

ALLEGHENY COUNTY COUNCIL

REGULAR MEETING

- - -

BEFORE:

John P. DeFazio	-	President, Council-At-Large
Nicholas Futules	-	Vice President, District 7
Heather S. Heidelbaugh	-	Council-At-Large
Thomas Baker	-	District 1
Jan Rea	-	District 2
Edward Kress	-	District 3
Michael J. Finnerty	-	District 4
Sue Means	-	District 5
John F. Palmiere	-	District 6
Dr. Charles J. Martoni	-	District 8
Robert J. Macey	-	District 9
William Russell Robinson	-	District 10 (Via Telephone)
Terri Klein	-	District 11
James Ellenbogen	-	District 12
Amanda Green Hawkins	-	District 13 (Via Telephone)

Allegheny County Courthouse
Fourth Floor, Gold Room
436 Grant Street
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219

Tuesday, December 1, 2015 - 5:02 p.m.

SARGENT'S COURT REPORTING SERVICE, INC.
429 Forbes Avenue, Suite 1300
Pittsburgh, PA 15219
(412) 232-3882 FAX (412) 471-8733

IN ATTENDANCE:

William McKain	-	Allegheny County Manager
Joseph Catanese	-	Director of Constituent Services
Jared Barker	-	Director of Legislative Services
Walter Szymanski	-	Budget Director
Jack Cambest	-	County Solicitor

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: The meeting will come to order. Will you all rise for the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag and remain standing for silent prayer or reflection? Repeat after me ---.

(Pledge of Allegiance recited.)

(Moment of silent prayer or reflection.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We'll have the roll call.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

(No Response.)

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Klein?

MS. KLEIN: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

(No Response.)

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Present.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?

MS. REA: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Present.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Thirteen (13) members present.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9304-15.

MR. CATANESE: Proclamation thanking the Law Enforcement Torch Run for Special Olympics Pennsylvania and declaring Saturday, December 12th, 2015 to be Pittsburgh Polar Plunge Day in Allegheny County. Sponsored by Council Members Baker, DeFazio, Ellenbogen, Finnerty, Futules, Green Hawkins, Heidelbaugh, Klein,

Kress, Macey, Martoni, Means, Palmiere, Rea and Robinson.

MR. BAKER: So Chief Porter is actually on his way over right now, so we'll get started and then ---. This is Carrie Hucker, though, ---

MS. HUCKER: Hello.

MR. BAKER: --- from Special Olympics. And the Polar Plunge is coming up in just a few days now. It's always in December. And as we're waiting for Chief Porter to arrive, I just want to tell you quickly about my background in Special Olympics. As a kid, growing up here in the City, my dad was a special education teacher in the Pittsburgh public schools. He was the original Albert Einstein, as well as the school district mascot, which was very fun.

But the first thing that he got me involved with as a kid was Special Olympics. And as a six, seven, eight-year old who gets to go to all the events and gets to hand out the Gatorade cups to all the athletes, fast forward 25 years later, got elected to the State Board for Special Olympics. And it was a real honor to get to serve on the State Board these last four years. Carrie is here and Chief Porter will be here any second, I think. Council, a little bit more. Law enforcement is incredible. They do an amazing job with the Polar Plunge.

First of all, has anyone in the room ever plunged before into the water? Oh, good. Okay. So it's really cold. I did bring visually to the presentation, this is the original Polar Plunge we did back in 2010. And that's me and my friends. I got about 15 of my friends to plunge with us that first year, which was a lot of fun. And this was last year. We did a bipartisan, non-partisan plunge together with the --- Councilman O'Connor from the City and I did a bipartisan, non-partisan plunge into the Super Plunge area --- Corporate Mascot Commander Schubert?

MS. HUCKER: He's parking.

MR. BAKER: He's also parking. Sounds good. So we might get a picture after, but --- and I think we're the only Proclamation tonight, Joe; right? Oh, Mr. Robinson? Okay. So he's going to give one. Oh, okay. Come on. Come on. So we're singing your praises. How are you? Good to see you.

So the Polar Plunge is coming up in just two weekends. I would just encourage everyone here to please show support in donating to the people that are plunging.

It is a special day in our community. It's Giving Tuesday. We have all different holidays and things that take place over the weekends, but this is Giving Tuesday. It's a day for our region to really give back to good causes and the organizations that we care about. Chief Porter certainly does that, Chief Schubert from the City, and everyone that's involved we really appreciate their support. So Carrie, maybe you can tell us a little about the details for the event and we'll get to say hi to Commander Schubert or Chief Schubert when he comes as well. This is Carrie Hucker, a member for five years.

MS. HUCKER: Yes.

MR. BAKER: Lives in District One right now, as well.

MS. HUCKER: Yes. Very excited, Tom. The Pittsburgh Polar Plunge is on December 12th.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Pull the microphone ---.

MS. HUCKER: Sorry. The Polar Plunge is on December 12th at Heinz Field. And it starts at nine o'clock for registration. We're doing a big push right now, just one more. If anybody is registered or knows somebody with a team, we're just asking everybody to get in there and register. Get one more friend, one more donor, and we can reach the donations for the athletes. All of the money raised goes to support the athletes in Pennsylvania. We have about 20,000. And this event is slated to raise \$425,000 this year. And our law enforcement partners have raised well over a million and a half in the last five years, all from western Pennsylvania. We have a very strong showing from our law enforcement partners out here so we're excited and ---.

CHIEF PORTER: Just so you know, we crushed Philadelphia so ---.

MS. HUCKER: So we always strive to get --- Philadelphia is trying to beat us. We're all on a team, but a friendly competition. And our website is pittsburghplunge.org or pittsburghplunge.org, if you're interested.

MR. BAKER: This is Chief Porter, Port Authority.

CHIEF PORTER: All I can say is if you're looking for a great time, I mean, if you've ever done the plunge or you would like to do it, I mean, it really is a good time. And you raise some awareness and funds for children and adults with intellectual disabilities. It's really a great cause. Thanks.

MS. HUCKER: Thanks you guys for your support.

MR. BAKER: And then with that, we'll read the Proclamation. Maybe Commander Schubert will just like run in right now.

WHEREAS, Special Olympics is the world's leading voice in elevating awareness for the needs and abilities of people with people with intellectual disabilities.

AND WHEREAS, on Saturday, December 12th, 2015 the Law Enforcement Torch run Special Olympics Day hosts its annual Pittsburgh Polar Plunge at Heinz Field on the North Shore.

WHEREAS, Special Olympics Pennsylvania provides Olympic type sports for children and adults with intellectual disabilities where they can develop physical fitness, demonstrate courage, experience joy, participate in the sharing of gifts, skills and friendships with their families, other Special Olympic athletes and the community.

AND WHEREAS, more than 2,000 people are expected to plunge into the chilly Ohio River to raise funds for Special Olympic Pennsylvania.

And I think that year it was just a couple of hundred; right? It was small. So the fact that's now over 2,000 plus, it's really incredible.

SO WHEREAS, more than 2,000 people are expected to plunge into the chilly Ohio River to raise funds for Special Olympics PA, including hundreds of law enforcement officers with local, state and federal agencies.

NOW, THEREFORE, LET IT BE RESOLVED that Allegheny County Council does hereby declare Saturday, December 12th, 2015 to be Pittsburgh Polar Plunge Day in Allegheny County. We thank the Law Enforcement Torch Run for Special Olympics PA for raising funds and awareness for the Special Olympics. Sponsored by myself and County Council. Thank you.

CHIEF PORTER: Thank you.

MS. HUCKER: Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9305-15.

MR. CATANESE: Let the record show that Councilman Kress is present.

Proclamation recognizing the 18th Annual Summit Against Racism and declaring Saturday, January 23rd, 2016 to be Black and White Reunion Day in Allegheny County. Sponsored by Council Members Robinson, Heidelbaugh, Macey, DeFazio and Klein.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Good evening. If we can have all the recipients here? My colleague, Mr. Robinson, could not attend this evening, but is present by telephone. Mr. Robinson, can you hear us?

MR. ROBINSON: Yes, ma'am. I thank you, Ms. Heidelbaugh, for being kind enough to make this presentation on my behalf. And I encourage any of my colleagues who would like to be a co-sponsor to please do so at the appropriate time.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Thank you, Mr. Robinson. He asked me in his stead to present this proclamation which was my honor to do in regard to an event that is going to occur in our community on January 23rd. January 23rd happened to be a big day in my life. It was the day I got married. And I began to wonder what other important events have occurred on January 23rd. In 1845, the U.S. Election Day for president and V.P. became authorized as an annual day. In 1849, Ms. Elizabeth Blackwell became the first woman physician in the U.S. In 1943 --- these are all on January 23rd --- Duke Ellington played for the first time at Carnegie Hall in New York City. 1964 was a big day for January 23rd, the U.S. --- the 24th Amendment to the United State Constitution ratified, was ratified barring poll taxes from federal elections. January 23rd in 1973, U.S. President Nixon announced an accord that had been reached to end the Viet Nam War.

Particularly important to Pittsburgh in 1975, Ralph Kiner was elected to the Baseball's Hall of Fame. In 1979, Willie Mays was elected to the Baseball Hall of Fame. And in 1986 there was the first induction into the Rock and Roll Hall of Fame.

Now, none of those --- all of those pale in comparison to what's about to happen in our community on January 23rd. There's a big event occurring in our community. It's the 18th Annual Summit Against Racism which is a multi-cultural initiative of the Black and White Reunion. It will occur from 8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m. that the Pittsburgh Theological Seminary. And the folder that I received, a flyer actually, announcing the Summit quotes Frederick Douglas, the great abolitionist and author and his quote says power concedes nothing without a demand, which is a uniquely American sentiment.

You may be surprised to know, all of you, that Frederick Douglas received a letter on January 23rd, 1849 from C.H. Chase, and I'll give that to you. And Frederick

Douglas responded to that letter on February 9th, 1849. And this was a letter which changed the course of history. He wrote a --- C.H. Chase wrote a letter to Frederick Douglas discussing whether the U.S. Constitution was pro-slavery or anti-slavery. Frederick Douglas' response is taught in American History and began the transformation of thinking on this issue including President Lincoln's thinking 11 years later in 1860. This Summit continues the important work that needs to take place in our community as well as across the nation.

I'd like to introduce Mr. Stevens and Mr. Miller to further discuss what will be happening in our community on January 23rd.

MR. MILLER: Yeah, this is the 18th Annual Summit Against Racism. Many of the --- some of you have attended in previous years. We were founded after the killing of Johnny Gammage in Brentwood. We've been demanding justice for Johnny Gammage since then. Justice for Johnny Gammage, maybe we didn't win that, but we do have a scholarship which is the Johnny Gammage Scholarship. It is funded by the Summit Against Racism every year. Every year, we use a huge portion of the funds we raise at the Summit Against Racism to support young black law students at Pitt and Duquesne pursuing the law and that are interested in civil rights.

The other part of Justice for Johnny Gammage is our Citizen Police Review Board, which is in the City of Pittsburgh, but police brutality is really a whole problem, you know, throughout the whole region. And we're hoping that this year the extension of the Department of Justice which has come to nestle here in the City of Pittsburgh will spread throughout the region. I really think the intervention of the Department of Justice in police departments all over western Pennsylvania is critical. And we're doing the voter registration at the community colleges. We got 200 in this last election. We're looking forward going again. And one of the things that make our voter registration campaign a little bit unique is that we're very focused on combining it with the Universal Declaration of Human Rights.

So you know, really if we see people doing voter registration in our communities we could help them along by making sure they also are doing some educational work with the Universal Declaration of Human Rights.

We have a great Summit team. It's a great team this year. The website is fantastic. We have a flyer like this for every school and police department in the region.

This is Marcia Bandes. She's facilitating a workshop this year at the Summit Against Racism.

MS. BANDES: Good evening. And yes, I've been to the Summit Against Racism now ever since I came to Pittsburgh, and I love it. So this year we're making the step forward to do a workshop there, and it'll be focused on two different conventions. One is the convention to end all racist --- racial discrimination as well as the U.N. Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women. So we're taking it a step further, and I'm really looking forward to it. And I hope that you can all make it. I think you'll find a fascinating and enlightening day, so please join us. Thank you.

MR. MILLER: Ron Bandes has also facilitated workshops at the Summit Against Racism. He happens to be amongst the best election protection people in the whole region. We're going --- oh, he's the man if you're going to see the Pennsylvania Secretary of State to talk about elections, Ron Bandes is from Pittsburgh and Barry Kaufman from Harrisburg.

MR. BANDES: Thank you, Kenneth. So one of the things that we do at this Summit Against Racism, of course, is not only enroll people, register people to vote, but try to make them more aware of their responsibility to vote, how to become a voter. And we recruit people for election protection, which is something we do not only at the Summit Against Racism, but also the organization that Tim Stevens founded, the Black Political Empowerment Project.

In collaboration between BPEP and Common Cause, we train election protection volunteers who stand outside the polling places and ask voters as they come out if they had any problems voting. And although I have trained such people in collaboration with primarily Celeste Taylor, I have never myself been an election protection volunteer because on election day I'm a Judge of Election. So in 2012, it was very amusing to have two people who I trained to be election protection volunteers monitoring my polling place. But of course, we had no incidents at my polling place.

And I'd actually also like to take this moment to thank Councilwoman Heidelbaugh, who has been on the Board of Elections and we've greatly appreciated her efforts there. And she's always made citizens who come to the meetings feel very welcome and really interested in our comments. So thank you very much, Councilwoman Heidelbaugh. And thank you to Council person Robinson also for sponsoring this Proclamation.

MR. STEVENS: As Brother Robinson goes out of office, he's certainly been steadfast in his support of the Black and White Reunion Summit. And as Tim Stevens is the founder of the Black and White Reunion Day my presidency in ACP, my first full year, what the Black and White Reunion has become is a example of how you can take a negative and create some positives out of it. It was the death of Johnny Gammage that occurred October 12th, '95. And soon after that, right blocks away from here, we had hundreds of people came to the YWCA, black and white alike, to discuss how we could begin to build the bridges between the white and black community.

And I've heard from some law enforcement people over the years that the way we handled the death of Johnny Gammage, which occurred technically within the limits of the City, was done in a way that we did not have the riots and did not have some of the negative interactions which occurred in other parts of the country. And we began to lay some roots and foundations for how do we create a relationship between the police and community? We continue that work today, and with the presence of Cameron McLay, we've certainly moved ahead with that in the Pittsburgh region.

This summit now occurs every Saturday after the birth date of Dr. King, the celebration, the official celebration of Dr. King's birth date. And what it has become is the most significant collective effort --- as we begin each year --- we had 400 or 500 people last year come together across racial lines, age lines, ethnic lines. We call it a multi-cultural initiative.

It's called the Black and White Reunion because when this happened, it was basically an issue between the white community and the black community, and we wanted to build those bridges. And we're trying to build bridges now between all the ethnicities in the City and do so in a positive way. We've had about 15 workshops in the last two years each. We expect to have something in that

direction, and --- so people can recommit their commitment to human rights and civil rights in the Pittsburgh region, and do so surrounded by people who believe in that energy and that commitment to make a difference in the Pittsburgh region.

So we thank you. We thank Bill Robinson, who is on the phone, who has been our strong supporter for these many years. And I thank him for his work politically as a former City Councilman, a former state legislator, and a current member of County Council. He's been, in my opinion, probably the most consistent African-American political leader in our region in advocating for the issues that need to be advocated for on behalf of the African-American community and the poor communities of our region. Thank you for the opportunity. Thank you for representing the Councilman.

MR. ROBINSON: Thank you very much, Tim.

MR. STEVENS: Thank you.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Let me just read --- I think we've gone through a lot of this, so just ---.

BE IT RESOLVED that Allegheny Council, in recognition of this important event, does hereby declare Saturday, January 23rd, to be Black and White Reunion Day in Allegheny County.

(Applause.)

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Let's get our picture taken.

(Pictures taken.)

MR. CATANESE: President DeFazio, we have a couple of people that came in from the first proclamation. They would like to take a picture with Councilman Baker. Is that okay?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah. Sure.

(Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9305-15 (sic), and the rest will be read into the record.

MR. CATANESE: 9306-15. Proclamation declaring Sunday, December 6th, 2015, to be AUTISM Frosbite 5K Run/Walk and Community Day in Allegheny County. Sponsored by Council Member Baker.

9307-15. Proclamation declaring Saturday, December 5th, 2015 to be Zachary's Mission Day in Allegheny County. Sponsored by Council Member Baker.

9308-15. Certificate of Recognition awarded to Mr. and Mrs. Jerry and Sylvia Lynn upon the occasion of

their 50th wedding anniversary. Sponsored by Council Member Baker.

9309-15. Certificate of Recognition welcoming The Honorable Dr. Gennaro Capo, Mayor of Castel San Lorenzo, Italy, to the City of Pittsburgh and Allegheny County. Sponsored by Council Member DeFazio.

9310-15. Certificate of Recognition congratulating Mr. Raymond Ehrman upon the occasion of his 100th birthday. Sponsored by Council Member Finnerty.

9311-15. Certificate of Recognition congratulating Mr. Thomas Gravelle upon the occasion of his retirement after 27 years of dedicated service to the Borough of Verona. Sponsored by Council Member Futules.

9312-15. Proclamation thanking The Honorable Edward Dusa for his more than 60 years of dedicated service to Shaler Township. Sponsored by Council Member Kress.

9313-15. Proclamation congratulating The Employment Institute at Auberle for being named the 2015 Pennsylvania Community Based Program of the Year by the Pennsylvania Juvenile Court Judges' Commission. Sponsored by Council Member Macey.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under Public Comments, we have one. Fran Lange.

MR. LANGE: Right here, sir.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

MR. LANGE: How many minutes do I have?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Three.

MR. LANGE: I'm here for the ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No. No. Take ---. You got to get over there.

MR. FINNERTY: Take the microphone first.

MR. LANGE: Hello. My name is Fran Lange. I live at 5228 Tower Terrace. That's Ross Township, 15229-2231. I'm here to represent the people in North Hills that are trying to get our bus service back or more or whatever. I'd like to just --- okay. I can watch the clock. My grandparents moved to Towers Terrace 100 years ago. My grandfather was able to teach at Allegheny Vocational and retired in the 1940s due the fact that he could take the streetcar there because he was so dyslexic he couldn't drive. I also went to the Tam-o-Shanter Art School for five years at the Carnegie Museum from '61 to '66 via the streetcars, the buses, any other streetcars.

And from that, I was a Carnegie Tech alumni at 14. That's about the best I've done so far, but anyway ---.

Right now, there's 30,000 people in Ross Township. That's the last census. It cites 31,000. I think that's a little off. Back in 1930 there was 8,500. Well, we're back now to about --- we're still at the same --- we haven't lost all those people in Ross Township, but we're back to same service we had somewhere around 1930. Okay? We don't have the Harmony Short Line any more, so there's no --- there's no way for people and students to get out to the CA --- Community College, the library. There's businesses, services, employment opportunities. There's so much in that whole 19 corridor that has been totally shut down since the removal of all the buses.

And I live right across from that Park & Ride, and if you could have that 11-C or something like it reinstated, you would find you could have that shuttle --- get that 01 filled up even more. That 01, it takes --- I've timed it. It takes eight minutes to get to town from my place. It's eight minutes. That's when you get on the bus. You're gone. You're here. Those people would stand those cars on end, if they could, to park there. So if we got --- I think if we get more buses, okay, if we get more buses to be able to coordinate with the Park & Ride, you would get ridership up. You would get more commerce. You'd get more business. You'd get students going to college. My mother went to the Duquesne University from 1936 to 1940 via the Penn West 8 to Perrysville and all the 5th Avenue streetcar lines. Okay?

We want those kids in the North Hills to be able to make it to community college; don't we? That community college is out there. That's why they put that school there, because that --- the 11C had run for 40 years. They put that school there specifically for that. And we want our kids to get to school. Where there's all those businesses and services out there, employment opportunities, we really need to irrigate that mass transit desert out there. We really do. And thank you for your time. And thank you for giving me some time. I really appreciate it. Thank you.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9318-15.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the reappointment of Sharon Adams to serve as a member of the Council of

Friends organization, South Park, for a term to expire on December 1st, 2017. Sponsored by Council Member Palmiere.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Thank you, Mr. President. It's a pleasure to do this and to recommend Sharon Adams to another term on the Council of Friends. She's been very active and very effective in her membership the past couple of years, so I'd move for approval, please.

MR. MACEY: Second.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it. Someone questioned about the minutes. We have no minutes. That's why we moved on.

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: This is Council Member Amanda Green Hawkins. I'm on the phone.

MR. CATANESE: Got it.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. 9319-15.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the reappointment of Jim Converse to serve as a member of the Council of Friends organization, South Park, for a term to expire on December 1st, 2017. Sponsored by Council Member Palmiere.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Thank you, Mr. President. Again, Jim has been a wonderful member of the Friends of South Park, and you know, again, I'm honored to have the opportunity to recommend him for another term.

MR. MACEY: Second.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it. Unfinished Business. Committee on Budget and Finance, Second Reading. 9067-15.

MR. CATANESE: A resolution amending the New Home Construction/Improvement Program enacted May 23rd, 1996 by the Board of Commissioners of Allegheny County at Agenda No. 700-96, subsequently amended by Resolution Nos. 22-00, 6-01, 61-02, 04-04-RE, 49-05-RE, 07-08-RE, 25-09-RE, 30-11-RE and 6-14-RE by providing for the continuation of the Allegheny County New Home

Construction/Improvement Exemption Program. Sponsored by Council Member Means.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Means?

MR. FINNERTY: Excuse me.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: What?

MR. FINNERTY: I think the Chairman has to go first.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. I thought you were --- yeah, you're the Chairman. Go ahead.

MR. FINNERTY: Thanks. This was released from the Committee with a negative recommendation. The vote was 5 to 2. So I'll make a motion that we vote negatively on this. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: There's a motion. Do I hear a second?

MR. FUTULES: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Second. Under remarks? Now, go ahead, Sue.

MS. MEANS: I'm sorry. I don't ever remember us ever making a motion to vote one way or the other before. That's very unusual. It's usually a motion to vote, but not a motion in casting a negative cloud on it. But anyway, thank you for recognizing me, and I would like to have this letter written from a gentleman named Joshua Vaughn entered into the record. And then, Mr. Szymanski, could you please give a copy to everyone? I received this letter from him yesterday, and we all got a copy. And basically would you trouble me to read the letter or should I just --- I would like ---. Basically, it's a very disappointed young professional. He and his wife are scheduled to close on their house on December 18th, and it was to be a very exciting day. And he had very carefully calculated out what his taxes would be and his monthly payments. And now he comes to learn that the abatement program that he thought he was going to be able to sign up on December 18th may be going away. And he says very articulately that the new home construction abatement program, he gave it great consideration. It was one of the reasons he chose to build his new home in Allegheny County.

But this is an abatement program that's been here in Allegheny County since the time of the Commissioners, since 1996, and has been unanimously passed by Council year after year except one year when Amanda Green Hawkins was new, she abstained. In 2014, the

Council reduced the abatement program amount to 50 percent.

Now, I consider this a way to grow our tax base. I also consider this a way to encourage people to move into the County and build their homes in the County just like Joshua Vaughn stated, that he could have built in another county, but he chose to build here because of the abatement program. I mean, we --- this afternoon, we had a lovely meeting with the former Senator Matt Smith and that --- as the president of the Pittsburgh Chamber of Commerce. And he talked specifically about how we need --- we need tradesmen. And this abatement program encourages small business. And I live in Allegheny County, but right on the border of Washington County. So weekly, I travel into another county where I just see an explosion of new homes and business, and they have lower taxes than we do. Their tax is only six percent on the dollar. And if Governor Wolf has his six cents on the dollar, his way, our taxes in Allegheny County will go up to eight and a quarter percent.

We are in competition with other counties. And I think this encourages people to build in Allegheny County. There's also the positive side of a builder building houses. He builds a street. He builds sewers. He builds infrastructure. And I'm quite perplexed as I see my Council members repeatedly pass TIFs and LERTAs to encourage large business to build warehouses or hotels, and I don't understand why this isn't --- these are jobs for people. And again, this encourages people to move to Allegheny County, build our population, build our tax assessment. It's good for us, and we've had it in place since 1996. And I encourage my Council members to vote in favor of it. Thank you very much for recognizing me.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any other comments?
Representative Heidelbaugh.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Throughout the discussion on this bill, there have been repeated statements that no one would complain about this, that no one would really care about it. That people don't move in or out of the County because of these issues. And so this is Exhibit A. This is evidence that people do care about this issue, and we will be affecting people.

I guess one of the principal reasons that I'm disturbed about all of this is really a bait and switch. We have promised a number of people in our community

through their --- not only their home builders, but through the actual legislation that they were going to receive this tax abatement, and now they're not. And I think there's going to be a lot of angry people and they're going to, obviously, look at the people who voted to do this to them. It's just not what we as a government ought to be doing. We ought to be giving people notice that this is not going to be continuing. But people who are promised it, who relied on it, who made decisions on it, they shouldn't be penalized. There should have been some sort of legislation which we tried to pass to grandfather people in, and they haven't been grandfathered.

So I just think this is a terrible thing for government to do to people.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any other --- go ahead. Who was first?

MR. FINNERTY: Go ahead. Let her go.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead, Sue.

MS. MEANS: I just wanted to point out this legislation that I introduced does grandfather in the people that are in the program because I agree with Heather, if someone is in the middle of their tax abatement, they shouldn't lose that. And I just want to point that presently there's 2,500 --- I'm sorry, 2,055 parcels participating in the Act 202, and also they're --- so the remaining --- there's over 1,000 remaining parcels. So there'll be a 1,000 families if this expires who don't get their full tax abatement.

And also this legislation is wrapped in with Act 42. So also we have a program, a wonderful program that doesn't penalize people for fixing up their house. Of course, if they --- they are going to buy a house in a blighted area, they're going to invest in a new roof or a new bathroom, and so they get a cheaper tax abatement for their home improvements. Thank you for recognizing me.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you. First of all, this program was put in place in 1996, as was mentioned. And it was put in place to incentivize people to build in Allegheny County. Right now, we have no problem with people building in Allegheny County. If you look at the numbers, you'll see that more people build in Allegheny County than any other county around. Some people take all the counties around, and say that there's more houses

being built around us. We're a great place to live and people know that.

And if you take a look at --- and I don't know if you've been to Collier Township lately or Findlay or North Fayette --- or Jan Rea's area is another place that people are building houses, lots of houses. So the incentive pay --- incentivizing people to build houses is not --- is not needed at this time. What's really needed more than anything else, if you want people to come to Allegheny County, is good infrastructure, good roads. And that's where this money is going, to good roads. So that people see that our roads are good. We have --- we're starting a program to do roads that needs to --- need to be done. In fact, I think we did a road in your area, and I think that's important. People see that. They see that things are taken care of. They want to live there and they want to live here.

And that incentive is not that much any more. In relation to us promising somebody something, we never made that promise. The real estate people made that promise. They knew that this was going to sunset. They knew that. Now, I'm sure they didn't tell the homeowners when they were selling it. So that's the way I look at it. I think we need this amount of money which is about, --- excuse me, roughly about \$1.3 million, to put into our infrastructure. Thank you very much.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Wait a minute. Okay. Representative Heidelbaugh, then Representative Ellenbogen. Go ahead

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I think the number fluctuates between \$1.2 to \$1.3 million when we're talking about this. And we did make a promise to these folks without warning that we would be taking this away. I don't think there's any science or anything that you can quote that people move to a region because of good roads or bad roads. I think there's a lot of science and a lot of facts that people move to a region because of taxes. I don't understand how your position can be we're not going to give tax --- a tax abatement to families that have built a new home that we've already promised. They're relying on it. And then vote yes for almost every TIF and every LERTA that has down the pike in the last four years. Last year alone, in 2015, we granted tax abatements of \$5 million to some of the largest corporations in America, times ten years which is \$50 million last year alone.

This is one \$1.2 out of a total budget of \$854 million.
This is a speck.

I'm not willing to turn my back on 1,000 families and to tell them what was promised to you is now being taken away. It's just not fair. It's not what government ought to be doing. I am willing to say to some of the largest corporations in America, you have to pay whatever tax everybody else pays. And you want to come to Pennsylvania, you want to come to Allegheny County, it's a great place to live. Everybody is going to pay the same tax.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Ellenbogen.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: First of all, I've lived in this city for the last 60 years. When this city has 700,000 people that lived within the city. The geography of this town, to be like Houston or other cities like that spread out like that, all one has to do is sit on Banksville Road or in the tunnel to see the traffic problems that exist currently in the city.

This Councilman's feelings has been known about how I feel about this for --- since I've been here. In 1996, we were sprawling out. We've torn up so many woodlands and whatnot in building these various communities that are new that now we have bear that are walking down the middle of the street in the city. I have animals in my backyard I've never seen in 30 years that I've lived in the house that I live in.

That being said, I have been fortunate to meet many young people who have moved from places like Alabama and Kansas and Montana and whatnot, who have relocated in the 12th District, rehabbed a lot of these homes, used the trolley as a wonderful way to get into town and to help rebuild the infrastructure that exists now.

And furthermore, the District that I represent, the 12th District, is a blue-collar working district. I do not believe that I am going to saddle the people of the 12th District with a tax increase that could happen over these types of things for people who could afford to build a half a million dollar home. The people in my district are not for this and I'm not for this. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Futules.

MR. FUTULES: I'm not sure if I want to bring it up or not, but I just feel the inconsistency in this argument. Politics 101. About last month, you were an advocate for not spending \$100,000 for birds in the parks.

And you said we've got to use the money for roads and bridges. A couple of weeks ago, you didn't want to support the arts because you said we need money for roads and bridges. But today, you want to blow \$1.2 million on something as an abatement. I feel that's some sort of a conflict and inconsistency. I'm not sure why, but you take a stance on something, it's --- you're either for making money or you're not. It seems to be that it's back and forth and you're confusing me.

But I don't support this. I think it's time for us to let this go. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Means?

MS. MEANS: I'd like to respond. I like birds, but I like people better. And I like homes for people. And I think homes for people are more important than birds. And if the people, if we get them --- to explain my point of view is the birds aren't going to increase our tax base, and we need more people to build. And if they build a big home, then they pay more taxes, and they employ more people have jobs, and it grows the economy. When you head into a recession, this is what you see. People hold onto their money tightly. They don't build a new house. They don't buy a boat. They don't get a new computer. And the economy tanks. So this is a stimulant to the economy, to explain my point of view. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Wait a minute. She hasn't said anything.

MS. KLEIN: I'd like to just say that I appreciate Councilwoman Means' opinion that this is an economic stimulus. I think that when I looked at the data, something like the average price of new construction in Allegheny County is \$330,000. And I think people who buy a \$330,000 home can pay their full freight of taxes. So I appreciate your opinion, but I will vote no.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Anyone else? If not, take the vote. Are we clear on the vote?

MS. MEANS: Voted ---.

MR. BAKER: Yeah. Is this Mr. Finnerty's motion or Ms. Means'?

MR. CATANESE: This is on the new home construction improvement program, to continue it.

MS. MEANS: I'm going to make a motion to pass, ---

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I second it.

MS. MEANS: --- to vote on the bill. Not to say negative or positive, but just to take a simple vote rather than a motion --- because that's very confusing.

MR. CATANESE: We are.

MS. MEANS: Like if you're voting --- if it's a negative vote --- let me just finish. If it's --- if you say I make a motion that we vote in a negative manner, does that mean a yes is for or against the legislation? It's very confusing. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Do you have a point of order or a question?

MR. FINNERTY: No. I just have a question.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MR. FINNERTY: If you don't want this, you vote no. If you want it, you vote yes. Am I correct or do we have to go to the Solicitor?

MR. CAMBEST: That's correct. That's the motion on the floor. That would be the proper vote.

MR. FINNERTY: Right. If you don't want it, you vote no. If you want it, you vote yes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Seeing no more, let's take the roll call.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Klein?

MS. KLEIN: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: No.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?
MS. REA: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?
MR. ROBINSON: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No.
MR. CATANESE: The ayes are 6; the no's are 9.

The bill fails.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. We go to 9300-15.

MR. CATANESE: A Resolution of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, adopting an Operating Budget pursuant to Article IV, Section 2 and Article VII, Section 4 of the Home Rule Charter, by setting forth appropriations to pay the expenses of conducting the public business of Allegheny County and for meeting debt charges for the fiscal year beginning January 1st, 2016 and ending December 31st, 2016. Sponsored by Council Member Finnerty.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you. Yes. This was released from Committee with a positive recommendation, and if you take a look at --- I think you should have your sheet in there. That would say that the amount of the operating budget will be \$854,825,000. That is the amount of the operating budget, and the revenue and the debit are equal, so it is in balance. And I make a motion to approve.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I have an amendment.

MS. MEANS: I'll second it.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: She didn't give it yet.

Hold on. Representative Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I have an amendment. Walt has a copy. May I speak to my amendment?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I have --- what you have in front of you is an amendment to the operating budget, and there are two components to it. The first is to the Office of County Controller, which is an increase from the Finnerty budget from \$4,730,815 to --- strike that.

\$4,730,815 to \$5,380,815 in a fringe benefits' increase for a total increase to the County Controller for

\$7,672,252. The reason why I want to give the County Controller an extra one million is based on the current Decision from Judge James, which allowed her to conduct performance audits. It has been one of my goals since beginning service in county government that each of the departments should be reviewed as to performance. The Controller's office had the right to perform performance audits but was principally performing audits in regard to monies in and monies out. The County Controller now has the right, per Judge James, to examine, as many auditors do, whether each of the departments is performing to their peak ability and doing that which the Charter allows them to do. I have not discussed with the County Controller. This will come as a complete surprise to her and her staff.

MR. ROBINSON: Second.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Excuse me?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead. What?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Okay. I think that if we add a million dollars for staff and for fringe benefits together, that in the end we will --- we could be saving a lot of money by looking at the current inefficiencies in county government. We are also, by the Charter, required to perform sunset reviews. We are also required by the Charter not to take the last year's budget and just add more. What we're supposed to be doing is we're supposed to be looking very closely as a legislative body which is the appropriators. We're supposed to be looking at how the departments spend the money, whether they're spending it efficiently, whether there can be a sunseting of departments, whether there need to be major changes, and we are not doing that. We don't do that in this legislative body. It's one of the many complaints that I have had about my service here in the last four years. There's a lot of smart people here. They're devoted to service, but we are not doing what we're supposed to do by the Charter.

My next amendment is for the Office of the County District Attorney, and that is to increase personnel from \$11,998,273 to \$12,000,476 --- 773 cents (sic) and fringe benefits appropriately for a total of one million dollar increase. I have not ---.

MR. ROBINSON: Second.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I have not discussed this with the District Attorney or any members of his staff. This

will come as a surprise to him. The reason I am suggesting this is because last year and the year before, I believe, the District Attorney had to come before us and had requested 750,000 more dollars in order to hire five detectives. He wanted to do that because of the problem of crime throughout Allegheny County that was not being rooted out through the use of detectives. We chose not to do that. It was voted down at Council.

Since that time, crime has worsened. This is, obviously, you know, no disrespect to the District Attorney, the County police. This is not a criticism of anyone. This is an attempt to provide more money for more resources because if you cannot be safe in your home, you have an absence of liberty. For mothers and children who can't play out in the streets, who can't walk safely from school to home, life is not what it is for you and I who feel safe in our homes and our neighborhoods.

One of the major reasons that people come to Allegheny County is because it has a relatively --- it did have a relatively low crime rate, and we're now facing escalating violence and I want to put money behind that effort.

So those are my two amendments behind the operating budget. I believe Sue Means has provided a second.

MS. MEANS: Yes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Wait. We should go with one at a time. We should go ---.

MR. FINNERTY: That's correct. He seconded her motion.

MR. ROBINSON: Second. Bill Robinson. Second. Vote.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Are you seconding the first issue or the second issue?

MR. ROBINSON: Yes, sir. Yes. I'm seconding the first issue and I will second the second issue at the appropriate time.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All right. Let's start with the first issue.

MR. FINNERTY: That's where we are.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: The first issue is on the County Controller issue.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yeah. It's contained in one document.

MR. FINNERTY: One document.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Which one?
MR. FINNERTY: Just one document.
MR. CAMBEST: Ms. Heidelbaugh's amendment is not
on the floor.
MR. FINNERTY: Yes.
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Are they all in one? I
didn't look at ---.
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: It is. It's an amendment to
the operating budget.
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: It's my operating budget.
It's the Heidelbaugh ---
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: --- Operating Budget.
MR. FINNERTY: Correct.
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. It was properly
seconded by Bill Robinson.
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: And Ms. Means.
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: It only needs one. Okay.
Now, under remarks? Any remarks? Seeing none, ---.
MR. FINNERTY: Let's vote.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?
MR. BAKER: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?
MR. ELLENBOGEN: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?
MR. FINNERTY: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?
MR. FUTULES: No.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?
MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Klein?
MS. KLEIN: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?
MR. KRESS: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?
DR. MARTONI: No.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?
MS. MEANS: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?
MS. REA: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No.
MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 3; no's 12. The amendment fails.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Now, do we have another amendment? Seeing none, we go to ---.

MR. FINNERTY: Let's vote.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead and vote on Representative Finnerty's ---.

MR. CATANESE: Okay. This is on Bill 9300-15.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Klein?

MS. KLEIN: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?

MS. REA: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 14; no's 1. The bill passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9301-15.

MR. CATANESE: Resolution of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, adopting a Capital Budget pursuant to Article IV, Section 2 and Article VII, Section 4 of the Home Rule Charter by setting forth appropriations to pay the expenses for capital expenditures during the fiscal year beginning January 1st, 2016 and ending December 31st, 2016. Sponsored by Council Member Finnerty.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you. Again, this was released from Committee with a positive recommendation. Our Capital Budget --- and I'll make sure I get it right here. I hope I got it right. There are too many papers in front of me here. Our Capital Budget is going to be \$91.7 million this year. That's an increase from \$79.9 million in 2015. So we have increased our Capital Budget. And one of the things that helped us do that is our abatement and also that we're going to be receiving \$3.5 million in relation to the registration fee. That's this year. Next year, we will be receiving \$4.5 million. So we have increased that, and 66 percent of the Capital Budget is roads and bridges. I move for approval.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I have an amendment.

MS. MEANS: I'll second it.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Heidelbaugh.

MR. FUTULES: What amendment? We don't even have it yet.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Are you ready, Heather?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I am. I only have one amendment to the Capital Budget. And this is to the South Park. Currently, South Park improvements are getting \$66,666, which is way too many sixes. And I'd like to increase that to a total of \$2 million. Principally, the reason why I want to do this is because in the last four years what I've noticed is that, unfortunately, South Park is the redheaded stepchild of the parks system in Allegheny County. No offense to redheads in the audience.

You know, South Park is an integral part of the culture and the amenities in the South Hills. And year after year after year, the South Park is ignored. I'm not

really sure what the reason for that is, but it really ought to be addressed. We gave \$2 million to Deer Lakes Park, which does not have a percentage of the visits that South Park does. When you come into the community to move here and you look at South Park, it's really an embarrassment for all of the residents of the South Hills. I think we ought to put some money there, devote some energy, because the residents of half of our county who really use that park for one of their major sources of entertainment and recreation really have a terrible place to go. This is no criticism of Andy because he does a wonderful job, but I just think we need to devote more money.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead. Representative Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I just wanted to bring to the Councilwoman's attention that if you look under South Park ice rink renovations, there's a million dollars allocated toward that so just as a point of information. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any other remarks?

MR. FUTULES: Yeah.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead. Raise your hand. Representative Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yeah. I just want to point out that you said that South Park is a stepchild. But I mean, they get the lion's share of renovations there. They just did the oval last year, which was well over a million if not \$2 million. But the \$66,000 that you're talking about, this is just divided up money amongst all the parks that came from Marcellus Shale. That was in addition to the million that they're spending at South Park. So they're getting actually \$1.6 million --- no, \$1,666,000.

MR. FINNERTY: There you go.

MR. FUTULES: I'll correct myself. But to give them \$2 million, that just seems a little bit ---.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: We just did that with Deer Lakes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Okay.

MR. FUTULES: Well, that was something --- that's correct. We won't deny that.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yeah.

MR. FUTULES: But the money was specific because Deer Lakes did need the money and the improvements are still underway there. And it was something that we did for the Marcellus Shale to get that money that you didn't

vote for, so I really, truly believe that this is disingenuous.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: One minute. Go ahead. Representative Kress.

MR. KRESS: I just want to point out that money for Deer Lakes didn't come from the taxpayers. That came from a private entity due to a contract. And to say that somehow we're unfairly distributing taxpayer money, that's not true. Again, this came from an outside source. And this is what I've always been for, is trying to get money from outside of the taxpayers, because you know, we don't want to keep raising property taxes. We always try to look from other sources. And that's what I've been trying to do with my marketing committee, is try to look for other sources to spend money on the parks and improve things. And to say that, oh, we gave Deer Lakes \$2 million, maybe Deer Lakes has been an area that's been neglected. I mean, Joe Catanese lives out in West Deer, and we know what we've done out in this area. I'm just saying that --- let me say something. My area, West Deer, which I represent, okay, they --- you know, when I go out there to meetings, they say they've been neglected. So here's a park here that we put money into. And I think it's a great investment. But again, it didn't come from taxpayers. Okay.

And the other thing I'm worried about this amendment here, we're taking money out of the roads. You know, we just had a vote here about the \$5 so we don't want to see that money shrunken. Okay? We want the money --- this isn't a bait and switch. It looks like to me it's a bait and switch. We're taking money out of roads. And to me, again, when it comes down to fundamental analysis of government, you know, is the roads themselves --- because again, that's where we have problems with the lives of people. If we have a road that's not paved, people can lose their lives. And to take money out of the roads, I don't know, I can't agree with this at all. But thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Wait a minute. Representative Ellenbogen, and then we'll come up the line.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: No. I just wanted to --- there's something else I saw here. We have the \$66,000 and we have a million for the South Park ice rink. We also, if you look at the bottom you have under South Park

bike and pedestrian improvements, you have a \$1,440,000, so the total is --- you're looking at almost \$2.5 million.

MR. FINNERTY: That's what it is.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Finnerty and then Futules.

MR. FINNERTY: That's exactly what I was going to say.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Sorry about that.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Futules and then we'll be up this way.

MR. FUTULES: Yeah. I kind of noticed the same thing.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We go to Mr. --- Representative Macey.

MR. MACEY: Thank you, Mr. President and members of Council. I would love to piggyback on what was just said from the other Council persons in regards to roads and bridges. But what I want to say is there's been a lot of deferred maintenances. I got two parks, White Oak Park and Round Hill Park in my district. The deferred maintenance has been going on for years, and I've argued. The Commissioners, the mayors in that area have asked and begged to get those parks somewhere in better condition than what they are. And to take \$2 million to South Park who's already getting several million was an insult to me and to my constituents. I appreciate, you know, the Finnerty Budget and I would like to stick with it. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Means?

MS. MEANS: Yes. I just want to make a point of clarification to the Parks chairman. I believe the fairground improvement was funded by state grants and the Parks Foundation matched it, so it wasn't --- I mean ---.

MR. FUTULES: No. We matched it.

MS. MEANS: Oh, we matched it.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Hold it. Hold it.

MS. MEANS: We matched it. Okay. All right. But I mean, half of it was ---. I thought for sure ---. Oh, the state grant was given to the Parks Foundation.

MR. FUTULES: You got it.

MS. MEANS: That's how that worked. Okay. I stand correct. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Let's vote on the ---. Heather, do you have another questions?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No. I don't have a question. I just wanted to state, you know, we make decisions as a matter of policy here. And it remains my view that after four years, South Park has been neglected in the budget process. So the suggestion to spend an additional one million to bring it certainly not up to par because it's way behind where it ought to be for such a huge number of citizens.

Number two, South Park has been neglected. It would have to be for two decades. It's in horrific condition, and it's an embarrassment. So to say that we're going to put some money into the skating rink, and we're going to put some money into the oval, which I've been out to the oval. The work hasn't been done correctly. There are still a lot of problems at the oval. This is not a lot of money to bring up one of our great resources that should be for the people.

So I'm not asking for a million dollars to be diverted to fur coats for rich people. I'm saying a million dollars for a park that everybody is going to use. That's it.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Futules?

MR. FUTULES: You know, Heather, I agree with you 100 percent. South Park is neglected. And so are the other eight county parks because we have on the average of \$100 million in deferred maintenance in all these parks. You're right. South Park is neglected. And so is South Park, North Park, Boyce Park, Heather --- you know, all --- every --- all nine county parks. You're right. But to take one --- the money and shove it into one specific, because --- you don't even have a project. You just think they need the money. But when you do a --- Capital Projects you need a reason, what's the project's name? So that's the best reason I could say.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Well, it's under ---.

MR. FUTULES: All nine county parks --- might I finish, please?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.

MR. FUTULES: All nine county parks need improvements, and we are badly in need of them and I understand that. And I agree with you 100 percent that South Park is one of the nine county parks that's neglected.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Rea, did you have a question?

MS. REA: No. My only comment was I thought it was \$2 million, but I guess it's like a million nine when you take the --- you already have the \$66,000 ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Ellenbogen.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I just wanted to say, I mean, you know, a lot of credit should be given to the County Manager, Mr. McKain, and to the Budget Director, Mr. Finnerty. The public in Allegheny County do not want their taxes raised right now. There's a lot of things that we could do and spend money on that --- I mean, we have lots of places to spend money. But we've had to do everything we can to try to hold our taxes in line and keep them from raising. So a lot of credit should go out to them. I mean, even in terms of public safety, I mean, you know, the thought of just --- we're not going into everything. Just for one example, just taking the park --- creating the park rangers so that we could take more County police and put them in the street. I mean, trying to think out of the box and trying to do things so that we don't have to raise taxes. So kudos to both of them and to all the people on the Budget Committee and across the hall. I mean, this is big stuff that we were able to hold the line. That's what's important here right now. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I'm not suggesting that there be a tax increase. And thank you, Councilwoman Rea, I misspoke. It is \$2 million. That's what I originally said. It's \$2 million.

The park rangers, to refute what you said about the park rangers, what we were told was that the park rangers would be started, and that people would be diverted to fighting crime, and that is not what has happened. What has happened is we've added park rangers, so that, I don't think, is a good analogy.

This is my idea to better --- to upgrade South Park. The South Hills, an enormous amount of people use South Park. It has been in a disgraceful condition for two decades. If people don't agree, it's fine. This is what the legislative process is supposed to do. It's supposed to discuss these things and decide where our priorities are. That was one of the things I thought we ought to think about.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Let's vote. Take the vote.

MR. MACEY: What are we voting on?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We're voting on the amendment first.

MR. CATANESE: It's Council Member Heidelbaugh's amendment to the Capital Budget.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Klein?

MS. KLEIN: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?

MS. REA: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 1; no's 14. The amendment fails.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Now, let's vote on the Capital Budget which is --- what is it, 9301-15?

MR. FINNERTY: It's Finnerty's Capital Budget.

MR. CATANESE: This is on Bill 9301-15, the Capital Budget. Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MS. MEANS: I didn't have an opportunity to speak on the Capital Budget.

MR. FINNERTY: Certainly.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks. Go ahead.

MS. MEANS: Is that okay? I just wanted to ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Well, I don't know. I have to ask them if they have any remarks. I don't think I did that, so ---.

MR. FINNERTY: Well, my question is this.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MR. FINNERTY: It's a point of order. Did we have a motion and a second on this budget?

MR. CATANESE: Yes.

MR. FINNERTY: Or did we have ---? I made a motion and I don't know if we got a second.

MR. CAMBEST: I believe there was a motion and a second, then there was a motion to amend.

MR. FINNERTY: Good enough.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks. Go ahead.

MS. MEANS: I just ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Wait. Hold it. What?

MR. CAMBEST: We started the vote.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Yeah, you can't. He already voted.

MS. MEANS: Okay.

MR. FINNERTY: No, that was on the ---.

MS. MEANS: That's right.

MR. FINNERTY: No, it wasn't. He voted.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: It was on the --- it was on the main ---.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Baker voted. Game over.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Right. You're right.

Right.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Point of order.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Look at me. Then I'll go to him if we need him. I'm acting president, got the little club (indicates gavel). Go ahead. What's your question?

MS. HEIDELABUGH: Point of order, Mr. President.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MS. HEIDELABUGH: You forgot to ask for remarks.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That's correct. I said that. I said ---.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: So we're going to vote on something that no one gets to talk about?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Well, look, I'm not arguing with you on that point. I asked that question. I couldn't remember if we did what you said. I asked our

solicitor, what's your opinion. I don't know if I did or not. If you go back and look on the minutes, I'm not sure.

MR. CATANESE: I don't know.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I think she's correct on I don't think I ---.

MR. CATANESE: She's correct, but we started the vote.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: But you started the vote so does that ---?

MR. FINNERTY: Yeah. That's all. So finish the vote.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: So the question is ---.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Who said that?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: The Parliamentarian.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: The question is --- he made a ruling. I'll go along with it. He made a ruling that we started the vote, which we did. So that trumps the issue so ---. What's your point?

MR. FUTULES: Point of order.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: What's your point?

MR. FUTULES: Can the President make an exception if like a mistake was made to begin a vote?

MR. CAMBEST: He can't.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I can't make the exception.

MR. FUTULES: I just wanted to ask. That's a question. That's all.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No, I mean it's the issue --- is it right or wrong and they started the vote, so ---.

MR. FUTULES: Okay.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

MR. FINNERTY: Go ahead.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead. Continue with the vote.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Klein?
MS. KLEIN: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?
MR. KRESS: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?
DR. MARTONI: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?
MS. MEANS: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?
MS. REA: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 14; no's 1. The bill

passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Liaison ---.

MR. FINNERTY: Mr. President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. FINNERTY: I'd like Ms. Means to get an opportunity to say what she wants to say.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I'll second that.

MR. FINNERTY: Personal privilege.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. I'll accept it.

MR. FINNERTY: Okay.

MS. MEANS: Well, thank you very much. I appreciate the opportunity to speak. I was going to vote for the Capital Budget, but I wanted to tell the public that I am very disappointed again that I --- we don't --- as a body, we vote for road projects that we don't know what the roads are. And again and again, I feel that as Council members, we are disrespected by the administration because they have a plan for roads, and they have it and it's a --- they probably have a ten-year plan, a five-year plan and a one-year plan. And we are not told what that plan is. And our constituents call us on the phone and they ask when roads are going to be fixed and we don't have an answer for them.

So it --- it's my --- this is my opportunity to say I think we should be included on the road projects and informed. At the present time, we are informed the same

time the public is. You know, Amy Downs sends out an e-mail and it's posted on the County website. We get --- we don't get notice ahead of time. We're not included in the process. And I appreciate the opportunity to speak. And thank you, Mr. Finnerty, for giving me that opportunity to speak. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I gave you the opportunity.

MR. FINNERTY: Yeah. The President gave you the opportunity.

MS. MEANS: Oh, I ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That's okay. That's okay.

MR. MACEY: Could I answer her?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Now, wait a minute. Go ahead.

MR. MACEY: Thank you, Mr. President and members of Council and Councilwoman Means. As chairman of the Public Works, some time ago I put through a resolution that we have a website that is to keep the public aware of road construction and shutdowns and things of that nature. And I will see that we continue to that in the best manner possible so that anybody could go on the website and find out what road construction is going on so that they'll be familiar with delays or shutdowns.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Finnerty. I mean, I'm sorry, not Finnerty --- Futules.

MR. FUTULES: Yes. It seems that we opened the door and I wanted to comment what Sue had --- or her complaint was. And I understand, but back in other days when I was doing something else, sometimes when you talk about roads over the winter, you're not really sure which ones are going to actually go bad until the spring. You could have a specific road planned to be paved, and there's another one that falls apart in the meantime that's --- and this one didn't. You know what I'm saying? So things change. And on behalf --- you know, as far as the administration, I think they're not even 100-percent sure of exactly what roads are going to do. Like Crawford Run in my District, it fell apart. Okay? And I don't think it was on their agenda to pave it, but it happened, but they had to fix it, so ---. For that reason, I believe that they can't ---. If they tell us exactly what roads we're going to do and if they don't do it, now they're accused of not doing it. So the smart thing to do is don't say anything until it's done or get --- until

it's gone on the agenda to actually do it. That's the way I would look at it. I just wanted to explain that.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Sue?

MS. MEANS: I just wanted to reply. I mean, we all understand it's fluid. We understand the weather changes things. But when I share my experience on County Council with Commissioners and township and township supervisors and council members, they cannot believe that we vote on roads and we don't know what they are. I mean, really. So thank you very much for the opportunity to speak.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Moving down to Liaison Reports. Anybody have a Liaison Report? Go ahead. Sue was first. Go ahead.

MS. MEANS: I read this article in the paper and I wanted to share it my fellow Council members and challenge us a County to think about this.

I want this article entered. Bucks County tells State, no budget, no tax payments. So in Doylestown, the elected officials in the suburban Philadelphia county have turned the tables on the state government, withholding all tax payments owed to Pennsylvania because the state legislators and the Governor have failed to reach an agreement on the budget.

Officials in Bucks County said Tuesday they will withhold \$4 million to \$5 million in monthly taxes and fees meant for the state, including real estate transfer taxes and revenues collected by the civil and criminal courts. State aid to the counties has dried up because of the five-month budget impasse. Bucks' finance director Dave Boscola, says the county has been draining its cash reserves and could run of money by the end of the year.

County Commissioner Bob Landry (sic) said nobody at the state has felt any pain through this budget stalemate. He went on to say we strongly encourage the other counties to follow suit by withholding tax money.

They're collecting the money. We have human resources, schools and everyone is being held at bay and hostage. They --- some of these subcontractors that provide like early childhood intervention, rape crisis centers, they have to borrow money to pay their payroll. Eventually, they'll get paid, but in the meantime, they have to pick up the interest, and the State will not reimburse them on interest. We are being held hostage, and I just thought I would challenge fellow Council

members to think about doing something similar to this. Thank you for allowing me to speak.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Seeing no other liaison --- oh, wait a minute. John Palmiere.

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Palmiere.

MR. PALMIERE: Thank you. I --- after Sue gets done, I'm wondering, well, should I even mention this? But you know what? I'm going to mention it anyhow. On Thanksgiving Day or Thanksgiving morning, the YMCA has been holding a Turkey Trot race here, oh, I don't know, the past --- (adjusts microphone). Am I on now? Thank you.

The YMCA has been sponsoring a Turkey Trot race on Thanksgiving for many years now, and I just wanted to compliment them on the --- their success because I was able to participate in that. I was the caboose. I finished way after a lot of good people. But they do a wonderful job down there. And I just want to tell you this. When I first started running that race, if we had 300, 400 participants, that was a lot. They had four different events on Thanksgiving morning down there, thousands of people, families from all over the place. And it's become a real, real event, a real Pittsburgh event. And my compliments and kudos to them for having such a wonderful event on a --- and it was a beautiful Thanksgiving morning this year, too. I just wanted to mention that, Mr. President. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Representative Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: So this is the section of the agenda we all --- Liaison Reports. And we've kind of lumped that in with announcements about other things, which has been interesting. But as I conclude my four years, I wanted to wrap on --- wrap up my report on two boards that I serve on as a result of being Council-at-Large.

Number one, I was a trustee of the Carnegie Library. I attended a lot of the meetings, not all of them, but a lot of them. The Carnegie Library is a jewel and asset to this region that I didn't fully comprehend before becoming a Board member. It is run by the head librarian, Mary Alice Cooper, who is an extraordinary person who does an extraordinary job. And her staff is really phenomenal. The board is extremely large, and I

think that they're going to --- Carnegie is going to vote to reduce that Board, so the At-Large position may not be a Board member by virtue of their Board processes in the future.

Number two, I served on the Election Review Board. I attended in excess of 95 percent of those meetings. One of the greatest honors of serving on Allegheny County Council was to swear in the election workers before the count of every election. Election is on Tuesday. The results are announced to the media Tuesday evening, but the actual count occurs on Friday. And our election workers who serve in the Department of Elections under the leadership of Mark Wolosik, are sworn in by the Chief Executive, myself and Mr. DeFazio before the count of each election.

And they're sworn under oath to count the count in a faithful way so that we have true results. And I have found it be an enormous privilege to be able to address the workers in our elections department, to ensure that the vote is always fair. We as Americans can live whatever --- with whatever the result is as long as the vote is fair.

I've enjoyed very much my additional responsibilities of serving on those two boards.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Okay. Seeing no more, we will go to New Business. 9295-15.

MR. CATANESE: Motion of the Council of Allegheny County to continue the service of Attorney John F. Cambest to provide legal advice, representation and consultation to County Council. Sponsored by Council Member Futules.

MS. MEANS: Point of order.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Wait a minute. Nick, wait a minute. One second. What's your point?

MS. MEANS: Since this is a personal matter, I wish that we would go into Executive Session so we could discuss Mr. Cambest being retained.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We never --- this is the way it's been going from day one. This is the way we've always done it.

MS. MEANS: Not to disagree with you, Mr. President, but we did go into Executive Session last year to discuss this same topic.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Well, if you want ---.

MR. FUTULES: She's right.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Well, I said, first of all, you want to make a motion?

MS. MEANS: Yes. I would like to make a motion that we recess into Executive Session to discuss the retention of Mr. Cambest as our solicitor.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Does someone want to second that?

MS. KLEIN: I'll second it.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: She seconded it. Under remarks? Seeing none, take a vote on it.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

(No Response.)

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Klein?

MS. KLEIN: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?

MS. REA: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Nay.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I --- the question was she wants to go to ---?

MR. CATANESE: Executive Session.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. I say no.

MR. CATANESE: We have yeses, 7; and no's 7. It's a tie.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Well, it don't pass so ---.

MR. CATANESE: Right. Now what?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: It don't pass so ---

MR. CATANESE: It failed.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: --- we have to vote. I mean, we have to go on with the ---.

MR. FUTULES: Okay. Shall I continue?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.

MR. FUTULES: Okay. Before I make a motion, I'd like to thank John for your service to our Council since the beginning. I believe you've been here since the actual first year, and you've remained here. And you have not raised your fees for quite so many years as far as I'm understanding. I just want to thank you for your service. But I know you have somewhere down the road, but I know not lately. But I just want to compliment you on your work here and make a motion to approve Mr. Cambest for the next year.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Sue.

MS. MEANS: I think that in the middle of the summer that we should always put out --- you know, of advertising this position. Mr. Cambest has been here for 16 years. And in my opinion, I do not believe that he has worked in the best interests of Council. I think it's time for a change, and I would share more, but we're out here and not in Executive Session. Thank you for recognizing me. I will be a no vote.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any other --- Representative Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Excuse me. Thank you, Mr. President. I just want to say that, you know, Mr. Cambest I've known for many, many years. He's represented many of the communities within Allegheny County. He's always conducted himself professionally. He's always been congenial about issues. He's always conducted himself very ethically. We have various attorneys that sit on this Council. You know, I have a lot of friends who are attorneys. They don't agree on pretty much anything, you know. He's tried to do the best he could in a professional way to give us the best advice. There's no other solicitor that I know of in Allegheny County that has the years of experience to be able to sort out some of the more complex issues that I think that we're going to be dealing with in the future. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Any other comments?
Representative Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes. I have a lot of personal regard to Jack Cambest. I think he's a wonderful person. But I did find that one time this year that he stepped outside the professionalism, he normally exhibits in relation to an issue that was contentious. And I thought he acted as a advocate instead of a attorney for the entire Council, and that I had not seen before. I'm going to be a no vote. Despite the fact that attorneys can disagree, I thought that there were times in which rulings were not a straight up referee call, that there was a institutional bias and that there was not a recognition that there has to be rulings for the entire Council. So despite my great personal regard, I'm going to have to vote no.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I'd like to turn the mic over to the vice president for one minute because I want to say something.

I've been here from the beginning and we had another solicitor who was a good solicitor. But to be honest with you, Jack has been --- well, we've only had a couple, but Jack has been the best. He has been honest and fair. He don't care if you're Democrat or Republican. When he says something, he does what he thinks is right. And every time I've ever checked or double checked him, he has been right. He won't go out there to tell you what you want to hear. He's always --- tells you what the ruling really is. And I've never seen anybody come back with anything to contradict his rulings. So I believe he deserves --- and he has the experience. And like Representative Ellenbogen said, you're not going to go out on the street and get someone that understands this business like Jack does. Thank you.

Okay. Is there any other comment? Seeing none, let's take the vote.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

(No Response.)

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Klein?
MS. KLEIN: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?
MR. KRESS: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?
DR. MARTONI: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?
MS. MEANS: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?
MS. REA: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 12; no's 2. The bill
passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. We're down to
9206-15.

MR. CATANESE: 9296-15.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: 9296.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah, 9296-15.

MR. CATANESE: Motion of the Council of Allegheny County expressing the Council of Allegheny County's opposition to the extension of certain foreign trade policies. Sponsored by Council Members DeFazio, Ellenbogen, Finnerty, Futules, Macey, Martoni, Palmiere and Klein.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I'd like to just say real quick this isn't good for the workers. It's not good for our country. And if you thought NAFTA was bad, this is like NAFTA on steroids. So I think everybody has had an opportunity to look at it. So that's all I have to say for now. So anybody else have ---? Well, someone want to make the motion for me? Or I'll make it.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I'll make a motion.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead. He makes the motion. Someone want to second it?

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Sue?

MS. MEANS: Mr. President, and all those co-sponsors, I just want you to know that I found the language of this motion to be very inflammatory, and that this piece of legislation is 6,000 pages long. No one knows what it really says. And I will be a no vote.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Anybody else? Seeing none, let's take roll call vote.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Abstain. I always abstain on these.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: No.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Klein?

MS. KLEIN: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?

MS. REA: Abstain.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?

MR. ROBINSON: Aye.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 11; no's 2 with 2 abstentions. It passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9314-15.

MR. CATANESE: Motion of the Council of Allegheny County re-establishing the Budget Transfer Committee in accordance with Section 805.03 of the

Administrative Code. Sponsored by Council Member Finnerty.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you. I make a motion to approve this. If you take a look at your packet there, 9314-15, you'll see that the Budget Transfer Committee is the County Controller, Director of the Department of Budget and Finance and the Budget Director for County Council. They are, that is the Transfer Committee, Budget Transfer Committee. It's a necessary thing since there are a number of transfers that have to go in by the end of the year in relation to the budget.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Representative Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes. I have a question. I'm confused and I apologize for being confused. But this is under New Business motions. And it's a motion --- is it my understanding correct that this was never referred to a committee because it's a motion?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I imagine you're right.

MR. FINNERTY: She is right.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: So this has not been discussed by this body until right now; is that right?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I'd ask Mr. Finnerty.

MR. FINNERTY: Are you asking me?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Well, I'm asking.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No. I'm asking him.

MR. FINNERTY: Okay. That's right, it has. And it's because it is the Section 805-03 of the Administrative Code. It's something that we do every year that we ---.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: This has been done every year?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes, every year. It has to be done.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Oh.

MR. FINNERTY: That's why it's in the Code. That's ---

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Okay. Okay. Okay.

MR. FINNERTY: --- Administration, Administrative Code.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: I have no recollection of seeing this before. So what you're saying is we have had this on the agenda ---

MR. FINNERTY: Oh, yes.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: --- every year?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: And we've passed it?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes, we do.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under ---. Any other ---?
Okay. Representative Means.

MS. MEANS: I was just wondering if the Chairman of the Budget Committee could just clarify. So basically this is just like a housekeeping type of ---? We're taking the money we have now, and we're transferring it over to use next year?

MR. FINNERTY: Transferring it between different departments and stuff to balance. It is a housekeeping. You're right.

MS. MEANS: Thank you very much.

MR. FINNERTY: It's housekeeping. That's why the Controller is there, and the Budget Director and our Budget Director are there.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Seeing no more, it's a motion so we'll try to start with all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? Okay. It passes.
9317-15.

MR. CATANESE: Motion of the Council of Allegheny County pulling Bill Number 8849-15, an Ordinance of the County of Allegheny County, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, amending Article 1203, Government Review Commission, of the Administrative Code by clarifying the procedure by which the five appointees of the County Council to the Commission are nominated and selected, from committee for an immediate final vote. Sponsored by Council Member Means.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead, Sue.

MS. MEANS: I believe that since it's in the pool that we're not allowed to have a discussion on the content; correct?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Right.

MS. MEANS: And the explanation is very clear what it is, so thank you very much for recognizing me.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. There's a motion. We'll try it. All those in favor ---. Oh, that's right. Did you get a second?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.

MR. BAKER: Second.
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. All those in favor signify by saying aye.
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Point of order.
MS. MEANS: Can we have a voice ---?
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Can we have a roll call vote?
MS. MEANS: Yeah.
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead. We can have it.
Do a roll call.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?
MR. BAKER: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?
MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?
MR. FINNERTY: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?
MR. FUTULES: No.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?
MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Klein?
MS. KLEIN: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?
MR. KRESS: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?
DR. MARTONI: No.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?
MS. MEANS: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE: No.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?
MS. REA: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No.
MR. CATANESE: Ayes, 8; no's 7. Pull the bill.
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Notification of Contracts.
We have none.
MR. ELLENBOGEN: You said bill.
MS. MEANS: That number isn't correct.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Pardon?

MR. CATANESE: It passed, 8 to 7.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: It passed. The bill is pulled.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: It's on what?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Thanks, Jim.

MR. FINNERTY: Off the agenda now. It's pulled.

MR. CATANESE: Eight (8) to 7.

MS. MEANS: So ---.

MR. FINNERTY: It's pulled.

MR. FUTULES: Get a copy of the bill.

MR. FINNERTY: No. It can be talked about now.

MR. MACEY: Right. Right. Right.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead, Sue.

MS. MEANS: So I would request a copy of the legislation be distributed to the members so that we can discuss. This was --- I also would like this newspaper article and the minutes from the March 24th meeting of 2015 to be entered into the record. And I would like --- basically, all members of County Council would have a --- nominate someone. The minority party would nominate two members of County --- of the Government Review Commission. They would discuss among themselves, and the majority of the members would --- majority party would nominate three members to the Government Review Commission. I feel that is a more equitable and fair way to discuss and come up with a diverse group of people, qualified people, to serve on the Government Review Commission.

The reason I'm --- Mr. Barker, will you --- the reason I want this newspaper article entered into the record and the notes entered into the record is because it documents that eight members of County Council were not apprised of the process and were not included in the selection process. And it is clear that there were five gentleman chosen. There was not one woman amongst them. There was not one resident of the city amongst them. And I believe that if each member was given a nomination --- and they could pull (sic) their heads together and come up with a more diverse group. And there was really --- there's --- the people that are serving are wonderful and they're very diligent, and they're doing a good job. It was the process that left out eight members of Council that was the problem. And so I feel that this remedies the problem. All members will be notified. All members will participate. And I thank you for my fellow members

that supported the motion to pull the bill. And I thank you all for the opportunity to discuss it.

And I have a fond memory of Barbara Daly Danko because she was present. That was the last time she was physically present with us on the vote for the Government Review Commission, and she said that it was one of the most important things we would do this year. Thank you for giving me the floor.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Was there a motion? Go ahead, Representative Heidelbaugh.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: So my colleague, Amanda Green Hawkins, is on the phone, and she has been sitting to my right for four years, a friendship that I did not have before I started Council, but I hope a friendship that exists until I no longer breathe. And it was her who said, I said, I heard he, he, he and he when these nominations were submitted. And then Brian O'Neill from the Post Gazette wrote the most wonderful article which I have in front of me now, March 29th, 2015, Allegheny Council, The Rubber Stamp Rules. And he watched that meeting, and he said at the end that it was --- let me read this quote here about the percentage of --- three suburban Democrats to pick someone and two suburban Republicans. Forty-eight (48) percent of the County is --- are males and 52 percent are women. And there was not one single woman that was selected. And then I think our President said we can't prohibit any of the folks that we have chosen already because they've already been told they've been picked before the vote. And this was just a classic example of how things are decided before we come here.

So let's try to make some amends here today. Let's try to do something different. Let's try to make this process and this Council fair and relevant. Let's give everybody a voice who lives in Allegheny County, especially the 52 percent of us who happen to be female. This is a great suggestion by Councilwoman Means. This will, I think, begin to turn the public's view of us in a little bit different light. The Government Review Commission is supposed to review this body and all of Allegheny County every ten years to make sure that we are complying with our Charter. And the people who form that Commission are integral and the most important part of what the outcome is going to be.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Let me clear the record up just a little bit. I talked to a Republican to get people, and I talked to some Democrats to get people. I didn't pick the people. But when I seen how the turn out came, I talked to the County Executive and I said, look, we need some minorities on there. He probably would have did it without me talking to him, but I did talk to him. And he balanced out the committee pretty good. I think we got one of the greatest committees we ever had on there. So it wound up being a good job. But nothing is ever completely perfect, though I think we made it a pretty good committee. That's all I have to say on it. Go ahead.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I just wanted to say, first of all, you know, I'm not one councilman, whether you're a Democrat or Republican, that is going to stifle your right to speak about something that you're interested in. That being said, it doesn't always mean that I'm going to agree with you. In deference to the President, I will say this, that I was there. The President did everything that he could to ask people whether they wanted to nominate people --- including myself, he asked me. I declined. The fact that it ended up all males was purely coincidence. Everybody didn't like get together and say, hey, let's cut out the female vote here. What happened here and when the President saw what happened he did everything to remedy that situation. So I don't think it's fair to put this on him that he did anything other than try to do the best he could. Because I can recall at the time people just not wanting to --- or didn't have anybody that they should recommend. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Futules?

MR. FUTULES: You know, I agree that this process could be improved. I really do. We got nine years to fix it, and we've got five new members of Council coming here in January. And I'd like --- I don't think time is of the essence where this needs to be voted on now. I think --- I agree that this is good material and things should be fixed, but I just don't think tonight is the night to fix it. I'd like to give the new Council members an opportunity to weigh in on their opinions on how they think things should be done, too.

So like I said, we got nine years to fix this, but I'm sure that we're going to work on it, hopefully next year. I just don't think tonight is the night to

talk about this on the floor because this is a committee process. You know, this is a voting meeting, not necessarily a two-hour discussion.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Heidelbaugh?

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Amanda Green Hawkins who is one of the --- who is the only African-American female on this Council was not asked about her opinion on who ought to serve on the Government Review Commission. Bill Robinson, the only male African-American member of this Council was not asked on who ought to be on this Government Review Commission. I was not asked on who ought be on this Government Review Commission. Sue Means was not asked and I believe Barbara Daly Danko was not asked, so there was no outreach to the women or --- not all women, but many of the women or to the African-American members of this Council.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Well, you mentioned a few names. It's possible. But all the other names you didn't mention, evidentially, they got asked somehow by somebody. It wasn't done. Jimmy Ellenbogen explained it well. This wasn't done against women or black or anyone. This was just tried to be done correctly, and when I seen it wasn't done the way I think it should be done, I went to the County Executive, like I told you, and he balanced it out pretty good. And it's a good committee. Great committee. I think he did a good job. He may have did it if I didn't ask him anyway, but I did ask him to do that.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Mr. President, may I respond to your comments ---

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MS. HEIDELBAUGH: --- since you're responding to me? I'm not --- I am not saying to you, Mr. Chairman, that you sat in a room and you said let's exclude the African-Americans. Let's exclude the women. I'm not saying you did that. What I'm saying is what was produced was five men who were not a member of any ethnic diversity. That's what the result was. You can't argue with that. And it was only after the African-Americans and the women on Council said, whoa, wait a minute. You're going to study the whole government here, and you haven't included anyone of color or 52 percent of the population. That is a fact. Okay? And that's how racism and how gender discrimination happens because we're not included. Okay? That's how it happens. And it's not over. I face it every day. Is it better than it used to

be? Yes, it is. And it was offensive. Okay? It's 2015. It was offensive that not a single woman was suggested to be on that commission.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Very, very incorrect. Jan Rea was asked for an opinion. She was out of town, and that's why there was a mix-up there. But you're wrong in what you're saying. It sounds nice, but it's not true. Jim.

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Mr. President. I'm sorry.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: That's exactly right, Mr. President. What's happening here is there are people who are trying to twist the truth for whatever political future or means that they want to do. They're sitting in the audience right now, two people who are going to be taking office here in January. There'll be three others who are not here tonight.

MS. MEANS: No. There are three ---.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I have the floor.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Right.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: They deserve an opportunity to weigh in on this issue. The five people that are leaving, you had four years and some of you longer to make your points heard. You want to do it at the last meeting or the meeting before. The ladies and gentlemen that are coming in on this Council have a right to be able to weigh in on an issue this important. Thank you.

And furthermore, I'm not going to sit here and have the President slighted here because what's happening here is not the truth. It sounds like a good story, but don't let a good story get in the way of the truth.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I think ---.

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Mr. President, I have a comment when ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No. Go ahead. Go ahead, Amanda.

MS. MEANS: Go ahead, Amanda.

MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Oh, thank you. I hope that everyone can hear me clearly. I want to draw to everyone's recollection that during that meeting where we were discussing some people who were appointed, we were --- and when I say we, those who were offended by the process, we were told, basically, that this is who was nominated and if we like it, we vote for it. And if we don't like it, we don't vote for it. Now, this is neither here or there when it comes to this motion. But I want to

make sure that we're coloring the facts of what happened at that meeting correctly. And I found that to be very offensive.

Now, here are with this motion, and the point is that we want to make sure that all kinds of perspectives from those who are elected are brought into the process when we're talking about who's going to be nominated and appointed. And that's simply the matter here. This is not about Councilman DeFazio and what he did or didn't do. That happened months ago. We're here to talk about this motion, and the reasons for it came out of that meeting for it, yes. But basically, as we were told, if you like it, you vote for it. If you don't like it, you don't vote for it, or you can hold it until next year, but at least this is on the record so people can understand where this is all coming from. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Means.

MS. MEANS: I would like to thank my colleague Amanda Green Hawkins for being very articulate, and I --- speaking this evening. I thought she did a great job. And Heather as well. But it isn't --- again, this is a process. I think we need to vote on it tonight because --- while it's fresh in people's mind by the people who experienced it, that they should be the ones to vote on it. And I wanted to clarify that the article I had put in the minutes is the Brian O'Neill, On County Council, The Rubber Stamps Rules, March 29th, 2015. I'd like to have a copy of this article distributed to my fellow Council members.

The other thing I want distributed to my fellow Council members to --- for your reading pleasure is that you --- so that you can read the minutes from the night, I have here verbatim minutes taken by the stenographer of County Council so you can read what happened. So we don't have to argue about what happened.

And I'd also like to point out that I was --- am the Republican Chairwoman, and I was not notified of the process or included in the process. And that the President of Council nicely apologized to me about what happened at the last Government Reform meeting and said, you know, he's sorry I wasn't included. And then Mr. Futules shared he didn't even know I was Caucus, Republican Caucus Chairwoman. Didn't even know.

MR. FUTULES: Oh, I did.

MS. MEANS: And then the gem of the whole meeting was when Mr. Finnerty said, well, we talked about it in our caucus, the Democratic Caucus, and if you weren't there, then you didn't get to participate. But you see I'm the Republican Caucus Chairwoman. And if I was given an opportunity to appoint these people, as a Caucus Chair, I was notified --- I would have notified all my members that we were going to discuss it that day. And we would have interviews and we would see resumes and we would put our heads together and come up two great candidates. And if we were given that opportunity, we may have chosen the same two people, but we were left out of the process. So thank you for allowing me to speak, and I'm asking that the chief clerk come and distribute the notes of that night to the members, along with Mr. Szymanski, the article of the Rubber Stamp Rules. Thank you very much.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Let me say this, Sue. I didn't --- first of all, I go by the rules. I go by the book. If someone tells me something is wrong, I go correct it. We didn't do anything to violate the rules, but I did tell you I talked to a couple of Republicans. I didn't realize all you people didn't know, and I told you. Maybe I should have talked to you, too. I said I'm sorry it didn't happen, but that's the way it went down. Nothing was done to go against anybody, but it could be like he said, like Nick Futules said, it could be a better procedure, but should the new people also be involved when we do this? This isn't going to happen for ten years. Go ahead.

MR. FUTULES: I had my hand up.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead, Nick.

MR. FUTULES: Thank you. You just repeated basically what I'm going to say, but yes, this can be improved. And yes, there were some problems. I'm not going to sit here and throw anybody under the bus because there were some problems with the way the procedure happened. But I'm not against this, but I'm not going to vote for it tonight because I really, truly believe we've got new members of this Council, and I want them to be present because they're going to be here for the next four years, and there's five members of this Council that won't be. So I want to give them that opportunity. I'm not throwing this away. I think it's a good idea. Okay? You understand? I like the idea. I think it's a great

process. It needs to be fixed and that's --- but tonight I don't think it's a night we should be voting on this.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Kress.

MR. KRESS: Yeah. I just want to address this whole issue, because again, I was the one of the people that ended up picking two of the people. And what actually happened was that Johnny had called me up and called Jan Rea up. He was setting up a committee, a nominating committee to pick these people. And we have these committees that John sets up. Okay? And I didn't really think anything of it at the time. And I ended up picking, you know, Doug Price, and then Jan's like, hey, I can't do this. I'm kind of busy with things and can you pick somebody? And I did. And I ended up picking Jay Hagerman. And I thought these two picks were excellent because, you know, Jay is a younger fellow. He's in his 20s. He's an attorney. And Doug Price set on Council before, and I think he's very intelligent. And you know, I don't know what else to say. I mean, that's --- they were my picks and I stand by them 100 percent. I think they're excellent picks.

Now, to the whole process like people weren't called again. We have committees where people aren't always called. Okay? I mean, again, I went back to the minutes from 2005, okay, and how did they do it? They basically did it the same way. Maybe they had it in a way maybe slightly different. But I remember I called Vince Gastgeb about --- hey, do you remember this? And he's like no, not really. And he goes --- and I looked at the minutes and they just nominated the two people. Vince says, okay, here's two people. And I think maybe John, I'm trying to remember who the president was at the time, they --- I think they nominated three people, and they voted on these five people.

And the thing about this Government Reform Commission or Review Commission, it's basically an advisory committee. I mean, it's not like they're going to force us to do something. So again, they're just going to come up, they're going to give us some advice --- I think the committee from or the Reform Committee from 2005, I don't even know if anything was even accomplished there, but it's a nice thing that they're trying to do. But I don't want to overstate what we're actually doing here again. It's an advisory commission. Okay? And I have to say that they ended up picking five people from

the suburbs. I think Rich maybe picked, I don't know, four people, no, four people from the City, I think. Is --- well, how many people did Fitzgerald pick?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Three, ---

MR. KRESS: Three. Four.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: --- four or five.

MR. KRESS: I think he picked, how many, four people from the City of Pittsburgh, I believe. Is that true?

MS. MEANS: That's correct.

MR. KRESS: Yeah. So what I mean, the suburban population is 75 percent, so actually in a way you could say the City is over represented on the committee. So I mean, you can sit here and complain about how everybody is picked and whatever else. I mean, again, you know, I did what I thought was best. I picked two solid people. I think they're doing an excellent job on the committee. And if people want to complain, that's fine. But I'm standing by my picks. Stand by what happened. And again, Jay Hagerman is a good kid. He's 20, in his 20s. I think that we're looking at trying to encourage young people why not pick someone in their 20s. I don't understand why everybody would complain about that. But thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: One last thing and then we'll close this all off. I'm glad Ed spoke up. I didn't want to bring it all out. But look, I didn't pick, personally, anyone on that committee. Okay? They picked a new person. They sent the letter. I didn't even pick that person. I went with the recommendation. So the deal was after I seen the way the committee come out --- and I know people were complaining. I said, yeah, it don't look good at all. I agree with that. So I told Rich. And like I said, I'm repeating myself, Rich balanced that committee out. He did a heck of a good job. And everyone will admit that committee does a great job.

With that, I'm going to also say with Nick Futules that there's nothing wrong with what Sue did here. The only thing I think I'd vote no is because I'd rather wait till the new people come on board to do this. That's my opinion. Thank you. With that, I guess we might as well vote.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?
MR. FINNERTY: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?
MR. FUTULES: No.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Green Hawkins?
MS. GREEN HAWKINS: Aye.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Heidelbaugh?
MS. HEIDELBAUGH: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Klein?
MS. KLEIN: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?
MR. KRESS: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?
DR. MARTONI: No.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?
MS. MEANS: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE: No.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Rea?
MS. REA: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Robinson?
MR. ROBINSON: Aye.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No.
MR. CATANESE: 7 yes, 8 no. The bill fails.

Next.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We're down to --- is there any --- no contracts? No Notification of Contracts? None. Public Comments, none. Does someone want to make a motion to adjourn?

MR. MACEY: I move.

MR. FINNERTY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All those in favor, signify by saying aye.

(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.
Meeting adjourned.

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:04 P.M.

CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify, as the stenographic reporter, that the foregoing proceedings were taken stenographically by me, and thereafter reduced to typewriting by me or under my direction; and that this transcript is a true and accurate record to the best of my ability.

Valerie Gregory
Court Reporter

Valerie Gregory