

ALLEGHENY COUNTY COUNCIL

REGULAR MEETING

- - -

BEFORE:

Dr. Charles J. Martoni	-	President, District 8
Nicholas Futules	-	Vice President, District 7
John P. DeFazio	-	Council-At-Large
Heather S. Heidelbaugh	-	Council-At-Large
Matt Drozd	-	District 1
Jan Rea	-	District 2
James R. Burn, Jr.	-	District 3
Michael J. Finnerty	-	District 4
Vince Gastgeb	-	District 5
John F. Palmiere	-	District 6
Robert J. Macey	-	District 9
William Russell Robinson	-	District 10
Barbara Daly Danko	-	District 11
James Ellenbogen	-	District 12

Allegheny County Courthouse
Fourth Floor, Gold Room
436 Grant Street
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219

Tuesday, December 4, 2012 - 5:04 p.m.

SARGENT'S COURT REPORTING SERVICE, INC.
429 Forbes Avenue, Suite 1300
Pittsburgh, PA 15219
(412) 232-3882 FAX (412) 471-8733

IN ATTENDANCE:

William McKain - County Manager
Joseph Catanese - Director of Constituent Services
Jared Barker - Director of Legislative Services
Walter Szymanski - Budget Director

PRESIDENT MARTONI: The meeting will come to order. Please rise for the Pledge of Allegiance, being led by our students here. Would you say your names, please?

MS. FONTINI: Callie Fontini.

MS. MALCOM: Lauren Malcom.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. It's yours.
(Pledge of Allegiance.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Please remain standing for a moment of silent reflection or prayer.

(Moment of silent reflection or prayer.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Please be seated. Roll call.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Burn?

MR. BURN: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Danko?

MS. DANKO: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio?

MR. DEFAZIO: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Drozd?

MR. DROZD: Present.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Gastgeb?

MR. GASTGEB: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

(No response.)

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?

MS. REA: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Present.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni, President?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Fourteen (14) members present.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Proclamations/
Certificates. 7263-12.

MR. CATANESE: Certificate of Achievement
awarded to Central Catholic boys' golf team, for winning
the WPIAL Class AAA Boys' Team Golf Championship.
Sponsored by Councilwoman Danko and Robinson.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Bill?

MS. DANKO: I'd like to ask the Central Catholic
boys golf team to come up and stand behind us over here,
along with their coach and anybody else from Central that
wants to come on up. All right. I'm very happy to be
here today to congratulate the Central High School boys
golf team. As some of you might know, my youngest son
attended Central Catholic and graduated in the Class of
2011. I don't want to say a whole lot, but I do want to
say that we all know, as parents, as Council members, as
people in the community, that keeping our kids in high
school and keeping them engaged, they need to be involved
in academics. But a lot of times, being involved in these
extracurricular activities is really important, as well.
It gives them a chance to excel in things outside of
academics, get that sense of camaraderie going. And I'm
so proud of these boys for what they've accomplished. And
in a short time, I'm going to turn it over to Council
member Robinson.

MR. ROBINSON: Thank you very much,
Councilwoman. As most of you know, I went to public
school, so I only know a little bit about parochial
schools. But I grew up during the time when they were
very dominant in the City of Pittsburgh, in terms of the
physical building and being filled with dedicated people,
always known for their academic prowess. Central was
always known for its academic prowess. Lately, it's been
known for its athletic prowess and its academic prowess,
which is good; students, first; academics, first. While
this singular honor goes to Councilman O'Connor and his
associates and this fine men's golf team, it also goes to
the school.

I know these young men are good students. I
know they had to get up early in the morning, do things on
the weekends and work at night to be successful. I know
they're good students, and I know they will proudly carry
the legacy of Central Catholic out into the world some
day. First and foremost, gentlemen, remember, you are
students; graduate. If you don't graduate, all is for

naught. Even with those trophies and those medals, it's all for naught. I congratulate you. I thank you. As a former athlete, I know your pride and sense of accomplishment and when you can't wait to get a sweater or a jacket or a ring or something that you can show to people to let them know you're a champion; once a champion, always a champion. No one can ever remove this from your record. Graduate. Help other students to see that they can do extracurricular activities and still be good students. You are shining examples. I thank you, and I congratulate you. Thank you very much.

(Applause.)

MS. DANKO: I'm going to ask the coach, Corey O'Connor, Council member from the City of Pittsburgh. We have overlapping districts, but Corey finds time to coach on the side. I thought he might want to introduce his team and say a couple words, and then we'll read the official proclamation after Council member Robinson gets his glasses.

COACH O'CONNOR: Thank you, Councilwoman Danko and Councilman Robinson and all of County Council, for the great job you guys do. You really always bring us down here and all of the high schools in the county, to show your support for their student athletes. And I think that's a great thing that you guys always do. And I know you're in budget meetings, so I'll keep it really short tonight. I actually want to say to Councilman Burn, who went to North Catholic, it's always great when Central wins a championship.

But to that point where everybody thinks we recruit, we actually don't recruit, we attract --- is the key word at Central Catholic. But I want to thank my players, my assistant coach, Jabba (phonetic), who most of you know, and I'm just going to read them off by class. We have sophomores, Brian Baker and Nick Cuny (phonetic), juniors, Brent Rodgers and Jesse Eckel (phonetic), seniors, Kris Wright, Collin Davies, Shane Fogerty (phonetic), Nathan Festan (phonetic) and Logan Cuny. And this team --- we've gone to six straight WPIAL finals but weren't able to win the championship, and these guys did it this year. It was a great accomplishment. They worked really hard. And I want to thank you for this honor here tonight; so thank you.

(Applause.)

MR. ROBINSON: I did have my glasses. They were in my back pocket. So it's not my eyesight that's failed me. Just remember, gentlemen, it took the Steelers 40 years --- 40 years --- to land one Super Bowl and now they have six. Most of us can't think back 40 years. This is a Certificate of Achievement. It comes from our County Council awarded to Central Catholic High School, 2012-2013 boys' golf team. This Certificate of Achievement is awarded to the 2012-2013 Central Catholic High School boys' golf team, in recognition of earning the 2012 WPIAL Class AAA boys' team golf championship. We commend and recognize each player whose determination and resolve led to this achievement. We also congratulate the administration, the janitors and everybody else over there at that school, because they're all champions. The team has set a positive example of excellence for all of Allegheny County, continuing evidence that this is the County of Champions.

This achievement has conferred honor on this county and is an accomplishment in which the entire community can be proud. This is sponsored by Council member Barbara Daly Danko and myself, and I'm sure on behalf of my colleagues who wish you well. Thank you.

(Applause.)

MS. DANKO: We're going to have one member of the golf team speak, Collin Haag.

MR. HAAG: Quickly, just to congratulate the guys behind me on a great season. We had high expectations coming in and certainly filled those by winning the championship. Also, Corey O'Connor, Councilman to everybody else, Coach O'Connor, prepared us for what we needed to do. And certainly, the championship would have never resulted. We couldn't ask for anything more and then, finally, the Council for taking the time to give us this great honor. It certainly means a lot to us as a team and to our school. So thank you once again.

(Applause.)

(Pictures taken.)

MR. BURN: Excuse me, Mr. --- President Martoni. Mr. Catanese, in the spirit of bipartisan, would you add my name as a co-sponsor?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: 7282-12.

MR. CATANESE: Certificate of Achievement awarded to Moon High School girls' soccer team, for

winning the 2012 PIAA Class AA Girls' Soccer Championship. Sponsored by Councilman Matt Drozd.

MR. DROZD: Okay. Now you gentlemen in the audience can eat your heart out, because --- gee, I feel like, you know, I'm a thorn between all these roses, you know, surrounded by all these lovely ladies. And I'm sure each and every one of you would like that opportunity, too. You know, I'd like to say, as Corey had mentioned just previously --- and he almost caught what I always say. You know, I'm a liaison for the Air Force Academy, and what I always say is --- I say, no, I'm not here to recruit you, I'm here to give you an opportunity. It's up to you if you want to take advantage of that opportunity. You ladies, you did.

These ladies, by the way, despite losing in the WPIAL --- this shows character. You know, athletics not only brings out a successful person that's athletically inclined, but character, as well as academically. And they have to go through a lot of adversity. And these ladies really did go through a lot of adversity because they lost in the WPIAL semi-final. But they won the States. The State is much more difficult, much more broader and many more teams to face and much more pressure, because I saw it in my son every time he went and I know in your eyes.

But you accomplished this, just like what you would see in the Olympics with that basketball team. Do you remember all that? And ladies, I don't know if you remember this, they won on their adversity and what it would take to win. And I'm sure you would feel as the underdog as you went to States, because you aren't the underdog. And I want to tell you, I'm so proud to be up here with you and I want to tell you a little story, how much I think of the ladies that I served with in the military. Maybe you heard this story before.

But when I do give these tests in the athletic --- you know, in the athletic ability of these students for the academies, the military academies, we have to do certain things, so many push-ups, so many sit-ups, so much running under so many minutes. And these pull-ups are like this (indicating), not like this --- no cheating --- all the way down. And then you have to do at least a seven; women, only one, because women --- they don't have the broad strength up in here (indicating), right? So --- we love this. I watched it. Football

players have mostly, right? You think, you know, guys are so macho, you know, in the athletics. But anyhow, these guys are getting up there and straining to get seven, and this little lady is watching. So it's her turn. Remember, one; that's all they have to do. Usually, that's all they can do. I stopped counting after 25, and I just watched these guys go like this (indicating). The second thing I got to tell you, I remember on the aircraft --- and you probably --- I think you guys have heard this before --- any time you were a Warthog in Afghanistan, you went after the terrorists in Afghanistan.

And I'll never forget, this picture came back to us. And this plane, this A-10 Warthog, which has to go close to the air --- the ground, take out any arm or any artillery, anything that's on the ground or around the troops, or whatever, that's close to the ground. This aircraft --- it was hitting the shell; it was hitting the windshield; it was hitting the body of the aircraft; it was hitting the wing. I mean, you wondered, even made it back and how could it make it back? And this is where adversity --- overcoming adversity. And this is similar to what you did; I mean, overcoming adversity. And they looked at it, and all these pilots are standing around saying, my God, how did ---? And this pilot --- and they did run, drop this bomb load and came back and avenged our people --- what they did to our people.

And everybody was standing around. All those pilots were looking. How did this pilot ever make it back alive, let alone make it back? Standing right there proud as you can be and just did what she had to do, and that's what you did. You did what you had to do. And I want to say, I really am so proud of you. I mean that sincerely from the bottom of my heart. I know what you went through, because I, as a parent, and you, as a coach, agonize every little hit and every whatever. But you're even brighter than that, what you did; okay? I mean that sincerely. Oh, and Bill, if you would please mention something and say something on behalf of the team.

COACH PFEIFER: Ladies, congratulations winning the State. It was outstanding, a great accomplishment. But everybody who has come up here this evening is top notch student athletes and something that hasn't been touched upon is I did receive the kids' grades this week. Thirty-six (36) out of the 38 girls were on, at least, Honor Roll for the nine weeks that we went to State finals

and won the State finals. And as a team, 38 girls carried a 3.8 grade point average.

(Applause.)

COACH PFEIFER: Seventeen (17) young ladies on the team have a 4.0 or better.

(Applause.)

COACH PFEIFER: So not only are they successful on the field but successful in the classroom. And being around them all the time, they're successful in life. Well done, ladies.

MR. DROZD: I'd like to do something different. I want each one of you to say what position you played. And some day, I hope to be invited to the first woman presidential --- president. Hopefully, one of them will come from you or some other lady in this country. We need that some day; all right? We really do. So one at a time if we could.

(Players introduce themselves and positions)

MR. DROZD: And lastly, ladies, if you'll join me in congratulating and applauding your coach and your parents, because without them, you know it could never happen, right? Am I wrong? Besides, you're a team, and your parents are a team. They're the ones who support you.

(Applause.)

(Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: 7283-12. That's being held.

MR. CATANESE: That one will be held until the next meeting.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: The following will be read into the record.

MR. CATANESE: 7284-12. Proclamation congratulating The Honorable Thomas M. Smith, upon his 40th anniversary as Mayor of Blawnox Borough. Sponsored by Councilman Futules.

7285-12. Certificate of Recognition awarded to Joseph Marion Starr, of Boy Scout Troop 4, upon earning the rank of Eagle Scout. Sponsored by Councilman Gastgeb.

7286-12. Proclamation congratulating the Holy Spirit Parish, of West Mifflin, upon its 50th anniversary. Sponsored by Councilman Macey.

7287-12. Proclamation congratulating the McKeesport Grandparents Raising Grandchildren (GRG) program awardees. Sponsored by Councilman Macey.

7288-12. Certificate of Recognition honoring the 70th anniversary of Mr. and Mrs. Frank and Ruby Chiaverini. Sponsored by Councilman Macey.

7289-12. Certificate of Recognition honoring the 70th anniversary of Mr. and Mrs. Edward and Pearl Stanko. Sponsored by Councilman Macey.

7290-12. Certificate of Achievement awarded to Griffith Edward Trainor, of Boy Scout Troop 99, upon earning the rank of Eagle Scout. Sponsored by Councilman Macey.

7291-12. Proclamation honoring Pennsylvania Auditor General Jack E. Wagner, for receiving the Amen Corner Excellence in Leadership Award. Sponsored by Councilman Martoni.

7292-12. Proclamation thanking Sheetz, Incorporated, for choosing to expand its operation in Ohio Township. Sponsored by Councilwoman Rea.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. We have three speakers today not on the agenda. Okay? First, we have our newly elected Congressman, right there in the second row to us. Would you come forward, sir. Keith? Keith's here; Keith Rothfus. Thank you for attending the meeting tonight, Keith.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Thank you, President Martoni, and members of Council. I'd like to take just a moment to introduce to you my good friend, Congressman-elect Keith Rothfus. As most of you know, he just won the position of congressman in the 12th District. Keith and I have been friends as lawyers in Allegheny County for a number of years. He called me and asked me if he could come down here and meet all of you, because he's very anxious to reach out to members of Council in his new role as Congressman-elect. And I thought that was a very kind and extraordinary gesture toward us. And I appreciate his efforts to come down and speak with us for a moment. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you.

CONGRESSMAN-ELECT ROTHFUS: Thank you. Good evening. Councilman Drozd --- it's good to see you Councilwoman Rea and Councilwoman Heidelbaugh. Those are the three of you I know the most. Of course, I met with Councilman Burn on NightTalk. I thought I'd come in and say hello and to let you know that we'll be setting up offices --- an office in Ross Township, and I look forward to working with Council. I represent the northern third -

-- I will be representing the northern third of Allegheny County when I take the oath on January 3rd. I want to convey that my door will be open. I'll be --- need to be hearing the concerns of Council with respect to federal policy. And I look forward to working with you over the coming two years. And again, thanks for stopping in and coming in to say hello.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Next is Andy Mason. Andy? From the history center.

MR. MASON: Thanks very much for giving me a minute. I represent not only the Senator John Heinz History Center but the Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission. It's the State's history agency. I really came here to thank you, thank Councilwoman Barbara Daly Danko and all of the co-sponsors of the legislation --- the bill for the David McCullough bridge amendment, the 16th Street Bridge. I hope that that passes tonight. David McCullough is one of western Pennsylvania's, Allegheny County's and Pittsburgh's great ambassadors. He speaks all over the world. He's a two-time Pulitzer Prize winner. He's a Presidential Medal of Freedom winner and has written so many books that have engaged people all over the world, helping them understand the value of understanding our past, to make good decisions in the present and times for the future.

I hope that this passes. I think naming the 16th Street Bridge for David McCullough on the occasion of his 80th birthday, which will be in 2013, would be a fitting tribute to a truly great Pittsburgher and Allegheny County. Thank you very much. Thanks to all of you.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Ms. Wagner? Ms. Wagner?

MS. WAGNER: Good evening. I appreciate again the opportunity to present to this Council. But I think it's really critical this evening after, really, hours upon hours of answering questions from this Council, that you hear from me very plainly on my concerns on the budget; and very specifically, on what has transpired in this last week. I believe we are, as Allegheny County, on a terribly dangerous path in what has transpired this last week. You have received misrepresentations regarding the Controller's budget very plainly, as presented to you by

County Manager William McKain. And I've outlined those very specifically in my letter, as well as the letter to you from County Executive Rich Fitzgerald.

Specifically, it has been suggested that unlike any other County department, that you measure only the Office of the Controller by the projected expenditures. Projected expenditures, number one, are un-audited figures. Number two, they are figures provided to you by the administration. And as I say in my letter to you, it's one thing to say that somebody is entitled to their own opinion. It's a far different thing, and they are not entitled to their own set of facts. So regardless of what this vote is here tonight, and which I believe that the vote will be to de-fund my office only by \$450,000, I implore you to review the materials that you have before you, because I believe that we are going down a very, very dangerous path for this county government. When people of Allegheny County cannot trust in the numbers and the process provided to them by county government, we are defeating everything that was set out by government reform under the Home Rule Charter. Moving beyond my budget for the Controller's Office --- which I remind you is the only budget being cut, period --- period --- in this budget. My budget is the only budget being cut. And anyone can play with the numbers, but the other cuts are being shifted to a grants budget, so they're not really cuts; and then the other ones are reorganizations, which aren't cuts at all, which are actually receiving increases.

So what you see in this budget is unprecedented in two ways under this form of Home Rule government. The departments under the Executive are receiving more than a \$19,000,000 increase. They're receiving more than a six percent increase. That never happened under County Executive Onorato nor under County Executive Roddey. It is unprecedented. Yet any other time, the Office of the Controller, the only office of accountability in this county, is receiving an unprecedented cut. Make no mistake of what's going on here today. And regardless of the vote we make tonight, I implore you, as I said, to take that responsibility that I take very seriously to the taxpayers in this county, under consideration and review the materials before you.

As I said, I think this is very, very shameful. This is a shameful evening for Allegheny County. But let me say one thing very, very plainly, with regard to this

administration. This administration may choose to de-fund me, it may choose to defame me, but it will not defer the work that I do on behalf of county taxpayers. And let me also reiterate that at a time when spending is increasing in this county, the vote tonight, which I believe will be to de-fund only --- only the Controller's Office, the message to the taxpayers is that while Allegheny County is increasing spending, it is decreasing accountability. That's shameful.

And finally, let me say very plainly that if this administration is serious about leading Allegheny County into the future, into a form of government that's supposed to be under this banner of reform, it's time that this administration lets go of the politics of the past. As I said, this administration may choose to defame me or de-fund me, but it will not deter me. And in closing, as I'm saying that the resolve of my office, of the position to which I was elected is only strengthened by this move, that I stand ready to work with this Council, and I stand ready to work with this administration. But I absolutely will not compromise the duties of my independently elected office. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. 7293-12.

(Applause.)

MR. CATANESE: Motion to approve the minutes of the regular meeting of Allegheny County Council, held on November 7, 2012.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: So moved.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Moved in second. Question? All in favor?

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Opposed? So ordered. Presentation of Appointments. We have no appointments.

MR. CATANESE: There's none.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Unfinished Business. Committee on Budget and Finance, Second Reading. 7269-12.

MR. CATANESE: An ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, establishing the tax levy upon all real property subject to taxation within the limits of Allegheny County. Sponsored by the Chief Executive and Council members Martoni, Futules, Burn, Danko, DeFazio, Ellenbogen, Finnerty, Green Hawkins, Macey, Palmiere and Robinson.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Mr. Robinson.

MR. ROBINSON: Thank you, Mr. President, and members of Council. With your leave, I'd like to thank Mr. Walter Szymanski, the Council's Budget Director and all of the staff that worked with him, sometimes long into the night, to accommodate every member of this Council, regardless of the request. They did an extraordinary job. This was one of the most difficult budget processes that I've had the pleasure of serving as Chair of the Budget and Finance Committee. But this year, more so than other years, I wanted to thank them for their cooperation, their patience, their diligence and, yes, their expertise in preparing for us materials that represent what we believe is in the best interest of this county. And I thank them wholeheartedly. As far as 7242-12 is concerned, move for approval

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: We were at 7269-12; am I correct?

MR. ROBINSON: I apologize.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Check that out; that is correct.

MR. ROBINSON: I must have misunderstood Mr. Catanese.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: No problem. I just want to make sure we do the right ---.

MR. ROBINSON: The bill, sir, is the number ---?

MR. CATANESE: 7269-12.

MR. ROBINSON: If I'm not mistaken, that's a resolution of the County of Allegheny amending the Grants and Special Accounts Budget for 2012.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: No, ---.

MR. ROBINSON: Seventy-two (72) --- I'm sorry. I'm reading 7296-12.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: This is three..

MR. DEFAZIO: Page four.

MR. CATANESE: Page four.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Page four, on the top of the page.

MR. ROBINSON: Thank you, Mr. President. Thank you, Mr. Szymanski. On Bill 7269-12, move for approval.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Moved in second. Question?

MR. DROZD: Discussion.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Question? Do you have a question?

MR. DROZD: Yes, sir.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Yes, go ahead.

MR. DROZD: As you know, I wanted to get the taxpayers even a lower --- lower assessment, lower tax value. And I tried to do that along with some of my other Council members. And I commend my fellow Council members for doing due diligence. I know this was a difficult time for them and for many of us in trying to cut as much as we can from this budget, because the people of Allegheny County have suffered so much on these new assessments, and it hurts so much. I'd like if it had been lower, but I'm going to support it because it is lower. And it gives something and some hope to the taxpayers. But I would hope in the future that we look at ways --- not only can we get a lower tax levy upon the people of Allegheny County, but we cut some of that and give some back to them in future years to come. We look for ways to do that either through the innovative ways to gain revenues without going into their pockets or ways to cut costs. We really need to do that in the future. So I'll support it on that and commend my fellow Council members for doing all they could. And I hope you're going to work with me --- and I know they will because they're good people --- in the future to look for ways for new revenues without going into any more means of taxation and settling to cut costs where we can.

And I commend the employees of Allegheny --- our staff. They all work here. They serve here, along with us, and I commend them for all they've done with so little monies that they had with times it had been cut. And we've always tried to be considerate of them and their families, too, because they work very hard. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. Mr. Gastgeb.

MR. GASTGEB: Thank you, President Martoni. And also, it kind of does tell what Mr. Drozd said about our process. And there were some other bills --- and I actually supported one that Mr. Drozd put forth --- that the millage was a little bit lower. But I will say through the process, there's two things that are important because Mr. Drozd is not going to lower the assessment. But I think you have to kind of put this all together now because I, like a lot of my colleagues, have fielded --- I'll say hundreds of calls during the calendar year 2012, concerning the assessments.

By the end of tonight, we'll know the millage rates going to be in Allegheny County and put that together with the assessment number and get a perspective. The millage rate is going to drop from 5.69 mills to 4.73. So it's going to drop. Additionally, I think that's it's worth noting that this Council has kept, I repeat, has kept the Homestead exemption at \$15,000. So if you're in a neighborhood where maybe your home is assessed, maybe, at \$50,000 or \$60,000, you can see how \$15,000 would play against that. So we're able to keep that.

And quite frankly, the millage rate goes against the budget that's adopted. You have an expense on the budget side. This is the lowest millage rate that came out of committee, and this is the lowest millage rate that came out of committee tonight, 4.73 mills. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. Heather.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I'm going to be a no vote on this bill, and I'd like to offer to the citizens of Allegheny County my perspective on that. Having now served in the County Council for a year and having now been through two budget processes, I'm pretty familiar --- I understand now what the process is. There's a failure in County government and in County Council to really address what the problem is in government, which is a continual expansion of services with, really, no ability to look at the efficiencies and whether we like certain programs. It doesn't exist in our process.

I have just received last --- in the last couple of days, a list of all the programs that we fund through our Human Services Department. I asked for the number of employees that we fund and for the exact costs for each program. I'm getting that a year after I requested it. There is no process that exists in the budget or here in the County Council, to look at our programs and to say, are these programs still good? Do we still need them? Are they running efficiently? They may be looked at through department heads, but there is no mechanism for County Council to look at them.

I'm going to, hopefully, begin to address that concern next year; hopefully, bipartisanly, to see whether we're operating efficiently. It's my view that we cannot continue to grow the size of government, that there is a ceiling to that and that there is an unwillingness on the part of everyday citizens to continue to pay more in real dollars. This is a reduction from last year, which was

required by the statute because we can't have a windfall on the assessment here. It's my opinion that if we had done some real hard work this year by looking at the programs, looking at --- like we found \$12,000,000 in the Recorder of Deeds' Office. Looking at the jail, which we've never done despite repeated requests, that we could be making savings, and we could have --- if we were looking at the right things, we could have reduced the millage even further.

In addition, I think that the current trend would be funding the Controller's Office, whose function as an independently elected officer of the county, he reports to the citizens directly, to find waste, fraud, inefficiencies and abuse that's going in the wrong direction. And I will be offering an amendment to re-fund for office, so that we can continue to find efficiencies in government. This has nothing to do with personalities. It has to do with funding an independent watchdog office. We can do better in government. We can attract citizens to stay in Allegheny County. We are in the precipice of changing this county. We have manufacturing back for the first time in 25 years. Let's keep our taxes low. Let's root through government and find inefficiencies. Let's do better, and I'm going to vote no on this bill.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. Anyone else?
Jim, go ahead.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I'm trying to see how I want to phrase this. When they first conceived this form of government, I wasn't for it. The reason I wasn't for it was because --- I mean, most of us up here will tell you, we probably buy more raffle tickets than we get paid in the course of a year. We donate more money than --- than we get paid in a year. That being said, it's very difficult to work a full-time job and manage almost a \$900-some million budget. I would say that there are many up here who spend an inordinate amount of time trying to learn as much as they can, but there's just so much.

I have a little bit of an up on it, because as a former Chief of Operations of Special Services and Maintenance, which is --- you know, was four departments, and spending seven years in the County Controller's Office, even working for --- he's in the audience --- as a director in Treasurer Weinstein's Office, I have more of a personal overview and understanding than most people. It's a learning process. It's taken me over 30 years to

know what's going on in this county, and --- but this is what we have. I mean, everybody tried to look at everything that they possibly could. And for anybody to sit up here and say that somebody being paid \$9,000 a year is going to sit there, in her view, and has the time, that has to feed their kids or whatnot, day after day after day; you know, it's idealogically wonderful. But let's get real; it's impossible.

So we do the best that we can. And giving the best that we can, I feel confident that everybody here at least did the best they could, and that's all I have to say. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. Mike?

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you, Mr. President. I'd just like to comment and say that --- I mean, everybody has a problem with the reassessment, not --- I shouldn't say everybody, but a vast majority of people. It's something that was Court ordered. We didn't want it. The Chief Executive didn't want it. The prior Chief Executive didn't want it. It was Court ordered. We were singled out, 1 county out of 67 in Pennsylvania. And the Court said we had to reassess. That's one point.

The other point is --- and we talked about revenue neutral. And there's been a lot of calculations that go into this to try to make this revenue neutral, and I think it is. And I'd just like to say that a budget is a plan. This millage rate is a plan. It's the best option at this time. It doesn't mean somewhere down the road we might find out that we can cut past the millage rate a little further, because we bring in more than revenue neutral, and that can happen.

I'd also like to point out to some of my colleagues here, that in the last five years, we've experienced a tremendous amount of cuts coming from the State government and funding from the Federal government. It's caused us to have to increase the millage rate because of the cuts. When I was Chairman of Health and Human Services, the budget for health and human services was over \$1,000,000,000. It now stands at about \$800,000,000, roughly. That's a tremendous cut this should make over five years. We didn't reduce services. We kept the services. We moved money around.

It's something that we've done up here with the administration to keep these services, and I think it's an important thing to think about. At the same time, if we

take a look at economic development, which in the community development grants, you would see that every year. For the last five years, we've suffered a 16 percent cut in our block grants. This affects a tremendous amount of communities. I know in my area it does, and I'm sure in other areas it does, because this is money that they used to do different type of projects, like demolition of buildings, putting in handicapped curbs, et cetera. There's quite a number of new housing. So these are some of the cuts that we've sustained. And as I said before --- and I think it's important that everybody knows this --- that the cuts that come from the State and the Federal government with money that they cut, is all being pushed down to the county level, and it's being pushed down to the municipal level, where something to maintain the services, people have to do less with more; as some people say ---

MR. CATANESE: More with less.

MR. FINNERTY: --- more with less --- I'm sorry; but also to think about the problems that are occurring as we go on. It's something that we're looking at. It's something that the Public Works Department looks at. As people say, you know, we are the City of Bridges, but you have to have money to fix bridges. And I think it's important that you realize that that's what's being done as we go on. We're trying to do more and more with less and less. It seems like the money can go over these mountains to Harrisburg, but it has a heck of a time getting back over the mountains this way, so that we can use it in Allegheny County. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. Barbara?

MS. DANKO: I have just a couple of comments. Last year at this time we had the very difficult decision, which I believe was voted on, probably, 11 to 4, to where we raised the millage, 4.69, 5.69. It was a tough vote, but I think it was the right thing to do for the county. And I think that we're seeing that now as we move forward. This budget that we're going to, hopefully, have in a little while, relies on no one-time revenues. That's huge; that we're making ends meet, current revenues, current expenditures. We're building a fund balance, which is way under budget. We're making that commitment. We're starting to build a fund balance where the rating agencies say, this is the way it should be going. That saves us money in the long run.

And we didn't find any money, we increased fees. We took that step to vote to raise fees in the Recorder of Deeds' Office, which resulted --- I believe it's about \$12,000,000. So I think those are all important steps and new things that were done this year. And I think we've worked hard on the budget, as a lot of people have said. I can remember last year at this time people being very skeptical that we rolled back the millage, as we are --- we're going to be required to do. But we're doing it now and we calculated that number carefully. And I believe we're doing right by the citizens of Allegheny County. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Mr. Ellenbogen.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I'm sorry. I just want to say one more thing. In reference to what Councilwoman Heidelbaugh said, she's right; I mean, there's always things we can improve on, and maybe if we learn ---. But really think about what we've been through. There's a lot of stress up here. We had the Port Authority that was going to collapse, which would have destroyed this county. I mean, I --- you can't even believe. I know the phone calls and e-mails I got just on the Port Authority alone ---, you know, making sure that this winter will be traveled and these roads are --- we have the adequate people and the adequate equipment to make sure that your families are safe on these roads; you know, the airport.

I mean, there's so many issues that really affect people. You know, it's like your big toe. When was the last time you really thought about your big toe? But if you don't have it, try to walk. These are the issues, the bread and butter things that the average person has to deal with, that we had to deal with. And I mean, like I said, I feel comfortable, at least, that we were able to provide the services, like Councilman Finnerty said; you know, we didn't crush everybody with taxes like, you know, a lot of people could have. You know, Councilman Gastgeb said, you know, we have maintained the Homestead exemption. There's a lot of things that this council did and worked toward. And the administration worked very hard, also, so that we could keep people safe, and that we could keep people working.

And I mean, really, the basic bread and butter issues, they're the things that I think that we accomplished, and I feel good about that. I mean, like you said, Councilwoman, you know, there's a lot of things

that can be improved. But at least, you know, I think we got a good start and I think we're moving in the right direction. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Anyone else? Mr. Drozd.

MR. DROZD: Yeah, just a quick point. For those of you people out there that are listening in, I strongly recommend that you get involved in your local communities, especially in the school districts, because it's the biggest percent of your budget goes on a school board. And you have to put people on there that are very responsible and nice people that serve, people that know and understand the function of a school district, where you don't throw monies into so much brick and mortar, it kills the local taxpayers and then people go to Court. I've heard this many --- I've heard this many times. We save millions of dollars by cutting administrative costs, consolidating some of the schools within and enhancing the quality of education and enhancing further support. That's where the problem lies with a lot of it. It's out there in those districts, so many of them throughout Allegheny County and throughout southwestern Pennsylvania. People that are making decisions on behalf of your children and you, as a taxpayer. And those monies are not directed where they need to be.

I've seen the Taj Mahal in my district. We had \$1,000,000. We were down at the high school; built a \$300,000,000 Taj Mahal. Not the people; it's the board that was on there at the time. You walk in and you thought you were in Heinz Hall. Yet we renovated ours for 24,000,000 and that's what you get, and that's what's happening. You've got to look at that. I urge people, they better get involved. Go to those school board meetings. See what's going on. Go to those local township meetings. We've got to get people serving. At the same time, we've got to get people in there to really understand and to see that vision five and ten year --- ten years out. Thank you, sir. Thank you, gentlemen. Thank you, ladies.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Okay.

MR. DROZD: Ladies first, gentlemen second.

Okay.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: I don't think anybody has their hand up, right? Okay. Roll call.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Burn?

MR. BURN: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Danko?
MS. DANKO: Aye.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio?
MR. DEFAZIO: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Drozd?
MR. DROZD: Aye.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?
MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?
MR. FINNERTY: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?
MR. FUTULES: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Gastgeb?
MR. GASTGEB: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?
(No response.)
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?
MS. REA: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni, President?
PRESIDENT MARTONI: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 13, noes, 1. The bill

passes.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: 7243-12.

MR. CATANESE: A resolution of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, adopting an Operating Budget pursuant to Article IV, Section 2, and Article VII, Section 4, of the Home Rule Charter, by setting forth appropriations to pay the expenses of conducting the public business of Allegheny County and for meeting debt charges for the fiscal year beginning January 1st, 2013 and ending December 31st, 2013. Sponsored by Council members Robinson, Finnerty, Danko, Green Hawkins, DeFazio, Macey, Palmiere, Burn and Martoni.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Dr. Martoni, I have an amendment to the resolution, and I believe I have a second.

MR. DROZD: Yes. We first have to read, don't we, the amendment? I don't have a ---.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I have a copy.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Pass it out.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Dr. Martoni, may I speak to the my amendment?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Yes, please do. I was just reading.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Okay. Thank you, Dr. Martoni. In line with my previous comments, I think it is imperative that we continue the funding as it existed for the County Controller. Therefore, I'm introducing this resolution that --- to amend Resolution 7243-12 to adjust total funding for the Office of the County Controller by \$247,228 to a total of \$6,149,094 and to decrease the total 2013 funding for the newly created Department of Facilities Management by the equivalent amount of \$247,228, to a total funding of \$20,000,000. And that's the heart of the resolution that you have before you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Okay. We have a resolution in front of us.

MR. DROZD: Yes; and I'll second that, Mr. President. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Moved in second. Question? I guess that will take a roll call?

MR. ROBINSON: Wait a minute. Let me discuss first the ---.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Remarks?

MR. ROBINSON: Mr. President?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Yes.

MR. ROBINSON: Thank you, sir, and members of Council. I want specifically to amend. While I believe Ms. Heidelbaugh is moving in the right direction to make sure that the Controller's Office can function effectively and efficiently, I am hard pressed to support her at this moment, and she needs to know why. As those of you who attended the Budget and Finance Committee meetings know, I made a proposal to provide some funding to the Controller's Office, by looking at the past five years and working with Mr. Szymanski to come up with something that we felt was fair to keep that office functional, to maintain the separation of power between the Controller's Office, County Council, the Executive and any other office that the Controller's Office might decide to audit. That proposal found its way into the Budget and Finance

Committee but did not gain the kind of support that I thought that it would.

Be that as it may, Councilman Finnerty, Councilwoman Danko and myself came to an understanding at what we felt we could support. It was not my proposal. Suffice it to say, I'm on the record of indicating that the arrangement that we came to, that we presented to our colleagues in committee, is the same arrangement that is in the bill before us. I would be less than honest and transparent and true to my word if I now made a reversal, even though I believe this proposal speaks to something that should be done. I don't want to undo what I've done with Mr. Finnerty and Ms. Danko. I will stand behind them. The arrangement we made is contained in the bill before you. This amendment would undo that arrangement. I'm not willing to support this resolution, only because it will bring into question my word. And I don't want my word to be brought into question. Thank you, Mr. President.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Jim?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: You know, I really hate to air this old thing out between the Controller and the Chief Executive's Office in public. And the thing that concerns me about this, Councilwoman, is --- I don't have a problem with the money, but where is this \$200,000 going to come from, at what cost, and who's going to get --- go under the knife because of it? That's --- you know what I mean?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: To answer your question, sir, I have taken it out of the new department, Facilities Management, which --- it doesn't have a previous funding from last year. This is sort of, you know, new money.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: If I may, but are those positions already funded, in terms of --- as Public Works renewals? That's --- would you know?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Well, we have a funding situation. I mean, I will grant you that there is one side who is saying it's red and another side who's saying it's yellow. I've chosen to accept the side that's saying it's yellow, because I would rather follow on the side for the Controller's Office, for a balance of power, and to ensure the continuation of jobs there, because we have been told in no uncertain terms that 20 employees are going to lose their jobs, so ---.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I mean, that's an honest answer, and I respect that. It's just --- I don't want to

see anybody lose their job, so when these 20 don't lose their jobs and then 20 Public Works' people lose ---; do you see what I'm saying? I would assume --- would rather that the two parties sit down with each other and work this out, so that they can come to a reasonable solution, as opposed to us dabbling with this out here.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Well, that's their job --- our job as the County Council. Our most important job is to allocate the money. That's really why we exist.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Thank you for entertaining my question.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Yes, Barbara.

MS. DANKO: Yes. I just want to make one comment. To follow up on what Mr. Robinson said, the amount in this budget for the Controller's Office is not the amount the County Executive put forward. It is not the amount the Controller requested. This is our budget now. This is the amount that we, in the budget committee, came to a consensus on, and this is all our budget now. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Go ahead.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Just for the viewers who might be watching the citizens, I attend the budget committee as a pretty regular attendee, as I think Mr. Robinson would attest to. And I'm allowed to go because I'm a member of Council, but I'm not a member of the budget committee; and therefore, I do not have the right to put forth minutes on my own. And so I did not do that at that time. Maybe I'm wrong about that. Maybe I could have done that.

MR. ROBINSON: Yes, ma'am. The rules provide that any member of Council can offer an amendment in Budget and Finance. I thought I made that clear in the written communication, as well as at the meeting, to which I invited every Council member and encouraged them to offer any amendments pursuant to the rules that they had.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Then I misspoke, and I apologize. I think you are --- you're absolutely right. I did not offer an amendment, although I came to all the budget committee meetings, but I'm not a member. So I've offered it today.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. Jan?

MS. REA: I'm fine, thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: You're fine. Matt?

MR. DROZD: Yeah. This has been very difficult for me. I commend the Controller's Office for the good

work that they're doing and implementing. I wanted to take an across-the-board cut, that everybody shared in some of the things, so to speak, and gave something back, give something back to the people of Allegheny County. Although I wasn't successful in that, I know that my Council members work very diligently and very hard in trying to arrive at some decisions. I have testimony from --- we heard testimony from our County Manager, County Manager McKain.

And we here amongst ourselves voted to endorse --- that's not him, by the way. My constituents are saying, give that additional cut. All right. But in any event, based upon his testimony given that night, he said that without this \$200,000 increase, that it should fund all the positions. And I happen to --- I wanted a compromise in this. And this is a compromise. I see the additional \$200,000. I think it's a compromise. I would hope there was no political decision made here and based upon politics. And I'm going to give benefit of the doubt. And I believe that the County Manager has told me as such, because I put the confidence in him by giving my vote to endorse him as our County Manager.

So I think that we have to rely sometimes upon that and, hopefully, that this doesn't --- isn't detrimental to the County Controller 's ---. And I would ask this; can we revisit this one line item or --- further down the road, before the next budget issue? And I ask that, if you wouldn't mind, Mr. President, I could ask that of the Chairman. Maybe he would like to see this and maybe revisit this in another month or two down the road and see how things are going.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Do you want an answer from me?

MR. DROZD: Yeah, I'd like an answer on that, if you could.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Well, I don't know all the rules and regulations, but I always had the impression we could revisit anything we wanted to revisit.

MR. CANTANESE: That's true.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Okay.

MR. ROBINSON: Mr. President?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: I could be wrong.

MR. ROBINSON: If I may just offer a bit of information. This Council does have the power to reopen to budget. And in that process, Mr. Drozd, if you chose

to do so, this Council want to reopen the budget, could offer or Ms. Heidelbaugh or any member of Council, an adjustment to the budget for the Controller's Office.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Yes; you have something?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes. I believe the answer to my colleague's question was that the Facilities Management group has been funded \$3.2 million more than the previous Public Works. So, I think it's a \$3.2 million increase.

MR. DROZD: Okay.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Mr. President?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Jim?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: You guys --- I mean, everybody knows, I deal in numbers that are real. I can count. I know this isn't going anywhere; so in my opinion, although I would like to see the Controller be able to do what she needs to do --- but I can also count. I know this is going to fail on the floor. I would ask the sponsor and I would support her, that I would like to see, perhaps, with this Facilities Management thing --- is supposed to come together, like, quick. And what I'm thinking is, maybe Councilman Drozd has the right idea, in terms of helping the Controller, if she feels that she's under-funded, because she's going --- this is going down in flames. I mean, it doesn't take a nuclear scientist ---. And I've known Bill for 35 years, and I know that look on his face.

But maybe reopening it is the way to go, in terms of the best way to try to help her, if she feels she's under-funded. And at the same time, too, it would give us the ability to see just what the administration is going to do, in terms of the Facilities Management --- maybe, some other monies might be available --- as opposed to just dragging it across the Little Bighorn, because that's what's going to happen here.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Well, I have to tell you, Councilman, that I've been a trial lawyer for 28 years, and I've won some and I've lost some. I'm willing to lose.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Okay, Councilwoman. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Is there any other remarks; okay? Now are we going to vote on the amendment; okay?

MR. CATANESE: The amendment; this is voting on the amendment.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: It's a roll call vote on the amendment; am I correct?

MR. CATANESE: That's correct.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: You guys are really
confusing. Roll call.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Burn?
MR. BURN: No.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Danko?
MS. DANKO: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio?
(No response.)
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Drozd?
MR. DROZD: Nay.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?
MR. ELLENBOGEN: Nay.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?
MR. FINNERTY: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?
MR. FUTULES: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Gastgeber?
MR. GASTGEB: No.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE: No.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?
MS. REA: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?
MR. ROBINSON: Nay.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni, President?
PRESIDENT MARTONI: No.
PRESIDENT MARTONI: Now, are we ready ---?
MR. CATANESE: Twelve (12) noes ---. Mr.
DeFazio?
MR. DEFAZIO: I voted no on the amendment.
MR. BARKER: We don't have a vote here; sorry.
MR. CATANESE: Thirteen (13) noes, 1 yes. The
bill fails.
PRESIDENT MARTONI: Now we want to vote on 7243-
12; am I correct, Mr. Robinson?
MR. ROBINSON: Yes, sir.
PRESIDENT MARTONI: Okay. Joe, 7243-12.
MR. CATANESE. We already read that.
PRESIDENT MARTONI: We already read it. We're
ready for a vote.
MR. CANTANESE: Remarks.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Okay; remarks. 7243-12. Go ahead.

MR. DROZD: Yes, sir. Thank you. Forty-three (43) here is a concern to me, and one of which is the \$25,000 to fund the Commission. And my reason for that is, it may encompass one area that I voted against, quite some time ago, which I believe doesn't belong in our government. Second is, I'm concerned --- I don't want to tie the hands of our police, too. I'm concerned about that. I don't know if that's part of it. So I want to look at that further down the line, although I may vote for this Operating Budget, and that concerns me. The second area is, there were monies put in, in the Sheriff's Office with the intent, I understand, giving him a raise, because he hasn't taken a raise for a period of time. And I so commend the sheriff because he always liked --- and I always believed this --- he put you people first. The department heads need to put their people first. Their elected offices, people come first.

I would hope, you know, and I'm --- if I vote for the overall budget, I would hope instead the sheriff taking the increase, even though he may deserve the vote. I would hope that he'd look at ways ---, maybe, take those funds and use it within our judicial system to help the courts, even though as small as it may be, to help those people that are --- right now we have so many problems in our juvenile areas. And they can look at ways to help those juveniles, and maybe he can use that, maybe, in funding an officer or something that could help in the juvenile area.

That's where I hoped those monies would be put in place. Those are two areas that --- mainly that concern me and --- as well as, you know, I want to make sure down the road with everything that's going along where it needs to be included, that our people are taken care of. We need to do that, and that our tax base is kept low as it can go. Thank you, sir.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. Anyone else? Vince?

MR. GASTGEB: Thank you, Chuck. Just from my understanding about reopening the budget, it can be done at any time? It does require a 2/3 vote. And I think it's because at that point in time, it ought to be fairly obvious that 2/3 of Council are going to go forward with the budget. I can't remember it happening. It could be

the wrong job. And Chuck, I know it was tried one time. And I'd be receptive to reopening the budget, too, during the early part of calendar year 2013, if it was warranted.

The other thing, too, since Mr. Drozd brought up the Sheriff's Office, I don't think there's a relationship between budgeting for personnel and the Operating Budget and the Acola (phonetic). I believe the Acola means it was specifically acted upon either by itself or by specific legislation. So I think --- as I'm sharing the same viewpoint with --- as Acola within this budget. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. Are we ready for a vote? 7243-12. Roll call.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Burn?

MR. BURN: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Danko?

MS. DANKO: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio?

MR. DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Drozd?

MR. DROZD: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Gastgeb?

MR. GASTGEB: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?

MS. REA: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni, President?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 13, noes, 1. The bill passes.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: 7271-12.

MR. CATANESE: A resolution of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, adopting a Capital Budget pursuant to Article IV, Section 2, and Article VII, Section 4, of the Home Rule Charter, by setting forth appropriations to pay the expenses for capital expenditures during the fiscal year beginning January 1st, 2013 and ending December 31st, 2013. Sponsored by Councilman Robinson.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Mr. Robinson.

MR. ROBINSON: Thank you, Mr. President, and members of Council. This has been a --- probably, education process. Council members should remember that there is a procedure by which the Capital Budget is more easily reopened than the Operating Budget. In the past, the administration has done this on several occasions. The members have chosen, since I've been budget director, not to do that. But members need to be aware that if we pass a Capital Budget tonight, it can be more easily amended than the Operating Budget. We don't have to reopen the budget to change the capital.

There will be a bill presented a little later in this meeting that says exactly that; that is, make an adjustment in the appropriation for 2012. Having said that, move for approval.

(Chorus of seconds.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Moved in second. Question?

MR. DROZD: I have an amendment.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: You have an amendment?

MR. DROZD: Yes, sir.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Do we have a second?

MR. FINNERTY: We have to get it out first.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Yeah, I know. Matt, it might be helpful if you start there, please.

MR. DROZD: Okay. A lot of you knew this was coming. One of my pet peeves, as you know --- and that is --- and I know what the argument is going to be; it's done and we reached a decision. I want to delete from the Capital Budget the monies from the North Shore Connector. And that's basically it. And I allocated it to another area, as you can see, within the budget, although I'd like to put it into our debt service to reduce the debt, like many people in our country would like to see done, is reduce the debt upon the people of this country and this county. But it can't be done that way.

I'd like to reduce the taxes, but it wouldn't be that big and it would probably cost more to send out the rebates to the people of Allegheny County; but I'd at least like to get rid of the funding for the tunnel, because like a lot of people at home, my constituents, the majority agree and not happy about it. They don't get a chance to use it that much. And that's it. I thank you very much.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Go ahead, Mike.

MR. FINNERTY: Thanks. I'll save John the trouble. Thank you. Number one, this is part of the bargain we made. And you can't give your word and then take your word back, especially to the Federal government. I wouldn't do that. I wouldn't even entertain it. First of all --- and second of all, to say that the majority of people are against the North Shore Connector is totally disingenuous, because most of the people out my way like it and, especially, the people in Dormont and Bethel Park and Mt. Lebanon, and the people that come downtown to go to the games and go to the other venues that are on the North Shore.

They really enjoy that, and I do, too, because when I have to go to the North Side over to CCAC or to the Heinz Stadium, I just leave my car here and take the T. It's very nice. It's convenient. I mean, there's been some problems with the T, as there always is problems with new things. But it has been a blessing for the City of Pittsburgh and Allegheny County. And as we proceed into the future, I think we will see that getting across that river was an important thing. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Matt. Go ahead.

MR. DROZD: There was somebody before me.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: I can't see both sides. I only have two eyes. So I saw you, so go ahead.

MR. DROZD: I would venture to say --- thank you, Mr. President. I would venture to say, if people had a choice ---. When it started out, it was, what, \$250,000,000, \$300,000,000? Then it went to \$400,000,000, then it went to \$500,000,000. Do you know what it costs to maintain that tunnel, \$20,000,000 a year. Do you see us wringing our hands about the budget up here, about the county budget, not the state, the city. Federal dollars come out of your pocket. Even though it would have went somewhere else, it's out of your pocket. I'd venture to say, if you said to the people of our great county, county

and our great country, would you rather have that in the form of a tax rebate? Or would you rather have it going in the river? I think I know what they'd say, the same thing I think, how many people that really do use it. And the people that I've talked to, my constituency --- and that's who I speak on behalf of, and they don't agree with it. And I'm voicing their opinion and their voice. And I'll stand behind that any day. That was a ridiculous decision. That gets the Golden Fleece, not only of the year but the century. Thank you, sir. Thank you, gentlemen. Thank you, ladies.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Who's next? Bill?

MR. ROBINSON: Thank you, Mr. President, and members of Council. Two items, if I might. I think Mr. Finnerty is correct, that we made a commitment and we ought to honor that commitment. We are near the end of that commitment, in terms of the money that this county pledged for this project. We had a long and serious debate on this subject a couple years ago, and we came to an understanding, that we would not pay a penny more than we identified in legislation for this Council. So I'm hard pressed to support this resolution at this time, because a commitment is a commitment, and we ought to keep it.

The consequences of what Mr. Finnerty also spoke to --- and I agree with Mr. Drozd, as well to everybody, that it was a good decision but it's a decision made. The second thing is, I'd like to speak specifically to this resolution, in terms of a project that Mr. Drozd indicated that would be taken or put into the budget, so that all his numbers match. The document I have in front of me doesn't give me that kind of detail. And if the gentleman had that kind of detail, I'd like to know, because this Capital Budget is built not only by the budget staff and the administration, but it's still through conversations with individual members. And I think they deserve to know if some project that they think is worthy would be moved if this amendment were accepted. So perhaps the gentleman or someone else could tell us specifically where he found the money.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Was that a question for someone?

MR. DROZD: It's just a cut ---.

MR. ROBINSON: For Mr. Drozd; yes, sir.

MR. DROZD: Yeah, that's just a cut of the monies, Mr. Robinson. It goes into contingency for future road projects. And I think it goes along with the saying, as most people say out there, take care of my roads, rather than a tunnel under the river. I think that's where that comes from, take care of my roads. And that's part of it. That's where it went. It's a cut of the budget. It's not moving monies, additional monies. It's a cut of the budget that goes into contingency for future projects, which I hope to be doing what people say.

MR. ROBINSON: If I might, Mr. President --- if I might follow my line of thinking.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Please do.

MR. ROBINSON: That doesn't answer my question. Where did you find the money to take out of this Capital Budget that specifically relates to your interest and that's de-funding our commitment to the North Shore Connector. It's not identified, to my knowledge, on the three sheets of papers that I have in front of me.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: I think we saw it.

MR. DROZD: Yeah, it's in the last sheet, Mr. Robinson; look.

MR. ROBINSON: Could you identify it for me, specifically, please, sir?

MR. DROZD: Yes, sir. Okay; one, two, three, four ---; on the fourth page on the back?

MR. ROBINSON: Yes, sir.

MR. DROZD: Do you see contingency for future projects? That's where the money goes.

MR. ROBINSON: Future projects.

MR. DROZD: I had our Budget and Finance --- to go over that.

MR. ROBINSON: This is your amendment. This doesn't belong to any staff person. I'm just trying to find out from you.

MR. DROZD: I mean, it's very simple. You take the money from one side; you know, debit, and then you credit. So you're debiting that North Shore Connector, taking the money away and putting it into a contingency fund for future projects, which I would hope would be roads and ---. And a lot of our constituents have asked us to put it there.

MR. ROBINSON: That's more reason why I'm asking this question. I am putting you on the spot from that standpoint, because I'd like to know who's going to come

up short. From what you said, at least somebody is going to come up short. And I don't want to be the councilman whose constituents come up short, and I'm not trying to make light of what you'd like to do. I'm just trying to ask some questions. Like Mr. Ellenbogen --- probably there's not enough votes on this Council to pass this amendment, but I think members need to be aware of the implications, if this were to pass. And I don't think you submitted this lightly; I think you really believe that this is the direction we ought to go. And I'm just saying, I don't have enough of an explanation.

MR. DROZD: It's taking \$1,635,000 from the North Shore Connector, eliminating that line item and put the money into contingency for future projects, which increases that from \$2,100,000 to \$3,735,000.

MR. ROBINSON: Last comment, if I might, Mr. President. I don't believe that this Council has the power at this point to do what Mr. Drozd has suggested. I don't believe we have the power to move the money from where he wants to move it and set it some place else. Mr. Finnerty, I think, is talking about politics --- I'm talking about government --- when he says it's probably not a good idea not to honor your commitment to the Federal government. I don't think legally we have any ability to move the money as Mr. Drozd has suggested, as worthy as his concern and idea and as consistent as it has been; just trying to make a point. Thank you. And I thank everybody for bearing with me.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you, Mr. Robinson. I have a list of speakers here. You're first, then Mike, Heather and then Jim

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Councilman Drozd --- I know everything that he says, he generally believes. And I know he tries to help his constituents. This is the most amazing thing I think I've ever seen in all the years I've been in government. Let's just revisit this for a second, this North Shore Connector; all right. It was almost a half-a-billion-dollar project, which we only paid \$12,000,000 for; okay? People didn't particularly like it at that time. But I can tell you right now that my district runs right with Councilman Finnerty's. The people in my district turned out to taste something that they thought really was bad, and they're loving it, absolutely loving it. That being said, this is a half-a-billion-dollar facility, and you're telling me, we're not

going to give them \$1,600,000 so that it stays a half-a-billion-dollar facility. And if we wanted to just literally go commit ourselves over at Western Psych and do this, then that being said --- here's something just for everybody's knowledge. Once you get out into the river, there's what they call the U.S. Harbor Line, where the United States government owns that. So here's the deal. If you said to them, okay, let it fall apart, they're going to say to you, you can't leave it there. So now you better go find \$1,000,000,000 to take it out. That's how much --- and no disrespect to Councilman Drozd, because he tries very hard to help the citizens of this county. But this is just not a good idea. Thank you.

MR. FINNERTY: I agree with many things that Councilman Ellenbogen said. This was the last 80 percent/20 percent project done by the Federal government, which demanded if we wanted it, that we could pay \$12,000,000, so we did that. And the State put in, I believe, about \$20,000,000 and the Federal government put the rest in. It was --- the final cost I believe was, like, \$456,000,000. But it's important that you realize that you have to maintain something like that; and even if it's --- it has some costs to it, and I'm sure it does, to maintain that under the river and the other tunnels that go underneath the City of Pittsburgh. But that's part of the bigness of it.

And it's important to us as a city and as a county, that we do things and they're first class. And I think that was a first-class project. And since it was funded by the Federal government, if we would control money from it, as Councilman Robinson said --- it's probably little, number one --- that they would come back and tell us that we owe them \$456,000,000 right off the bat, because we can't do that. And I think everybody up here is a person who keeps their word in what they do, and we already voted for this. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Go ahead, Matt, real quick.

MR. DROZD: Okay. Calculating --- okay; \$500,000,000 on a 200,000,000-some population comes down to about two bucks a person times 1.2 million people in Allegheny County, not including our region, comes up at \$2,400,000 directly out of their pockets in Federal tax monies; not only the \$12,000,000 that comes out of their pockets every year, not including --- yeah, times are good --- \$20,000,000 a year to maintain that tunnel. And

guess what we're struggling money for and we're cutting transit service for --- we don't have the money. Where would that \$20,000,000 go? A long ways to provide transit authority to each one of our constituents throughout this county and this region, \$20,000,000. Remember what we were fighting about recently --- not we were, when the Port Authority came to us --- \$20,000,000; it was off \$20,000,000. There is.

And lastly, quoting the word of a former governor, as we all know --- he said, quote, unquote, who said this before, this was a bad idea. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: We have an amendment on the floor.

MR. DROZD: Yeah, it's got to be voted on.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Let's vote on the amendment. It appears to me, we're going nowhere on the debates; if you guys would agree with me. Roll call.

MR. CATANESE: This is on Councilman Drozd's amendment. Mr. Burn? No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Danko?

MS. DANKO: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio?

MR. DEFAZIO: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Drozd?

MR. DROZD: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Gastgeb?

MR. GASTGEB: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?

MS. REA: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Nay.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni, President?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: No.

MR. CATANESE: Noes, 12, yeas, 2. The bill fails.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Now I believe we're still on 7271-12; am I correct?

MR. CATANESE: That's correct.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Okay. You explained that very well, Mr. Robinson. Let's have a vote on 7271-12.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Burn?

MR. BURN: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Danko?

MS. DANKO: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio?

MR. DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Drozd?

MR. DROZD: Nay.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Gastgeb?

MR. GASTGEB: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

(No response.)

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?

MS. REA: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni, President?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 13, noes, 1. The bill passes.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: 7272-12.

MR. CATANESE: Resolution of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, adopting the Grants Budget, Special Accounts Budget and Agency Fund Budget, by setting forth appropriations to pay said expenses during the fiscal year beginning January 1st,

2013 and ending December 31st, 2013. Sponsored by Councilman Robinson.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Mr. Robinson.

MR. ROBINSON: Thank you, Mr. President, and members of Council. Again, for purposes of edification, this Council is not required by law to pass a Grants and Special Accounts Budget. Historically, we have always done so; I believe, in part, so that we could be transparent and address the concerns of how taxpayer dollars, if you opt to come to this Council meeting, are spent. No dollars that are accepted by this county are spent by this county without the authorization of the County Council. That's not legal to do that. The Grants and Special Accounts Budget provides us with an opportunity to fund some very worthy projects, oftentimes as the fiduciaries for outside agencies or governments.

But the primary responsibility rests with this Council. No money can be accepted by this county to be spent or spend without the approval of Allegheny County Council. Move for approval.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Moved in second. Question?
Roll call.

MR. CATANESE:	Mr. Burn?
MR. BURN:	Yes.
MR. CATANESE:	Ms. Danko?
MS. DANKO:	Aye.
MR. CATANESE:	Mr. DeFazio?
MR. DEFAZIO:	Yes.
MR. CATANESE:	Mr. Drozd?
MR. DROZD:	Aye.
MR. CATANESE:	Mr. Ellenbogen?
MR. ELLENBOGEN:	Aye.
MR. CATANESE:	Mr. Finnerty?
MR. FINNERTY:	Yes.
MR. CATANESE:	Mr. Futules?
MR. FUTULES:	Yes.
MR. CATANESE:	Mr. Gastgeb?
MR. GASTGEB:	Yes.
MR. CATANESE:	Ms. Heidelbaugh?
MS. HEIDELBAUGH:	Yes.
MR. CATANESE:	Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY:	Yes.
MR. CATANESE:	Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE:	Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?
MS. REA: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni, President?
PRESIDENT MARTONI: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 14, noes, 0. The bill

passes.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: 7242-12.

MR. CATANESE: An ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, changing the name of the 16th Street Bridge within the City of Pittsburgh, to the David McCullough Bridge. Sponsored by Council members Danko, Martoni, Macey, Heidelbaugh, Palmiere, DeFazio, Drozd, Rea, Futules, Gastgeb and Robinson.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Mr. Macey.

MR. MACEY: Thank you, Mr. President, and members of Council. After a distinguished committee had been put together to overlook this naming of the bridge, and after many hours of discussions, I'm very proud to say that at the Public Works meeting, it was moved and approved as a --- for affirmative recommendation to full Council, on November 20th, 2012. I make that motion that this bridge be approved.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Moved in second. Question?

MR. FINNERTY: I'd just like to be added.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Jim?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I just wanted to say, when Councilwoman Danko first proposed this, you know, I really didn't know who this gentleman was. I heard the name, but I didn't really know who. And actually, I'd really like to just commend her for the phenomenal job that she did bringing this gentleman's accomplishments to the present and what contributions that he has made to Allegheny County. And she should be commended for that and even have Mr. Masich from the History Center; I mean, you did a great job on this. And actually, I learned a lot and it was great. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: And you're absolutely right, she did a great job. Matt, do you have something to say?

MR. DROZD: Yeah, just real quick. Yeah, I commend this gentleman and a lot of credibility. But we also need to look at the long-term --- the five, ten years out there. Allegheny County is the second known as the

Land of Bridges. And a lot of those bridges, like the infrastructures, are coming up for repair. And there's going to be a horrendous amount of money. And without the Federal and the State coming down with monies, we've got to start looking at this; we really do. We need to produce some projections and look at where we're going to go with this and what needs to be maintained. We need a maintenance schedule on those bridges, as well as other facilities. When that facilities department goes into place within the county, this new department, they need to look at those bridges, too, and do that schedule out there to see where those monies are going to come from, what we're looking at in costs and where will we go with those monies and gauge those elected official --- one of which is before us tonight --- to make sure they're looking at long term, that they're going to get those monies here in Allegheny County, so the people won't have to bear that cost. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you, Mr. Drozd.
Heather?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: When we vote in favor of naming this bridge in honor of our great colleague, David McCullough, we do more than bestow an honor upon him. What we say to ourselves is that history is important and that, culturally, in addition to the many fine sports teams that we have in this town and which we recognize continually, that we also recognize the contributions of others in our community, such as a great historian. And I hope that we, by doing this small act, teach our children that history plays such a vital and important role in learning from our mistakes, so that we don't repeat them.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. John?

MR. PALMIERE: Thank you, Mr. President. I just wanted to say, Mr. McCullough is a treasure, and he's always --- and many, many times when I've seen him on television, and so on and so forth, he always, always indicated very plainly, very clearly, that he was a byproduct of Pittsburgh and Pittsburgh --- and Carnegie Library System. He always praised the area and always recognized Pittsburgh. And for that, I'm very grateful that he's always done that. He's always seen fit to do that. And he is just a one of the premiere historians of our time. And I think it's way overdue that we have an opportunity to honor him tonight. Thank you very much.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Vince?

MR. GASTGEB: Thank you, President Martoni. I've been on this Council for all the renaming of the bridges, and they've all been very deserving. I think Mr. Ellenbogen said a couple years ago, if you took a ledger and put all the conceivable names that contribute to Allegheny County or the Pittsburgh area, it would be so impressive that there wouldn't be enough bridges, even though we have a lot and we are the County of Bridges, to cover them. But what makes this a little bit different to me is the way Ms. Danko went about this with the blue ribbon committee, with engaging the Public Works Committee under Mr. Macey's leadership and really reaching out --- I'm sure that I wasn't the only one that got e-mails from her for questions --- and just doing it in a very holistic manner for, really, a great person in Mr. McCullough.

So I think not only are we renaming the 16th Street Bridge in honor of a great American, but I think Ms. Danko showed us a really strong way to continue this great tradition. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. Ms. Danko; we can't forget about you.

MS. DANKO: I just want to thank all my colleagues. Mr. Macey was an early supporter and Mr. Palmiere --- I think he's read every one of Mr. McCullough's books and has helped me to shepherd this through the process. I also want to thank the County Manager and his committee. They did fabulous work, and I hope after we vote and, hopefully, after the County Executive signs this, I'm looking forward to a great celebration of the renaming of the 16th Street Bridge. Thank you, all.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. Roll call.

MR. BURN: I did want to say one thing.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Go ahead. Hold it. Go ahead, say it. ???.

MR. BURN: We've had the pleasure of seeing Mr. McCullough on 60 Minutes a few times, just about a month ago. He actually made it two weeks in a row. But the most important thing that was humorous to me, he was on the island of Martha's Vineyards, and he was in this little square building. And he writes his books on a typewriter; not a computer but an Underwood typewriter. And they asked him why he did it and he said, he doesn't want to accidentally push one button and undo a years' worth of work. And I thought that was pretty special for

him to say it that way, because to write a book on an old Underwood is certainly something from the past. And none of us have ever known any of that any more, for sure. That just shows his character, that he still respects the old time of America. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Roll call.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Burn?

MR. BURN: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Danko:

MS. DANKO: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio?

MR. DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Drozd?

MR. DROZD: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Gastgeb?

MR. GASTGEB: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?

MS. REA: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni, President?

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 14, noes, 0. The bill passes.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Liaison Reports. Any liaison ---?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes. This is about jobs that are opening up. The Western Pennsylvania Construction and Occupation Laborers Joint Apprenticeship and Training Program is going to be opening up. If you want to contact them, the number is 1-800-442-8868. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. Mr. DeFazio?

MR. DEFAZIO: Yes. Under the Presidential Election, there were eligible registered voters, 924,469; voting was 627,704. There were 67.8 percent voting at the election; and for the absent --- for the original ballots, 340 was counted and I think 1,525 --- I guess they're partially counted on that. There was 1,947 rejected. The ones mostly rejected were people that were never registered to vote, and you can't vote if you were never registered. And that's all I have.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. Anyone else?

MR. FINNERTY: I'd just like to commend Heidelberg on their fantastic Light-up Night that they had last Saturday. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you. Okay. New Business. Ordinances and Resolutions. 7294-12.

MR. CATANESE: A resolution of the County of Allegheny, amending the 2012 Capital Budget for Allegheny County. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Budget and Finance Committee. 7295-12.

MR. CATANESE: A resolution of the County of Allegheny, adopting the Shannon Transit Village Tax Increment Financing Plan presented by the Redevelopment Authority of Allegheny County, creating the Shannon Transit Village Tax Increment Financing District and making certain findings. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Economic Development and Housing Committee. 7296-12.

MR. CATANESE: A resolution of the County of Allegheny, amending the Grants and Special Accounts Budget for 2012 (Submission 13-12). Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Committee on Budget and Finance. New Business, Motions. 7297-12.

MR. CATANESE: Motion of the Council of Allegheny County, re-establishing the Budget Transfer Committee in accordance with Section 805.03 of the Administrative Code. Sponsored by Councilman Robinson.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Motion?

MR. ROBINSON: Move to approve.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Moved in second. Question? All in favor?

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Opposed? So ordered. Okay. Notification of Contracts.

MR. CATANESE: None.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Public Comment on General Items. We have several speakers today. Our first speaker I don't believe is here, Rusty? I don't see him. Herman Hardy? Herman Hardy, are you here? He's not here. Michael Stout is here. I see him back there. Name and address for the record.

MR. STOUT: My name is Mike Stout. My address is 4223 Willow Avenue, Castle Shannon, 15234. And I'd like to address Council about --- approximately, two and a half, three years ago, we came to Council concerning the issue of the Marcellus drilling. That was beginning to boom in western Pennsylvania. And the sentiment that we got from County Council at the time was the issues of safety, the issue of whether or not our water and our land and people were being poisoned was --- the question was still out on it; and that, in fact, there had to be a lot more investigation and a lot more research done. Well, what I got handed out to the Council members here is a book. And the book, which is entitled, From the Shale Fields, Personal Testimonies and Collective Stories, is in fact, first-hand testimony from people who have leased their land or had land adjacent to leases, concerning the Marcellus drilling; and through personal --- have given personal testimony that their land, that their families, that their animals have been poisoned by the drilling process and from this fracking. The book also contains more than 500 other people, not only in the State of Pennsylvania but throughout the United States, who have experienced fracking on or adjacent to their land, who have been poisoned by this process.

We ask the Council people respectfully to please read the first-hand testimonies, to read this book and read what people are going through who have leased their land and had their families, their animals from their land poisoned. We not only respectfully request you to read it, but we hope that you will give us the opportunity to meet with you, either the week of December 18 or at a time that's convenient to you, to discuss what is in the book and what we presented to you. Also in the book and in the packet that I've given you is a report by the physicians, scientists and engineers for healthy energy, which is a Ph.D. person, Anthony Ingraffea, who is one of the

foremost researchers and investigators on fluid vibration mechanisms.

And what this addresses is the issue of aquifers and underground water and whether or not the fracking process, which is going underneath the aquifying process is, in fact, migrating up and has the potential and is, in fact, poisoning our water and our aquifers. A lot of people are arguing back and forth, gentlemen. But we ask you if there's a possibility that our water, in fact, is being poisoned, it needs to be addressed by County Council. The State is not addressing it. Governor Corbett is not addressing it. The Federal government is not addressing it. And we need somebody to stand up for the people of Allegheny County and western Pennsylvania, to address it. Thank you.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you, Michael. Joni Rabinowitz? Joni, I think I saw you back there.

MS. RABINOWITZ: Yes. My name is Joni Rabinowitz. I live at 7721 Edgertin Avenue, Pittsburgh, 15221. I was going to talk about the issue of Marcellus, but it seems like the reports that have been presented to you do an excellent job of it. What I want to ask you is, to ask yourself when you look at these reports, is it worth it? You're going to have to make a decision about drilling on county land. Is it worth the future and the lives of your children and grandchildren and seven generations hence, for the horrible dangers that this drilling causes? Now Mr. Macey told me earlier that he had a lot of books --- a lot of reports and things on this data, and I don't know whether you all do have such reports on your desks. But I hope that you will investigate the issue easily and thoroughly. I want to beg you to be responsible to your children and grandchildren on this issue, because you can't take it back.

Once those chemicals and stuff is down there and once it's coming up in the air and once it's coming up in the water, you can't take it back. One of my biggest concerns is the pollution of the water. The water table that serves New York City and Philadelphia is being drilled right now, the water source. So I beg you to go to the links that we provided in this report, get on the Internet, plug in some key words --- Marcellus Shale, dangerous fracking problems; you know how to do that ---

and you will find more information in the form of links and YouTube, that you can ever imagine.

I spend many hours a week reading these links?, which will require you, as responsible adults, to halt that industry from drilling on county land. Germany, Denmark, Netherlands and other countries are producing energy from waste burned in non-emissions incinerators. So research this. I beg you, read everything you can about the effects of this industry. I beg you to ask yourself --- Mr. Burn, Ms. Daly Danko, Mr. DeFazio, Mr. Drozd, Mr. Ellenbogen, Mr. Finnerty, Mr. Futules, Mr. Martoni, Mr. Gastgeb, Ms. Heidelbaugh, Mr. Macey, Mr. Palmiere, Ms. Rea and Mr. Robinson --- to please do what you are responsible for, for your families and your constituents, and investigate this issue thoroughly. Once you do that, I guarantee you, you will vote against drilling on county land. Thank you.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Jim Barr? Jim?

MR. BARR: Good evening. My name is Jim Barr. I reside at 200 Frankfort Avenue, West View Borough. And tonight, I'd like to comment on a trib article that was dated November 27, 2012. And the title was, A Path Beneath the Sturg. Now the title of the article is not what I'm here about. I'm here concerning the body of the article, which talks about a department-wide assessment in comprehensive review of the public works organizations or documents; specifically, the public works --- from this public works site, you will examine the department's overall efficiency and service delivered.

My concern is that when they do this study, which I believe --- I guess --- it is already supposed to have taken effect beginning in November --- but what I'd like to ask this Council to look into is that --- for example, in West View, we have a State road, we have a county road and we have about 69 municipal roads that are maintained. I guess the question is, you know --- and I understand, you know, is it most efficient for ---? My question is, is it most efficient for multiple governed public works departments to maintain municipal communities? And I understand that there are --- you know, there's always budgets that are always a concern.

But I'd like to --- you know, as far as this study if you were to pursue it, and to find out an answer

if multiple governments are always the best way to maintain --- to govern the municipalities? But I'd like to leave you with this one thought in answering that question about what is best --- you know, which government entity would best maintain the roads; that elected officials --- they always want to satisfy your constituents. I believe that a statesman would want efficient services overall government, not just, you know, who would maintain a road and to politically maintain it. But I think individuals --- that the government should maintain it most efficiently, not who would have to pay for it. Collectively, overall, the government should maintain the roads most efficiently. Thank you very much.

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Thank you very much. Motion for adjournment?

MR. DEFAZIO: So moved.

(Chorus of seconds.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Second. All in favor?

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT MARTONI: Opposed? So ordered.

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:00 P.M.

CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify, as the stenographic reporter, that the foregoing proceedings were taken stenographically by me, and thereafter reduced to typewriting by me or under my direction; and that this transcript is a true and accurate record to the best of my ability.



Kayle Gooden