's been a pleasure to serve with. The other point I have was, you had mentioned early in the meeting about former Councilman and mentor, Joe Natoli.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Yes.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: And I just wanted to say that I was kind of disappointed that when I looked into the media and stuff to see where Joe's name was and that I didn't see a big thing made out of it. I didn't see a headline. I didn't see anything on the news, and this and that. And I have to tell you, I'm kind of surprised. I don't know. Sometimes maybe people forget about who people were or whatever. But I personally cannot remember a time in my life when I did not know Joe Natoli. And Joe being a councilman and Joe being a parks director and all those things were wonderful.

But I could tell you, as a child who grew up in the 10th Ward, there wasn't one kid that grew up in that ward that did not know who Joe Natoli was. He was the guy that --- you know, we were a lower middle class neighborhood. He was the guy that made sure the kids had

summer jobs. He was the guy that --- he was a mentor. I mean, people like Bill Fralic, who was all pro-offensive lineman for the Atlanta Falcons, and Ricky D'Amico, who was an All American at Penn State, these were people that Joe mentored. And I know even when I was a teenager, when I played sandlot football, Joe used to let us use the field house which they put together, to keep us street kids off the street, if we helped him coach. And you know, the legacy that Joe Natoli leaves behind is not being a Councilman, it's not being the person that was the parks director. It was the guy who took care of the kids. He was somebody who should be remembered for somebody who really looked after and kept kids like myself --- and all over this county, you'll find people like myself who Joe left a mark with and helped us. I mean, I used to run the ward office when I was a kid, when Joe was the treasurer and he would tease around with us.

But that's Joe Natoli's legacy. You know, it lives in the people like myself who tried to aspire to be better than we thought we were, coming off of the street as we grew up. I appreciate everyone listening. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you; very true. Liaison Reports; anybody I missed. John?

MR. DEFAZIO: Yeah, just real quick; I know, Chuck, you covered --- covered it well when you spoke of Joe Natoli, and I agree with everything you said. And I was here when we appointed Joe. I think the only people at that time who were here were Jan Rea, Chuck Martoni and myself. But everything everyone said about Joe is true. He was a heck of a guy, and I remember Joe going way back when he was a coach for Morningside Bulldogs. Everybody seemed to know Joe Natoli before he was a Councilman and parks director and all that. He was known for that Morningside Bulldog, and I'm just glad that, like --- to say a few words on his behalf. He was a great person.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Yes. I could, John, on your words --- actually, Joe's brother, Felix, gave me my first football helmet when I was 12; so you know, I was one of them kids, too.

MR. DEFAZIO: I heard you used to knock Fralic all around.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Well, I'm going to tell you something. You know, I'll tell you --- if I can tell you a quick story. I was 19 years old, and I was playing for

the Tri-Ward Rebels, which was a semi-pro football team then, and Joe said, look, you got to go in and use the weight room down at Natoli Field, you guys got to help me coach. So here comes this kid that's 6'2", like 220, and these kids are, like, 14, 15 years old. And at the time, you know, I was around 200 pounds and I look ---I'm like, who's this kid right here? And you know, Joe's assistant, Fitzpatrick at the time, said, oh, he's 11 years old. So I'm 19 years old; this kid hit a two-man sled like nothing I had ever seen. And I said at that time when that kid was 11 years old --- I said, the way he knocked us around and we were grown, I said, if you don't make the pros, then I never played the kind of football in my life that he did, so ---. No, you're right, John. He was something.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. Down here? Anyone? Jan? Jan and then John.

MS. REA: I just want to tell you, Krista --- Ms. Harris --- it was a real honor to serve with you, and thank you for taking the time away from your family and --- to be here. And thank you also for treating your colleagues always with the utmost respect; so thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: John?

MR. PALMIERE: Thank you, Mr. President. Krista, that goes for me, also. And the other thing that you did, too, you brought the average age of this Council way down. Bless your heart for that, and yet you've been wonderful to serve with, and we're going to miss you.

Mr. President, also, on Sunday night last, I had the privilege of attending the Montour Trail Council dinner, their annual dinner. And I met a lot of fine people out there at Saint Joan of Arc Church, out in South Park Township. And boy, do they have a beautiful place out there for banquets, I mean, it was really a wonderful evening. And the interesting thing was, we're connecting South Park to the Montour Trail and the South Park Connector and working --- those people have been working very diligently over the years.

You can't believe the achievements that these groups --- these volunteer groups, what they do for these trails and what they do for this region. I was really impressed. And the other thing, Mr. President, my wife even attended. Now that was really something; I mean, to get her to come out to anything. So it was a wonderful

evening, and I was glad to represent County Council.
Thank you very much.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yeah. I'm sorry, Mr. President, and members of Council. When you asked me to speak, I thought you were under liaison reports. But since we're giving accolades to our good colleague here, Krista, I'd just like to say it was a pleasure serving with you. And I always like your professionalism and your nice, kind, soft voice. So I'm sure you have greater things ahead, and I know you served District 5 quite well. Thank you very much.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. Nick?

MR. FUTULES: Since we're going in that direction, Krista, thank you for being here. You've been a great councilwoman, and I think you actually may hold the record of being the youngest. I believe Amanda was at one time, and I think you guys are pretty close. I think if you look back on the history of this council, that you find --- you will find that you are probably the youngest member in the history of this council that ever served. And I really am glad to see you did a great job while you were here, and you have a lot of respect from everybody, and I appreciate that. Thank you so much. And I have one more little note that --- I'd like to take an opportunity to address the speakers here this evening just real quick.

I just want to let you know, folks, that you've become regular customers here, and I have a lot of respect for you and your opinions and your freedom of speech. And at no time, do I believe that this Council would ever disregard you. The only problem I have is the fact that I might have to invite you to our Christmas party, because you seem to be as diligent as being here as members as any of us. I just wanted to emphasize the fact that this Council does respect you in every way, and we appreciate your being here. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Michael?

MR. FINNERTY: Krista, it's been a pleasure serving with you, and I'm glad he mentioned your soft voice; and I wish you the best.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Barbara?

MS. DANKO: I just want to say, as one of the three people on Council who is on Twitter, we get to see a lot of pictures of kids going back and forth, Amanda and Krista and I. And every now and then we see some county

stuff, too, but I appreciate --- I don't have that many followers, so it's nice. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: John?

MR. DEFAZIO: Yeah, just real quick, I agree with everyone else; you know, we might as well say a few good words about Krista. She's done a good job, and we're going to miss you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Go ahead.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Mr. President, may I say something about Krista leaving, please?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Please do.

MR. CATANESE: Councilwoman Heidelbaugh, go ahead.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Thank you so much. I just want to add my warmest regards to Krista Harris and thank her so much for not only coming forward to ask for the appointment to the Republican caucus, but also then running an excellent campaign. In today's world, we need many more young people to volunteer for public service. She has been a bright spot. She's been a great companion. I've loved sitting next to her. She really caught on very quickly, and I know that although this time, she wasn't successful; I heartedly encourage her to run again, because she is a great voice in the community. And I just really, really thank her for all her efforts and appreciate her so much.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: We thank you.

MS. HARRIS: Thanks, Heather.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Thank you, Mr. President, and members of Council. I want to thank Ms. Harris for giving her time and her effort. She should get an award as the quietest, least talkative member of this Council in the history of its existence. I don't think anyone has said fewer words; then when she speaks, they are meaningful and we listen to her, even in that nice, soft voice. And that nice, soft voice oftentimes is --- is needed and is really appreciated.

And while your service has not been long here, we know you're here, and we knew you were here. And I appreciate the fact that you seemed to be paying attention at all times, to all people, and you were totally respectful to every member of this council; even sometimes when we were having a rough go at it, you maintained your cool, and you always added something at the right time.

So I thank you and I thank your husband and your little baby, and I thank you for giving us an opportunity to interact with you as a family person and to enjoy your smile; and the best to you in the future.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Bill, if we're going to award somebody for talking the least, you might be up for an award ---

MR. ROBINSON: I doubt that.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: --- for talking the most.

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Thank you, Mr. President. I just wanted to give my regards to Krista and thank her for her service. I was just really excited to hear that you would be joining us on Council. Being another woman on Council and just having another woman's voice as an elected office, I think is very, very important. And I commend you for stepping up to do that. I was sharing with a colleague earlier, if you're not at the table, then you're going to be on the menu. So I thank you for being at the table, and I hope that you will pursue other elected offices. Maybe even --- this one, I'm sure you're incumbent --- I'm sorry, not --- but the person who will take the office doesn't want to hear that. And I hope that you will run again at some point in the future. Your voice is very much needed. And partisanship aside, it's just very important for us as women to be at the table and not on the menu. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Jim?

MR. BURN: Thank you, Mr. President. The best of luck to you. It's only been a few months, but it's been a pleasure to be up here and work with you. I truly believe that you exemplify what I've always been impressed with, as it relates to this legislative body; that is, there is the art of politics to get us here, and then there's the business of government once we're here. And it's not that you and I want to be passing out the same slate card on Election Day. But once that's done and the constituency makes its decisions, then you put that slate card aside and you pick up the manual and you do the bidding of the constituents. I think you've exemplified that.

And I --- you know, as a councilman I'm sure that we'll be seeing you again at some point in the future. As State Party Chairman, I know that I'll have my hands full when that day comes. Best of luck to you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Matt?

MR. DROZD: Yeah. As the caucus leader of the independents, the only one, I just want to thank you, Krista. You know, it took a heck of a lot of years to bring this average age down, I'll tell you that. And you know, I don't think it's a sad thing that you're leaving. It's the only sad thing that we lose. Well, who doesn't lose is that beautiful child you have. And you know, if you know Krista, you know, it's like, you just look in the back of your phone, right? Show them. That baby is going to really gain many times over. That's who's going to remember --- there you go. Okay. Good luck, Krista.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Okay. I think I got everybody. New Business. Ordinances and Resolutions. 7849-13.

MR. CATANESE: A resolution of the County of Allegheny, amending the Grants and Special Accounts Budget for 2013 (Submission 10-13). Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Budget and Finance Committee. Notification of Contracts.

MS. DANKO: Mr. President?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: I'm sorry.

MS. DANKO: Mr. President?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Yes.

MS. DANKO: I move to pull from committee 7738-13, for an immediate and final vote.

MR. ROBINSON: Second.

MR. DROZD: Can I follow-up?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: What bill is that?

MS. DANKO: I would ask the clerk to pass out copies of the bill, 7738-13.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Would you speak to the bill for us?

MS. DANKO: I'd be happy to speak to the bill. As I'm sure you are all aware, I introduced this bill on September 10th. We are well past the 60 days and fast approaching the 90 days when we are supposed to, as a body, act. Since August, we've had people from every Council district, except one, come in here and speak on this issue. Eighty-eight individuals have come down here from all over the county, 9 from outside the county, to talk about this topic. I know some people say it's the same 10 people over and over and there are people who have been here many times. But we've also received hundreds of e-mails, at least I have. I think that it's time for

Council to vote. These people, people all over Allegheny County, want us to discuss this. We haven't. It's being discussed all around us, and I think it's time for a vote. Thank you.

MR. BURN: Mr. President, Point of Privilege --- Procedure, Point of Procedure. With your permission, Mr. President, I need to ask the Solicitor a question.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Please do.

MR. BURN: Mr. Cambest, a question for you, sir. This is a procedural motion, as I understand it. This is not a motion that gets into the substance of the proposed legislation, but rather a procedural vote on bringing a substantive matter to the body; am I correct?

MR. CAMBEST: That's correct.

MR. BURN: Mr. Cambest, if I have a conflict on the substantive issues of the ordinance, which I do and which I will articulate if the bill gets pulled, my question to you is, because of that conflict, what is my ability or inability to vote on a procedural motion to pull the bill from committee?

MR. CAMBEST: Mr. Burn, I don't think there's a conflict on the procedural issue of calling it off the table and bringing it before Council. Once that's out of the way, then you may have a conflict on the substantive portion.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I could not hear that ruling. I need to hear that ruling.

MR. CAMBEST: I said, Ms. Heidelbaugh, that there is no conflict on bringing a --- the procedural aspect of bringing the motion from the table before Council.

MS. HEDELBAUGH: Thank you.

MR. BURN: If the bill comes onto the floor and Ms. Danko's motion is successful, then at that point I'll get into, with more specificity, the reasons for my need to abstain on the substantive merits of the legislation. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you.

MR. FINNERTY: Mr. President?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Go ahead.

MR. FINNERTY: I was really under the impression that when you want to pull a bill, it's not on the floor. It's still in committee until it's pulled.

MR. CAMBEST: That's correct.

MS. DANKO: I have made ---.

MR. FINNERTY: Excuse me.

MS. DANKO: Sorry.

MR. FINNERTY: And one of the reasons for pulling the bill, that I know of, is the time in this matter. And my question has to do with --- and what we've done before --- that you can't speak to the bill when it's pulled, until it's on the floor. So what I'm saying is, the merits of the bill one way or not, should not have been discussed here. We're talking about pulling a bill ---

MR. CAMBEST: That's right.

MR. FINNERTY: --- on timeliness. Until it gets to the floor, we shouldn't be talking about this bill.

MR. CAMBEST: Well, the president asked Ms. Danko's comment and that's why, I believe, she commented on that. I don't know that there was a good discussion on the substantive portion of the bill; it was just whether or not --- she thought it was time where it should be brought forward.

MR. FINNERTY: I understand that. I'm just saying that I think that's been the way we've operated, that --- and I'm sure Matt knows that --- that if you try --- if you want to pull a bill before you can speak, then that's what I believe that Councilman Burn is speaking to; before you can speak to the merits of the bill, it has to be on the floor.

MR. CAMBEST: That's correct.

MR. FINNERTY: And that's what I think we should stick to, what we --- is our procedure --- our parliamentary procedure.

MR. CAMBEST: I don't disagree with you. I think the president asked for a comment, and she gave it. Thank you. That's all.

MR. FINNERTY: Okay. I just want to make sure everybody understands the parliamentary procedure.

MR. FUTULES: I want to make a little clarity, too, the fact that it's not on the floor. Before we take it to a vote, do we just take it to a vote, or do we make a comment as to how we're going to vote and why? I mean, do we just --- what's the procedure there?

MR. CAMBEST: Well, you shouldn't --- we shouldn't --- as Mr. Finnerty said, there shouldn't be a discussion on the substantive portion of the bill. If for any reason you felt that procedurally the bill should not

be brought out, if there's a violation of the rule or something, you can speak to that.

MR. FUTULES: Okay.

MR. CAMBEST: But just on the procedural aspect.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: First Mr. Drozd, then ---

MR. DROZD: I'm not going to talk the substantive of the bill, but I am going to talk about the procedure --- the parliamentary procedure. And I think that needs to be changed --- I think it really does --- because here we are.

MR. FINNERTY: No.

MR. DROZD: I get a chance to talk to the procedure, Mr. Finnerty, Councilman Finnerty.

MR. CAMBEST: Are you talking about the procedure on this ---?

MR. DROZD: No. No, I'm saying overall. Yeah, overall procedure, the way we do business. When we're pulling a lot of different ordinances and motions out of committee, the people, as well as these Council members, have a right to know something about what we're pulling out; they do.

MR. CAMBEST: Well, I think she ---.

MR. DROZD: For us to say, oh, pull ordinance --- I'm sorry, Mr. Cambest. I understand. And please forgive me, but you know, what are we doing here? We're pulling out the ordinance --- number, number, number --- and not saying what it is or giving a little bit of background information? And the people that are observing and in the audience, they have no concept, and some of us don't, because we don't know ordinance --- and I'll guarantee you that --- by number. So I just have a problem. I think that needs to be changed in parliamentary procedure, and maybe I'll introduce something next meeting to do that. Thank you, sir. Thank you. I'm sorry, Mr. Cambest.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Go ahead, Barbara.

MS. DANKO: My understanding is that because we're past the 60 days, we take a vote to pull it. We need a majority of Council to vote yes to pull it.

MR. FUTULES: --- majority.

MS. DANKO: No.

MR. CAMBEST: Eight votes.

MR. FUTULES: Eight votes?

MR. CAMBEST: More than 60 days, yeah.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Well, why don't we just vote, then?

MR. FINNERTY: Wait. I got a ---

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Go ahead.

MR. FINNERTY: I've got a comment.

MR. FUTULES: Comment on it.

MR. FINNERTY: It's not a matter of what's in the bill, it's just the matter of pulling it from committee. I think it should stay in committee. I think it's part of our process that it is in committee. And I think that there should be some sort of meeting, and we should discuss it in committee before we pull it and bring it to the floor. I understand it's been a while, but it's still part of the process. So that's my feelings.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Okay.

MR. FUTULES: Okay. Well, in my opinion, I think it should stay in committee, as well, but we don't have an ordinance in front of us yet for any type of activity in the park, so I think that these two will coincide. Once the other agenda comes to us, I believe that a moratorium bill would be an option at the time. So I don't think that this is the appropriate time to take it out of committee when we haven't even discussed it at all in a committee process, and we're just circumventing a pretty important issue. So that's the way I think.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Your turn.

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Thank you, Mr. President. I want to try to be diplomatic when I make this comment. But, I think what everyone seems to be tap dancing around is the fact that it was presented that committee meeting would be held and this bill would be discussed. And that was a while ago. That hasn't happened yet. And so if we recognize that, can we at least give Councilwoman Danko some credit for having the guts to come in here and make this motion? Thank you.

(Applause.)

MR. MACEY: Thank you, Mr. President, and members of Council. I agree with what the residents --- and those individuals in those districts who have a county park and what their desires are. To make a blanket resolution at this particular point would maybe not give those opportunities ---.

MR. BURN: Point of Order. I think we're into substance. No disrespect, Council, but I think you're

getting into the meat and potatoes, and they're not on the table yet. That's all I'm saying.

MR. MACEY: Correct. Okay. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: So who's next here? Matt?

MR. DROZD: Yeah. I just --- I just believe --- and whether you agree with whatever, an ordinance is, or whatever, and I'm not getting into the substance. Whether you agree or disagree, I believe we owe the council member and their constituents at least the courtesy to give them the opportunity to bring it out on the floor. And then if you so desire, you can vote it up or down. I just always believe that. People have the right to know, and this is another way for them to know a little more about what the substance of it is. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: John?

MR. DEFAZIO: Let me ask the question. Chuck, I know people who want this to be brought up. Are you planning to bring this out of committee? I'm not saying at this moment, all --- once they come forward from the County Executive with the bill ---

PRESIDENT MARTONI: If he ever sends us a bill, yeah. I haven't got a bill; and I never got a bill.

MR. DEFAZIO: Now some of these people, it looks like they're being afraid it's not going to come out.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: I have not got a bill.

MR. DEFAZIO: No, no. Okay. But I'm going to --- the plans are, once you get it, we are going to have ---.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Absolutely; and we're going to discuss it. Has there ever been a time when a bill came that we didn't have a meeting and discussed it?

MR. DEFAZIO: No, I agree. I'm just --- I'm saying, we're voting for the people.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: I know you are.

MS. DANKO: Call the question.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Question.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Burn?

MR. BURN: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Danko?

MS. DANKO: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio?

MR. DEFAZIO: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Drozd?

MR. DROZD: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?
MR. FINNERTY: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?
MR. FUTULES: No.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?
MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Harris?
MS. HARRIS: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE: No.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?
MS. REA: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni, President?
PRESIDENT MARTONI: No.

MR. CATANESE: So we have ayes, 8, noes, 7; pull the bill.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: The bill is pulled.

MR. BURN: Mr. President, if I may, now that it's on the floor, ---

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Right.

MR. BURN: --- may I make my statement about my reasons to abstain, before we begin to vote?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Please.

MR. BURN: Thank you very much. The reason for my abstention --- and the reason is a conflict. As many of you know, I'm a trial attorney by trade. I have clients right now who we have --- pending litigation, or inevitably we're going to have litigation. And some of the defendants are going to be --- some of the industry --- some of the fracking industry. Because of my opinion, my clients are suffering because of some of the exposures they've had or some of the dangers and hazards that they've been exposed to. That is not to be taken as a referendum on the industry; that is, my opinion based on the injuries my clients have sustained and based on the medical evidence. We're going to pursue those actions, and I do suspect that we will be looking in the direction

of some of these drilling companies. And therefore, because of that --- and again, that's no referendum on either side --- because of that, I do believe I have a conflict. And because of that, I will abstain, and I would remind my colleagues to please note, up until this point, I really haven't weighed in one way or the other, because the issue wasn't right for me to have that conversation, or to specifically list my reason for the abstention.

Now it is right, and now I'm saying it. And thank you for your indulgence, and thank you all so much for your activism and your understanding.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Go ahead.

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Thank you, Mr. President. And my comments are very similar to Councilman Burn, in that I do have a conflict, as well, on the substantive issue with regards to drilling. Due to my husband's business --- business activities, our family does have a financial interest in drilling. And I do believe I need to abstain from the decision on this.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Mr. President, may I speak?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Yes, you may.

MR. CATANESE: Yes, you may, Councilwoman.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Yes, please.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Thank you. Unfortunately, at this time, I believe it's the safe thing for me to abstain, based on a potential conflict which I may have.

MS. DANKO: Mr. President, can I speak to the merits of the bill?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Yeah, please; please do that.

MS. DANKO: All right. Back in January, the County Executive --- when we did the airport, we took the airport vote and we --- Council voted to give the Airport Authority authorization to enter into a lease. The County Executive, I believe --- almost everybody heard this conversation --- said, we'll see how this goes before we try to do anything else, and I took him at his word. I'm not sure what changed, but by beginning of the summer, we started hearing about --- well, we have people interested in drilling in our parks. So what does this bill do? It tries to slow down the process by enacting a three-year hold on leasing surface or sub-surface rights on Allegheny County parkland. It's really a very simple bill; three-year hold. After the three years, you know, we may

decide it's a good idea; we may not. And part of the reason that I chose three years was because of the uncertain regulatory environment that we exist in in Pennsylvania.

Aside from the fact that we have environmental protections in our state constitution, we also have a --- a very significant court case still sitting in the Pennsylvania Supreme Court. It was there when I introduced the bill in September; it's still sitting there. And this case deals with municipal rights vis-à-vis drilling. The State Department of Environmental Protection --- I think it was August or the beginning of September --- issued extensive new regulations speaking to drilling activity around the state.

It will probably take at least a year or more for those regulations to be finalized. We're new. The gas isn't going anywhere. I think that to take --- to push forward now, particularly in our parks --- we're the public stewards of the land owned by the people of Allegheny County is --- for us to go too fast, I think we're doing a disservice to our children, our grandchildren. I also want to say that, you know, the park system in Allegheny County was designed --- I mean, they --- there was --- apparently, they had the map of the county, and they tried to make it so that everybody in Allegheny County could access a park.

You know, that's why we have North Park, South Park, parks in the valley, parks up in the Alle-Kiski area. We have parks scattered. It's not like they're all in one --- one section of the county. This was, as someone said to me last week, designed to be the poor man's country club, and we need to protect that interest going forward. Thank you.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Matt?

MR. DROZD: Thank you, Mr. President. I'm going to have to abstain, too, because I am in --- I do work closely with someone that --- a company that does water reclamation and cleanup. And we do, or will be, marketing and --- this is the good side of this. Okay? And yes, what we do is something that might be --- so I'm going to have to abstain on this, too. Thank you, Mr. President. Thank you, my Council Members.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Yeah?

MR. MACEY: Thank you, Mr. President, and members of Council. I am not going to abstain.

(Applause.)

MR. MACEY: I represent 94,000 people in my district, and in my district, we've suffered from the closing of the steel mills. We have communities of modest means. We need jobs. We make coke in Clairton. We send the coke to ET. ET makes steel; steel goes to Irvin Works. Irvin Works send that flat to --- steel to McKeesport. McKeesport makes pipe. The pipe then goes to Duquesne and it goes to Liberty Borough, where it's coded, where it's processed. For what? The Marcellus Shale gas industry. In addition to that, White Oak has a gas lease, McKeesport has it. Elizabeth Township has gas leases, and they're drilling in Forward Township.

People I represent, need the income. People I represent, the communities, need the revenue. I don't have a problem. And of course, the communities I serve certainly, to this point, don't have a problem with Marcellus Shale. I've seen commissioners in townships. I've seen them work with the industry. Take those frack trucks and slow them down to 20 mile an hour. Make sure that they're not using their Jake brake to upset the communities and create noise in those communities.

They're following the rules. They're following the laws. In my community, we look at it as a blessing. And for some individuals to say, we don't want the pollution, and we don't want any of the --- the dirt and the filth of the steel industry, I want to remind them that the steel industries of the Mon Valley won us two wars and continues to support our military and support this nation, as well as the world. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Matt?

MR. DROZD: Yeah, go ahead ---.

MR. FINNERTY: You abstained.

MR. DROZD: I can still talk. I checked with legal.

MR. FUTUILES: Oh, no you can't ---.

MR. DROZD: I just checked with legal. No. No, I can talk; correct?

MR. CAMBEST: Anybody before this vote can ---.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Yeah.

MR. CAMBEST: You just can't ---.

MR. FUTULES: I thought when you abstained, you take away your right to even the conversation about the --

-

MR. FINNERTY: No, no.

MR. FUTULES: Really?

MR. FINNERTY: Yeah. He's still ---.

MR. FUTULES: That's my point.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: They told me in --- that you're not supposed to speak.

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: You're not supposed to influence the billing.

MR. FUTULES: That's correct. You don't influence the billing ---.

MR. DROZD: Well legal just --- it was a legal opinion.

MR. FUTULES: Once you abstain, you're out.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: What's the legal opinion?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: You could abstain for a host of reasons, but if you have a conflict of interest, you're not supposed to --- I'm sorry. Mr. President, you didn't give me the floor. I'm sorry.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: No, you got the floor, because I don't know that.

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: You're not supposed to influence the bill at all.

MR. FUTULES: Correct.

MR. CAMBEST: You're not supposed to --- the language we had in our rules is, you're not supposed to participate and vote --- and that's ---.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: John?

MR. DEFAZIO: Chuck?

MR. MARTONI: John.

MR. DEFAZIO: Okay. Let me say something here --- and this isn't saying we'll go this way or that way. Number one, we have people --- a lot of people up here all abstain, abstain, abstain. We have to have a committee meeting, first of all, to check --- do you really have to abstain or don't you? I mean, we don't seem to have this --- our act together here on that, number one. Number two, we haven't heard hardly anything. A lot of people made a lot of sense in what they were saying, but we never heard hardly anyone from the other side. So there's a lot in issues. And I know Bob Macey made some good points. There's a lot of people making good points. But we have to dig further into this, and

now you have a bunch of people saying they're abstaining. And maybe under certain conditions, once we check it out, you don't have to abstain. Their vote ain't going to count anyway, so the way they're going now, hardly anyone is voting up here, it looks like. So I recommend that we're going to have to regroup on this and have a --- you know, have our meeting and discuss it and check into it. Do you really have to abstain or don't you?

MR. CAMBEST: I mean, you bring --- you bring up a good point. As I understand, most of the abstention stuff, except for Mr. Burn and Ms. Hawkins, they indicated that they believe they have a direct personal interest, as opposed to --- Mr. Drozd is saying, well, he's associated with a water company. I don't know that a water company is going to be involved in the final drilling there. So that's kind of a general --- you know, I guess you could say that for --- even for Ms. Hawkins and Mr. Burn, that until there's a bill brought here that says okay, we're going to lease this to ABC Company, and that's who's going to do the drilling or water reclamation or whatever it may be, they still --- they have a conflict in general, but as Mr. DeFazio says, it's really not specific. I don't know --- and unless you feel there's some information, no matter what company is ultimately going to do the drilling, or the water reclamation, or whatever, that you're going to have a potential pecuniary interest, and you have the right to abstain.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Yeah. Do you want to speak?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: I have in mind a particular entity, which is why I raised the conflict of interest.

MR. CAMBEST: I understand. I'm just, you know, raising that question.

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: So this was good for the public's information, as well.

MR. FUTULES: Mr. Finnerty and I have our hands up.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: I'm sorry. Is it your first?

MR. FUTULES: I don't care. I have a gas furnace and I have a gas stove. Should I abstain? That's what it's starting to sound like --- I don't mean --- but seriously, though ---

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I would like to make a comment, when someone lets me have a chance.

MR. CAMBEST: No, you raise --- you raise a good question. Now pecuniary interest has to be something that not everybody --- not associated with all the other members. It has to be an individual pecuniary interest.

MR. FUTULES: Sure. Well, I just --- I just want to really comment --- on why I do not believe --- let's go back to the moratorium and let's get away from abstentions. Moratoriums, in my opinion, take away my right as a Councilman to address each bill that comes before me regarding the parks, such as Deer Lakes, North Park, South Park. I was elected to vote. Abstention, personal reasons, I understand. But I certainly would not want to take away my right as a councilman and the Chairman of the parks to address each park individually, when and if they never come up.

So by abstention, or should I say --- I'm sorry --- by the moratorium, I've taken away my rights as a Councilman to explore the possibilities in the future for any type of drilling, because of our legislation, unless we reverse it or --- after three years, of course. I agree with that. But it's obvious that we have a specific Deer Lakes Park in hand, and for us to place a moratorium could endanger the possibility of the exploration of us even considering it. And that's something I'm not going to do. We definitely need to take our stand as Council members and vote the way we feel. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Michael?

MS. DANKO: I'd like to call the question.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Wait a minute. I'd like to say something, please.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Michael?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Joe?

MR. FINNERTY: You did before that. I just --- what's that?

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen wants to speak.

MR. FUTULES: After Mr. Finnerty.

MR. FINNERTY: Well, I just wanted to say that I'm pretty disappointed about somebody throwing a moratorium up there. I think that --- it would be different if it was a year, but we're talking about three years. There's a tremendous amount of information in relation to this drilling, and I think everybody out there knows that. You've been presenting it continually. I mean, it might be one-sided, but you've been presenting

it. And there's another side to the story, and as Councilman DeFazio said, we're going to have to have a public hearing, anyhow. And we'll see both sides of the story at that time. But to put a moratorium up and say, well, I don't care what happens in the public hearing, because we're not going to do it for three years. I think that's the wrong way to go. We have to sit up here, and we have to vote the way we think is best for the people of Allegheny County; not one group, the whole county.

I understand people have opinions one way or another, and so do we. And we should be respected for our opinions, just as we respect you for yours. And putting a moratorium up is just kicking the can down the road, and I don't think that's what we do here. They might do it other places, but we don't do it here. And that's all I have to say. Thank you.

MR. CATANESE: Councilman Ellenbogen would like to speak. Go ahead, Mr. Ellenbogen.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Okay. Does the Chair recognize me?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Yeah, we recognize you, Jim.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Okay. Boy, isn't that unusual where I'm the one quiet?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: That is very unusual.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: All right. Well, here it goes. Number one, you know, I don't think it's fair for anybody to disparage Councilwoman Danko, because if you look at the chart, she's getting the most heat out of her district than anywhere. In my district, more people --- they're more interested, like Councilman Macey's district, in working, you know what I mean? But I'm going to tell you, as the public safety chair, you know, I got concerns, you know. The county manager will tell you that I spoke to him about my concerns, in terms of emergencies and things like that. In theory, I want everything to be safe. But as Councilman Finnerty said, kicking the can down the road, in a lot of instances, is a good idea.

But this is like kicking a can down the road. Because of the corporate heads and the money and the people that are involved in this, this is like putting a baby alligator in the sewer and then coming back three years later and now go get him. This thing's going to be bigger and more powerful, and I --- like Councilman Finnerty said, and I've said this before --- you know what, let's dig into it, let's research it and let's vote

up or down, whether this is where we were elected to take the direction of this county in. You know, I've been disparaged for making wrong choices in my life, but I'm not afraid to say what I feel. And you know what, like Councilman DeFazio said, let's dig in and roll up our sleeves and figure out whether this is safe, whether this makes us money, keeps the taxes down and get on with the business of this, and let's just vote it up or down and to have these committee meetings, like, as soon as possible. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Let's just call the question and vote.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Burn?

MR. BURN: Abstain.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Danko?

MS. DANKO: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio?

MR. DEFAZIO: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Drozd?

MR. DROZD: Abstain.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Abstain.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Harris?

MS. HARRIS: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Abstain.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?

MS. REA: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni, President?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: No.

MR. CATANESE: The yeas are 2, the noes are 9 and there's 4 abstentions.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Okay. Thank you.

MR. CATANESE: It fails.

MS. DANKO: I appreciate the vote from my colleagues. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. Notification of Contracts.

MR. DROZD: I may have one that I'd like to pull out this evening.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Okay. How about a motion?

MR. DROZD: And we can read whatever we can read. I make a motion to pull this out. I make a motion --- wait until I get the number. Remember what I said about remembering numbers? That's my perfect example. I'm making a motion to pull 7831-13. Can I read what the resolution is?

MR. ROBINSON: Second.

MR. DROZD: Okay.

MR. BURN: Point of order. Can you read it before it's here, or is it just a motion to pull the bill without reading the subject matter?

MR. CATANESE: I believe we have to pull first.

MR. BURN: We get to make a motion to pull Bill X-Y-Z-1-2-3 without naming what the bill is.

MR. CAMBEST: Correct.

MR. BURN: I don't --- but I think Joe was about to read about the substance. All right. Thank you, Mr. President.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Go ahead, go ahead.

MR. DROZD: Thank you.

MR. DEFAZIO: How about getting a second?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: What the hell's going on?

MR. DEFAZIO: There wasn't a second.

MR. ROBINSON: Second.

MR. FINNERTY: Yeah, there's a second.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Mr. Robinson.

MR. FINNERTY: 7831. All right? Thank you. In regard to timeliness, I don't think there's any timeliness considered on this bill whatsoever. I think it's been in committee how many days?

MR. BARKER: The bill was entered November, on the 6th.

MR. FINNERTY: November the 6th? So timeliness is not something on this bill at all. So that --- for that reason, I don't think it should be pulled. Thank you.

MR. DROZD: Can I come up and comment, not on the substance, Mr. President?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Yeah, go ahead, comment. Let's see what it is.

MR. DROZD: Yes. Thank you, sir. The media just reported recently about pulling and getting these bills out on the floor and into this --- into this grand Gold Room of ours to vote on. But the timing of this is very slow. Now it's no fault of the Chairman or anything. I don't fault any one Council members. But we are being criticized in the media, and then the media does report to our constituents. The timeliness of these --- getting these out are very slow. I can't remember. I mean, this maybe one, November 9th. But my God, I got some I haven't even seen. I don't even remember --- let alone the substance, let alone the number.

What's going on? Why aren't we getting and addressing these bills that Council members --- whether you agree or disagree with them, put them out. That's what it's about. Whether you agree or not agree, people have a right to know. Thank you.

MR. FINNERTY: Robinson wants to talk.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: He wants to talk? I'm sorry. Go ahead.

MR. ROBINSON: No comment, Mr. President.

MR. FINNERTY: Oh, I thought you were going to say something. I'll say something.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Did you want to say something? Go ahead.

MR. ROBINSON: No, sir.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Michael?

MR. FINNERTY: This bill has been vetted in committee a number of times. It's in Mr. Robinson's committee, I believe. And it's been held every time, and it's been held with the consent of the sponsors of the bill. There's no timeliness on it. There's no reason to pull it. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Mr. Drozd and then ---

MR. DROZD: Oh, thank you, Mr. --- correction. This bill hasn't been vetted. It's in a different committee. You're correct on that one. I have two different bills addressing similar issues to this without going into substance. And I thank Chairman Robinson for what he's done. He's brought --- he's done due diligence. He's doing what he's supposed to do, and I thank him for

that. But this one --- and no fault, again, of any one person or anything like that. Please understand that, it hasn't. And I've had other invoices --- not invoices, bills; I haven't really been thinking about any more --- ordinances or resolutions that haven't been addressed. This is one of them. Thank you.

MR. FINNERTY: I call the question.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Question called. I guess we better do a roll call.

MR. CATANESE: We will need 2/3 on this --- pass in 60 days.

MR. DEFAZIO: Point of Order.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Point of Order; go ahead.

MR. DEFAZIO: You didn't accept the vote. If someone makes a motion to cease debate ---

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Will somebody tell me what you guys are discussing? I can't hear real good with the ---

PRESIDENT MARTONI: I cannot tell you. Somebody else has to tell him.

MR. DEFAZIO: If someone makes a motion to cease debate with a second, then you need 2/3. I don't think that happened. He just said a motion, and then we didn't do anything. If anybody has any questions ---

MR. FINNERTY: I just called the question, is what I did.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: He called the question.

MR. FINNERTY: I called the question.

MR. DEFAZIO: You didn't say, cease debate.

MR. FINNERTY: No. I called the question ---

PRESIDENT MARTONI: So then that would be a roll call I would imagine. Roll call.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Burn?

MS. DANKO: To put this on the agenda?

MR. CATANESE: That's correct. Pull the bill

MR. FINNERTY: It takes 10 votes to pull it.

MR. BURN: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Danko?

MS. DANKO: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio?

MR. DEFAZIO: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Drozd?

MR. DROZD: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I can't vote on what I can't hear. I don't even know what you're voting on.

MR. CATANESE: We're voting to pull Bill 7831-13 from Committee.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: What's the subject?

MR. FINNERTY: We can't tell you.

MR. DROZD: There goes my point.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Well, you want me to vote on something I don't even know what I'm voting on.

MR. FINNERTY: Just abstain.

MR. FUTULES: Abstain. That seems to be the rule today.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Well, I'm going to have to abstain, if I don't even know what I'm pulling out of committee.

MR. FINNERTY: Okay.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Okay. Let's go.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Harris?

MS. HARRIS: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?

MS. REA: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni, President?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 5, noes, 9, with 1 abstention. It fails.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Notification of Contracts. 7850-13.

MR. CATANESE: We already voted on that one.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Yeah. I didn't remember that. It seemed like a long time ago.

MR. CATANESE: We're at Public Comment.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Public --- yes. Do you want to say something?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Yeah, I just wanted to have the opportunity to make a comment. Thank you for giving me that opportunity, Mr. President. And it's in response to remarks I'm hearing about people that are abstaining from voting tonight. And I would note that three people who said they would abstain are attorneys. We know that in some jurisdictions, where you know you have a conflict of interest, it is a violation of the law. Even if it's not a violation of the law, should you vote on something where you have a conflict of interest, you risk disciplinary action. You risk your license that you worked hard for. And I can't tell you what my mother, and my family, and me went through to get my license.

I'm not risking it, so joke all you want. It's not a joke. Thank you.

MR. BURN: Mr. President, let me jump on that. I appreciate that remark because, look, we didn't all --- we many not all agree up here. We may have our healthy debates. We don't mock each other for the decisions we make on whether we vote yes, whether we vote no or whether we abstain. And I, for one, didn't show up with a doctor's note to avoid the drink tax. So you really should govern yourself accordingly, Mr. Vice President. We had a right to do that, as you had a right to vote no, as you had a right to vote yes. I just think you were out of line with what you said.

(Applause.)

MR. FUTULES: I apologize.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Okay. He apologizes. Now let's get on with our speakers. Rick Grejda --- Grejda (changes pronunciation). If I mispronounce your name, forgive me. Rick, are you here? Come up. How about pronouncing your name correctly.

MR. GREJDA: Sure; Grejda, Grejda.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Grejda; okay.

(Applause.)

MR. GREJDA: I won't do this in open record. We'll talk about that later, but I enjoy the services of the JCC up in Scott Township, in your district, great people. Ms. Danko, I go up to the pool in Squirrel Hill, too, so great people up there. My name's Rick Grejda. I'm a business agent with SEIU 668. I'm here to speak regarding the fact that County Executive Rich --- excuse me, Fitzgerald, is refusing to pay some workers their annual longevity payments. These workers work primarily

in the Office of Court Records. They're here this evening, the district attorney, the public defender, the medical examiner and the sheriff.

This is a violation of the current collective bargaining agreement. In addition, it's an unfair labor practice. But worst of all, the worst part about this, it's an attack on these workers. These workers are among some of the lowest paid workers in the entire county. These workers that depend on this longevity payment. This payment is normally made in the month of December. As such, a large number of these workers depend on this for the holidays.

Rich Fitzgerald is essentially stealing Christmas from these workers and their families, simply because they elected to go to binding arbitration as part of their collective bargaining process. This is the first time in the history of Allegheny County with this bargaining unit, that any elected official, whether it be the County Executive or a commissioner, has withheld these payments. We realize you have limited ability to fix this problem, but what we're asking each of you to do on Council is to make a personal call to Rich Fitzgerald, to send him an e-mail, to write a letter. I want you to support these workers. I want you to ask Rich Fitzgerald to pay the contractual obligation of this county to these employees. That's all we're asking.

We tried to resolve this amicably; you know, we've had several meetings. I've been a business agent in this county for eight years. Never have I come before this body with an ask like this. Now we have to support these workers. It's the holidays; it's the right thing to do. I'm not sure, I guess I have 52 seconds left. I'm done. If anyone has any questions, you know how to reach me. Thank you for your time. Happy Holidays to you and your families.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. Mel Packer? Mel Packer? I know you're here.

MR. PACKER: Mel Packer, 623 Kirtland Street. You know, if anybody is going to abstain, it seems to me Rich Fitzgerald should probably abstained, because Rich Fitzgerald owns a company called Aquanef, which in the last campaign, it was revealed that he had cut a deal with Clean Water and Energy. We know nothing more about it. So if there's any conflicts of interest going on, perhaps

somebody should investigate Aquanef and see what that's all about, as well, while he negotiates with the companies that may, in fact, directly benefit him.

You know, I've been working for 45 years of my life. I just recently retired. I worked as a truck driver, local, long haul. I hauled that steel out of that valley, Bob.

MR. MACEY: Thank you.

MR. PACKER: I have hauled a lot of steel in those three years that I hauled over the road. I've become nuc med tech, then became a physician --- then retired from Mercy Medicine as physician assistant. I've been involved all those years in peace and justice --- but never in my life did I think I'd become an environmentalist. I drank the Kool-Aid. I thought technology could fix everything. I didn't believe the crap about the oceans were rising --- only in the last few years of my life never did I realize, we're in a whole lot of trouble. There's madness going on out there, folks. But what we've got being rammed down our throats, a man who doesn't want to pay the workers who wants the money that's due to them, but he wants to negotiate some deal so those frackers could make a bunch of money and ruin our parks, and contribute to this madness.

(Applause.)

MR. PACKER: Every day or my life, I pick up my newspaper and find --- or look on the Internet and find --- a new scientific study that talks about dangers in the environment. It talks about the fact that much of Florida is going to be underwater before the end of the century. It talks about our inability to stop the storms in New York City, our inability to stop the massive hurricanes that are --- hurricanes and the tornados that just hit out in the mid-West. We don't have --- this is all the product of climate change. Every day there's never one single scientific study, not a single scientific study, that says this is not true. Every single study says this is true. I have a lot more to say. I'm going to stop it here. I'm just going to go to the delegate to the Warsaw Conference in the Philippines. When he responded to the typhoon in the Philippines, he said, what's going on here is absolutely madness in our planet. We have to look at our children and think, what do we want to give to our children? Do we want to continue the madness? Do we want to contribute to this by fracking in our county parks? I

know that's a small thing. It's not a lot of jobs, and it's a very small contribution to climate warming and climate change. But folks, it is happening. Do we really want to continue to engage in this environment, or do we want to make some common sense here, hold back and say, we don't need that gas? That gas is going to be there three years from now. As Barbara said and some of you have said, there's no need for us to negotiate a deal right now. And you're going to have this jammed down your throat in January by Rich Fitzgerald.

You know darn well he's going to do that to you, and we're going to be up here opposing it. I want you to get up tomorrow morning, look in the mirror and think about your grandchildren and think, if you want to continue to contribute to that madness, and I hope you don't. Thank you.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Timothy Ludwig? Timothy Ludwig? Timothy Ludwig?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: That's the wrong ---.

MR. LUDWIG: Tim Ludwig, 18 Greismere Street, in Etna. I was surprised when one of the Council members just was talking about the moratorium and said it'll take away their rights to act on any bills. You've already taken away your rights to act. You have let the County Executive be the sole negotiator in this leasing process. I'd stress, like I did last meeting, for you to get involved in the negotiating process, like the Charter allows you. You are the only --- governing power that is allowed to negotiate a lease. I stress that you take that power. Because I know that you guys will do that, I want to go to the RFP and point to a few things that you should address. In Section 2, Number 3, it talks about how the proposers should list all their environmental citations that have been acted against them.

This is a --- Huntley and Huntley is supposedly the company that's going to be leased to. They're going to sub-contract that and contract that, and it's going to keep on going down. None of those companies are obligated to list their citations. Range Resources alone, in a litigation that's going on right now, has listed over 40 sub --- contractors and sub-contractors that are just in their company alone. Range Resources alone has had over 210 violations. None of those will be listed on the proposal in front of you.

As I continue on to the next part of the RFP, we talk about water quality. And nowhere in your RFP discusses what chemicals are being tested. It leaves it up to the current regulations by the Pennsylvania Department of Environmental Protection which --- it has been proven in court cases that are going on in Washington County now are inadequate. We needed to wait for the new regulations to come out, see if those are adequate and continue from there. If you're familiar with that case in Washington County, families have had chemicals introduced to their water supply from the drilling companies and are now in their bodies. It was tested for by the DEP and declared safe. Then they went back in to --- look at the test, and they didn't disclose the chemicals that the company introduced because they were not required by law to disclose those chemicals.

When we talk about air --- water quality, you leave out a big component that is not listed anywhere on the RFP --- is air quality. Allegheny County and Pittsburgh are constantly being ranked in some of the top 25 worst air quality in the U.S. The drilling process has been shown to produce significant air pollution, and regulations should be in place, like other industrial facilities. When the congressman --- councilman mentioned the Clairton Coal Works, you guys have a regulator in that facility every day. This lease doesn't even mention any air quality. Thank you for your time.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: John Detwiler? John? If I mispronounced it, John, correct me, okay?

MR. DETWILER: John Detwiler, 5723 Solway Street. I'm represented by Councilwoman Danko, Councilman DeFazio and Councilwoman Heidelbaugh. I'm an engineer and a business consultant. I've worked for many of the industries and some of the same corporations that we're talking about when you discuss fracking. And for years, I was an employee of Allegheny County, so I know a good bit about those industry organizations. Forgive my saying so, I think I know a bit about you, too.

You aren't here on County Council to earn your living. Each of you for his or her own reasons stepped forward to serve. And more than that, you worked hard to be elected, to persuade your communities, to put their trust in you. And then you work even harder to keep

earning that trust over and over again, month after month. So I want to thank you for that service, and I want to thank you for bearing the responsibility of serving on this council.

Nobody needs to be told that we're in a desperately critical time through our whole human civilization. Look at the weather reports. Look at the silence coming out of climate-toxic Warsaw. Within our own generation, our actions may decide what the entire human experience succeeds or fails. Through our amazing technological skill and our simple-minded ambition, we have quite literally changed the world. And now, like the sorcerer's apprentice, we are paralyzed in fear that forces that we have put into motion. So this is the time that we've living in. As Shakespeare said about greatness, so we can say of responsibility. Some are born into it, some aspire to it, and some have it thrust upon them.

You may not have aspired to responsibility for the future of this planet, but it's being thrust upon us. For the past several years, I've been one of those citizens who spends nearly full-time working on the issues of fracking. When we started, there was a lot we didn't know, and there was a lot of people who knew much less than we did. So our challenge is to learn and share what we knew. Now the challenge is shifting; people know. If you looked at the stacks of documents we put on your desks, then you know, too. Now the challenge is to do something; past through the terrible realization of what we're up against, and then to find the courage again to actually do something about it. Here's what we know: fracking is dirty, dangerous and destructive, but it's also desperate. It's a frantic escalation of the all-consuming craving for more stuff to burn, regardless of the consequences. It makes no economic or moral sense. It is simply uncontrolled compulsion.

The world's best science says that the fossil energy industry already has stockpiled five times as much carbon-based fuel as it will take, to put our modern civilization over the edge into irrevocable disaster; already, five times. This council will soon be asked to throw our county parks onto that cataclysmic bonfire. It's time to step up. It's time to start saying no. Thank you.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Jennifer Myers? Jennifer Myers?

MS. MYERS: Hi. Jennifer Myers, 5431 Carnegie Street, Pittsburgh. Thank you --- thank you, Councilwoman Daly Danko, for what you tried to do. And thank you, Councilman Robinson, for supporting her, and co-sponsoring her, and thank you for the letter that you sent to my house. I really appreciate that. And thank you to the people who said yes. To having voted upon and then pretty much all of them had to abstain, so that was confusing. I guess I stand here before you as an obviously concerned citizen and somebody who is now kind of unclear as to what the legal steps are.

I'm still unclear about how the --- we still don't even know if it's legal to frack in the parks. I feel like that's still not been resolved. Now the moratorium is over. Actually, I'm quite confused, but I've committed myself to coming to each of these and letting you know that I still think that it's a crazy idea to frack in the parks. And if you can zoom out as earlier speakers just wanted you to, to the bigger global picture, which is basically what we have to --- we have to balance. It's really confusing right now. We've got the local, which Councilman Macey explained eloquently. That was, like, passion --- you spoke really beautifully about the district that you represent, and I really appreciate that. I feel like our --- our response is not to go against the people that you represent, it's that we're all trying to work together in this new paradigm, which is that the climate is going to hell in a hand basket, and we can't keep burning fossil fuels. That's the basic gist of our message, and the parks are wrapped up in it. But the moment now is just to embrace as much as we can, renewables. And we all know that, and it just sort of sounds like a pie-in-the-sky dream, but it really isn't. It's really happening in other countries, and you guys are leaders in this county. You can push this, you really can, and we can help you. I don't really know what the steps are. It seems very confusing to me.

I just wanted to end with this really beautiful thing that Mel Packer actually mentioned, Yeb Sano from the Philippines, his speech a couple days ago. I'll just say the part that really grabbed me. He said, to anyone who continues to deny the reality that is climate change, I dare you to get off your ivory tower and away from the

comfort of your armchair. I dare you to go to the islands of the Pacific, the islands of the Caribbean, the islands of the Indian Ocean and see the impacts of rising sea levels; to the mountainous regions of the Himalayas and the Andes and to see communities confronting glacial floods, to the Arctic where communities grapple with the fast dwindling ice caps, to the large deltas of the Mekong, the Ganges, the Amazon and Nile, where lives are drowned.

We're all in this together, and we just need to work together. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Terri Supowitz? Terri Supowitz, I see you there; Supowitz (changes pronunciation), I'm sorry.

MS. SUPOWITZ: I feel like I know all of you and we've become friends. I'm Terri Supowitz. I live, breathe and garden at 310 Hay Street, in Wilkinsburg. First of all, I want to thank Bill Robinson for co-sponsoring the three-year moratorium and, of course, Barbara Daly Danko for having the courage to put it forth. Thank you.

(Applause.)

MS. SUPOWITZ: I also want to say that I think all of you are good, bright people who really want to do the right thing, and this is a huge issue. I've written three or four different things, and the thing that's coming to me is that I truly believe this issue is not just Pittsburgh. You've been hearing other people. This is a world issue, and I believe this is about --- the sky is falling. It's, like, right here. We've got a little bit of time to prevent it to, you know, push it back up. But to me, the sky is falling. The air we breathe, the water we drink, the soil that we use for food, is all going to be poisoned and polluted, not tomorrow, not even next year, but I bet by the time --- I have grandchildren, six and eight; when they're grown 50 years from now, you betcha.

Pennsylvania, no one is going to be living here. We can't. It's going to be one big oil --- gas field, with drill sites everywhere. It's not just the drill sites, it's the casing that goes into the ground. Five percent leak immediately; not tomorrow, but immediately. All of them will eventually leak. We've got all that

stuff going on down, you know, a mile under, coming up, polluting the soil, going into the air, going into the water.

It just doesn't make sense. The country of France has banned it. The State of Vermont has banned it. If this weren't so controversial, how could you have a country take such an extreme position of saying no, we're not going to have it anywhere in our country, nowhere. Rich Fitzgerald said it's going to happen anyway. It's not going to happen anyway. You can say no. We all can say no. It doesn't have to happen. It will take courage for all of you to say no. It will mean that you have to step out of where you're comfortable and look. Mr. Macey, you also. And God knows, I want all of those people to have jobs. I don't want to take anything out of their pocket. But this is bigger than their job. It's bigger than the parks. It's bigger than the State of Pennsylvania. We have to say no. We have to move towards a ban of all drilling in --- in Allegheny County. Thank you.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Dianne Peterson? Dianne Peterson? She's here.

MS. PETERSON: I don't know if I can follow all those fine speakers, but I'll try. Hi, I'm Dianne Peterson, and I'm from 125 Woodshire, and an address that is very new to me. I'm new to the state, new to this community, just moved in two days before school started. We moved. It was not a decision we took lightly or took easily. We took over six months to decide. It was tough with two teenagers, a family, and dying parents. It was a tough-made decision, but something that was made easier by all the wonderful things we've heard. First of all, I got a wonderful job opportunity for my husband, and then things such as this, lots and lots and lots of positive press on Pittsburgh. In here you can read, you are one of the top cities visitation destinations.

We're in the top ten places to raise children and have babies. We're in the top ten places for entrepreneurs. We're in the top, or the best, place to retire --- someone else says it's number seven is the best place --- retire as a baby boomer, number five, the best -- happiest place to work, not --- one of the top 10 places for starting a business, one of the top 13 places for entrepreneurs to move to. In 2012, it was rated the

number one fastest growing American city, and top ten in the U.S.A. for recreational activities. And here we go, number one, in America, as the number one smartest city. I like that one.

Pittsburgh, I know, was once known as a really dirty, smelly, icky place, but you've changed that. You've turned that around. You're known as --- and I'm told, I've read, people have told me, people have told me when we were trying to make our decision --- you're progressive, you're forward thinking. The city is beautiful. The city is concerned about green. The city is smart, and the people that run it have vision. And I was encouraged when I heard that the City of Pittsburgh banned fracking. And we moved here, and were pleased. And I said, gosh, why haven't we moved here years ago, this is a great place --- oh, my gosh. But I've been unpleasantly surprised to hear that you guys are considering fracking in your city parks --- your county parks. I am shocked. I can understand you're sitting on a wealth of natural resources. I can understand the reality of fiscal truth. But why --- and I understand that fracking has some positive pluses; well, we can get rid of coal. I understand that. But you're going to replace one bad idea with another.

I, nor all the environmentalists we can pull together, nor all the concerned citizens about your personal health, our personal health pulled together, we do not have the resources that this industry has. And you can look --- look at the pros and cons of fracking. And guess what? They have so much resources and so much wonderful marketing. They can make a --- what is it, silk purse out of a sow, is that how it goes? And I think they have. I don't have all those resources, but they do. They made it sound wonderful. But you know what --- I am not --- sorry --- I am not by any means an expert on hydraulic fracturing, better known as fracking. I am not. But everything I read sounds pretty nasty. The water, the air, it's just downright nasty. I'm going to talk right through that thing.

So basically, would you think Pittsburgh now? Look at all the positive press. But you know what? When you think --- what is it, Love's --- Love's Canal? Do you think positive press? You know what? I think of you guys and I think, Pittsburgh's a great place. I want to see that this city and this county is a place of vision ---

and I want to keep it that way. I want to keep it for a place that we want to live. But I guarantee you if this happens, you start fracking in your county parks, I have told my husband we are considering moving. And you know what? You're not going to be in that Top Ten list of people that --- places where people might come and build families.

So you're concerned about the finances; I understand that. But it is not a blessing because, quite frankly, money's important. But without your personal health, without your environmental health, money means nothing. So this is not a blessing to us. Please take the time to view this seriously. We're talking --- I heard someone say about a baby alligator. That's perfect. We're releasing a baby alligator and then later saying, how do we move this alligator? Money's important, but our survival, our health, our vision is more important. Thank you so much.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Lester Ludwig?

MR. FUTULES: Now it's your turn, Les.

MR. LUDWIG: My name is Les Ludwig. I live at 6589 Rosemoor Street, in Squirrel Hill. And I want to briefly touch on the speed at which bills go through, because under consideration is something that's close to my heart because I thought it up, and that is that we have to go ahead and make MBRO or revenue opportunities the joint effort of the county and the city. Winning elections doesn't mean a damn thing when it comes to health. Thank God I survived. I'm going to be 81 shortly.

Mr. Macey, I'm going to take you to task for the following reason. In the '60s, I was a processor of egg products, and \$1 an hour was the minimum wage. And a husband came to me and sat in my office and begged me for his life. He came to me to ask me, please, please, find a way to get me out of the mills. The work I'm doing is guaranteeing me I am not going to ever reach retirement. You're playing with my grandchildren's lives, all eight of them, and we heard it over and over again tonight. We came through all those periods, how? Because we had to, we had no choice. But today, we do have a choice, and you're not willing to face up to it when you hear what these people are saying. You're looking at the dollar.

The dollar isn't going to do you any damn good when you're in the ground. Grow up, man. Thank God I made it this far. And I'll continue to fight, and I'm proud and pleased that there's another Ludwig in the room who came with better documentation and a wonderful lady who just moved into the community. God Bless You for doing your homework.

When are you going to do it? This woman is right. Wait three years. The gas isn't going to go anywhere, and we've got to look at the five percent, or whatever leaks, because it's going to destroy us. You're playing with your grandchildren's lives. And I'm here to stand and tell you, I don't want you playing with my grandchildren's lives. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Erica Chang? Did I pronounce it right; did I pronounce your name right, Erica?

MS. CHANG: Yes. My name is Erica Chang. I am --- I live at 4 Old Timber Trail, Pittsburgh, and I am a resident of Fox Chapel and a senior at the public High School. The environment around us, and local parks in particular, affect all of us; the water we drink, the air we breathe and the land we, and our children, play on. Fracking can harm all of these in ways that we understand but also, in so many ways that we don't. For instance, the wastewater that is created by fracking --- and I'm not talking about the toxic stew in containment pits --- but the water that is pumped out during the fracking process. Usually, it's heavy metals like lead and arsenic and even radioactive elements, like uranium and radium. Despite what many gas companies tell concerned citizens, a lot of this wastewater ends up in our public water sources; in part, contaminates our drinking water. And the fact that the industry is exempt from most environmental health laws, like the Clean Water Act, the Clean Air Act, and the Safe Drinking Water Act, just encourages the industry at our expense.

Furthermore, the process of hydraulic fracturing releases massive quantities of particulates that form unsafe levels of ozone and smog. We already have the highest level of particulate air pollution in the nation. Do we really need to add more? Besides the well researched causes of climate change, such smog leads to

increased rates of lung cancer, heart disease and a variety of respiratory diseases, especially in children. Parks like Hartwood Acres and North Park were part of my growing up. They're part of the lives of all the dog walkers, the joggers, and the children that play there.

Fracking upsets the fragile ecosystem of the area and disrupts the lives of all who enjoy parks, who breathe the air, who drink the water; in other words, your constituents. As noted in our state Constitution, and I quote, the people of Pennsylvania have a right to clean air, pure water and to the preservation of the natural, scenic, historic and esthetic value of the environment. We cannot embrace fracking for a cash wind-fall in the short term, if we all run the risk of health problems and their uncontrolled cost in the long term. We need more time to learn about and regulate the impact of hydraulic fracturing before we make some rash decision that we cannot undo later.

So please vote against the leasing of our county parks' mineral rights to gas companies, and thank you, Councilwoman Danko, for everything that you've done. And thank you all for your time.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Joni Rabinowitz? I think I saw her here. Yeah.

MS. RABINOWITZ: My name is Joni Rabinowitz. I live at 7721 Edgerton Avenue, in the City of Pittsburgh. I actually had three points that I was going to make tonight, but one of them has been taken care of, because I was going to take Dr. Martoni to task for not calling a committee meeting. So now that that's gotten out of the way by half the council deciding they didn't want to vote on this, I'll go on with my other two issues. Number one, it's been --- it's been alluded to tonight, and I really appreciate Dianne's comments and observations about what a wonderful area Pittsburgh and Allegheny County are, because I am a transplant also, and I feel the same way about all the things that she talked about.

However, in addition to all the things that we're first in and second in around the Country, we're also first in polluted air. Now I'm sure you all --- you saw this article on Sunday in the paper. If you didn't, you need to go back and look at it. But there was a study. There was a review from 1970 to 2012, which showed that we have one of the worst, if not the worst, air

pollution, ozone and particulate matter in the country. Not just last century, smoke --- were a problem, the report found that modern-day levels of air pollution lead to a broad range of very serious and potentially fatal health effects from cradle to grave. These include heart and lung disease, asthma, poor birth outcomes, premature birth and infant mortality. And the writer goes on to talk about how he describes some of the heartbreaking scenarios that he, as a physician, has seen in his practice as a result of this pollution. Now, I know they're talking about gas, but --- I mean, I know they talk about coal, but we haven't even looked at the results of methane, the methane in drilling.

Number two, I want to tell you about an article, Meet the Newest Anti-fracking Activist, Pope Francis. I thought it was a joke when I saw this. Pope Francis has come out against fracking, and I'm going to make this available to all of you, this article. Again, I thought it was a joke, so I checked it out. He has actually said that he is defending God's creation by being against fracking. He has a little t-shirt, No On Fracking. He also has another t-shirt which says that Water is More Important than Oil. And he's going to issue an encyclical on the issue. He met environmentalists from Argentina, which is his hometown of environmentalist, doctors, movie --- filmmakers, and he has come out with this statement. Now, for those of you who know it, please, look it up. I'm going to make it available for all of you. And again, Francis is, you know, if he's coming around to our side, we certainly need for the rest of you to look seriously at this issue.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Robert Nishikawa? I'm probably saying it wrong, Robert. Are you here?

MR. NISHIKAWA: I'm here. I'll pass.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Come on up if you're here.

MR. NISHIKAWA: No, I'll pass.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: He wants to pass. Thank you very much.

MS. NISHIKAWA: Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Would you pronounce your name for me?

MR. NISHIKAWA: Nishikawa.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Okay. I was a little close.

MR. NISHIKAWA: You did better last time.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Okay. Anais Peterson?

MS. PETERSON: Hi. I'm Anais Peterson. I live at 125 Woodshire ---

MS. PETERSON: Sorry. Is that better? Okay. So I also listened here a couple months ago, and the first thing that I really noticed about the whole Allegheny County was how beautiful all the natural resources --- like all natural was --- it is so gorgeous here. I love it. And when I first heard about fracking, the first --- like, it's just struck me --- how it ruined --- all the beauty in this area. It would just take away all the important things, just going on the bus to school, you see the beautiful leaves, the beautiful hills, and the fracking would take all of that away from everyone who lives here.

It wouldn't just take away, like, the beauty of the area. It also would negatively impact all of our health. Like, for example, the water that we all drink. If we frack in the area, there's a strong reason to believe that methane gas and other toxic gases will leech into our drinking water and will just leech into the water. And then that water, with that gas in it, will be put into our drinking water. This causes --- neurologic, respiratory, and sensory disorders. And that's what's going to be put into our bodies by these companies. That's just a start of an extremely long list of problems that fracking could cause to all of us. So you can look into this list there's huge numbers. Because of this, there's so much research to be done, so please don't allow them to frack our areas. There's so much harm it can do to us. You all have this chance to step up and be heroes to everyone in this county, so please take it and help save our lives for that.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thaddeus Popovich? Thaddeus Popovich? Thaddeus?

MR. POPOVICH: Thaddeus (changes pronunciation).

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Sorry about that.

MR. POPOVICH: Thank you for giving me the practice of being an orator. My name is Thaddeus Popovich. I live at 6606 Virginia Avenue, in the Borough of Ben Avon, six miles North of Pittsburgh along the Ohio River. At the Council meeting on September 24th, 2013, not too long ago, I presented information on the research

on shale gas extraction symposium being held on November 25th, 26th, at Duquesne University. More than two dozen academic researchers will be here in Pittsburgh to present their findings on issues that are so pertinent to the debate of fracking the county parks.

I long ago signed up for this symposium and recently was told that it is up to 350 registrants. In fact, they asked me, do I really want to come, because there's a waiting list; how about that? I understand --- how about this --- that Dr. Martoni, John Palmiere and Heather Heidelbaugh have signed on. Thank you very much.

(Applause.)

MR. POPOVICH: You will not be disappointed. In fact, I will be happy to introduce you to the presenters I know and other participants at the symposium. By the way, I dress up better than this on occasions. You won't be assessed.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: You look great.

MR. POPOVICH: Okay. And I'm also an engineer graduate, and I have a Masters, so if that helps. Okay. For the other Council members, the entire symposium is being videoed and will be available soon after its conclusion. I will connect you with the online links as soon as they are made available. I talked to John Stolz tonight --- or earlier today, who is running the symposium and will work with me on that.

There is a small opportunity coming up this Saturday, if you want a condensed version: Shale Drilling and Public Health, a Day of Discovery. The League of Women Voters of Pennsylvania's Shale and Public Health Committee are putting it on. That's from nine a.m. to five p.m., at the Heinz History Center. It is free. The public is invited. It doesn't get any better than that. You probably have to pay for parking, though.

Let me finish with this concept of the will to disbelieve. It goes something like this. Despite evidence about the human cost of fracking, many people don't want to face the facts. Some simply --- the data; others try to explain them away. So other people argue that the consequences of fracking are actually good, once one's consciousness is elevated in the right direction. I think it's called money trumps everything. These academic researchers and experts who will be in town will be presenting data that have been reviewed by their peers and

are in fact very believable. If you are a witness to this evidence, how can you not be a believer? Thank you.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. Karen Bernard? Karen Bernard, you're here?

MS. BERNARD: Hi. I live in Indiana Township. I don't consider myself an activist or an environmentalist. I'm not here to talk about numbers and facts because other people have been doing that for months now. If they haven't convinced you yet, then more for me aren't going to do it. I do want to talk about something from horror stories though. And that is, zombies. Maybe you realize and maybe you don't, but zombies are extremely popular now and they certainly were the most common creature at the Halloween party I went to. I also want to assure you I'm not some kind of kook. I'm just kind of your average white girl that's been to grad school and studied cultural symbols. And I think the zombie trend is not insignificant.

Okay, just one fact. 5.3 million people watched the first episode of the Walking Dead, a zombie show, and that's 83 percent more than watched the Season Four premiere of Mad Men, a very popular show. And I think there must be a reason that zombies are up. And one thing is I know that monsters are personifications of what we hear and they always have a basis in the current culture. So just brush up on zombies and I can tell you that they come from Caribbean voodoo. They're reanimated corpses controlled by the person that brought them back to life. They're the walking brain dead and they have no will of their own. In modern literature and film, I'm sure you've seen them around, their aim is to eat flesh and they're driven by one thing, insatiable hunger. Zombies are ravenous, mindless consumers --- and the George Romero movies, one was set in Monroeville mall, zombies I think are the embodiment of our own consumerism and greed.

So why zombies and why now? I agree with the critics who say it's because we have apocalypse on the brain. Zombies are about broad cultural collapse when anybody, a policeman, a nurse, a friend can turn into a force of evil. And unlike werewolves or vampires or King Kong, you can't have just one zombie, you have to have millions of them. So werewolves or vampires, with them all the evils concentrated in a single creature where with zombies, it's everywhere. And when you've got millions of

zombies lurching all over the place, society is clearly breaking down. The whole world is going crazy.

So here's the thing, ruining millions of gallons of good clean water with carcinogenic chemicals is crazy. Fracturing our bedrock, releasing heavy metals and radioactive elements into the water is --- and the toxins into the air, that's crazy. Poisoning our aquifers, devaluing our land and our homes is crazy. Doing all of this in order to consume more and more fossil fuel while our planet is unquestionably heading toward the point of ecological collapse is crazy. When government officials who are elected to serve and the protect the people and the land, make mindless decisions out of hunger for money, when any of us can't think for ourselves because we're controlled by corporations or just by the numbing everyday mindset of business as usual. And we can't imagine what's actually happening in the Philippines, or Tuvalu, or the other little islands in the pacific. And we can't imagine what's actually happening here in Western Pennsylvania and we can't imagine a green, healthy, thriving future. Then I fear we are dead people walking. Please let us avoid the zombie apocalypse. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Elissa Weiss.

MS. WEISS: Hello, again. I'm Dr. Elissa Weiss. 134 Dennis Drive, Glenshaw, Pennsylvania. Oh, sorry. Elissa Weiss. I'm an internist. I reside at 134 Dennis Drive in Glenshaw. I've spoken several times and I actually don't want to repeat all of that again, I am actually just going to try to reiterate some of what has been put forth as a position statement of Physicians for Social Responsibility whom I have mentioned on both previous occasions, the U.S. affiliate of the International Physicians for the Prevention of Nuclear War and recipient of the 1985 Nobel Peace Prize.

Essentially in their discussion of hydraulic fracturing, or fracking, they described it as a natural gas extraction process that has proven to have negative consequences for human health and for climate change. Fracking for natural gas extraction creates potentially harmful health effects along its entire life cycle. The hydraulic fracturing technique itself, as well as associated processes including road building, pad clearing, truck trips, drilling, cementing, flow back waters, off-gassing, fugitive emissions, compressors and pipelines, among the most serious sources of concern are

toxic drilling fluids in fracturing, air emissions including volatile organic compounds, diesel pollution and noise pollution, stress factors effecting the quality of life in communities where drilling occurs, methane leaks and accelerating climate change.

Due to the severity of these concerns, PSR believes it's critical to know and examine the health impacts of hydraulic fracturing. They have, therefore, recommended the precautionary approach that includes a moratorium on the use of hydraulic fracturing until such time as impartial federal agencies such as the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency develops and implements enforceable rules that provide adequate protections for human health and the environment from fossil fuel extraction processes that use hydraulic fracturing.

I'm not sure how this can be ignored. I had come to advocate for the moratorium, which of course, has been passed along; however, I understand that this proposal for fracturing will come up as an actual proposal. So I was going to encourage you to vote in favor of the moratorium, the proposed moratorium on hydraulic fracturing, but now I have to encourage you to use this intervening time until the proposal is made to educate yourselves extensively regarding fracking for which I will pass out a resource list which I did pass out before but just in case I got sidetracked. And I have one for each of the members of the Council here.

Additionally, Dr. Anthony Ingraffia, a civil engineer from Cornell University, who has been working on this for decades, will be speaking at the Succop Conservancy on Thursday evening, November 21st, and as Ted Popovich had mentioned, at a free conference at the Heinz History Center this Saturday, and again, he discussed the Duquesne University Conference, which I'm really hoping to see if several of you will attend. Because of the magnitude and the effects of this process on our health, the environment and the future policies for which it will establish a precedent that will significantly impact humanity --- we're not talking about like local stuff --- humanity, because this is the advocated globally, globally. There are shales everywhere. You will in hindsight find it to have been one of your most profoundly ethical decisions that you will have had to make. Thank you very much.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: I believe that was the last speaker tonight. I'm sorry. What's your name?

MR. LYONS: Lucas Lyons. I signed up at the office to make sure I'm on the list.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: You're not on the list, but come on.

MR. LYONS: Thank you. I'm Lucas Lyons, 1902 Meadville Street, North Side. Mr. Macey, Councilman Macey, my family is from McKeesport. My grandfather was a boss at Westinghouse Steel Plant for 30 years. Steel, that industry, the history of Pittsburgh, it's in our blood, you know. It's part of all of us and I have just as much time in it as you do. It's a dead-end industry. It's gone. It's not here anymore, and fracking isn't going to bring it back. We've had 500,000 people leave the City of Pittsburgh, leave behind a legacy of pollution and now that's going away. So we need to change the paradigm. We need to change the way you think about the future of Pittsburgh.

The evidence is all here. We keep hammering it with you, everyone, you know, asking why it's not coming out of committee or why are we taking this out of the Committee. Thank you very much for taking this out of committee the way you did. We can see where everyone is at. I understand the conflicts of interest some of the lawyers have, but you are our elected officials. We need you to stand up and vote. We need you to represent us. What are we supposed to do? I'm a professor, you know, I shouldn't be up here making public activist statements about fracking. I could probably get fired for that. Who knows, you know? We all have stakes in this. If you are elected officials, you need to vote and we need to put an end to this fracking nonsense now.

One more thing I want to say, Rich Fitzgerald keeps saying that the fracker --- and I heard someone --- to us tonight, the people that come and speak, the 10 people that come and talk to you every time. Mr. DeFazio, you're like, we'd like to hear the other side. There is no other side. 800 residents of Allegheny County were surveyed, okay? Here's what they said about fracking and the environment. Would you like to hear? This is from October 29th in the Post Gazette. 59 percent of Allegheny County said drilling poses a significant to moderate threat to public health and the environment. Here's the million dollar stat. 70 percent of people in Allegheny

County, 800 people surveyed, opposed drilling in state parks, game lands and nature reserves. Rich Fitzgerald calls us the vocal minority, the ten people that come and speak every time? No, we are the majority. We have the ethical. We have everything but the economic. And Mr. Macey and Mr. DeFazio, where are these jobs you talked about? Where are the jobs reports? Show us the jobs that we're going to get. Where's range resources --- where are these jobs going to come from? Okay. We would need to see that.

Furthermore, 95 percent want fracking fluids to be made public. They're not. I think the young lady up here said that, you know, they're exempt from that because of Clean Drinking Water Act part of --- they're exempt from that. 95 percent of the people want to know what they're putting in the ground. They don't have to tell us, okay? That's illegal. Make them tell us. 64 percent believe that climate change has a clear, moderate effect on economic impact.

One last thing, 57 percent believe an environment should have precedent over economic impact on the area. 70 percent of Allegheny County residents don't want fracking in our nature reserves. So start listening to the public, start voting your conscience. We all have conflicts of interests. Let's stop putting down somebody that wants to bring some sunlight to what's happening here. We all know what's happening tonight. Everyone acted like they didn't know what was happening with the committee vote, or the moratorium vote. Let's get it done, find out where we all stand. Show me the jobs report, Mr. Macey. I'd like to see it.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: I'd just like to briefly mention that Soldiers and Sailors Hall will be open until nine o'clock tonight. They're doing the Gettysburg Address out there on the stage. So if you get a chance when you're going home, stop in Soldiers and Sailors. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. Motion for adjournment?

(Chorus of motions.)

(Chorus of seconds.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: All in favor --- Meeting stands adjourned.

MEETING CONCLUDED AT 7:35 P.M.

CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify, as the stenographic reporter, that the foregoing proceedings were taken stenographically by me, and thereafter reduced to typewriting by me or under my direction; and that this transcript is a true and accurate record to the best of my ability.



Court Reporter